1962

Property of

CSaT

Please return to

Graduate Theological

Union Library

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2026

https://archive.org/details/practical-anthropology_1959_6

PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY

Volume 6

1959

Property of
CSaT
Please return to
Graduate Theological
Union Library

Reprinted with the permission of Practical Anthropology

JOHNSON REPRINT CORPORATION
111 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10003

JOHNSON REPRINT COMPANY LTD.
Berkeley Square House, London, W. 1

CSaT

V.6
1959

By arrangement with the original publishers, pages containing advertisements in the original edition have either been left blank in this reprint or entirely omitted.

First reprinting, 1966, Johnson Reprint Corporation

Printed in the United States of America

Contents of Volume 6 (1959)

The number of the issues in which any of the titles listed below may be found can be determined as follows: pp. 1-48, No. 1 (Jan.-Feb.); pp. 49-96, No. 2 (Mar.-Apr.); pp. 97-144, No. 3 (May-June); pp. 145-192, No. 4 (July-Aug.); pp. 193-240, No. 5 (Sept.-Oct.); pp. 241-288, No. 6 (Nov.-Dec.).

ARTICLES

Polygamy, Economy, and Christianity in the Eastern Cameroun, *by William D. Reyburn* 1
Drunkenness in Indigenous Religious Rites, *by Eugene A. Nida* 20
Ancestor Worship, *by K. A. Busia* 23
Are We Really Monotheists? *by Eugene A. Nida* 49
Social Anthropology, Christian Missions, and the Indians of Latin America, *by William L. Wonderly* 55
The "Gospel" Comes to Sar Luke, *by Georges Condominas* 65
Some Social Consequences of Missionary Activity among South African Bantu, *by Bertram Hutchinson* 67
The Christian Concept of Forgiveness and Anang Morality, *by John C. Messenger, Jr.* 97
Some Problems of Culture Contact, *by G. Gordon Brown* 103
The Role of Cultural Anthropology in Christian Missions, *by Eugene A. Nida* 110
Africa in Transition — I: Before European Colonization, *by K. A. Busia* 117
Ritual Value-Washing among the Weinerkreiser, *by Douglas N. Morgan* 124
Mission and Anthropology in the Solomons, *by T. E. Easterfield* 128
Mushroom Ritual versus Christianity, *by Eunice Pike and Florence Cowan* 145
Economic Development and American Aid in Laos, *by Joel Martin Halpern* 151
Africa in Transition — II: Under European Colonialism, *by K. A. Busia* 171
A Franco-African Cross-Cultural Clash, *by Robert C. Blaschke* 193
Village Reborn, *by Adib Galdas* 198
The Function of Religion in Society, *by Robert B. Fox* 212
Arab Customs, *by Dorothy L. Van Ess* 219
Africa in Transition — III: Technical Civilization, *by K. A. Busia* 223
Minimizing Religious Syncretism among the Chols, *by John Beekman* 241
The Buddhist-Christian Encounter in Burma, *by Paul D. Clasper* 251
Acculturation Survey of the Dansalan Junior College, *by David L. Hamm and Batua Macaraya* 262
Television on the Tepee, *by Wesley A. Hotchkiss* 272
Ethnographic Questions for Christian Missionaries, *by Joseph E. Grimes* 275

342226

CHRISTIANITY IN CULTURES

The Spiritual, the Material, and the Western Reaction in Africa, *by William D. Reyburn* 78
Gbeya Prescientific Attitudes and Christianity, *by William J. Samarin* 179

TO SEE OURSELVES

Wisdom which the West Should Learn from the East, *by Mu Tsung-san, Hsü Fu-kuan, Carson Chang, and T'ang Chün-yi* 84
The Structure and Symbol Underlying "Conversion" in Bantu Tiriki, *by Walter H. Sangree* 132
My Contacts with Christians in Thailand, *by Prajuab Tirabutana* 277

PRACTICAL PROBLEMS

Christian Education among Non-Christian Peoples: What Are the Goals? *by William J. Samarin* 29
Reply: The Christian Gospel and African Culture, *by Chester J. Jump* 30
Reply: Christian Education in Contemporary Indian Culture, *by Wesley J. Culshaw* 33
Reply: The Function of Christian Education, *by William A. Smalley* 41
Education — Colonial or Tribal Language? *by Arni and Irene Shareski* 76
Reply: Present Needs and Future Trends, *by William A. Smalley* 76
What Are Indigenous Churches Like? *by William A. Smalley* 135
Vocabulary and the Preaching of the Gospel, *by William A. Smalley* 182
The Missionary Role and "Marriage Palavers," *by Eugene A. Nida* 231

EDITORIALS

The Voice and the Message, *by William A. Smalley* 43
Some Questions about Missionary Medicine, *by William A. Smalley* 90
The Moral Implications of Social Structure, *by William A. Smalley* 140
The World Is Too Much with Us — II, *by William A. Smalley* 186

REVIEWS

Africa Today (C. Grove Haines, Ed.), *Reviewed by George R. Horner* 45
Helping People Learn English (by Earl W. Stevick), *Reviewed by Ralph D. Winter* 46
A Century of Darwin (S. A. Barnett, Ed.), *Reviewed by Henry W. Seaford, Jr.* 189
Introduction to Cultural Anthropology (by Mischa Titiev), *Reviewed by Joseph E. Grimes* 191

Reader in Comparative Religion, An Anthropological Approach (William A. Lessa and Evon Z. Vogt, Eds.), *Reviewed by Irvine Davis* 235
Introducing Animism (Eugene A. Nida and William A. Smalley), *Reviewed by James O. Buswell, III* 282
The Christian Faith and Non-Christian Religions (by A. C. Bouquet), *Reviewed by Eugene A. Nida* 283
British Policy in Changing Africa (by Sir Andrew Cohen), *Reviewed by James Muir* 285
Letters 48, 95, 192, 237, 287
Notes and News 42, 236, 250

PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY

EDITOR:
William A. Smalley

ASSOCIATE EDITOR:
Eugene A. Nida

BUSINESS MANAGERS:
Mark H. Taylor
Hanna Teachman

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE:
James O. Buswell III
REVIEWS

Claude E. Stipe
NEWS

Robert B. Taylor
Marie Fetzer Reyburn
William D. Reyburn
William L. Wonderly

CORRESPONDENCE

Articles, book reviews, and other editorial matters should be addressed to William A. Smalley, 9 Foxhill Rd., Valhalla, N.Y., U.S.A. Business matters should be addressed to Mrs. Hanna Teachman, Box 307, Tarrytown, N.Y., U.S.A. Please do not address any correspondence to the Mexican address on the envelope.

EDITORIAL POLICY

PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY brings together in a non-technical but creative way the resources of Christians and others oriented in a cross-cultural view of man and society. It is devoted to the development of more effective world-wide Christianity by the investigation, interpretation, and dissemination of the practical implications of anthropology and other culturally oriented studies.

The editors urge people from any field of endeavor to participate in the lively discussion we want PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY to contain, by contributing articles and book reviews, by reacting to its contents through letters to the editor, by submitting problems which may become the basis for discussion, by drawing our attention to other relevant published materials, and by sending news about subscribers and events related to our goals. The opinions of contributors are their own and do not necessarily represent the views of the editors.

CONTENTS

POLYGAMY, ECONOMY, AND CHRISTIANITY IN THE EASTERN CAMEROUN 1 WILLIAM D. REYBURN

DRUNKENNESS IN INDIGENOUS RELIGIOUS RITES 20 EUGENE A. NIDA

ANCESTOR WORSHIP 23 K. A. BUSIA

PRACTICAL PROBLEMS

Christian Education among Non-Christian Peoples:

Question: What Are the Goals? 29 WILLIAM J. SAMARIN
Reply: The Christian Gospel and African Culture 30 CHESTER J. JUMP
Reply: Christian Education in Contemporary Indian Culture 33 WESLEY J. CULSHAW
Reply: The Function of Christian Education 41 WILLIAM A. SMALLEY

NOTES AND NEWS 42

EDITORIAL

The Voice and the Message 43 WILLIAM A. SMALLEY

REVIEWS

Africa Today (C. Grove Haines, Ed.) 45 GEORGE R. HORNER
Helping People Learn English (Earl W. Stevick) 45 RALPH D. WINTER

LETTERS 48

William D. Reyburn

Polygamy, Economy, and Christianity in the Eastern Cameroun

Polygamy as a desired form of marriage among the tribes represented in this study appears to be inseparably linked with economic aspects of life as these are developing in the eastern Cameroun today. Motivations for polygamy are a complex set of cultural factors which have not and will not be readily changed. Christianity in its total condemnation of polygamy has failed to discriminate between things which are totally different. The emphasis upon monogamy has often led Africans into a false picture of the monogamous union and a resultant reaction to it. While there are certain immediate and practical steps Christian churches can take concerning polygamy, the church is neither equipped nor is it operating in the real sphere of its message by following these superficial approaches to the problem. The Christian church, particularly Protestant, makes its fatal mistake in attempting to operate with neither a formulated missionary science nor an articulate missionary theology. From the side of missionary science we must learn that the case involved in this area is primarily economic and not primarily isolated polygamy. From the side of missionary theology we need to take the findings of such information and in true Christian identification with the human being involved move with our theology to his inner longings and WITH HIM *communicate a gospel that speaks to the roots of his real need and show him that Christ is the ultimate answer to the* POWER *problem of his heart. When this has been done the transformed individual displays a transformation of symbols in his new relation to the power of the gospel and his regenerate life.*

A KAKA tribeswoman, the mother of three children, sat on a low stool with a mortar between her bare legs. Rhythmically she raised her right arm high above her head, then brought a heavy wooden pestle down with a sharp blow, beating the manioc into flour for the evening meal of *kamo*. Her left hand shot into the mortar to stir around the manioc meal and then was quickly pulled aside as the pestle hammered down again and again. A child sat silently in the dirt beside her tugging gently at a fetish hanging about its neck. Soon the child arose and tried to move in toward a lank breast that was bobbing back and forth on the mother's chest. The woman stopped, took the child and

---

Dr. William D. Reyburn's article on polygamy is based on a talk given in September 1958 in Douala, French Cameroun, at a conference on the social responsibility of the church before the social changes in the Cameroun. The report provoked a vigorous discussion among the delegates and some of their conclusions are incorporated in the article.

put it to her breast, wiped the sweat from her forehead, and turning to her husband said, "If you had two wives I could go to my mother's tomorrow." Her husband lay stretched out on a mat, appearing to pay no attention to his wife. The woman continued in a louder voice: "Look across the courtyard at Abele. She sits and plays with her children while Kana cooks tonight." Turning toward her husband she picked up a stick and pointed it at him, and with an angry scowl on her face she called out, "Poor man, poor man, who respects a poor man?" The husband arose from his mat, walked to the fire, picked up a live coal between his leathery fingers and dropped it into his pipe. Turning toward his wife he spat, cursed softly, then slowly walked away. The woman sat the child on the ground, picked up her pestle and continued to prepare the evening meal which her husband would eat by himself by the embers of his fire while her half would be for herself and his children to be eaten in the flickering light of her mud floor kitchen.

Motivations for Polygamy

The Kaka woman described above reveals something of the feminine motivation for the polygamous[1] family. She wants more freedom for herself and blames her husband's poverty for not securing this liberty. She often provokes her husband into a polygamous union by employing the ridicule of "poor man." Polygamy is an institution which appears to many modern Africans as something natural to Africa. As some say, "Polygamy is beautiful; it is a symbol of that which is truly African." Since a very large number of modern Africans were born into polygamous families and have experienced both the rewards and frustrations of westernization, it is not surprising that many Africans feel a strong pull toward the polygamous family as a satisfying security in a world that is changing perhaps too quickly. The gregarious nature of the large polygamous family fits the Kaka[2] personality, which is constantly endeavoring to express itself in interpersonal relationships.

The Desire for Children

Perhaps the most commonly voiced reason given by people of the Cameroun for the continuation of polygamy is the desire to have numerous children. The African looks upon offspring in a way which is often different from European ideas. In the first place the traditional African conceptualizes a marriage union as centered primarily around fertility. This view that all things should produce their kind causes him to conceive of humans as producers of their own kind. He views his life as a gift which he has received from his father, who received it in turn from his father, and so on. The gift of life has been handed down from generation to generation and each one is morally responsible to participate in that continuity. When a man has been given the gift of life from his father he will be most unfaithful to his father, if he fails to pass it on himself. Not only is there a sense of responsibility for reproduction among men, but the woman is likewise prepared to conceive of herself as the property of a man who has paid for her productive rights and she is responsible to produce children as well as gardens. It is little wonder then that many Africans read the accounts of Jacob, his wives and concubines, in the book of Genesis with a greater avidity than they read the Gospels or the Epistles.

---

[1] Because of the popular usage of *polygamy* to denote plural wives, it is used here in that sense. More exactly, it should be called *polygyny*. *Polygamy* actually refers to plural marriage, whether of husband or wife. *Polyandry* is the technical term for plural husbands.

[2] The Kaka are the group in the Cameroun with which the author is primarily working.

Children are a great asset in the African household particularly in the traditional village life. There is a separation of boys and girls which takes place even before puberty in which boys are associated with the male segment of the patriclan (the father's family and line of descent) and girls with the female side. This separation is often a further motivation for children. If a woman has only sons she has no one to associate with her and to identify themselves with her in her work and life. She is therefore anxious to have boys for her husband but also to have girls for herself. Girls are particularly valued in the monogamous marriage where they will for a certain number of years be available to assist the mother in her work. Girls are the source of dowry payment which will increase the father's wealth and give him the opportunity to form a marriage union between his daughter and a friend who may often be of his own age group. It is this friendship pact between men which gives rise so often to the marriage of young productive girls to old senile men. The girl's father is more concerned to prove his long standing friendship to a man of his own age class than to arrange a compatible marriage for his daughter. To the traditional Kaka father his friendships come before the assumed conjugal compatibility of his daughter. He conceptualizes his daughter in terms of *service* and not in terms of happy marriage union. It is because of this attitude, which many young African girls no longer share, that such marriages become extremely pathetic.

Boys are desired particularly because they are the visible continuation of the father's lineage. They will continue to inhabit the paternal village and to continue the family names which have been handed down through the generations. The father of an African household expects his offspring to help him and to provide him with a retinue of servants. The African father who is visibly well serviced by his many offspring is considered as a man of standing and is envied by others who for lack of children are forced to perform many menial tasks for themselves. In African societies such as in the southern French Cameroun, where land is plentiful and every man is an independent cash crop producer, it is impossible to hire workers. Consequently a man who has a large number of children can increase his cash crop production through the labor of his children. The economic aspect of polygamy will be taken up in more detail below.

A modern development of child motivation for polygamy in some African areas, particularly French, is the financial compensation for children. Many men in government service as well as private service are extremely anxious to increase the size of their families in order to receive this financial aid. Since children belong to their fathers and will not be lost due to separation of father and mother, there is often not much restraint in divorce and a turnover of wives is often common.

The high infant mortality rate of children is another factor which increases the pressure of polygamy. Africans are vividly aware that only a portion of the children born to them will live to serve them and to grow up and reproduce themselves. As one man said to me once, "I have eighteen children. Some are bound to die, some will be of no account, and I hope that the few that are left will grow up to be worth something."

Not only is the African man aware of the fact that he will lose children through death but also that he may lose his wife through death or for some other cause, such as interclan disputes. Since a marriage union is not often viewed as being a lifelong association, a man is prone to view the taking of a woman as a temporary arrangement in life. Many Kaka men have said that they would not have much security if married to only one wife. "What would I do if I had only one wife and she died?" It is especially true that a man who has had plural wives and has a large number of children feels it necessary to keep a retinue of mothers for his children.

Sexual Contact

While sexual considerations per se are probably secondary as a motivation for polygamy, Kaka men often express their concern that the death of a wife would leave them deprived of sexual contact. Also a man finds it convenient to have more than one wife for sex contacts when one wife is sick, called to her paternal village, or is having her monthly period.

The literature on the subject of polygamy often cites the long period of abstinence between birth and the weaning of the child as a reason for polygamy. This may have been true at an earlier time, but at least among the Kaka it is presently insufficient reason. Sex relations with a nursing mother are tabooed, but this is primarily to protect the child. If a Kaka man has a sex contact with a nursing woman, he must carefully bathe himself and put medicine on the eyes of the child. Otherwise his impurity will pass on to the infant and cause it to die. Kaka men do not observe a strenuous abstinence code during the period of lactation and are unable to defend this as a reason for wanting plural wives. Christian Kaka men who do not practice fetish medicine and who do not plan to enter a plural marriage are beginning to have children more frequently than before. They are not entirely free from a sense of shame in doing this.

Failure to have children is perhaps one of the strongest motivations to enter a plural marriage today among the Kaka. If a woman is sterile a man is often compelled to take on a second wife so that he may have offspring. Among some Kaka families it is felt to be an obligation of the father-in-law to provide another daughter when the first has proven sterile. Among many Kaka this involves the husband in no additional dowry payment, but for others the husband is instructed to return the daughter and his money is refunded and it is entirely up to him to find another wife. In many cases in the Kaka tribe men have been able to keep the first wife, who continues to serve her husband, but always with remorse over the fact that she gave him no children. Some monogamous men who have large families in the villages of this study are not as a rule anxious to enter a polygamous union.

On the basis of demographic counts of male and female births as well as marriageable youths, there is in this area no disproportionate female excess in population. Men disappear earlier in the upper age grades leaving a larger group of old women than old men. However there is no population imbalance at the marriageable age level to motivate polygamy. If one counts the number of young males and females living with their fathers, there is always a great excess of sons over daughters. This is due to the fact that daughters are placed in marriage shortly after sexual maturity while sons must wait considerably beyond maturity to amass the money necessary for dowry payment. It is very rare to find a Kaka girl over fourteen in her father's family village, while his unmarried sons may be there at twenty to twenty-five years of age without having been able to take a wife. *Hence it should be underscored here that the two most common reasons for polygamy given by French administrators and missionaries in particular (viz., long sexual abstinence and female population excess) are in this area of no motivational validity whatsoever.*

The Role of the First Wife

The role of women and their attitude toward the family and marriage is a major aspect of monogamy and polygamy. A woman who has more work than she can handle is often anxious that her husband take on another wife. This frees the first wife from much of her burden and gives her free time to take produce to a market, sell it and perhaps spend her money. She will be free to go to her village and visit, to spend more time with her small children and to undertake other tasks in which she finds pleasure. In addition to the freedom that polygamy gives the woman, it creates a special position of authority for the first wife, called *nya toū* in Kaka, which means "woman of the house." It is *nya toū* who directs the other wives and makes the final decisions when problems and arguments arise among the co-wives. Only *nya toū* has direct access to her husband and may call him by his name, and it is she who receives the orders from the husband. In many Kaka marriages in which the husband is advanced in years, *nya toū* may be an elderly woman managing the polygamous compound made up of co-wives and junior wives who are expected to obey her commands. *Nya toū* plays a very important role in the husband's decision to espouse another woman. *Nya toū* usually talks over with her co-wives the advisability of another wife, and if they are agreed that the presence of the potential wife would disrupt the harmony of the compound, *nya toū* presents these facts to her husband and often makes alternative suggestions to him. If the husband disregards *nya toū*'s advice, he soon finds out that the price of peace means returning the new woman to her family. In the case where a man marries a young girl, it is the responsibility of *nya toū* to take care of the girl like a mother and the husband does not sleep with the girl until *nya toū* advises him. Hence, the attitude of the first wife toward the possibility of co-wives is a very important factor in the creation of the polygamous family. In the villages of this study it was often found that the first wife was not anxious to have co-wives provided that the husband's demands were not too great. Also, if he bought her European goods which represented an equitable share in the cash income and if she had children, she did not feel extremely anxious for the presence of co-wives.

Frequency of Polygamy

In order to investigate the relation of polygamy in the changing economy of the eastern French Cameroun, a survey was made of five villages. The area covered by this survey represents a zone which is sparsely inhabited and consists of some seven relatively small tribes (Kaka, Yengele, Mponpong, Bizom, Ngounabem, Mpomam, Bangando). The distance by road between the two most extreme villages (Gounté and Mbateka Ndjong) is approximately 650 kilometers. The results obtained showed that the detailed study of this problem at Lolo was quite typical of the greater area. A full account of the Lolo study will be prepared at a later time. In order not to burden this paper with statistics I will give only the summary figures for the various villages.

1. *Ngola.* An Mponpong speaking village in the Subdivision of Yokadouma and located twenty kilometers south of Yokadouma on the Yokadouma-Molondou road. Ngola has 58 husbands and 95 wives, making a ratio of 1.6 wives per husband. Thirty-nine percent of the husbands are polygamous, 56 percent of the wives are in polygamous unions.

2. *Mbateka Ndjong.* A Bangando (Gbaya dialect) speaking tribe in the Subdivision of Molondou, located 20 kilometers north of Molondou on the Molondou-Yokadouma road. Mbateka Ndjong has 16 husbands and 22 wives, making a ratio of 1.37 or 1.4 wives per husband. Thirty-one percent of the husbands are polygamous, and 50 percent of the wives.

3. *Mindourou.* A Kaka speaking village in the Subdivision of Batouri, located 40 kilometers south of Batouri. Mindourou is divided into two halves; one is Protestant and the other Catholic. The statistics on this village include only the Protestant half of Mindourou. Mindourou has 35 husbands and 50 wives, making a ratio of 1.4 wives per husband. Thirty-seven percent of the husbands and 56 percent of the wives are in polygamous marriages.

4. *Gounté.* A Kaka speaking village in the Subdivision of Batouri, located 25 kilometers east of Doumé Station. There are 25 husbands and 38 wives, making a ratio of 1.5 wives per husband, with 44 percent of the men and 63 percent of the wives in polygamous unions.

5. *Lolo.* A Kaka village in the Subdivision of Batouri, located 80 kilometers east of Batouri on the Batouri-Gamboula road. Lolo has 56 husbands and 78 wives, making a ratio of 1.4 wives per husband. Forty-three percent of the men and 50 percent of the women are in polygamous unions.

From the foregoing data, the following conclusions may be drawn.

1. The percentage of wives in polygamous marriages is greater than that in monogamous marriages. In Lolo and Mbateka Ndjong they are equally distributed.

2. The percentage of husbands in polygamous marriages is always less than the number of husbands in monogamous unions.

3. The ratio of wives per husband is in all areas less than 2.

4. The overall frequency of polygamy and the ratio of wives to husbands is essentially equivalent throughout the entire area of this study.

Sexual Reproduction at Lolo

It was stated above that one of the major motivations for polygamous unions is to increase the number of children. In the following paragraphs we will examine briefly the sexual productivity in Lolo and then proceed to review these factors in the light of the changing economy.

In order to study the productivity of polygamous and monogamous marriages, it is impossible to arrive at just conclusions without comparing women of similar age groups whose productive activity has been over a similar span of years. In the data given below such a grouping has been done and only the final figures are given. Children here refer only to surviving offspring.

In Lolo 10 percent of the polygamous women have produced no children while nearly half of the monogamous women have produced no children. This statement must be understood in terms of the general age grouping of these women because there are just as many polygamous women in Lolo as monogamous. A detailed explanation will be given under the section on polygamy and the new economy. The polygamous women of Lolo have produced on an average 2.5 children per polygamous mother, while the monogamous women have produced an average of 2 children. On the surface it appears that the comparable age group of polygamous women has many more children than the equivalent group of monogamous women. However in Lolo nearly half of this group of monogamous women have had no children at all. If we remove them from the group, the monogamous women have produced an average of 3 children as compared with 2.5 for the productive polygamous women.

This quantitative view of productivity looked at from the male's position is somewhat different. The average number of children per polygamous male household is 5.3 while the average number per monogamous household is only 2.

It is extremely difficult to provide a quantitative account of this kind of data. In the first place no marriage is conceived in Lolo as being permanently monogamous. Likewise what are today polygamous unions may be tomorrow monogamous and next month will revert again to polygamy. However a qualitative account of child productivity in polygamous and monogamous unions in Lolo helps to show that certain kinds of monogamous unions are tending to produce more children than polygamous unions taken as an average. This is extremely valuable in the light of the fact that selected monogamous unions in Lolo are achieving what 90 percent of the men of Lolo claim can only come through polygamous unions.

It was said above that only 10 percent of the polygamous women have failed to produce children while 50 percent of the monogamous women have had no children. Does this then prove that the polygamous union is more productive? If so, why? The answer to these questions is entirely one of *selection*. The matter may be stated very simply. If a woman has given birth (before marriage or after), she is marked as productive and this in turn increases the price of her dowry. A polygamous man with wealth can afford to pay for a proven producer whereas a poor man with little source of income is doing well to get a low-priced wife who may often be a woman sent away from another marriage for her failure to give birth. If a man has money he can afford to buy the producing wife; if not, he cannot. Consequently we may say that financial position (usually gained through polygamy) makes possible the *choice* of productive wives. When this form of village capitalism was pointed out to a group of anti-capitalist college students, it came to them as quite a shock.

Monogamous marriages that can be compared in terms of time of monogamous union and period of productivity potential fall into two groups: those that bear children and those that do not. A further comparison shows that the 18 child-bearing monogamous unions tend to be stable and with less desire to seek extramarital sex contacts than the other 18 unstable nonproductive monogamous unions.

Venereal Disease

It has long been noticed by Africans and missionaries alike that pastors and catechists have often tended to produce large families. At least one of the reasons for this is the fact that sex relations in these cases are restricted to the husband and wife, thus reducing the possibility for contracting venereal disease. Among the Kaka the wide-spread occurrence of venereal disease may be attributed largely to the wide-spread practice of premarital and extramarital sex relations. It is estimated by one doctor working among the Kaka that nearly half of his women patients are cases involving a venereal infection and resultant sterility.

The spread of venereal disease, which in many cases eventually prohibits conception, is due to two main sets of factors. In the first place is the commonly accepted practice among the Kaka of sharing wives between close friends[3] and the premarital promiscuity practiced by the young. The second set of factors stems more from the economic development. Many young men are unable to secure the money required for dowry payment. Consequently they seek relations with prostitutes and transmit venereal disease. Many wives find that their husbands do not share with them enough of the income from the cash gardens, and so these women seek sexual relations with other men in exchange for money, cloth, or other gifts. These women feel that European goods are necessary to life now and find this as a means of obtaining some of them.

In view of these factors it is exceedingly difficult for a Kaka man to maintain a selfish economic control of his wife and expect her to be faithful to him. It has been found in Lolo that the productive monogamous and polygamous marriages cannot indulge in outside sexual contacts if they expect to have large families.

Polygamy and Economy

So far we have only alluded to some of the effects of the desire for money and European goods. It will now be necessary to describe briefly the type of economic development taking place in the eastern Cameroun and to show how this economic activity and polygamy are interrelated.

The economic life of the eastern Cameroun has been retarded, due mainly to its distance from the coast. Before the arrival of European colonizers in the Cameroun in the last quarter of the 19th century, coastal tribes were trafficking in ivory, rubber and slaves, which they secured from interior tribes. These coastal tribes maintained an exclusive contact with Spanish, Portuguese, German and French merchantmen sailing the west coast of Africa. Following the German occupation of the Cameroun it was discovered that the Kaka area contained considerable quantities of native rubber. Before establishing contact with the Kaka, it was necessary for the Germans to cross the hostile Meka tribal area as well as several other smaller tribes who had killed and eaten the few German merchants and officers venturing into this part of the

---

[3] See the description of Kaka sexual practices referred to here in William D. Reyburn, "Kaka Kinship, Sex, and Adultery," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 5, No. 1 (Jan.-Feb. 1958), pp. 1-21.

Cameroun. Punitive expeditions were carried out against various tribes and a communications route established, opening up the southeast Cameroun for rubber exploitation. Rubber and ivory were exchanged for European trade goods from approximately 1906 until the Germans were driven out in 1914. Following this initial period of influx was a period of some fifteen years in which the French attempted to organize its administrative units and did practically nothing to encourage economic development in this area. It was not until about 1935, when the road connecting Batouri in Cameroun and Gamboula in French Equatorial Africa was built, that the economic aspect of this country came again under outside stimulation.

In 1907, at the time of the first rubber exportation from the Kaka country, an average dowry payment was twenty *boukas,* which is a flat hoe-like piece of iron. By 1914 the price was still twenty *boukas,* but also included some European trade goods, especially cloth. In the 1920's the number of *boukas* was about five, but the amount of trade goods was greatly increased and in addition money was included. By 1939 the *boukas* had disappeared entirely and the dowry payment was entirely cash and trade goods.

This change in the dowry payment reflects the way in which the economy of the country was changing. *Soumba* is the term used in Kaka for iron, dowry, wealth and money. From time immemorial the dowry and iron have been synonymous. All wealth was in iron, and iron was used primarily in agriculture, hunting, war and marriage. The iron ceases to be the token of wealth today, but money, also called *soumba,* is used in payment of dowry.

The introduction of cash into the eastern Cameroun has been based upon two principal sources, labor and crops. Labor has always meant working for the administration, merchants or missions, in each case European institutions. Job opportunities have been relatively few. However, the introduction of money crops of cacao, coffee and tobacco have recently become available to all. The opening up of the roads in the eastern Cameroun (and in all other areas) made it possible to market crops in local central markets as well as to transport them off for exportation. Cacao was introduced into the western Cameroun before 1900. However, in the area of this study it was greatly delayed due to the lack of roads and communication and did not get started in the grasslands until in the last fifteen years.

Effect of Changing Economy

Cacao and coffee began to be exported from the forest areas of the eastern Cameroun as early as 1920. However it was not until 1946-50 that the tobacco development began in the forest and grasslands. The result of tobacco production has had a vast effect on nearly every aspect of the life in the area. Throughout the area of this study, social organization, village settlement patterns, daily routines, economic values and a host of other aspects of these cultures have been vastly affected. Some of those factors relevant to polygamy are presented here.

1. Most outstanding is the increased work burden for the woman. The men of this area (if not of Africa in general) do not believe that a man is obliged to work to the same extent as a woman. A man is responsible for numerous details of village and family life which require hours, days and weeks of deliberation which cause him to be absent from his

gardens. However, he expects his wife or wives to spend full time on the job. The result of greatly increasing the woman's work with all of the detailed jobs in the production of coffee, cacao and tobacco has the effect of causing the woman to object to her disproportionate burden. She is therefore, in many cases, obliged to seek help in her tasks through the assistance of a co-wife or wives.

2. The general increase in wealth tends to make those who have money appear richer than those who do not. Consequently the feeling of being "poor," which is opprobrium to the African, is increased. He feels impelled to avoid being left behind while others gain more wealth. Polygamy is a way to keep up and avoid the ridicule of poverty.

3. It is impossible in the area concerned to hire workers. Land is free and available. Every man is in competition and attempts to make gardens as large as his work force will allow. In some cases, extended families or subclans work cooperatively and in this way assist one another in their gardens. However, this form of cooperative labor is not extensive and it is not aimed at increasing everyone's garden but rather to reduce the total amount of heavy labor for the men. A man must depend upon himself, his wives and children to produce his income from his gardens.

4. The increase in cash has meant the increase in dowry price. In the area of this study, the majority of the money that is earned goes into dowries. Trade goods such as clothing, bicycles and sewing machines come next, and education lags far behind. Many young men find that their fathers do not pay them anything when the crop is sold. Hence they are not motivated to remain and continue the work. It is also the case that marriage has become exceedingly unstable due to the increase in available cash and the competition for wives as laborers. Many a father will encourage his daughter to leave her husband so she can go into another marriage where the father will receive a larger dowry. Consequently the father-in-law may blackmail his son-in-law for additional payments. If the son-in-law is unable to pay, the girl is forced by her father to leave her husband and enter another marriage. The original dowry is then repaid and the girl's father has made a handsome profit. With this profit he may be able to buy another wife for himself.

Sex and the Changing Economy

It is a thesis of this paper that the desire for the possession of wealth among the peoples of the eastern Cameroun has caused them to make certain adjustments which are tending toward their own ruin. In early times extramarital sex relations were formally forbidden and to break this law meant death, war or separation of subclans. With the coming of the European administration, particularly the French, all of this has been changed. Former controls have been lifted. It was formerly part of the responsibility of village elders or parents to guard their daughters from too frequent sex contacts. Any infraction of the laws of extramarital sex relations (except in *wandja,* the exchange of wives between close friends) was dealt with by the most serious punishment, usually death. The French administration, unlike the German, put the political responsibility into the hands of *chefs de canton* who were backed by French authority. Courts were set up to put into practice French laws. Punishment for sex offenses were adjusted to the levying of a fine. This was new to the Kaka and was entirely removed in his thinking from any moral dimension. The French authorities encouraged people to be married civilly, and when a man committed adultery with a woman having had a civil marriage it was in the eyes of the French an infraction upon a person who was in the process of becoming *evoluée*. Consequently the fine for such a case of adultery is fixed at 3,000 francs while the fine for adultery with a woman married only by traditional arrangement is only 1,500 francs. Since the responsibility for acting against adultery was removed from the hands of the village notables and placed in the courts, there was no longer any fear connected with adultery. In fact, often a man has found that if he can successfully accuse another man of committing adultery with his wife, he can collect the money from the offender and the matter is settled entirely on the basis of a financial agreement outside of court.

The codification of adultery as an offense against the colonial law had the effect of removing the traditional control of adultery. Since the payment of a fine was such a meager punishment and a new means of securing money for the offended party, it actually served to vastly encourage extramarital sexual relations with the result that in recent years the spread of venereal disease has become a front rank social problem among the Kaka, reaching the point of social pathology.

The result of the widespread occurrence of venereal disease has been, as was cited above, a sharp decline in the number of births in Lolo.

It is only fair to point out that it has not been the administration's policy alone which has created this situation. The cultural preparation which had been laid for many millennia before the arrival of the European colonizers has also contributed its part. This orientation among the Kaka as among many other African ethnic groups has been one which viewed the woman primarily in terms of sexual fertility and social inferiority. As long as the Kaka lived within a closed kinship world, his sexual behavior toward all the women with whom he associated was extremely well defined. However the extension of that small world through roads, the cessation of interclan and tribal wars, the opening of schools, and migrations sent him abroad into a new world where his rigid village *structural morality* was insufficient to guard him. Mission schools have often been more of an open temptation to sexual promiscuity for young people than a place where new moral attitudes were instilled. The traditional attitude of the young male has been that of sexual aggression, and the cultural and psychological preparation of young girls has been that of submission as part of the preparation for fertility expected of females.

The Kaka practice of *wandja,* in which two men in close friendship trade wives for sexual purposes, has had certain economic aspects which have come into play in the extension and reinterpretation of this practice. When two men establish the relation of *so* ("friend"), they trade gifts. Each takes turn giving the other a gift, which must be increased with each exchange. The *so* relation has not been primarily concerned with wife exchange but with material gain. The giving of a wife creates a new relation between the two men and their wives, in which the men are now expected to pass gifts to the wives. However, these gifts do not remain the property of the wives but are given to the husbands. Consequently the institutionalized practice of *so* has been extended in recent years in order to gain gifts through the lending of one's wife. This in turn has increased the spread of venereal disease, and when gone unattended for long periods, sterility has been the frustrating result. This in turn has caused the husbands to seek other wives for the production of children. Other practices of this type could be cited; however, the *so* relation is typical of the ways in which certain Kaka practices have undergone extension in practice motivated primarily out of economic considerations.

The Problem Is Economic

It is evident now that polygamy as well as freedom of sexual relation, the spread of venereal disease, the sterility of many women, and associated problems share a common nucleus which is of an economic nature. That is, there is a conceptualization of wealth which is the heart of this problem. Women and children are viewed largely as laborers and producers. Wives produce children and gardens, girl children produce dowry and provide personal service and are valuable for increasing garden income. The cash income from all a man's gardens belongs to him exclusively and he shares as little as possible with his wife or wives. Wives have a great desire to own, and if they do not find that they receive an equitable proportion of the cash income from their labor, they are anxious to seek other means of securing money. This they may do by encouraging and helping the husband to secure other wives. This gives each wife an opportunity to free herself from the close control of her husband, to sell her garden produce in a market town, to find employment, and to have financially rewarding extramarital sex relations.

It is then in conformity with the facts that the matter of polygamy in the eastern Cameroun today is motivated more out of economic consideration than from anything else. Consequently it is both futile and dangerous for the Christian church to set up ecclesiastical laws against polygamy. What is needed rather is a reorientation of both men and women concerning money and wealth, and in particular a new conceptualization of the African family, in which economic considerations are secondary to other values. Such an attitude should have to begin with the male.

What Is Polygamy and What Is a Marriage

The mission and church in the Cameroun have at various times attempted to legislate the admittance of polygamous women into the church. In essence the approach has been that the polygamous man is viewed as guilty of polygamy while the wives are innocent. This judgment has been based upon the fact that the man in these societies, because of the dowry, is the instigator of marriage. This is true in principle since the woman has had very limited choice in matters of marriage.

This position is not entirely just, however, since in many cases it is the first wife who provokes the husband into marrying a second wife, a third, and so on. Where only one wife in a polygamous marriage is admitted on the assumption that the man has only one real wife, the first one, there is the problem which often occurs due to the dictatorial power of the first wife over the co-wives. A second or third wife may be one who merits church membership but the first wife becomes a member in spite of the fact she may be unfit. If a man returns his wives in order to be a church member, he normally keeps the one which pleases him and who is fertile. He and his *selected* wife are then eligible for admittance.

It appears that by condemning polygamy per se, Christianity in Africa has done needless harm by a lack of discrimination. The question of a type of marriage union has appeared to be more important than the nature of the family involved in any kind of parental union. In the first place, the Christian church in its absolutist position of monogamy has impressed Africans that monogamy automatically produces a wholesome Christian family. While this has not been the purpose of Christian missions, it has nevertheless been implied.

The various kinds of polygamous unions found throughout Africa do not display the same basis for the foundation of the family. Neither are all polygamous marriages to be simply lumped together without discrimination.

In the French Cameroun today there are polygamous marriages involving chiefs who have upward of thirty wives. These wives are given out for child production and are exchanged quite as freely as merchandise. This is the exception. It is the remnant of the chief-polygamous marriage of the past generation, in which a chief might have a "wife" in nearly every village in his tribe. These wives played a definite political role as well as serving as wives and child producers and economic exchange. In the Cameroun today there are also polygamous marriages in which the family is the center and the relations in the polygamous family are most pleasant. Co-wives treat each other like sisters and all appear to be interested primarily in the welfare of all the members of the polygamous family group. The husband has a genuine concern for his wives and children and provides for them in a truly benevolent fashion. After one has lived in close contact with such a family, there can be no doubt why some Africans say: "I am proud of the fact that I was raised in a peaceful, compatible polygamous household." It would be extremely false to classify a peaceful, happy polygamous marriage and family with the type of chief-polygamy cited above. Likewise it would be unjust to lump a wrangling, arguing polygamous group of co-wives with either of the two cited above. It is a true and unfortunate fact that the majority of polygamous unions in the area of our study classify themselves as "incompatible marriages," due often to reasons related to the economy. In all five villages there is at least one generally recognized "ideal" polygamous family. It is possible to set up four types of family groups in these villages based upon the general peacefulness and compatibility that exists in the parental union and family group. There are two types of monogamous family and two types of polygamous family: (1) incompatible monogamous, (2) compatible monogamous, (3) incompatible polygamous, and (4) compatible polygamous.

Objections to Polygamy

If we admit that all polygamous unions and families are not made of the same stuff, just as all monogamous-based families are not of the same moral quality, we are brought back to the question: Should some cases of polygamy be admited to the church and others not? This is the question that the ecclesiastical authorities of churches ask themselves and they will continue to legislate the matter. Our purpose here is not to plead for one decision or another but to examine some of the implications of polygamous unions in the light of Christian thought.

The Christian church bases its objection to polygamy upon the Scriptures. However, on the level where these anti-polygamous decisions are made, it is commonly assumed that the New Testament is explicitly clear on the subject. This is not the case. The New Testament is conspicuously unconcerned with the subject. There is ample historical evidence to show that monogamy was the accepted and honored form of marriage among both Jews and Gentiles in the time of Jesus. Geoffrey Parrinder states in his study of polygamy:[4]

> Much of the teaching of Jesus on moral questions seems to have been given in answer to queries brought to him, on matters that were keenly debated at that time: for example, the penalty of stoning for adultery, divorce, the payment of taxes, the greatest law.
>
> Now it is very significant, and a point often overlooked, that there is no record of a question about whether a man might, in any circumstances, take a second wife. If there had been any doubt at all about whether a serious-minded Jew could have several wives, we should very probably have some reference to it in the Gospels or the Epistles. This would certainly have been preserved by the early Christian communities, if the problem had ever arisen in their own moral life. The absence of a negative command against polygamy, in the New Testament, is therefore very significant, in exactly the opposite direction to that which is commonly and rashly assumed. It shows that the question no longer arose among the Jewish or Gentile communities to whom the gospel was addressed.

If it can be accepted that the teachings of Jesus and the apostles took place among monogamous people where polygamy was not common enough to be in the minds of the people, we may ask if the New Testament has nothing to say on this subject. The answer, of course, is that the New Testament teaching regarding marriage and the family are fundamental attitudes which are often incompatible with polygamous unions as we know them. Jesus exalted sexual morality, and the permanence of the marriage union (Mark 10: 2-12). Paul exhorted wives to obey their husbands, but also placed a responsibility on the husband to love his wife. The emphasis in the Gospels upon a marriage between two people is a

> . . . quotation from Genesis given in the Gospels, as also in the Epistles, (which) is from the Greek Septuagint translation of the Old Testament. It is even stronger than the original in Genesis, where the words "the twain" did not occur. The Gospel still further reinforces this by adding, "So that they are no more twain, but one flesh."
>
> If, then, a man cannot leave his wife, it is obvious that Jesus would not countenance a man's taking a second wife. This would be sheer adultery. The "one flesh" makes this quite clear. It is not permissible to have two marriage contracts at once, "two flesh." Nor can the unity of man and wife be broken up by the admission of a concubine.

---

[4] Parrinder, Geoffrey: *The Bible and Polygamy.* S.P.C.K.: London, 1950, p. 43.

"They are no more two, but one flesh," excludes a third party.[5]

Another serious objection to polygamy which should be presented is suggested in the Golden Rule. Now polygamy is the *ideal* form of marriage in the villages investigated in this study; over 90 percent of the men in Lolo replied that they preferred a polygamous marriage. This means that the majority of men in these areas are monogamous by circumstance and not by choice. In these villages we have shown that only slightly more than one-third of the men presently have plural wives. Between one-half and two-thirds of the men are not being able to realize their ideal. Polygamy as an ideal form of marriage union if conceived as permanent is an *impossibility*. Only under the most rare circumstances would it be possible for every man to have at least two wives. Since ideal polygamy is not practicable and the available women go to the men with the money to pay for them, many young men are therefore driven to seek relations with prostitutes and to be late in marriage, and to spend long frustrating years attempting to amass the necessary wealth to afford a wife. During this process a man is tempted to steal, usually contracts venereal disease, and often becomes quite cynical desiring to have wealth more than anything else. It is only natural that such a person would believe that adequate wealth would purchase all kinds of happiness.

The objection may be raised here that in most societies there are things which cannot be shared equally. The American executive position may be cited as a parallel in our own society. Other things such as driving Cadillacs, owning a suburban home, having a swimming pool, may be indicated as desired aspects of American life which are wanted by the majority but of nearly impossible realization. We may certainly admit to the truth of this and show the frustrating effects upon our society due to the fact that the *personal failure* is a resultant institution which fills psychopathic wards, amusement escapes, crime and even evangelistic halls. However, the parallel is not complete due to the fact that the marriage union is a universal form basically necessary for the continuation of mankind.

Polygamy as it is today in the eastern Cameroun is an open attempt at female monopoly and is incompatible with the Golden Rule. Any people who idealize and live in expectation of that which is unrealizable and impossible are thereby imposing serious strain on the structure of their society. This is particularly true when it concerns something as expectable as is the marriage union and the family.

We may sum up the past two sections now by saying that polygamy varies and in some cases it is concerned for the family welfare and in others, just as in many cases of monogamy, it has no such concern. We are also safe in saying that there are basic attitudes in the New Testament which are contrary to the principle of polygamous unions when this is an ideal form of marriage for the majority of men. We may go further and question whether or not a Christian conception of marriage partnership would allow the continuation of polygamy. Polygamy dies out where the status of the woman is raised and where the woman becomes highly conscious of her own personality and aware of marriage as a sharing reciprocal relation rather than a servient relationship. It is safe to say that modern Africa cannot make the adaptation to the modern world without allowing and favoring the changed status of its women. Consequently, by moving toward an identification with the other countries of the industrialized world, African societies are of necessity moving toward monogamy. Independence for African nations will bring women into positions and responsibilities which they never knew under colonial administrations. These adjustments will unquestionably create conditions unfavorable to "buying wives."

---

[5] *Ibid.*, p. 48.

Approach to the Solution

Having described the nature of polygamy in one large area of the Cameroun and having stated that polygamy is an institutionalized form of wealth today, we are now ready to outline how this problem may be faced by the Christian church. In the first place, for the church to preach against polygamy is simply going at the matter backwards. Legislating against it by church councils, while at the same time encouraging the economic build-up of the churches, creates a contradiction which the Africans in the area do not comprehend. The orientation of Christian missions is definitely cast in a financial mold which it brings from its home churches and ecclesiastical heritage, in which self-propagation means often that the local church needs to pay the catechist or pastor and keep books. This is to the missionary a mere step which the indigenes must learn if they are to be a self-supporting church. Actually many native churches would be self-supporting if missionaries had not made such an issue of it and caused it to become a front line aspect of the missionizing movement. European backgrounds with money-conscious values and organizations have in effect often impressed native groups that upon the financial handling of the church depends everything else. Consequently the conceptualization of the church has often been in the natives' mind a kind of primitive bank in which everyone is a member of the board. There is probably nothing in the native churches of the Cameroun today which merits one tenth of the time taken up in budgets and money matters. As one well educated Cameroun pastor put it, "All the work of the church depends upon money, and if we don't make our budget we are weak and unable to work."

The native church in the Cameroun feels a dilemma in that money is felt to be so terribly necessary for the ongoing of the church, but those who can often contribute most (the polygamous men) are excluded from its membership. It is as though General Motors Company were told to increase its total output of automobiles, but also to send its employees on vacation. The African is not entirely responsible for the situation in which he finds himself. Neither is he entirely free from responsibility for it. Christian mission churches are over-concerned with the idea of membership which no doubt helps to assess increase and decrease and provides figures for the home board. A first step in a Christian solution to the problem in the eastern Cameroun would be to reconsider the idea of church membership and to embrace a fellowship of families without consideration for the status of the marriage union. As it is presently, the father of the family is forced to be an outsider. The source of authority is excluded. The family takes on a feeling of separation from the one they really honor, the father. Anywhere in the Cameroun where a person is asked if X is a Christian, the reply is Yes, or No; and if No the qualification is frequently added that X is a polygamist. The church in the Cameroun is by and large a female church where the man who needs the teaching of the church is felt unwanted. However, there are certain basic attitudes shared by the men which will not be affected by the church as long as the church communicates itself along the artificial lines of "membership." Consequently the church has no choice but to work in reverse and tell women (who have little choice or voice in the matter) that polygamy is wrong.

If the church does not want to readjust its lines of communication and prefers to be based upon membership, then the church will have to get out of its narrow confinements and address itself to the males in other ways. It may hold men's institutes, sponsor gatherings for men outside of the church atmosphere, and through the personal contact of its present male constituency attempt to bring about a changed attitude toward money and wealth. Where polygamy is a sign of status, it is sometimes possible to take on a new sign which serves the old purpose. Cement houses in the villages of the Bulu tribe are beginning to receive the recognition formerly granted to polygamists only. Careful financial arrangement may enable male Christians among the Kaka to build such houses and the prestige accorded to the polygamist only may be shifted to the owners of cement houses. The church could help by advising Christian men on how to economize and to plan their expenditures.

The status of women must be visibly changed. This is being started through education, but here again we cannot assist present adults by thinking always of people of a generation or two in the future. Christian men and women who have proven that marital fidelity produces more children today than unfaithful polygamy or monogamy, will continue to be a strong influence for the cause of Christianity.

Reorientation of Values

Most fundamental of all perhaps is the necessity for Christian village men to conceptualize their wives as partners in a permanent marriage concerned for the welfare of their families. In order to do this, it is absolutely necessary that these men change their attitude toward work. In spite of the fact that they are ridiculed, they must not demand of their wives more than they are willing to do themselves. Here is precisely one of the greatest problems. Christian missions have created the specialized class of African pastors who see themselves as professional men who do not work in gardens if at all possible to avoid it. Seminaries have failed to take into sufficient account the social reality of African life. It may be necessary that the Cameroun seminary student be taught to appreciate a new meaning of physical labor and actually be taught to work with his hands as an integral part of his training. This would mean that his teachers, Europeans and Africans, would also have to participate. Pastoral theology is not enough. If the African pastor conceives of himself as above work, he will be at a loss to bring about any fundamental change in the male attitude toward work.

A great danger for the Christian church which concerns the matter of polygamy is that the church gives the impression that a monogamous marriage is automatically good. The African knows that this is not necessarily so. In fact he knows that monogamous marriages are sometimes completely impracticable.

For instance, a village or clan chief with heavy responsibilities and a constant flow of visitors to feed would not be able to perform his expected duties with one wife. If he tried, his wife would soon die of overwork. Polygamy cannot be viewed from European labor class and economic points of view.

There can be no doubt that two factors would automatically lead toward monogamy: male and female equality of rights with mutual respect, and the existence of a complex class system where hired laborers were available. As for the first of these, the Christian church may have a great deal to say. The second matter is a problem of cultural change which fortunately or unfortunately may come eventually. Probably the thing which will have the greatest practical influence in the Cameroun for some years to come will be the fact that many Christian men have taken on a new idea of womanhood and marital fidelity and this has in turn often been rewarded by numerous offspring. These outward signs will change with the time. The Christian message must continue to seek in the African's heart and in identification *with him* the answers to the deeper longings that find their outlets in polygamy. I suggest one of these here because of the fact that Christianity can effectively work in this sphere. I refer to it as "transformed symbolism." The argument is essentially that the African feels a compulsion to represent in tangible form his innermost feelings. That which is purely symbolic to Europeans the African fills with a meaning and action. The Christian sacrament of the communion cannot be equated for the European and African. To the latter the Roman Catholic doctrine of transubstantiation is real and meaningful. The Protestant view is given lip service but is not satisfying to the heart. It would take us too far afield to follow up this discussion in detail. However, it has its outworkings in the matter of marriage and the family, wealth, and polygamy. Children, crops, gardens, and wives are all aspects of the traditional African's compulsion for a visible sign to mark what he believes. They are the tangible living representations which guarantee for him the meaning of life. Life is an aspect of power. All that polygamy ideally produces are vivid signs of the presence of this power. Now we have come to the core of this longing. This deepseated emotion, which silently lies hidden in the heart beckoning and calling, is a desire for power. The possession of force is the possession of being and vice versa. Everything in the African's life partakes in this power and life is conceived as a gamble for the gain or loss of power. One need only listen to the prayers of the African Christian to witness the extent to which this concept of power is the truly motivating aspect of his life. Life needs to be continually reinforced through the addition of power, by the increase of life. All life is lived in a dynamic drive for power, for human vitality. It affirms this life and finds it totally inconsistent with some aspects of the Christian message aimed at renouncing life. All in this life exists to serve man and to affirm his living presence. Is there little wonder, then, that a living compulsion moves the African toward all those outward symbols of such a world outlook? The Christian songs that are choices among the people of this study are ones which affirm this life or look forward to the eternal life which is a blessed continuation of this life. Christ has come "that they might have life, and that they might have it more abundantly."

It is absolutely necessary that Christianity not confuse this existence in power of the African with European ideas of power. This is not power as an idea. It is not just power as a lust for submitting others to one's will. The *ddeti* of the Kaka is a dynamic force in all existence which one must partake of and be a part of in order that life may be guaranteed. This power naturally plays its role now as it mingles with political ideas and nationalism. It was all-important at earlier times in war. It is the nucleus of medicine, of fetishism, of magic. It is the essence of the African's concept of God. It makes even the most stubborn western forms of Christianity take on an African feeling. It is the generating principle behind ancestor worship and kinship bonds, social structure and village life. African Christianity, as it matures, comes back to it and makes it serve its task of revealing the meaning of life.

The insipid nature of much of the African's Christianity stems from the fact that he joins a church and relies upon this association (church contagion) to place him nearer to the source of power. The step which is badly needed in the communication of the gospel to the African is that the presence of this power is realized in submission to the role of the humble servant to be filled with a power for service to others. This means the acceptance of a new and vital aspect of this dynamism which the African hopes for. It means that the tangible symbols of its presence must be seen. It is for this reason that the African believes when he sees and one act speaks more than a thousand words.

Missionary Standard of Living

From a letter from Jane and Wendell Sprague, Ebolowa, Cameroun:

Today we had at our Missionary Retreat an African leader, Oyônô Ndoum, who is the head of the local schools, talk to us. He told us the things that bother them most, one of which is that the missionaries do not visit in the Africans' homes as much as they used to. One question asked of him was whether our so-called wealth — nice homes, clothing, appliances, etc. — made a gap between them and us. His answer rather surprised some of us, for he said that it does *not* make a difference to have our standard of living higher as long as our attitude and hearts are right. Marie Reyburn asked him if it would make them feel any better if we would have nothing more than they, literally, and he won everybody's heart by his reply: "It might help your heart, but it would not help ours."

Eugene A. Nida

Drunkenness in Indigenous Religious Rites

Drunkenness, like other human activity, has to be viewed cross-culturally to be seen in the light of its meaning in any particular culture. In this article Dr. Eugene A. Nida suggests briefly that the motivations behind drunkenness in the United States do not necessarily apply in other societies, and particularly that drunkenness has a ritual, ecstatic function in many religious rites.

THERE is a tendency for some missionaries to regard drunkenness in indigenous religious rites as nothing other than a sign of total moral degeneracy. It is quite understandable why missionaries should do this, for especially in Protestant circles drunkenness is strictly prohibited and has strong moral implications. If, on the other hand, a missionary has read about Alcoholics Anonymous or has become acquainted with some of the psychological and sociological studies on alcoholism in American society, he is likely to decide that the use of liquor in indigenous religious celebrations indicates a basic inferiority complex on the part of the worshipers, who as a group are suffering from some form of cultural morbidity and are hence seeking a sort of escape from real or imagined threats. We must not deny the fact that alcoholism can be a characteristic of a group which is suffering from extreme cultural pressures, and under the influence of liquor such a group may be able to create a kind of make-believe world in which the people can experience a "release" once they are free from the inhibitions imposed by the threatening social, economic, and political woes.

However, there are certain situations in which drunkenness in religious celebrations does not fit such an easily constructed picture of moral or cultural disintegration or escape. For example, many Mexican Indian religious festivals mark a period of excessive drunkenness, but the people are not particularly addicted to drunkenness at other periods of the year. Moreover, many of those who imbibe the most at such religious festivals are often those who are quite restricted in their alcoholic intake during other times. In other words, there is no close correlation between persons who are habitual alcoholics and those who become thoroughly drunken in these religious rites. Such fiestas, however, are not merely occasions sanctioned by religion in which drinking is quantitatively increased for all members of the group. There is something selective involved, and it is this selectivity which is important if we are to understand ritual drunkenness.

Another area of the world in which alcoholic consumption is closely tied with certain religious practices is in West Africa, where some religious festivals involve the consumption of enormous quantities of palm wine, with resultant drunkenness. Moreover, there is no reason to think that these festivals are particularly diagnostic of cultural morbidity or degeneracy. There does not appear to be any special reason prompting any "escape." From every observation the people are simply "reveling" in what many missionaries have denounced as wanton debauchery.

There are many such places in the world in which drunkenness has been closely associated with religious rites, but perhaps in no area was it so elaborated as among the ancient Greeks, who worshiped the composite figure of fertility and drunkenness in the person of the god Dionysus, also known as Bacchus. The rites of Dionysus involved some of the most extreme orgies of frenzy and group hysteria ever recorded. In the enactment of these rites the drinking of wine was an indispensable part, not as an expression of bravado or intemperance, but as something far more profound, namely, as a means of attaining religious ecstasy, in the form of a "divine madness." It would seem that here is a fundamental factor in alcoholic consumption in religious rites which has often been overlooked by those who have viewed such events from an "alien" standpoint.

Drunkenness and Religious Ecstasy

One of the most powerful emotions which can be associated with religion is ecstasy, whether discovered by the mystic, as the result of long periods of meditation, or by the hysterical voodoo dancer, who finally collapses when he is at last "touched by his god." Alcohol has been discovered by many peoples as being one of the "drugs" by means of which such an ecstatic state may be attained. Here is a method, not merely for escape from the world of mundane reality, but of access to the supernatural world where one can enjoy the ecstatic thrill of identification with the supernatural. Other means employed to accomplish much the same purpose are peyote, mescal beans, mushrooms (among the Mazatecs of Mexico), and hashish (or marihuana) in the Middle East. Alcohol, however, seems to have certain special advantages for worshipers, for it removes normal inhibitions (thus permitting greater freedom of expression), provides a sense of wellbeing, increases suggestibility, and stimulates sexual desires, where in many religious rites drunkenness is associated with fertility cult practices.

One must not presume, however, that alcoholic consumption in religious ritual must necessarily be directed toward the goal of complete ecstasy or utter physical collapse. The Tarahumaras of Northern Mexico, for example, consume vast quantities of beer (called *tesqüino*) during socio-religious dances which may last all night. Though some of the participants collapse either during the night or on the paths back to their homes, the beer is not drunk in order to provide an escape, but to promote a sense of uninhibited participation by all those present — a kind of social ecstasy, with religious overtones.

Drunkenness in Latin America

Of course, it is not easy to determine just where the factor of ecstasy may leave off and mere escape begins, nor is it always possible to know whether part of what may be observed in "religious drinking" may have a carry-over into non-religious alcoholism. However, it has been my observation that among many of the lower classes in Latin America drunkenness is not just what it is so often in the United States. The alcoholics of

Skid Row in America seem so often intent on merely "blacking out," with the avowed purpose of drinking themselves to death. Our bars are frequently filled with relatively quiet men seeking to forget, with the entertainment consisting mostly of television or radio, punctuated by a fight or by some slap-happy customer who wants to yell or sing. But bars in the small towns of Latin America seem to provide in many instances a quite different kind of picture. There is a good deal more singing, whether by individuals or groups, more drinking for the extreme "delight" of it, more boisterous, convivial "hoopla," and more real "charge" out of the experience. People drink because they enjoy drunkenness. In general, they do not appear to be trying to "show off" or to exhibit "cockiness" (as in American patterns of drinking where our individualism is at its worst); they get drunk for the sheer exhuberant joy of drunkenness — an emotional reaction evidently not too distantly related to the dionysian reveling of ancient times.

The apparent differences in certain motivations for a good deal of drinking deserve much careful study if we are going to fully understand some of the acute sociological problems of Latin America. But apart from some of the more far-reaching implications of such contrasts, there is one factor which may be significant in interpreting certain developments in the response of people to particular types of missionary work. For instance, a Pentecostal type of approach has been highly successful in reaching the lower classes in Latin America. There are undoubtedly a number of reasons, such as the very dramatic forms of ritual (which substitute for the spectacles of the Roman church), emphasis upon healing (also an integral part of Roman Catholic appeal and a pressing need for people who lack means for medical assistance), a highly developed sense of group participation, and a well-motivated sense of responsibility (since so many Pentecostal movements have not been hampered by being dependent upon foreign missionaries). However, there is still an additional factor which may be very important in the case of a number of conversions involving notorious drunkards, namely, the fact thay they find in Pentecostalism something of the same type of intense ecstasy which they formerly endeavored to attain through alcohol. (It is not without significance that on the day of Pentecost the people interpreted the ecstasy of the disciples as being drunkenness. Moreover, Peter did not deny the similarity, but insisted that it could not be drunkenness since it was so early in the day.)

It would be wrong to imply that Roman Catholicism does not emphasize the ecstatic element in worship. The truth is that there is much more importance attached to such experiences by Roman Catholics than by Protestants. The Roman church provides the people with unusually thrilling spectacles, encouraging ecstatic visions of the saints and the Virgin, and propagandizes miracles of healing. Protestantism, except for the more emotional groups, is largely devoid of such elements, and the focus of attention is upon true religion as a pattern of conduct rather than an emotional outburst.

Cross-cultural Study of Drunkenness

In making certain of these suggestions as to the possible link between the ecstatic nature of a good deal of drunkenness in Latin America and certain aspects of the appeal of Pentecostalism, I am not suggesting for a moment that the ecstatic phases of Pentecostalism are essentially unworthy, unreal, or anything more than mere psychological substitutes. Moreover, an analysis of motivations prompting certain types of drinking in Latin America is entirely inadequate to explain the Latin's propensity for intense emotional responses. The forms of drinking are only symptomatic of a whole complex of related characteristics which combine to explain the so-called Latin temperament. What we are trying to suggest in this presentation, however, is that drunkenness in other societies cannot be judged merely from observation of our own culture, and that drunkenness cannot always be analyzed merely as an attempt to escape from one's own sense of inferiority. Rather it is a technique, widely practiced now and throughout the centuries, whereby people have sought for ecstatic religious experiences.

K. A. Busia

Ancestor Worship

The study of religion in primitive societies and ancient times must not start with its creeds, for they are often secondary, contrived "explanations" for religious behavior. Rather, the functional significance of religious forms like ancestor worship lies in their social bonds, in the way in which they provide a link between the living and their dead kin. Can the individual Christian participate in that network of social relationships which is so all-important to the African?

Is Christianity true or false? You may think me an infidel for asking such a question. The Christian or the theologian would answer that Christianity is true. I may then ask him further: "How do you know?" Or, "How can you prove it to me?" I think the answers that are usually given by the theologians to such questions amount to saying: The proof of the pudding is in the eating; i.e. if you have faith, if you believe, you will know by your experience that Christianity is true. Beyond this rock of faith the theologian does not go. I trust this oversimplified statement of the case is acceptable to those here who know more about the subject than I do.

I am to talk about ancestor worship. If you were to ask me whether ancestor worship is true as a religion, what should my reply be? Should it also be: "If you believe, you will know it to be true?"? I do not think I would say that; because you may ask further: "What shall I

Professor K. A. Busia is an Ashanti sociologist. His article is slightly abridged from a lecture, "Ancestor Worship, Libation, Stools, Festival," which appeared as Chapter 3 of *Christianity and African Culture,* published by the Christian Council of the Gold Coast (Accra, 1955). Used by permission.

believe?" I am sticking my neck out for the theologian again. If the theologian said to me: "If you have faith you will know that Christianity is true," and I said: "What may I believe?" he might say: "Believe on the Lord Jesus Christ." If I asked for further enlightenment, I think he would enlarge on that by stating a body of propositions, the articles of faith, the creed of the church.

Not a Creed

I could not state for you a body of propositions, or the articles of faith of ancestor worship. No one who shares in an ancestor-worshiping cult is called upon to believe in a creed or set of propositions. He participates in certain rites. Of course, these rites presume that persons survive after death, that they are in touch with this life, and that they can be depended on. But I would suggest that the way to look for an understanding of ancestor worship, and for the points in it which merit the attention of the Christian or theologian, is not to look for a body of beliefs which he could then proceed to prove to be erroneous. I do not think Christian preachers will get very far merely by saying to the members of these communities in which cults of the ancestor are held: "You are in error; I bring you the true faith."

If we are to appreciate our problem, then I think we should pay some attention to what anthropologists have to say about the function of ancestor worship in society. I think one of the most important statements on the subject is contained in the Henry Myers lecture on "Religion and Society" delivered to the Royal Anthropological Institute by A. R. Radcliffe-Brown in 1945 and published with his other addresses in *Structure and Function in Primitive Society*. I would strongly recommend it for careful study by those who desire to come to grips with the subject.

The ideas suggested for our consideration are that religion, like morality and law, is an essential part of the social machinery, a part of the complex system of social arrangements; that the social function of a religion does not depend on its truth or falsity; and that to understand a religion it is on the rites rather than on the beliefs that we should first concentrate our attention.

From the point of view of this paper, you will be interested in the following excerpt from Robertson Smith's *Lectures on the Religion of the Semites*, 1907, pp. 16-17:

> In connection with every religion, whether ancient or modern, we find on the one hand certain beliefs, and on the other certain institutions, ritual practices and rules of conduct. Our modern habit is to look at religion from the side of belief rather than that of practice; for, down to comparatively recent times, almost the only forms of religion seriously studied in Europe have been those of the various Christian Churches, and all parts of Christendom are agreed that ritual is important only in connection with its interpretation. Thus the study of religion has meant mainly the study of Christian beliefs, and instruction in religion has habitually begun with the creed, religious duties being presented to the learner as flowing from the dogmatic truths he is taught to accept. All this seems to us so much a matter of course that, when we approach some strange or antique religion, we naturally assume that there also our first business is to

> search for a creed, and find in it the key to ritual and practice. But the antique religions had for the most part no creed; they consisted entirely of institutions and practices. No doubt men will not habitually follow certain practices without attaching a meaning to them; but as a rule we find that while the practice was rigorously fixed, the meaning attached to it was extremely vague, and the same rite was explained by different people in different ways, without any question of orthodoxy or heterodoxy arising in consequence. . . .
>
> It is of the first importance to realize clearly from the outset that ritual and practical usage were, strictly speaking, the sum total of ancient religions. Religion in primitive times was not a system of belief with practical applications; it was a body of fixed traditional practices to which every member of society conformed as a matter of course. Men would not be men if they agreed to do certain things without having a reason for their action; but in ancient religion the reason was not first formulated as a doctrine and then expressed in practice, but conversely, practice preceded doctrinal theory. Men form general rules of conduct before they begin to express general principles in words; political institutions are older than political theories, and in like manner religious institutions are older than religious theories.

I think this is noteworthy. Noteworthy also is the quotation from Confucius' *Book of Rites*: "Ceremonies are the bond that holds the multitudes together, and if the bond be removed, these multitudes fall into confusion." I think we have seen evidence of that in Africa already. In attempting to appraise African religious institutions, it is well to consider these ideas.

Ancestor worship was an important part of the religion of ancient Greece, and it has been a part of the religion of China from the earliest times to the present day. In this paper we shall consider ancestor worship with special reference to African communities.

The Kinship Bond

The group that takes part in ancestor worship usually consists of persons related to one another by descent in one line from the same ancestor or ancestress. The rites in which the group participates have reference to their own ancestors to whom they make offerings of food and drink. A cult group may consist of a lineage, or a clan, or a large chiefdom, as among the Akan peoples of this country, or the Lovedu of the Transvaal.

Among the Lovedu of the Transvaal, for example, the ancestors can only influence the fortunes of their own descendants, but the chief's ancestors take care of the whole tribe. The prayers to the ancestors ask for good crops, fertility, good fortune or success. They are conceived as exercising an over-all control over their descendants.

We may give another example from the Mende of Sierra Leone. They believe that a person survives death, and he goes to the land of the dead. To get there, he has to cross a river, and various articles are buried with him to help him on his journey. The Akan people here will observe this similarity of practice and belief. Life in the land of the dead, to which the dead go, seems similar in many respects to life in this world. The relationship between the living and the dead is kept alive by regular sacrificial rites. The members of a household, sons, grandsons, nephews on both sides of the family, form a cult group. They usually have their own place of worship, a place in the bush at the foot of a silk-cotton tree. There the members of the household meet to make their offering of the bowl of fowl and rice to their ancestors. The head of the household (or, if it is a large one, the man specially appointed for such ceremonies) calls the names of the ancestors (none must be omitted, from the first to the most recently dead), and says, "Grandfathers, we are here to offer you your portion of food." Then they return to the village to share a communal meal, after which there is general rejoicing. Some families make a number of routine offerings of this kind during the year, for the dead must have their share of their descendants' acquisitions.

The ancestors in the land of the dead are nearer the Creator, the final source of supernatural power. The prayers which the Mende offer directly to the ancestors are also intended for transmission to God the Creator, who is too big to be directly approached. The ancestors are nearer and more immediately able to give assistance. As a Mende chief explained: "If you are seeking a favor from a chief, you don't go to him yourself; you start by asking some one near him to speak on your behalf."

Among the Akan, a cult group may consist of a lineage or a chiefdom. In connection with the latter are festivals in which all the members of the chiefdom participate. Ancestor worship then becomes a tribal religion.

Offerings to the Dead

What is the meaning of the offering of food and drink to the dead, of this periodic coming together of the descendants of an ancestor or ancestress to perform elaborate rites and festivals? Radcliffe-Brown, following Durkheim and others, offers us this theory: that these rites have a social function. They give solemn and collective expression to those sentiments on which the social solidarity of the group depends. The ritual is an expression of the unity of society, and its function is to recreate the social order by reaffirming and strengthening the sentiments on which the social solidarity, and therefore the social order itself, depends.

This theory is clearly supported where the rites involve whole chiefdoms, as among the Akan, and where in addition to the offerings and prayers to the ancestors, there are public ceremonies, dances, drummings, singing, the recital of tribal history, and the reaffirmation of tribal values by word and action.

Here are sample prayers to ancestors:[1] First prayer, by an elder of the Konkomba tribe of the Gold Coast:

> I have come to sacrifice to you today.
> I want the corn to grow.
> I want the rain to fall;
> I want food to eat.
> Those people who have gone to Krachi,
> I want them to come home to their houses.

Here is another prayer, also by a Konkomba elder:

> We are but children;
> We know nothing;
> We rest on you.
> We want rain.
> We have planted yams, but there is no rain.

---

[1] Tait, "The Place of Libation in Konkomba Ritual": *Bulletin de l'I.F.A.N.T.*, XVII.

If we have rain, there will be food,
And people will be happy.
We want rain now.

Here is an Ashanti one at one of the Ashanti periodic ceremonies:

Today is Adae;
Come and receive this and eat;
Let the tribe prosper;
Let those of child-bearing age bear
children;
May all the people get money;
Long life to us all;
Long life to the tribe.

These prayers show another aspect of the rites; they manifest a sense of dependence on the ancestors who are believed to watch over their living descendants. Their descendants in turn submit to the control of the ancestors. This is one of the points at which Christians have expressed to me either anxiety or disapproval of ancestor worship. They have said that the sense of dependence should be directed to God alone. This point requires examination.

Ancestor Worship and Immortality

Another point of criticism is that ancestor worship shows a concern for this life, and may contribute to its harmony and prosperity, but has no reference to after-life, and also that it is devoid of morality, and is therefore unsatisfactory. This view seems to be supported by some anthropologists, as, for example, by the Kriges, who write of the Lovedu of the Transvaal:

> There is among the Lovedu a vague idea that failure to carry out one's kinship obligations may bring ancestral displeasure in the form of bad luck, and there may also be some connection between such displeasure and *mahava*, the force generated by complaints of living kin, which causes illness. But a careful study of Lovedu religious practices over a period of years has brought to light no single instance in which ancestors have complained about anything not immediately concerning their own personal relations with their descendants — their right to tendance, remembrance, and propitiation; the manner of their burial; their desire to be told of major events in the lives of living kin. No ancestor has ever been known to concern himself with theft, witchcraft, murder, or adultery of any descendants, nor do they trouble about the breaking of taboos which prevent rain and vitally affect the well-being of all. Lovedu ancestors are not upholders of custom in general; they are concerned only with those customs and taboos which affect their own welfare and that of their kin."[2]

On the other hand, Kenneth Little writes of the Mende of Sierra Leone: "Misfortune suffered personally, or by the family as a group, is a sign of ancestral displeasure and is interpreted as a warning that the persons concerned should look closely into their conduct towards relatives as well as towards the spirits themselves."[3]

I considered this problem in relation to the Ashanti, and I concluded as follows: "The Ashanti have concepts of right and wrong, of acceptable behavior, culturally defined in terms of their own life and belief, and as has been apparent in the brief accounts given, the ancestors and gods punish those who violate the traditionally sanctioned code, and reward those who keep it."[4]

---

[2] *African Worlds*, p. 79.
[3] Ibid., p. 116.
[4] Ibid., p. 207.

Decay of Social Structure and Ancestor Worship

There are examples in contemporary African communities to show that ancestor worship weakens when lineage and family organization lose their solidarity. In some areas men have left their homes to seek work at industrial centers. Others have gone to live in towns. Families have been separated, sometimes for long periods. All these, as well as the teaching of Christian missionaries, have weakened in some individuals the sentiments that attach them to their kindred. The consequent disintegration of the social structure and the decay of the ancestral cult appear to be proceeding together. I think it can be said of the Akan, however, that ancestor worship is still a force, in spite of rapid social change. This is because it has consisted not only of lineage rites but also public rites, i.e. festivals in which the whole tribe or chiefdom have participated. It has become associated with the sentiments and values on which the unity and continuity of the tribe depend.

The Cup of Culture

A chief of the Digger Indians conveyed the same idea in the symbol of a cup. "In the beginning," he said, "God gave to every people a cup, a cup of clay, and from this cup they drank their life. They all dipped in the water, but their cups were different."[5]

Christianity indeed does make its challenge primarily to individuals. It confronts the individual with Christ, and asks the individual to respond to Him. But because Christianity does this, it makes a challenge to society too, for man was created a social animal, and his life is lived in a social context, within the culture that his group has built up throughout its existence. His religious beliefs and practices are a part of the complex network of social relations which make up his total life. It is possibly true that group life means more to the African today than to the European in whose social situation greater emphasis has been placed on the individual. To the African group life is still a highly prized value.

Therefore I submit that we should consider the impact of Christianity on the group life and culture of the African. To put it another way, I am asking you to consider the life of the individual Christian within the group of which he is a member. He must share in its family life as defined by his society. He must share the reciprocal obligations of that group. As a member of that group, he takes part in its economic activities. He shares its knowledge and experience; he shares in its sentiments, its drives, its fears; he shares in its song and language and art and dance. He drinks out of its cup, the cup of the group's culture, different from other cups. The cups may be filled from the same river, but they are different cups. Must Christianity change the cup, or can it be the river that fills it? This is the challenge.

---

[5] Ruth Benedict, *Patterns of Culture*, p. 15.

PRACTICAL PROBLEMS

Christian Education among Non-Christian Peoples

In an earlier issue of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY *there was an editorial which raised again briefly the question of the relevance of so much of our missionary teaching and preaching.*[1] *The editorial concluded as follows: "I do not think missionary education, or missionary preaching, should be abolished because it has so badly distorted its message in the past, and continues to do so. But I do feel that preaching, and teaching, will themselves have to be transformed if they are to convey more relevantly the message of the true Transformation which comes in men's lives only in the context of the life they know. Only when teaching becomes relevant both to faith and to life (African or Indian or Asian life) will education be Christian education, and (dare we say it?) will preaching be Christian preaching in such areas of extreme conflict of cultural values. There have been sensitive souls whose ministry has been so transformed. Relatively speaking, they seem to be few.*

"Fortunately the Holy Spirit works anyhow, and strangely enough, He works through us (the missionaries) even though we are often preoccupied with tasks that will make it as hard as possible for Him. We have very often substituted the filthy rags of culture — OUR *culture — for the Bread of Life, but the Holy Spirit has built a church in many places, though it often is festooned in a bizarre way with these unlovely tatters."*

We received a provocative reply to this editorial from Dr. William Samarin, and have used it as the basis of a symposium treating some of the issues related to the Christian witness through education.

Question by William J. Samarin

What Are the Goals?

You and I have had identical reactions to some of the preaching and teaching in Africa. How often, for example, have I heard a missionary give a three-point message that was presented in the current American fashion. You are absolutely right: Our preaching must be "relevant both to faith and to life." There is no justification for any other kind of preaching.

But Christian education is another question. It is a big question, one to which I have given many moments of thought since my arrival in Africa (in 1952) and about which we Brethren

Dr. William J. Samarin is a Brethren missionary in French Equatorial Africa. His graduate studies are in anthropology and linguistics.

---

[1] See the editorial "Christian Education and Christian Preaching" in PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 4, No. 5 (Sept.-Oct. 1957), p. 202.

missionaries have decided but varied opinions. What, I have pondered, is my responsibility in educating the Africans? What should I teach them besides the gospel? What kind of educational program should I encourage in the area in which I work? What policies should guide my voting in a democratic mission organization?

For a long time I felt that my first responsibility was to *know* the people (and this, as you know, takes time). That was during my period of initiation into the work. But now that I am a "second-termer" and have assumed the burden of my own responsibility to the achievement of Christ's command, I find that I cannot so easily detach myself from some other aspects of the work.

This is what I mean. You and I know that the *C'est un chat* school is not making disciples of Christ. But does that mean that it is doing *no* good? Are we not forced, at least in French-speaking Africa, to have such schools? What happens if we do not have them? The children attend the Catholic or government schools; we lose them.

You ask in PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY how the children "would . . . learn through all of this that the Son of God lived the forms of a Jewish culture to teach Africans that they must live out their faith in God, their life of reconciliation, in African forms of life?"[2] The answer is simple: They would not. But they *do* catch the young people — as do American camps and parties — and keep them under the influence of the church.

Many of our missionaries are also wondering if we can hope for a responsible (i.e. "indigenous") African church without leaders trained in the Western fashion who can stand between the old and new cultures.

I am not here defending any particular type of educational program. What I am trying to do is show that there may be certain inescapable patterns under which one must work. One may find himself, for example, in competition with other powerful institutions whose programs one is obligated to imitate.

Certainly, none of these facts escaped your observation either in Africa or when you wrote your editorial. You had one point to make, and you made it. What I should like to know is what enlightened missionaries feel is the goal of Christian education and the form(s) it should take among non-Christian peoples. Are the goals (and forms) different for Indo-China, rural Mexico, and rural Africa? Here is a subject which I should like a book written on! (Maybe it has already been written.)

Reply by Chester J. Jump

The Christian Gospel and African Culture

As a Christian missionary begins his work in what to him is probably a foreign land, he must decide for himself how he is going to make the Christian gospel meaningful to those with whom he comes in contact and bring it in all of its implications to bear upon the culture with which he will be dealing.

There are those who feel that a missionary should only concern himself with a direct proclamation of the gospel through preaching and allied means, what is generally termed evangelistic work. Those who follow this approach probably feel that the missionary should not concern himself with the secular.

---

[2] Ibid., p. 201.

However, there is a grave danger in doing this that one will teach the African or Asian, etc., to divide his life into the secular and the sacred or spiritual. Certainly, Jesus never did this. To Him everything was sacred and a part of His Father's creation. And if He taught anything, it was that religion, His gospel, is for all of life.

So, we do injustice to the cause of missions when we alienate ourselves from the ongoing life of the countries to which we go and concentrate only on "evangelism." When Jesus said, "Go ye into all the world," He undoubtedly was thinking in geographical terms. However, we do not misinterpret His teaching when we think of that command to His disciples as meaning that they should invade every corner of the life of the community in order that the Christian gospel can pervade every facet of life.

Actually, when we teach, when we minister to the sick, when we teach better methods of agriculture, that, too, can be a direct proclamation of the gospel. I say, can be. However, one must recognize the danger that we will become overly concerned with the mundane and forget our purpose, which of course is to bring the people with whom we work into a vital relationship with Jesus Christ.

Mission Schools in Congo

In the Belgian Congo, as in many other countries of Africa, the policy of the government has been education through missions. Until quite recently, there have been no lay or public schools, and the only opportunities offered for education have been in the schools operated either by the Protestant or Catholic missions. Were there no Protestant schools, Congolese youth would have just two alternatives: either no education whatsoever, or else they would have to enter a Catholic school. It is not difficult to see what either alternative would mean for the future of the Protestant missions. Hence, the Protestant missions have had to organize and maintain vast school systems.

Actually, these schools have been a wonderful means of evangelism. We do teach, "This is a cat"; "this is a pen." And if that were all we taught, one could well ask, "How can you think of a school like that as a means of evangelism?" At the same time that the boys and girls receive instruction in arithmetic and French and geography, etc., and are prepared to make a living in their community, they are also taught through their classes in religion and through the daily witness of their Christian teachers how to live in the world and still not be a part of it in its more sordid aspects.

As Americans, we are accustomed to a public school system and have grown to believe that education is primarily a function of the state. As a result, there is considerable feeling in the various Protestant missions that our schools should be turned over to the government for use as lay schools. Actually, this is probably what will largely happen as the government finds itself able to expand its lay school program, although at present it is not in a position to do so.

It is felt that if the government would assume full responsibility for the secular education, the missions could then concentrate on their religious education and

---

Rev. Chester J. Jump is Mission Secretary for the American Baptist Foreign Mission Society in Leopoldville, Belgian Congo.

thus better fulfill their function of bringing the Congolese youth to a knowledge of Christ and His way. It might work out that way, but we have no assurance that it will. In the United States for many years now the government has assumed the burden of education and the churches have been free to carry on any programs of religious education that they wish. Through Sunday schools, youth fellowships, released-time classes, etc., they have been carrying on the programs. Yet, who would dare say that they are doing a better job of religious education than the missions now do in other lands? Certainly, not very many of us are satisfied with the religious education in America, and in a number of places the Christian communities have even begun day schools of their own in order that they might have the opportunity that the missions now have and are thinking of giving up. So, some of us will want to give this still further serious thought before we come to the conclusion that mission schools are of little service to the "evangelistic" work.

Relevance of Education

In so far as making our mission school program and our evangelistic work, too, for that matter, relevant to African culture, I believe that we still have a long way to go. Most of the books that are used in Congo schools have been translations of those used in Europe or America, and obviously not entirely pertinent to the life of the Congolese students. Actually, the missionaries are well aware of the difficulty, and efforts are being made to prepare materials written specifically for African pupils in African schools. Of course, the main difficulty here still is that missionaries must take the lead in the preparation of these books, but it is hoped that as soon as possible more Congolese themselves can take a large part in the preparation of this literature.

It is probably true that much of the evangelistic effort in Congo, and, for that matter, in Africa, has been simply a transfer of American or European methods and principles to the Congolese or African scene. Certainly, we should be adapting our Christian message to the thought forms and patterns of life of the African culture. The great strength of our Christian faith has been its ability to adapt itself to whatever culture has been its milieu. That does not mean that there need be any compromise of the fundamental message. But it does mean that we cannot allow our forms of liturgy, our church music, our architecture, and our ways of doing things to become so sacrosanct that they cannot be changed to become more relevant to the life of the African community.

However, one must proceed with caution in this matter of adapting our Christian religion in its new milieu. We must be careful that we do not allow our policy of making everything adaptable to African culture rob our African friends of the opportunity to borrow what they want from other cultures.

As we sing in church, we should hardly object if the Africans feel that singing a hymn in a different way from that in which we have traditionally done it somewhere else is wrong. But at the same time, we must not object if they happen to enjoy singing some of the hymns which have been imported from other countries.

Much is made of the fact that we have imposed our Western-type buildings and church architecture on our African friends. But have they no right to construct comfortable, permanent buildings with permanent roofs rather than temporary buildings of mud and thatch that need to be replaced every few years and whose roofs leak like a sieve every time there is a hard rain?

The question is raised as to the propriety of preaching three-point sermons in the current American fashion. Granted that often an African fable told effectively can be a more effective sermon than one which is perhaps more homiletically correct, we must also be careful that we do not throw out the foreign just because it is foreign. What the "current American fashion" is, I'm not exactly sure. But the value of a "three-point sermon," in my estimation, depends upon the three points. We must remember that the Africans, too, in their tribal courts laid the foundations of their cases in much the same way. They may have called their "points" by the name of "palm nuts," but what's in a name?

It is right that we give careful thought to our missionary strategy and seek means of making our Christian gospel more relevant to African culture. As we do, we probably shall succeed in giving it the sort of climate in which it can flourish as it has wherever it has been preached. But whether or not we, as missionaries, succeed in finding the right patterns, we need not worry. The Africans themselves are rapidly taking over the reins of leadership in the church of Christ manifested on the African continent, and history teaches us that the Christian gospel will adapt itself to the life of the land and to the greater glory of God.

Reply by Wesley J. Culshaw

Christian Education in Contemporary Indian Culture

My intention is to lead us to certain conclusions regarding the task of Christian education in India at the present time, after considering the relevant data which I propose to mention under three heads: (a) the lessons of experience, (b) the witness of the Bible, and (c) the general character of the contemporary culture within which we have to function. It is scarcely necessary for me to stress the fact that my treatment is meant to be suggestive rather than exhaustive, and that the conclusions to which I come are tentative. They will be put forward in the hope of stimulating your thoughts and not least in the hope that we may learn from each other in the course of the subsequent discussion.

The Lessons of Experience

It is not possible to recall even in outline the whole history of Christian education in India. On all sides it is acknowledged that notable contributions have been made towards the building of

---

Rev. Wesley J. Culshaw is Translations Adviser of the British and Foreign Bible Society for India. In addition to extensive missionary experience, he has written a monograph entitled "Tribal Heritage, A Study of the Santals." His reply to the Practical Problems department is a slightly abridged form of a paper presented to a conference on "Teachers in the Life of the Nation and the Mission of the Church," August 30-31, 1958.

modern India. Rather, I would ask the question first, What have been the aims of such education and to what extent have they been realized? What other results has it achieved, apart from those which were consciously sought by the originators? The pioneer missionaries entered the field of education at all levels. Naturally, it is the contribution of missions in the sphere of higher education which has attracted most attention. The beginning coincided with a widespread demand for Western education; this suited the interests of the governing power, which wanted an army of administrators and clerks, but there was also an overwhelming popular demand, for the middle classes, or perhaps we should say, the higher castes of Hindus, wanted it too. The missionaries, however, entered this field with another aim. They were convinced that, if the students could be brought under the influence of Christian teachers, given also the benefit of instruction in the Bible and the opportunity of sharing in Christian worship, many of them would be led to a personal faith in Jesus Christ and would join the Christian Church. In any event, there were in the first few decades a number of notable converts. Many of them indeed became leaders in the church in their day, but the great mass of students did not follow them, and what had always been a trickle virtually dried up from the beginning of the 20th century and the rise of the movement for national liberation.

And along with this there came a shift of emphasis, which amounted to a change of aim. Christian higher education began to be valued not as a point of contact with those who could by this means best be reached by the gospel, but as what our gentler forebears described in ecclesiastical Latin a *praeparatio evangelica*, and what we in our tougher idiom describe as a "softening up" process. If the early pioneers thought of themselves as sowing the seed, the next generation were content if they were plowing the ground; but by this time another factor was making itself felt. In some areas at least, a relatively large Christian church has come into being largely through mass movements in the rural areas, and a new generation of hitherto unprivileged persons was beginning to clamor for higher education — the future leaders in the Christian church and community.

Training of Leadership

Hence alongside the idea that educated non-Christian India was being prepared so that later it would be receptive to the gospel, there was a demand that Christian colleges, and for that matter Christian high schools, should concentrate on the training of Christian leaders. This demand had two facets: on the one hand, there arose a demand that education should be available so that a higher social status and greater economic freedom might be reached by individual members of the community (so that ultimately, no doubt, the whole community might benefit), and on the other hand, that Christians should receive their higher education in Christian institutions, be educated in the things pertaining to the faith and develop Christian character. These aims are still consciously with us to the present time. Is this not because, to some extent at least, they have been realized in fact? There may be still a paucity of leaders in church and community who are Christians, but at least those who are have been largely trained in Christian institutions.

But it would not be right to exclude

from this survey the lessons to be drawn from Christian venturing into other fields of education. Higher education is only the apex of the system, which is based on primary schools. In this field, the Christian movement has made some distinctive contributions and gained experience which is significant for us today. One such has been the rural boarding school. At first, many of them were started in order to shelter homeless children — the famine orphans and others. Little or no thought was given to the content of the education imparted. The children had to be rescued, and their training was on "formal" lines. Later the schools developed as centers of training for the Christian community and they attracted attention further afield as places where the educational theories of "child-centered" and "activity" educationists could be tried out and adapted to Indian conditions. They were the true forerunners of what we call today the Basic schools. And they had a real influence on the standards in rural primary schools.

What criticism they received — and I imagine they still receive, though I am no longer in close touch with that kind of work — was directed at them from two quite different angles. One kind came from educationists themselves. We were too tied to the existing systems of education; for one thing we were dependent on government grants, and had to conform to the curricula in force. In spite of playing about with "rural bias," most of the children were unfitted to return to the life of rural communities and at the same time they were not properly fitted for the life of the towns to which they tended to flock for work. The other kind of criticism came from the mass of conservative parents who were quite openly suspicious of any innovations, and especially of any which seemed to indicate that the aim of the schools was to send children back to the villages. They knew what poverty meant and the lack of opportunity for advancement in the villages. The result was an inevitable compromise.

If I may illustrate from personal experience. For some years in the thirties I was responsible for the administration of two rural boarding schools, one for boys and one for girls. This was in Bengal. In those days, we had primary schools with a four-year course, middle schools giving a further two-year course — and these were again divided into two streams, known as middle vernacular and middle English — and a further four-year course in high schools, in which the emphasis was placed on the teaching of English. Our boys' school had long been a middle vernacular school, and most of the boys had aimed to become village school teachers after a further year in our training school. Over a period we were driven to introduce progressively the teaching of English so that every year a number of the boys could proceed to high school. This was the only way in which we could satisfy the parents and the boys, for this was the only thing they wanted. But I found that so long as we satisfied this demand, we could pretty well make whatever other innovations we wanted by way of agricultural work and the teaching of crafts and methods of teaching.

The girls' school of those far-off days was a primary school, with a four-year course — in formal education it lagged behind. During my time we made a radical change in the living arrangements. The girls used to live in a large brick building with dormitories, kitchen, and outhouses — all surrounded by a six-foot wall. We took the step of building some mud and thatched houses on an open piece of land, putting the younger children to live with older girls in families, each with its own garden, a chapel for the village, rooms for matrons and teachers, and around the whole compound wire cattle fencing about three feet high. There was some short-lived but vehement opposition to the scheme, but not sufficient to put us off our course. Why did it succeed? Chiefly because we were in fact transferring the girls from an artificial environment to one to which they were accustomed, for they were mostly Santal girls, used to village life and to a great degree of freedom. Change is at least seen to be good if it is a change in the direction of familiar cultural traditions, provided we also give people what they most want. And at any rate in those days, the girls mostly wanted to be homemakers — independent careers were an acknowledged second best — and the life in cottages was demonstrably a good training for home life.

Education of Women

I have referred in passing to coeducation; but in thinking of the past it would not be fair to pass over in silence the contribution made by the Christian church to the cause of girls' and women's education. The Christian emphasis on the value of personality and on the fact that in Christ there is neither male nor female joined issue with the views current in the prevailing culture. Today there is no longer any argument about the fundamental beliefs on which the pioneers of girls' education set to work. And if in these days there are others who lay claim to some of the credit, I do not think we need to quarrel with them on that account. Opportunities for women and girls were and are a fundamental part of our Christian witness, and if this is now widely accepted, let us rather rejoice.

The vital question is: To what degree have we succeeded in imparting Christian education? At this stage I do not want to outline a complete answer. I have hinted at some of the things which any answer must take account of: changing aims, compromise with things as they are, and experiments especially in community living. Our immediate concern is to answer that question in terms of contemporary culture, and not in terms of a diagnosis of the past. Besides, we have not yet asked the question: What is Christian education? Before we can answer that question, we must consider an important matter.

The Witness of the Bible

In the September-October 1957 number of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY there were some editorial remarks on "Christian Education and Christian Preaching." Having described some experiences of education in Africa, and being particularly concerned with two conditions which are common the world over, i.e. the involvement of Christian schools with things as they are (in this case within the framework of French imperialism), and with the desire of the children to become "somebody," the Editor asks three questions: "How would they learn through all of this that the Son of God lived the forms of a Jewish culture to teach Africans that they must live out their faith in God, their life of reconciliation, in African forms of life? Could they learn it here in this thatched mixture of France and Africa, with all of the focus on France? Could they learn it from African teachers who, though Christians, didn't know it, whose overwhelming motivation was to adopt more perfectly the symbols of identification with the glamour of the outside world?"[3]

I want to return to that phrase, "the Son of God lived the forms of a Jewish culture," but to start from a text: "You are a chosen race, a royal priesthood, a holy nation, God's own people, that you may declare the wonderful deeds of him who called you out of darkness into his marvelous light. Once you were no people, but now you are God's people; once you had not received mercy, but now have obtained mercy."[4] It matters enormously, for education as for anything else, what Christians believe about themselves and why they are Christians, or if you like it that way, about "The Nature and Mission of the Christian Church." In our text we are told that the church is "God's own people" and that its mission is to "declare the wonderful works of God." We are "a holy nation" because we belong to God. We are a "royal priesthood" because God has chosen us. By God's mercy we have become His people in order that we may be witnesses to His truth in the world.

In terms of education, this means that Christian education should be an activity of the Christian community. Where this can function within the framework of a system that is not hostile to the Christian religion, let it so function. Where there is no Christian community there cannot be Christian education in any real sense, though there may be Christians who are educators. And where it does seek to exist, it must never exist solely or even primarily for the sake of the social or economic advancement of individual Christians. The ultimate aim and the everyday aim must be to declare God's wonderful works, to make known the word of reconciliation, which is Jesus Christ.

The phraseology of Peter is steeped in the forms of Jewish culture. The "people of God" is a Jewish conception: the Jews went wrong because they came to believe that they were separated from all the peoples of the world, and not separated to make God known. In Jesus Christ the people of God are those who are redeemed by Him. But they, too, need to remember that they have been separated from the others in order to make God known.

And Christ Himself, the Son of God — was He not more of a rebel and reformer than a conformer to the culture of His day? He lived the forms of Jewish culture only in so far as they expressed or enabled Him to express the truth of God. He went to the synagogue on the Sabbath day, yet He broke the law of the Sabbath and undermined the authority of those who upheld it. He spoke of the incompleteness of the Law, and attacked those who perverted it. He deliberately dissociated Himself from the current expressions of nationalism. He was crucified, cast out, excommunicated. The Jews rejected Him. Yet He did not reject them. He loved His own people with a tender love, and wept over Jerusalem.

He died. He rose again. Our God is "the living God." Christ lamented over the city of Jerusalem because "it knew not the things which belonged to its peace." We believe that the course of history is determined by spiritual laws — the eternal love of God. A recent writer in the *Times* of London has quoted the words of Professor Butterfield, who concludes his study of "Christianity and

---

[3] Ibid., p. 201.

[4] 1 Peter 2: 9, 10.

History" with the words: "We can do worse than remember a principle which both gives us a firm rock and leaves us the maximum elasticity for our minds — the principle: hold to Christ, and for the rest be totally uncommitted."

Now this has tremendous implications for our preaching and our teaching. We are Christians "not by anything we have done, often in spite of what we have done, and always by the grace of God." We have inherited the traditions and the institutions of Christian educational endeavor, built up over the last two centuries: and we belong to God. But we have to express our Christian faith in a changed and still changing situation. What then?

Basic Education

At this point I think I should explain that I left India in the autumn of 1949, two years after Independence, and returned only in October of 1957. Since then I have traveled widely and tried to keep my eyes open. I do not propose to offer an analysis, but to set down certain impressions.

In the first place, I would put the widespread growth of the idea that education is the most important of all instruments for social change and even for revolution. This is the driving force behind the conception of Basic Education. I quote some words of Maulana Azad, the late respected Minister of Education in the Central Government: "Basic Education seeks to change the social structure through the children of the Basic school." Those who pin their faith to this system look to its universal application as the means of building a social order free from class distinction, exploitation, and violence. Behind this faith there lies the tremendous truth that the battle for a better world is ultimately fought and won, or lost, in the minds of men. It is necessary to change the attitudes of the younger generation if we are to change the social structure from within. The apostles of the Basic idea — and they possess a true missionary fervor — see the main result of education in India during the last hundred years as the creation of a class of intelligentsia who are out of touch with the needs of the masses, while the claims of those masses for education were to a great extent neglected. They seek to reverse this trend by building up a new kind of teaching profession operating in a new kind of school.

Its main features may be summarized as follows:

(a) *Education must proceed through activity.* The emphasis is on learning through activity and not on teaching through books. The activities undertaken in school must be related to basic needs: the production of food, clothing, and shelter. Originally, Mahatma Gandhi taught that, as this is a poor country, the activities of the school must be self-supporting, i.e. we must make the school rice fields pay for themselves as well as give an opportunity for the children to learn certain skills. The core subjects, reading, writing, and arithmetic, and facility in using the mother tongue, are learned through the interest aroused by the activities of agriculture and gardening, weaving, and other handicrafts. This, it is thought, will change the attitude of the pupils to manual labor, giving it in their eyes a new dignity. There is little that is new in this conception. Mahatma Gandhi has testified that his first inspiration came from the reading of Ruskin, and similar ideas have been adopted in a greater or lesser degree in the education system of many lands. It is, however, new in that it definitely reverses the former idea that education was the prerogative of certain privileged classes in the community because they alone needed it in order to be able to accept their stations in a static society.

(b) *The school is a community in which children will learn to be good citizens.* The unifying factor is love of country. Now in this idea, too, there is nothing new and nothing bad. But because of India's history, and the division of the adherents of different religions into different communities, this unity must transcend differences of religious faith. While the importance of religion in developing true manhood is recognized, I think it would be fair to say that it is thought to be potentially not a unifying element in the nation but divisive, and therefore it is subordinated. This is the reason why common worship, which is enjoined and expected, has a syncretistic basis; and this is posing special problems for Christian teachers and pupils alike. But let us not lose sight of the fact that the fundamental idea of the school as a community is entirely a good thing, one that many of us would claim to be derived from Christian insights.

Other Considerations

There are other matters to which one could refer under the head of basic education, other features of contemporary culture which we need to take note of, but perhaps it is better to treat them separately:

(a) *The increasing concern of government with education.* Whatever the form of government, the signs are that we must be prepared for an increasing measure of control. The Basic Education program has itself been adopted by the largest political party in the country. My impression is that it is being implemented at very varying speeds in different areas, but the overall aim is constant: free compulsory education for all children up to the age of fourteen. Lack of finance is going to delay the realization of this aim, but it is not impossible that it will be realized before the passing of another generation.

(b) *Preoccupation with raising living standards.* The new intelligentsia is crying out for more technological and scientific education. Among them will be found many of the acutest critics of the Basic Education idea. They fear the danger of everyone being pulled back to a mediocre level. They want more opportunity for the intelligent child. They pour scorn on the "simple-lifeists," the "Messiahs of backwardness."

(c) *A new concern with what is summarily called "the language question."* It is tempting to be drawn down some of the fascinating bypaths of speculation and controversy suggested by the very mention of that phrase, but it is a temptation that I hope to resist. To my mind, the fundamental principle that is going to shape future policy far more than any doctrinaire approach is that which has been formally adopted: that every child shall be given education through the mother tongue. Taking India as a whole, there are many areas where this will not be easy to implement, areas in which the true minorities reside — cultural and linguistic minorities, rather than religious — but wherever we are, we must take note of the fundamental principle.

(d) *There is in many minds a spiritual vacuum, a feeling of emptiness.* I was speaking recently with a man who is in close touch with people in villages and small country towns here in the south. He said that, in his view, popular Hinduism is losing its hold on the caste people, and they are looking round for something to hold on to. What, I wonder, is it going to be? Are there not many whose plight is depicted in that parable of our Lord in which He speaks of the house from which the evil spirit has been driven out, and the house swept and made clean, with the result that seven devils entered into it?

Practical Implications

To sum up, there is in the contemporary situation a new sense of nationhood with all its privileges and responsibilities, a tremendous awareness of the modern world, too, and an underlying quest for a new philosophy of life. But now, to what does all this lead us? What are the conclusions to be drawn from our survey? What are the practical implications for ourselves? As I said at the outset, I do not propose to do more than offer certain tentative conclusions. It would be presumptuous on my part to do more than this, for I am unfamiliar with the conditions in which you live here today. I suggest the following for your consideration:

(a) *We must ensure that Christian children are trained in Christian worship, Christian belief, and Christian living.* I have deliberately avoided using the phrase "Christian education." In an imperfect world we cannot do more than approximate to an ideal known as "Christian education." The kind of training of which I speak cannot be confined to a Christian school, still less confined to the classroom. I remember reading somewhere that the three pillars of Jewish society in Biblical times were the home, the school, and the church. We need all three. But as long as we are allowed to manage schools, then schools must play their part.

(b) *We must ensure that Christian children are helped to see their rightful place in their mother land.* They must take their place unself-consciously in the life of the country; they must know her history and literature, and love her peoples. There is much to be proud of, much to be thankful for, in the national heritage.

(c) So long as we are allowed to do so, *we must continue to serve the whole community, Christian and non-Christian alike, through our schools and colleges.* New ways often do open out when old ways are closed. If I may, I refer once again to the part of India where I have spent most of my life. In the early days of my missionary life, we in the mission "managed" all the Santal primary schools on behalf of the government, and we placed Christian teachers in all of them. Very few non-Christians of that particular community were then literate. We trained the teachers too. Now most of that has gone. We no longer "run" the day schools; we are not even represented on the district education board. But the training school has not been taken away, not yet anyhow: it is a Basic Training College, with Christian staff and Christian worship. And if at some future date recognition is withdrawn, other avenues will open up for Christian witness. But as long as we do have the opportunity to serve the community, we must continue to do so, for it is a part of our Lord's command.

But — and this I believe is an important "but" — we must make our distinctive contribution or none at all. We can do this best through building up in our schools Christian community living. At their best, this is what our schools have always done. Some of the forms may change — indeed, they are changing before our eyes. But Christian community will always find expression in the quality of its personal relationships, in the dedication of teachers to their vocation, in their care and concern for the individual child, no matter who he is, and in their care for those outside.

(d) *The teachers themselves are the key to the situation.* They have only to recall their own childhood to remember the depths and the lastingness of the impressions that they today are creating in the minds of those who are their pupils. I hope they find this an inspiring and a humbling thought. I would re-echo the fine words of Professor Butterfield: "Hold to Christ, and for the rest be totally uncommitted."

Reply by William A. Smalley

The Function of Christian Education

My editorial "Christian Education and Christian Preaching" was not intended to call in question the necessity of missionary education. Samarin has rightly raised some of the all-important factors that virtually force missions in some areas into undertaking such a program. Jump has pointed out the fact, again a very important one, that Africans should have the right to choose what they want to borrow from the West. Culshaw has given us a fascinating discussion of the relationship of education to modern Indian life, and has made many useful suggestions. Education is with us and will remain an important part of the mission program. The fact remains, however, that much education, like much preaching, is irrelevant.

There are reasons for that irrelevance ranging from government syllabi to the lack of imagination on the part of teachers, but irrelevant the program remains. I am convinced that Culshaw is right when he says, "The teachers themselves are the key to the situation." The teacher, whether he has an irrelevant syllabus or not, if he has insight and cultural perception, can salvage some valuable learning experience out of it all. The challenge is to the teacher as it is to the preacher: to so get across to children (or adults) within a school system the sense that the gospel is really as African as it is Hebrew or Greek or American. Having said this, we have not said how it is to be done. We invite any readers who have had experience in converting education to another culture to send us that experience. It would be of enormous value to other readers of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY.

In answer to Samarin's specific questions, I would say that the goals of missionary education are not different in Indo-China, rural Mexico, and rural Africa. The goals are always the preparation of an individual for responsible Christian life and leadership. That life cannot be responsible, however, if it is culturally disoriented.

I fear that forms, like goals, have to be pretty much the same in different parts of the world also, since we are dealing in formal education with a widespread phenomenon which has its particular stamp of procedure which renders it respectable. Desks, benches, blackboards, and "This is a cat" will be forever with us, I fear; but this is not the important point. The important point is that we break through these superficial limitations to bring students to fundamental grips with their Christian responsibility in their own society.

However, if we could break with the forms, I think that we might do a much better job in the task of educating. If I were free to do so in Africa or in Southeast Asia, I would want to try the type of educational process which is so outstandingly represented in the example of Christ and the Apostle Paul. I would like to select a few outstanding individuals who seem to have a sense of the call of God, to live with them and work with them, to minister with them and travel with them, and little by little to exchange with them those mutual experiences which would result in the enrichment of their lives and mine. Certainly I would want to share with them what knowledge from the West or from the background of the Scriptures they seem to need, and I would expect to share with them also the knowledge of the culture in which they live, which I would so badly need. Together in this way perhaps we could make a firm step toward the building of an understanding of what it means to be a responsible Christian in their particular surroundings. In so doing I would not and could not eliminate the place of formal education in their development, but I would try to transcend it to the glory of God.

Notes and News

Second Religious Acculturation Conference

For the second successive year, a religious acculturation conference was held, January 2-4, 1959, in Bagio, Philippines. Since the more theoretical aspects of the conference were discussed last year, this time the papers and discussion centered around specific problems. These included ways and means by which Christian workers may more understandingly bring the gospel to Filipinos. Discussion also covered problems relating to the complete Christianization of both non-Christian tribes and the lowland nominal Christians. Such rites as the *canyao*, as well as survivals or pagan beliefs and practices everywhere, were considered. Methods of translating Christian doctrines into Filipino languages and understanding were studied.

The following papers were presented: "The Impact of Christianity upon Pagan Culture" by Laurence L. Wilson, "A Summary of a Program among the Manobos of Central Cotabato" by William H. Olson, "The United Church of Christ in the Philippines Program for the Province of Apayao" by William Keller, "Acculturation Survey of the Dansalan Junior College" by David L. Hamm and Batua Macaraya, "Worship in Igorot Life" by William Henry Scott, "Adaptations of Western Medical Practice to Local Conditions in an Igorot Community" by Louis D. Chen, and "The Translation of Theological Terms in Some of the Major Dialects of the Philippines" by G. Henry Waterman.

EDITORIAL

The Voice and the Message

by William A. Smalley

INCREASINGLY, as a Christian and as an anthropologist, I am fascinated with the problem of *voice* and *message*. As a child the word of God came to me in the voice of a dedicated missionary family in the Middle East. As an adolescent it came in the voice of the preaching, the activity, the ritual of an American church. In college and since then it has come in the voice of a variety of experiences, of people whom I have met and with whom I have talked, books I have read, and academic study.

But through it all, and along with these voices just mentioned, pervading them and balanced against them at times, was the voice of Jewish history, the voice of God's dealing with a chosen people, a group whose culture He molded in certain ways through history, and a group through whose culture we see Him. This is the voice of the Scriptures, and the voice of God's Son.

Since childhood I have been concerned about the distinction between *voice* and *message*. Living in the Middle East, among a people whose culture forms were much more nearly like those of the Scriptures than mine were, I began to learn that this formal, cultural resemblance did not make people Christian. This understanding was sharpened when I returned to the States and found that people whose culture closely resembled mine were not necessarily Christian either.

As an adult, the more I studied linguistics and anthropology, the more keenly I became conscious of the problem. What was universal, supercultural in Christianity, and what was relative, formal framework, cultural expression? What was cause, and what was effect? Now God's word comes to me in a linguistic and anthropological voice, as well as a Biblical one. Its lessons are not so clear as the Biblical ones, nor are they as basic. Perhaps they serve most fully the function of giving me a better perspective for the understanding of the Biblical word.

As some measure of understanding comes to me, along with it comes a compulsion to see that this word of man's reconciliation to God through Christ is passed along to the world with all of its many cultures. As a missionary I watched a new church struggling to develop its pattern of expression in a society. I felt the uneasiness and uncertainty of one who wanted to help, but who had so much to learn about how to shake off the voices through which I heard the message, and to re-express it in the voice of a new language and a new culture. And if the cultural world of the New Testament was so different from mine, would not the cultural world of the Christian Khmuʔ again be drastically different?

I think that this is a feeling which many of the readers of PA share, and

I think it is one reason for the growth of the magazine. On the other hand, I wonder if there may not be readers who are disturbed by PA's very specialized nature, and who see a danger in a disproportionate concern with cultural forms and communication techniques, and who feel that Biblical and theological considerations should occupy a more central emphasis in its pages. Perceptive readers will of course see a great deal of theological ramification in much of the more significant material which appears in PA. These implications have not usually been spelled out or overtly discussed, however. There are some exceptions, but the usual pattern of PA contributions (when they are written by Christians, and are not from the general anthropological literature) is to start with cultural data and to base the discussion on cultural arguments, with occasional reference to Biblical events, theological traditions, or church history.

In a specialized publication like PA this is rightly so. There are other outlets for other approaches, and we feel justified in exploring the very meagerly surveyed field on which we have been concentrating.

I would, however, like to remind readers, and potential writers for the pages of this magazine, of a way in which we can do some serious thinking about voice and message. Given a specific cultural situation, a specific point of view in the minds of a group to which I am a missionary, or a group in my own country to which I am witnessing of my faith, what should I say? What have I said that has been particularly helpful? What is my approach? Why?

In PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY there have been repeated discussions of mistakes in approach, when cultural factors had not been taken fully into consideration. There have been discussions of cultural traits which have been barriers to a comprehension of the missionary's message. There has been the implication that the Christian tends to mistake the voice of his own culture for his message.

But assuming the validity of this point of view, and assuming that I have taken these things into consideration, what should I preach, what should I say, how should I act in a specific place and with a specific group of people? In other words, we need in PA some careful analyses of the actual preaching content of the missionaries and national Christians in relation to the culture to which they are ministering. We need analyses of the behavior and words of those rare but all-important "prophets" through whose ministry peoples' movements toward Christ have sprung up.

John Beekman, in his article "A Culturally Relevant Witness,"[1] made a good start in this direction. He described very briefly (tantalizingly so) his attempts "to select those Scriptural truths which will have the greatest relevance to their needs and concerns."[2] Mr. Beekman would not consider himself an anthropologist, although he is keenly sensitive to culture differences. Out of his experience he wrote a most helpful article. In the months ahead we would like to see several such studies in PA.

---

[1] PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 4, No. 3 (May-June 1957), pp. 83-88.

[2] Ibid., p. 83.

REVIEWS

Africa Today, by C. Grove Haines (ed). Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1955. $6.00.

Reviewed by
GEORGE R. HORNER

This book is a collection of about twenty-one essays, each related to either a special topic about Africa in general, or a problem peculiar to one area of Africa. The papers here presented were given at a Conference on Contemporary Africa held at Johns Hopkins University's School of Advanced International Studies, August 1954.

Published in 1955, the book, to the present reader, is already out of date, so fast does "change" take place in this enlightening continent. But for readers of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Part Two, "The Heritage of Africa," should be of particular importance, for here cultural backgrounds and heritage are considered. The essay, "The Role of Christianity and Islam" by George Carpenter, Executive Secretary, African Committee, Division of Foreign Missions, National Council of the Churches of Christ in the U.S.A., is particularly significant. His essay centers around the attraction of Christianity versus the attraction of Islam to pagan Africans, on grounds, *in part,* of cultural values, Christianity's appeal is described by Carpenter in the following terms:

> 1. Christianity provides a simple yet inexhaustible standard of personal moral conduct: "*thou shalt love*" [author's italics].... It [love] progressively transforms personalities and social situations wherever it is applied.... It does not solve any moral issues directly ... but it creates relationships in which any social problem becomes soluble.
>
> 2. The Christian Church, as the fellowship of those who have committed themselves to the Christian way, is a focus of social integration of the utmost importance to Africa. Because it reaches from the individual and the local group out through the community and nation to the whole world, because it reaches back through the past and forward through the future, because it is a living fellowship involving personal commitment, group acceptance, and action together under religious sanctions, it is uniquely able to replace, for its adherents, the old tribal groupings which cannot survive changed conditions.
>
> 3. The Christian tradition, arising from Hebrew-Judaic life, which was closely akin to African cultures, affords a cosmology which meets African needs for an intelligible universe. [The African] ... may help us recover our appreciation of the basic insights on which our culture is based by taking them for his own. [Here Carpenter is referring, I believe, to the Genesis account of the origin of the universe and the credulity of the miracles].
>
> 4. Christianity is compatible with the total Western cultural pattern

---

Dr. George Horner is on the faculty of the African Studies Program at Boston University. He has had field experience among the Bulu in French Cameroun. His former contributions to PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY include, "A Field Method: The Culture-Personality Approach" (Vol. 1, pp. 29-34), and "The Need for Anthropologically Trained Missionaries" (Vol. 1, pp. 93-97).

> which is becoming a world culture. ... Hence the adoption of Christianity imposes no limitation on the general social evolution of an African individual or group. . . . The permanence of Christianity is not that of a fixed unchanging system but of a creative energy, a kind of life.

Islam, too, has "positive cultural values which must not be forgotten," continues Carpenter (p. 98):

> 1. It intensifies the group loyalty of its members and permits no barriers of color or race to break the universal brotherhood of all Moslems.
>
> 2. Islam is profoundly conscious of God, "his sovereignty and power," plus obligations such as prayer etc.
>
> 3. Its insistence on sobriety, self-control, and personal dignity is an element of strength.
>
> 4. The universality of Arabic . . . provides a focus of cultural cohesion of great importance, supported by strong religious sanctions.

Wysner, in an adjoining rejoinder article, agrees in the main with Carpenter (as does the present reviewer) but takes exception to Carpenter's statement that the Islamic world regards the West with "hostility and defiance." This is an overstatement, and what seems to be "hostility" to one person may only be an expression of human rights to another, and a desire to fulfill those rights may lead to certain hostile acts, but this overtness to bring about a desired political change or social development is not the same thing as regarding the West with hostility as a permanent point of view or attitude.

One point neither Carpenter nor Wysner mentioned relative to the growth of Islam was its spread. It seems that Islam will be contained within its present boundaries, north of the rain forest belt of central Africa. Within this area (savannah and desert) it will probably grow faster than Christianity (humanly speaking), getting many more converts from the pagan tribes within that area. It is extremely doubtful that Islam will penetrate the rain forest belt. The most important reason is that many of the ethnic groups within that area fled there from slave-raiding Muslims who forced them to find shelter in the forests and thus to be won to Christianity.

The value of *Africa Today* lies in the fact that it has documented in part the high social volatility of the early 1950's in that continent.

Helping People Learn English, by Earl W. Stevick. New York and Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1957. 138 pages. $2.50.

Reviewed by
RALPH D. WINTER

Even if not directly interested in helping people learn English, readers of Practical Anthropology will be interested in this book — it is, in an important sense, *anthropology made practical*. The author is one of the new generation of anthropologically trained Christian workers. He is very well aware of the interrelation of language and culture and clearly spells in this book the intriguing practical import of this relationship to the language-learning process. He writes as an associate professor of linguistics in the Methodist Scarritt College for Christian Workers — a "seminary" for non-ordained missionaries. His Ph.D. degree represents a major in modern general linguistics with a minor (required at Cornell) in cultural anthropology. Behind his doctorate is an

M.A. in English at Columbia University, where he taught English in off-hours at Barnard College.

The book itself is an outgrowth of a course designed for students at Scarritt, a large portion of whom (as with missionaries in general?) will be putting part of their time, at least, into "helping people learn English." In this course and the resulting book, the author draws effectively on his own previous experience of some years in teaching English to the foreign-born. He taught first at New York's Labor Temple, where he contributed a great deal to the recently published book by Margaret Mitchell. Later he taught at both Columbia and Cornell in their programs for foreign students. The book is greatly enriched by this experience.

Yet the book is thoroughly sound in theory. It does not compromise with technical linguistics despite its simple written style. The best illustration of this is Part I, "Some Fundamental Ideas." Here we find not an irrelevant hat-tipping to theory, but a practical introduction to basic ideas that are employed throughout Part II, "Teaching Suggestions." Almost half the book, this second part, walks through almost every conceivable teaching or learning situation, systematically anticipating the factors and problems that will be encountered, all the while carrying on a running conversation with three major traditions in teaching materials.

Part III, "Some Useful Information about the English Language," maintains the same objectivity toward the various schools of thought that may have produced the materials a given reader is using or must use. The various special alphabets are compared in tabular form. A unique and surprising introduction is given to the matter of grammar, and a very helpful section is included on "Dealing with Mistakes in Grammar." Let no native speaker of English think he can skip this section!

An annotated survey of materials follows, as well as a condensed index of the grammatical information to be found in (1) The American Council of Learned Societies materials, (2) *El Inglés Hablado* (in the Cornell tradition), and (3) Michigan's *Patterns of English Sentences*. Did you ever try to explain to a foreign student the difference in sentence position of the two words *sometimes* and *always*? Grammatical explanations for foreign students of English are nothing like the grammar we learn in school. The author emphasizes this by actually quoting one of these three sources on what we need to tell a student about the word *the*, but goes on to index a couple of hundred other such words.

To anyone involved or to be involved in teaching English as a foreign language, who cannot go back and get formal and special training, this little book will be keenly informative and will surely save a great deal of time and heartbreak for both teacher and student. Would that it were tactfully placed in the hands of those many, many busy and naïve persons who think that having English as a mother tongue is all the orientation they need to teach English *as a foreign language*.

Dr. Ralph D. Winter received his Ph.D. in linguistics from Cornell University. He recently went to Guatemala as a missionary to the Mam Indians under the United Presbyterian Church, USA. His review reflects a long-standing interest in the problems of language-learning in general, and of the teaching of English in particular.

LETTERS

Appreciation

We read PA from cover to cover as soon as it arrives. We are deeply grateful to Eugene Nida for introducing us to PA and to all who have helped make it what it is. It meets a real need and we would add our voices to the many who say, "If only we knew these things when we first went to the mission field!"

William Stackhouse, New York, N. Y.

Professors Recommend PA

I have enjoyed this publication from the very beginning and am thrilled to hear of its expansion. At present I am teaching two courses in anthropology at the Biola Bible College in Los Angeles. I have been using Dr. Nida's book *Customs and Cultures* and Coon's *A Reader in General Anthropology* as textbooks, plus my copies of PA as part of the outside reading. I teach in the Missions Department and have a good opportunity to reach those students who are majoring in missions.

I will be getting my master's in social science from Long Beach State College in July, where I have been majoring in sociology and anthropology, and plan to continue in graduate work at U.C.L.A. next fall, majoring in anthropology. Having had two years of experience in Cuba in the establishing of our Practical Missionary Training School, I have seen the tremendous need for cultural anthropology.

Robert Owen, Fullerton, Calif.

When I was at the University of North Carolina continuing my graduate work in anthropology, I first became acquainted with your publication. I appreciated it then, and with the recent issues I have come to have a deepened appreciation for it and for the fine work that all of you are doing. The names I have sent are of some of my students this year here at Carver School of Missions and Social Work. I hope to be able to send along additional subscriptions next semester.

Hugh A. Brim, Louisville, Ky.

More of Reyburn

Our interest in Africa is understandably keen. But would it not be profitable to publish more of Reyburn's reports, that is, those he is making to the mission with which he is working? Specifically, on page 161, Vol. 4, No. 5, he refers to his presenting previously "a basic failing in the plans for advanced theological education." I, personally, would give a great deal to get his speech on that previous day.

I am more than ever pleased with PA. I really have nothing in the way of anthropological skills of my own, but PA is just full of seed thoughts and suggestive insights that a little reflection makes useful. Very valuable is the way Reyburn deals in big concepts to set the context for specific events.

Peter Muir, Portuguese West Africa

Eminently Worth While

I appreciate very much what you are trying to do, and, speaking as one who has had six years of missionary experience in West Africa, I would say that this project is eminently worth while.

Warren Woolsey, Houghton, N. Y.

CONTENTS

ARE WE REALLY MONOTHEISTS? 49 EUGENE A. NIDA

SOCIAL ANTHROPOLOGY, CHRISTIAN MISSIONS, AND THE INDIANS OF LATIN AMERICA 55 WILLIAM L. WONDERLY

THE "GOSPEL" COMES TO SAR LUK 65 GEORGES CONDOMINAS

SOME SOCIAL CONSEQUENCES OF MISSIONARY ACTIVITY AMONG SOUTH AFRICAN BANTU 67 BERTRAM HUTCHINSON

PRACTICAL PROBLEMS

Question: Education — Colonial or Tribal Language? 76 ARNI & IRENE SHARESKI

Reply: Present Needs and Future Trends 76 WILLIAM A. SMALLEY

CHRISTIANITY IN CULTURES

The Spiritual, the Material, and the Western Reaction in Africa 78 WILLIAM D. REYBURN

TO SEE OURSELVES

Wisdom which the West Should Learn from the East 84 MU TSUNG-SAN,
HSÜ FU-KUAN,
CARSON CHANG,
AND T'ANG CHÜN-YI

EDITORIAL

Some Questions about Missionary Medicine 90 WILLIAM A. SMALLEY

LETTERS 95

Eugene A. Nida

Are We Really Monotheists?

The Christian doctrine of the Trinity is a puzzling one for missionaries who try to explain it — or understand it, for that matter. In this article Dr. Nida discusses the mental images of the Trinity which we often carry around with us and try to teach to others. The response in those "others," if they are Muslims, should well give us pause and make us stop to consider just what we do say and think.

It usually comes as a surprise to the average missionary in Muslim lands to learn that Christians are consistently accused of being polytheists, not monotheists. To the Muslim, the very idea of God having a son is repugnant, for he immediately thinks in terms of sexual relations, and to associate such with Allah is nothing less than blasphemy. Moreover, the Christian's insistence that Jesus was not only the Son of God but "very God of very God" leaves the Mohammedan all the more convinced that the Christians have no right whatsoever to call themselves monotheists.

Most people set aside the Islamic reaction to Christianity as being based upon ignorance and prejudice. But if they make a serious attempt to study Christians' untutored reactions to the doctrine of the Trinity, they find that the accusation of being basically polytheists seems to adhere tenaciously in the minds of converts, especially those whose Christian experience and training is limited.

Mental Pictures of God

If a missionary dares to approach the problem realistically, he will probably get the shock of his life. If he asks who God is, the answers often cluster about the concepts revealed in such phrases as "the old man in the sky," "the Father in the sky," "the one who made us," etc. When asked about Jesus Christ, the same people will describe many features of His life and presumed appearance, but almost never do they speak of Jesus Christ as being God. In fact, Jesus Christ is more often than not a kind of culture hero, frequently somewhat in opposition to God, but always standing up for the people. The Holy Spirit is often conceived of as just another, and more powerful, benevolent spirit.

Some missionaries are inclined to think that this is more or less the way people should think of God, for in a sense this echoes their own concepts. The image which is the "mental reflex" of the word symbol "God" does exist for many mature Christians as an "old fatherly person in heaven." The Son, if He is not thought of in terms of the historical Jesus, is "a youthful figure at the right hand of the Father." And the Holy Spirit is a kind of nebulous, "foggy" substance that is supposed to be the "Third Person," but just how this is true remains a readily confessed mystery to most persons. Certainly these mental images suggest three separate entities much more than one.

What is more, some Christians tend to add to the Biblical imagery in such a way that the "three persons" are not only separate in form and function, but diverse in apparent purpose. For example, as an explanation of the theological basis of substitutionary atonement, some people say that God the Father insisted that His holiness and righteousness must not be stained by the presence of human sinners. Accordingly, to satisfy the demands of an infinitely holy and righteous God, Jesus Christ volunteered to go to earth to die in man's place, that God could maintain His inviolate character and still admit into His presence sinful mortals. Such explanations do, in a sense, contain a kernel of Biblical truth, but in some ways they introduce more error than valid clarification, for they tend to conform to pagan views about the standoffishness of God and the function of a culture hero (in this case Jesus Christ), not primarily as a mediator, but as a defender against the demands of God. Furthermore, these explanations implicitly contradict the initiative of God in redeeming man (i.e., His being in Christ Jesus reconciling the world to Himself) and His essential mercy and love.

If, as seems well attested by a careful study of believers' mental images, the results of our teaching, not only on the mission fields but also in our own culture, produce more of a sense of three different entities than one God, what are we really to say to our critics who accuse us of being basically polytheists? Of course, our first line of defense (and a justified one) is to insist that we believe in the Trinity (three in one). This is all very well, but when we are asked to explain what we mean, we find we can only repeat a definition. Search as we may, we cannot find any finite symbol which corresponds to our verbal description of the Trinity. Some people have attempted to describe the Trinity as a circle divided into three parts, but to this the theologians object, for they insist that God is not divisible into parts. Others try to explain the Trinity on the analogy of body, soul, and spirit, but this type of trichotomy breaks down immediately. Still others have spoken of Jesus as "God with a face" and the Spirit as "the heart of God." But whatever we attempt to do by way of finding appropriate symbols in our finite experience finally leaves us without any satisfactory analogy. However, in following the Biblical symbols which grant full attributes of personality to all three persons of the Trinity, we almost immediately lead people to conceive of God, Christ, and the Holy Spirit more as three than as one. What, then, are we to do? We can scarcely admit the Muslim contention that we are really polytheists, for we *really* are not. On the other hand, for all *practical* purposes we certainly appear to be polytheists to the devotees of other religions.

If, as is so obviously the case, we tend to give an impression of being polytheists, by virtue of the verbal symbols which we use, what can we do about it? Is there any way of correcting this difficulty? Or must we go on perpetuating the same views and implied errors?

Finite Language and Infinite Faith

I believe that we can, at least in some measure, correct our mental concepts so as to be essentially more in keeping with

God's revelation of Himself. In the first place, however, we must come to grips with the problem of Biblical symbolism, and to do this is not easy, for we are instantly involved in the fundamental problem of revelation and communication. However, if we are willing to do some radical thinking on this problem, we may discover something of what God wants to reveal to us.

In discussing the basic problem of God's communication to man, it seems essential, as a basic axiom, to recognize that infinite truth cannot be absolutely revealed in finite language. This does not mean that human language cannot reveal truth, but by virtue of its being tied to finite cultures (with all their human limitations), it cannot perfectly represent the ultimate reality. Paul speaks of this as "seeing through a glass darkly." This glass not only serves to reveal, but also to hide — and so with language.

In order for God to reveal Himself as a thinking, loving, creative "being," He caused Himself to be spoken of in terms of human experience, e.g., as having hands, a heart, feet, as being a Father, as feeling jealousy, pity, and compassion, as repenting, calling, and leading. God becomes located in heaven, surrounded by angels, seated on a throne and with His Son at His right hand. Many people will dismiss many of these expressions as anthropomorphisms, symbols with a nonliteralist significance. But just how far do most people go in this process of assigning Biblical figures to the status of anthropomorphic symbols? Some will say that God does not have hands and feet, and yet they cannot dismiss the concept of a throne in heaven. Others will eliminate a literal throne, but not the surrounding angels. All of these figures, however, are made even more puzzling to the average person by Jesus' statement, "God is a spirit." Does the recognition of God as a spirit completely invalidate all the other symbols? Should we accordingly cast them all out as primitive modes of perception? Frankly, I do not think so, despite what some theologians, such as Bultmann and Tillich, would advocate. God's revelation of Himself in the Scriptures does not hesitate to use such figures, and why should we? Furthermore, there is no evidence that we can come any closer to the truth by rejecting such symbols — the only means by which human language can describe nonhuman realities. Nevertheless, all this seems to imply a contradiction, for we have argued that these figures lead to a misconception as to the person of God, while at the same time the requirements of human language necessitate the use of such figures. Is there any solution to the apparently irreconcilable dilemma?

Revelation of God's Activity

The solution to the basic difficulty seems to lie in the recognition that *all* these anthropomorphic figures refer not to God's person, but to His activity. The Bible is filled with the revelation of an acting, creative, speaking, revealing God. In so far as we know God, it is *only* on the basis of what He has done. Even in the case of Jesus Christ we have no authentic description of what He looked like, but we have abundant information as to what He did. All this is in direct contrast to the gods of the pagans, who are always described in vivid detail.

If, however, we are to keep people from substituting a Christian "threesome" for a pagan trio, we must interpret the Biblical figures in terms of functions and not form. Since the Scriptures do not explicitly indicate the real nature of God, in terms of substance or form (evidently a fact not communicable in human language), we should be thoroughly Biblical by not presuming to know more than God has chosen to reveal. This means that we must emphasize the essentially functional character of Biblical metaphors and symbols. This approach toward Biblical symbolism may seem a little strange at first, but it squares with the requirements of any linguistic expression and the evidence of the Scriptures. "At God's right hand" is then only a symbol of a functional relationship, i.e., "in closest and honored union with." The "throne" is a functional symbol of governing, and God's jealousy, pity, and compassion are aspects of His breaking through to man in "redeeming love." (Here, as so often, we can only explain one functional figure by another.)

The recognition of (1) the essentially symbolic character of all words (whether so-called concrete terms such as "hands," "feet," and "throne," or the more abstract expressions such as "love," "pity," and "mercy"), and (2) the special functional significance which they have in the Scriptures can go a long way toward helping people avoid the error of being "polytheists." Though we cannot find Biblical symbols which "picture" the unity of God, Jesus Christ, and the Holy Spirit, we do find abundant evidence of the identity of function. Even Jesus, in His statement of His oneness with the Father, made this relationship explicit by indicating that whatsoever the Father did, He did likewise. Even the believer's being in Christ and Christ in the believer is primarily a relationship of function, not of form or space. Certainly, when Jesus insisted that "he who has seen me has seen the Father," he evidently was not referring to bodily, but to functional identity.

Temptation to Literalism

It is not difficult to explain the fact that people consistently tend to misread the intent of Scriptures in assuming the literal interpretation of symbols referring to form. This tendency exists in all peoples. In the first place, form symbols are more readily picturable by the mind than function symbols. For example, the mental image induced by "throne" is more readily elicited than one corresponding to "govern," or "rule." In terms of Gestalt psychology, we could say that the so-called form symbol offers greater figure contrast in comparison with the "ground." Function symbols, on the other hand, usually involve "eventing" and the movements against the ground provide less impressionable figures.

Most people, however, are not content with merely ideational symbols; they demand objectifications of these in art forms. This development has taken place in Christianity, particularly in Roman Catholicism, but is increasingly a factor in Protestantism. However, not only does the objective image take the place of the mental image (standing for some historical object or event, e.g., the Virgin Mary), but not infrequently the object itself gives rise to a new series of mental images which for many people are completely divorced from the mental image of the historical reality, as in the case of the mother of Jesus, which becomes the Virgin of Guadalupe in Mexico. When an object no longer refers one back to the original referent, but to a new series of mental images, a so-called religious image is no longer psychologically an image, but an idol.

This extreme form of "literalism" in

formal symbols (by which images become idols) is completely parallel to the psychological tendency to be literalistic in interpreting all types of figures. Formal figures always seem so much more real than functional ones. We can see them more readily with "the eyes of the mind." Therefore we give prominence to formal symbols and we tend to describe functions in terms of forms, e.g., governing in terms of thrones, power in terms of "a strong right arm," and recompense in terms of "crowns" or "fire." In keeping with this basic psychological characteristic of mankind, God has revealed Himself in just such meaningful figures, for they reveal truths (certainly to the vast majority of people) which no amount of abstract terminology could ever make known. Such symbols are certainly not untrue, but if they are interpreted by people without due recognition of their true symbolic character, they may give rise to weird theologies.

The Approach to the Muslim

But now we return to the Mohammedan objection that we are polytheists, not monotheists. First, we must admit that our chances of convincing a Muslim are very slim, for all his canons of interpretation of the Koran are essentially literalist, formal, not functional, which is no doubt the way Mohammed meant his words. However, if we do wish to try to explain to a Mohammedan what is meant by the Christian doctrine of the Trinity, we must say at the very start that the Bible contains neither a description nor an explanation of the Trinity. The identity which we find in Scripture is one of motivation and action, not of spatial diffusion or isolability. The mystery of the real essence of God will remain a mystery, for evidently though we may formulate a word symbol (Trinity), we cannot really explain in finite categories what it means. We can, however, explain what God has done within the stream of human history, and this is the really relevant set of facts which faces man.

This approach may seem to be essentially obscurantist, since it appears to deny the knowability of certain realities. However, rather than being either obscurantist or agnostic (as others might charge), this orientation takes a realistic view of the limitations of human languages as systems for symbolizing humanly perceptible "events." Moreover, this procedure of dealing with symbols recognizes the priority of form symbols and the fundamental psychological tendencies in the shift from function to form and the literalist apprehension of form symbols.

The missionary who discovers that the new believers have a "warped" literalist understanding of form symbols should accordingly not be surprised, for this has been the tendency throughout the history of Christendom, as well as in other religious systems. For example, the function symbol of "faith" (in the Biblical sense of active commitment and trust) was soon changed to mean the specific "objects" of faith, namely, the formulated doctrines. Likewise the "word," especially as "the word of God," gradually lost its meaning of "self-revealing act of Deity" and became only a synonym for the Bible. In the Johannine discourse on the sacramental nature of partaking of Christ's body and blood, there was the obvious tendency for the audience to think in literalist terms, and for this reason the discourse is concluded by a statement designed to relegate the form symbols to their proper functional status: "It is the spirit that gives life, the flesh is of no avail; the words that I have spoken to you are spirit and life."[1]

Necessity of Form Symbols

In view of the inherent dangers involved in the use of form symbols, one might justly ask as to whether we should attempt to avoid such symbols altogether and use only function symbols. In the first place, however, we cannot make any clear-cut distinction between form and function symbols, for even function symbols almost always provide the mind with a "figure and ground" from which certain more or less definite forms may be isolable. For example, for the symbol "repentance" there may soon grow up a widely distributed "mental image" (a culturally shared form symbol) of a man beating his breast in contrition of heart, as in the parable of the Publican and the Pharisee. Accordingly, even if we tried to choose only those symbols which were predominantly functional in character, we would have no guarantee that they would remain so. The history of the images in Roman Catholicism, the icons in the Orthodox Church, and the idols in Buddhism are abundant evidence of what almost inevitably happens to symbols.

In the second place, we would not wish to avoid form symbols, even if we could, for they are important means of communication. They were certainly used by Jesus in His teaching — and by every great teacher. However, what is of singular interest in the case of Jesus is His constant emphasis upon the functional character of the forms. His parables tell of events and happenings; they are rarely static images. Even when Jesus spoke of Himself as a "door," "bread," or "water," He had reference to function, not form. Here, then, lies the key to our use of symbols, namely, the constant emphasis upon their relationship to action, not to concrete figures. This serves to teach their relevance to life and history and keeps them from becoming "idols," whether of wood or of words.

If we are to be thoroughly honest about the allegation of our being polytheists, we are obliged to say that in the thinking of many Christians the word symbols by which the Trinity has been revealed have become so identified with isolable and isolated forms that on the level of this symbolism such people are polytheists. This is especially so if they associate any differences of motivation with various persons of the Godhead. However, on the level of the functional character of such symbols there is complete identity, and here lies the valid basis for our claim to monotheism.

---

[1] John 6: 63.

William L. Wonderly

Social Anthropology, Christian Missions, and the Indians of Latin America

Mexico has been in the vanguard, among the nations of the American continent, with respect to the application of the principles of social anthropology in the secular fields to the problems of indigenous or Indian groups. The present article attempts to summarize for English readers some of the major bases of this movement as it is being carried forward by Mexican social anthropologists of today. It then points out certain of the principles of the movement which are of special significance for the work of Christian missions among the Indian groups of Latin America, and certain points at which the movement, due to its commitment to a secular approach, needs to be supplemented by the development of a parallel Christian movement by groups who can come to closer grips with the specifically religious anxieties of the Indian peoples.

ONE of the outstanding names among the *indigenistas*[1] of Mexico is that of Dr. Alfonso Caso, director since 1949 of the Instituto Nacional Indigenista and a distinguished scholar in Middle American archaeology, anthropology, and other fields. His recent book (in Spanish) entitled *Indigenismo*[2] is a collection of twenty articles and lectures, mostly published elsewhere, which have the purpose that is stated on the back cover: that of "explaining, in the simplest possible terms, the theory upon which the *indigenista* action in Mexico is based and the results which have been obtained from it."[3]

In the first chapter of the book,[4] Caso attempts to define who and what are to be considered as Indian. He uses a combination of four criteria: biological, cultural, linguistic, and psychological. The first three are objective and accessible to the outsider; the fourth, the sense of belonging to an Indian community, is subjective and less amenable to outside investigation, but is the most important from the Indian's own point of view. Caso's primary definition is therefore a definition of the INDIAN COMMUNITY; his definition of the individual Indian is in relation to that community. We give the following translation of his definition:

---

[1] The Spanish term *indigenismo* is frequently translated as "Indianism" and *indigenista* as "Indianist" or "Indian." These translations, however, seem to be quite inept, inasmuch as the English words are not normally used in the same sense as the Spanish terms. Dr. Gonzalo Aguirre Beltrán, in his significant treatment of "Indigenismo y mestizaje" (*Cuadernos Americanos* 15.4, July-August 1956, pp. 35-51), uses *indigenismo* in contrast with *indianismo*, which further complicates the translational difficulties. In the present article we shall regretfully use the terms *indigenismo* and *indigenista* in their Spanish form, without attempting an English equivalent.

[2] Alfonso Caso, *Indigenismo*. Instituto Nacional Indigenista, México, D. F., 1958. Pp. 159; 19 plates. 12.00 Pesos Mex.

[3] All quotations from Caso's book in this article are our own translation. A number in parentheses following the quotation will identify the page in the original.

[4] The book itself, consisting as it does of separate materials published elsewhere, has a great deal of repetition; many of the chapters or articles develop in brief and interesting fashion an overall view of *indigenismo* or of certain of its aspects, but the progression from chapter to chapter is not worked out as it would be if the book had been written as a unit. Hence our presentation will not follow the order of the book's contents, but will attempt to give the materials in a somewhat rearranged form for the sake of continuity.

> An Indian is a person who feels that he belongs to an Indian community; and an Indian community is one in which non-European somatic elements predominate, which speaks and prefers an Indian language, which has a large proportion of Indian elements in its material and spiritual culture and, lastly, which possesses a social feeling of being an isolated community among the other communities that surround it, resulting in its considering itself as different from both white and mestizo[5] peoples (pp. 15-16).

Caso insists that the Indian problem be recognized for what it is, and reminds us of the cultural isolation of the Indian groups, especially those who are monolingual:

> The Indian problem is for Mexico a fundamental one, since 1 inhabitant out of 5 is Indian as to his culture and way of life, 3 out of 20 speak Indian languages, and 1 out of 13 speaks only an Indian language[6] and therefore lives outside the culture of Mexico and the Mexican community (21).

The orientation with respect to the Indian community as a whole rather than the individual alone is an important principle, which is discussed again and again in the book. But just as the individual is not to be considered apart from his community, so the Indian community needs to be treated as part of a larger context, the INDIAN REGION, which includes both the Indian communities and the mestizo town or city with which these are in a symbiotic relationship.

> ... We now speak not merely of Indian communities, but of INDIAN REGIONS; that is, of more or less extensive regions that are characterized by being made up of numerous Indian or Indian-mestizo communities which depend economically, culturally, socially and politically upon a mestizo city, which we call the METROPOLIS of the Indian region in question.
>
> This is the case, for example, with Tlaxiaco, in relation to the surrounding region of the High Mixteco, in the State of Oaxaca; and with San Cristóbal Las Casas and the Tzeltal-Tzotzil region in the State of Chiapas. . . .
>
> On the other hand, the Indian communities themselves have a decided influence upon the METROPOLIS, giving it a character which distinguishes it from other mestizo cities of the country. Thus there is an interaction from every point of view. We may say that the METROPOLIS of a region would be unable to live without its surrounding communities, from which it gets raw materials for its sustenance, for its commerce, and for its local industries (usually carried on by small artisans); and

---

[5] Since the Spanish word *mestizo* has already crept into our English language and dictionaries, we use it. It should be kept in mind that it means "mixed," and is used to refer to the mixture of Indian and Spanish in both the biological and the cultural sense.

[6] On page 52 he says that 1 out of 20 speaks an Indian language only.

> that the Indian communities themselves would be unable to live without the METROPOLIS, where they must go to exchange their surplus domestic produce for objects which they do not themselves produce but which they consume . . . (76-77).

The character of the metropolis, or mestizo center of an Indian region, is thus influenced by its long and intimate contact with the Indian communities, who have contributed to the mestizo population many aspects of their world view, religious outlook, folk medicine, and so on; and whom the mestizos have at the same time looked upon as an inferior group that is to be exploited for their benefit. Hence any valid approach to the Indian community must also take the mestizo center into active consideration.

Cultural Equilibrium and Acculturation

In a chapter on "Culture and Acculturation," Caso defines culture in the anthropological sense, discusses the various categories of material and spiritual culture, explains acculturation as meaning the transformation of a backward community through contact with the dominant cultural group. He points out that in this transformation the social anthropologist should be called upon to help plan and direct the acculturation process so as to avoid the disorganization of the weaker community and its exploitation by the stronger community.

He insists upon the INTEGRAL CHARACTER and the EQUILIBRIUM of the Indian culture, and the importance of an overall approach to the guidance of the acculturation process.

> We consider it to be impossible to transform a community if only one of the aspects of its life is changed; for we believe that the Indian communities have their own culture, and that every culture is an equilibrium in which one cannot change a given aspect without the other, unchanged, aspects of culture feeling the effect of the action on the one hand, and on the other hand acting as a brake to retard the proposed change. One cannot, for example, change the economy of a community without taking into account its taboos, its ideas of social prestige, and the ways by which it incorporates its children into the community. For this reason the policy which the Instituto Nacional Indigenista has chosen to follow is what may be called an INTEGRAL POLICY — that is, we study and modify the economic aspect and the social organization, and endeavor to accelerate, through public health, education and road construction, the incorporation of the community into the political and cultural life of the nation (65-66).

As we shall discuss below, however, one of the most important of the aspects which serve to integrate an Indian culture is the religious aspect; and it is difficult for us to agree that any approach to acculturation can, in the full sense of the word, be termed an "integral" policy so long as it concerns itself with the transformation of communities "in their economic, hygienic, educational, and political aspects" (35) but does not squarely face the full religious implications of these aspects of the culture change. This statement is not intended as a negative criticism of the *indigenista* movement, but rather as an indication of wherein lie some of its limitations.

Protection and Help, not Charity

On the matter of official Indian policy, Caso emphasizes time and again the need and justification for protective laws for the benefit of the Indian, rather than simply considering him as having equal rights with others and as being capable of defending these rights. Just as minors, women, and the physically handicapped are possessed of certain biological limitations which prevent them from holding their own as equals with the rest of the population, so the Indian is socially handicapped and needs the protection of special laws. He is the equal of any other member of the human family as far as his racial heritage goes, but is in a position of real inferiority socially, culturally, and economically; therefore to make him the object of supposedly equal treatment for all men is to take an unrealistic attitude toward him and to actually make him the victim of discrimination. Hence the need for protection and aid, not merely for theoretical equality before the law.

But Caso insists that such protective laws, and Indian policies in general, should not be such as to keep the Indian in a perpetual state of inferiority, but that "the Indian communities should be given all the hygienic and cultural elements necessary to speed up their transformation and to bring them into step with the progress of the rest of the communities in the country" (40). In other words, the Indian communities are not to be helped or protected as if they were indigent groups in need of charity, but are to be given such technical aid as will enable them to become true participants in the culture of the nation.

The Indian is to be helped by giving him education as to hygiene, medicine, agricultural techniques, etc.; he is to be given means of communication so as to market his products; he is to be given opportunity, through radio, moving pictures, and other media, to realize that he is part of a larger world and is no longer isolated. But all this must be done in a way that will avoid such a conflict between the Indian culture and modern culture as would disrupt the Indian culture.

> For these reasons, any government action undertaken to better the condition of the Indians of our countries should be based on recommendations made by anthropologists; inasmuch as it is impossible to change one aspect of a culture without at the same time producing an impact upon all other aspects. One cannot, for example, change the economy of a community without at the same time affecting the family and social organization, the attitude of the individual toward his family and his community, and even his concept of life itself (54).

Among the positive values of the Indian culture that are to be conserved wherever possible, special mention is made of the Indian's sense of community solidarity and of responsibility for mutual help within his group, which is a feature that can be a valuable contribution to the national life as the Indian communities become interrelated with it. Emphasis is also placed upon the artistic sense of many of the Indian groups, and the popular art that is produced by them and which should be encouraged. Four chapters of the book are devoted to various aspects of popular art in Mexico, with special reference to the Indian's contribution to it and to ways of protecting and encouraging it.

The Indigenista Movement in Mexico

In one of the chapters, Caso points out that the "social transformation that is taking place in Mexico today, . . . starting with the Revolution which began in 1910, has manifested itself in every sphere: economic, political, social and cultural" (85). He then relates to this historical development the "experiment in social anthropology" (85) that is being conducted by the Instituto Nacional Indigenista, which was established in 1948 and which has been carrying out extensive pilot projects in five regions (the Tzeltal-Tzotzil, Mazateco, Tarahumara, and two Mixteco regions). In these projects, three basic policies are observed (90): use of demonstration rather than compulsion; enlistment of the cooperation of at least part of the community prior to carrying out any action; and the use of bilingual Indians as employees and PROMOTERS to carry the action to the people and to promote cultural change.

The projects of the Institute include the promotion of economic change through securing of land, teaching of new agricultural techniques, use of better seed, crop rotation, forest conservation and use, establishment of cooperative stores, etc. They include work in public health and hygiene, and in literacy and the teaching of Spanish. With reference to religion, the approach is definitely secular; Caso indicates the policy toward religion when that it is preferable

> . . . not to persecute the individual who makes offerings to the gods of the mountains or to the saints so that it may rain and so he may cultivate his maize, but to construct dams and irrigation ditches which will make constant watering possible, as a better way than that of prayers and offerings (81).

These various activities are directed toward the region as a whole and the culture as a whole:

> The mission undertaken by the Institute is regional and integral. It is regional because it attacks not just the problems of one community, but extends to the problems of an entire region that shares a language and other cultural features, and includes in its radius of action the mestizo city as well, which we call the METROPOLIS of the region. . . . Our action is integral because it has to do with all the aspects of the culture of the community (90).
>
> . . . The clear and definite purpose that we have undertaken is that of accelerating the development of the Indian community so as to integrate it as early as possible with the economic, cultural and political life of Mexico, but without producing disorganization in the community itself. That is, our purpose is to speed up the change, which is inevitable anyway, that will lead to the transformation of the Indian community into a Mexican peasant community, and of the Indian region into a Mexican region with all the characteristics of the other regions of the country. Of course this does not mean an attempt to destroy the positive aspects that remain in the Indian cultures, such as the solidarity of the Indian with respect to his community, the use of certain regional costumes, the production of artistic objects, etc.; . . . but it is useless to conserve outmoded ideas regarding the causes of natural phenomena and the means of utilizing the forces of nature; it is both useless and injurious to conserve the old ideas of the causes and cures of sickness, or to perpetuate backward and unscientific techniques of exploiting land and forest resources, of animal husbandry, etc. (77-78).

Use of Indian Languages in Education

With reference to the use of the Indian languages in the program of the Institute, Caso writes, without much elaboration:

> In matters of education, our Indian promoters teach the children to read in their own language, as a step toward teaching them to speak, read, and write in Spanish (92).

This of course follows the pedagogical principle of beginning with the known before proceeding to the unknown; i.e. the learner is taught to read in a language that he already knows, and then his knowledge of reading helps him to go on to the learning of Spanish.

However, in the program of most *indigenistas* the teaching to read in the Indian language appears to be thought of as almost solely for this purpose of bridging the gap to Spanish. Very little basic education seems to be carried on in the Indian languages; as soon as the pupil learns to read his own language and then to read Spanish, he is expected to acquire the rest of his education in Spanish. This of course appears in keeping with the overall goal of bringing the Indian into effective contact with the cultural life of the nation, whose chief linguistic vehicle is Spanish. Yet there are two major difficulties which we may mention here, that are not discussed by Caso. (1) The Indian who learns to read Spanish at this early stage is unable to read it with comprehension unless he is already highly bilingual; reading in Spanish therefore becomes a feat whereby the Indian acquires a bit of added prestige, but does not become a tool whereby he can acquire significant information. (2) Even for the bilingual Indian who does learn to read with comprehension, reading materials in the type of Spanish with which he is familiar are sadly lacking. Very few Indians who are literate in Spanish continue as readers after they leave school.

Without belittling the importance of the use of Spanish, it would seem that somewhat more of the basic education program should be carried on in the Indian language, as soon as the initial hurdle of learning to read in the language is passed. By so doing, reading can immediately become a means of acquiring information, thus making it an activity which is satisfying and relevant to life. And the basic information thus acquired should lead to an earlier participation of the Indian in at least certain aspects of the national culture. In terms of the work of Christian missions, it is of course especially important that the message be communicated in a form that will be intelligible to individuals within their linguistic background as well as their cultural background.

Significance of Indigenismo for Christian Missions

Many aspects of the *indigenista* movement are highly significant in relation to the development of evangelical Christianity among the Indians of Latin America. In a country where there exists this movement to effectively relate the Indian communities to the life of the nation, an obvious corollary is the responsibility for the churches and missions to relate the evangelical Indian congregations to the life of the evangelical church in its national character. If this is not done, the Indian may upon conversion end up as culturally isolated both from his community and from the nation. But just as in all other aspects of the culture the integration process needs to be carried forward, as Caso emphasizes, without disruption of the existing cultural pattern and loss of the positive values in the Indian cultures, so also in the church this integration needs to be accomplished without the cultural disorganization that will result if the Indian congregations are forced into the Procrustean mold of outward conformity to mestizo church patterns.

A significant experiment in integration is now being conducted among the Chol Indian churches of the National Presbyterian Church of Mexico, in which the Chiapas Presbytery has formed a "Chol Institute of Coordination," whereby the elders of the organized Chol churches compose a body authorized to discuss and decide on problems of local nature which do not involve the Presbytery as a whole. For example, cases have arisen regarding marriage of two people who although unrelated have the same surname — a matter that would hardly even be recognized as a problem if brought before the mestizo Presbytery, but which is a very real problem for Indians who carry this prohibition over from an earlier practice of clan exogamy. The Indian coordinating group may also handle problems of how to dispose of the maize received in the harvest offerings, or of how to carry on Christmas and Easter celebrations in a way which, while Christian, will still meet the cultural needs formerly met by semi-pagan *fiestas*. Although it is still too early to evaluate the success of this experiment, this kind of an attempt, within the organizational structure of a national church organization, to provide a way for Indian groups to work out their own special problems would seem to be highly significant.

Caso's concept of the Indian region as a whole, with its mestizo center, has implications that are of great importance for the development of the church in such regions. The writer of the present article spent a number of years in the mestizo-Indian town which serves as a center for part of the Zoque region in Chiapas. He now feels, in retrospect, that one basic reason why no effective evangelical witness resulted from his work there, either among Indians or mestizos, is that almost all his efforts were directed toward the Indian people in isolation. He failed to realize the importance of the interrelationship between the Indian and mestizo people, to whom the former look for much of their leadership and who are the ones through whom the Indians expect cultural innovations to enter the region. (In support of this thesis, it may be said that during the same period the Seventh Day Adventists were successfully developing a work which did include the region as a whole, beginning with Spanish-speaking nuclei and embracing both mestizos and Indians indiscriminately).

The recognition of the Indian community as forming part of the larger mestizo-Indian region has a significant bearing upon the missionary's concept of the indigenous church. Most Indian groups are at some stage or other in the process of becoming peasant groups — i.e. they are no longer primitives living in complete cultural isolation, but are people who, although they conserve basically their own way of life, exist against a background of the mestizo culture and the urban way of life that they know exists "out there." They recognize the outside culture as having certain values to which either they or their children should aspire, and they seek to find points of contact between their own group and the mestizo group. To the degree to which this is true for a given community, the indigenous church goal should not be an isolated Indian church. If the church in an Indian community is to be really indigenous (that is, if it is to truly "belong" in the community), it should in such cases function against a background of the evangelical church in its national character to a degree comparable to that in which the community in general functions against the background of the national scene as a whole. This of course does not mean absorption of the Indian church by the national church to the point that the former loses its identity; but it does mean that the Indian church should be so organized as to be constructively related to the national church. To effect such a relationship will not always be the easiest way of organizing a church; it may involve tensions and problems of leadership personnel and of organizational patterns. But it is important that such problems be faced realistically and not with what Caso terms an "erroneous attitude [of] a false and romantic *indigenismo* [which] considers that it is best to leave the Indians alone and isolated" (100).

A further significance of Caso's concept of the Indian region with its mestizo center is that the evangelical church in the center needs an educational program that will help its own constituency to understand the problems of the Indian churches in the region. The church in the center needs to cease thinking of Indians as second-class brethren and learn to appreciate the Indian culture and the positive values it can bring to the church as a whole. It then needs to seek ways in which it can help in integrating the Indian churches with the national church life, while at the same time maintaining the cultural integrity of the Indian groups and giving them the effective content of the gospel message by using, wherever necessary, the native language for the proclamation and teaching of the Christian message. No project of Christian work among an Indian group can be said to have been adequately undertaken until these aspects of the problems are squarely faced.

There also exists a need for communicating these concepts to the wider protestant constituency in Latin America, and especially to the leaders of the evangelical movement who are responsible for guiding the development of the national churches in their relationships with the Indian groups. Caso's book itself sets an instructive example of a scholar's endeavors, through lectures and journal and magazine articles, to "sell" the generally educated public on the importance of an anthropological approach and to communicate to them something of its basic principles. Similar efforts need to be made to communicate, to the general protestant constituency, the basic principles of social anthropology as applied from a Christian standpoint to the problems of the Indian groups.

Need for a Christian Indigenismo

As mentioned earlier, *indigenismo* as it is being developed at present in Mexico is committed to a secular approach. This is in part due to the ideologies of the men who are developing it, and is justifiable on the official level because the organizations concerned are connected with a government which, under its national constitution, does not and cannot maintain any connection with religious organizations or movements. But whatever may be the reasons and justification for a secular approach, the fact remains that the Indian outlook on life is not secular but religious. Agriculture, medicine, social organization — all are permeated with religious attitudes; and any attempt to guide acculturation without taking these into consideration is seriously hampered from the outset. It is hardly accurate to say that such an effort "has to do with all the aspects of the culture of the community" (90).

Furthermore, religion is one of the major stabilizing factors in the maintenance of a cultural equilibrium and of the integral quality of an Indian culture. Granted that our western culture, toward which acculturation is directed, is highly secularized; but the Mexican peasant way of life toward which the Indian groups are actually moving is much less secularized than is our urban culture. The Indian in process of culture change needs, perhaps more than ever before, a faith which will enable him to meet the changing situation and around which he can build his new way of life without the moral chaos and social disintegration that can result if he loses faith in his old beliefs but remains unable to cope with the new anxieties that accompany what we call civilization.

Of course we are not hereby suggesting that the government-sponsored agencies, which in Mexico and some other Latin-American countries, even as in the U.S.A., are committed to separation of church and state, try to direct the religious acculturation of the Indian communities. What we are trying to say is (1) that there does exist a process of religious acculturation which, due to the very cultural equilibrium that Caso mentions, inevitably accompanies the changes that take place in other aspects of the culture; (2) that if left unattended this process may lead to loss of confidence in the old values and failure to discover new ones; and (3) that in order to avoid this creation of a moral and religious vacuum it is important that other agencies, which are specifically committed to a religious approach, develop an *indigenismo* that can supplement in a positive way what is being done in the secular field. Such a Christian *indigenismo* need not be in competition with the secular agencies, nor should it get involved politically. Its purpose should be to make the Biblical message relevant in terms of the changing Indian culture, and thereby to give a spiritual basis to the new way of life that the older religion, geared as it is to the older technologies and forms of social organization, is incapable of giving.[7]

A Christian *indigenismo* will seek to discover those aspects of the Biblical message which most directly relate to the anxieties of the Indian group and to the tensions that are created by the process of change. It will endeavor to find the most effective ways of communicating this message, whether by the use of the Indian language or by the cultivation of Christian practices to replace pagan ones; and in either case it will be concerned to put into the message such content as will be meaningful in terms of the cultural situation.

This orientation in Christian work will

---

[7] Manning Nash (*Machine Age Maya: The Industrialization of a Guatemalan Community;* American Anthropologist Memoir 87, 1958) found that in the industrialization of a Quiché Indian community the people have compartmentalized their thinking, maintaining their older religious practices (with some modification) with respect to their agriculture and family life but not effectively relating their religion to their factory experiences or their labor union organizations. He suggests that the basic religious attitudes have been left unchanged by the advent of the textile factory, but thinks the lack of change may be at least partly because the factory is institutionalized and beyond the immediate control of the Indian, who works as an employee but bears no responsibility for the management of the industry. Hence the situation described by Nash is not entirely parallel to the introduction of modern technologies into the average Indian community.

also give due recognition to the fact that, in many of the Indian groups, the younger generation's ambitions and outlook upon life are no longer limited to the horizons known to their elders. The recognition of this fact will call for the preparation of Christian Indian leaders who not only are oriented toward the Indian cultural background but who are also equipped to face those aspects of the modern world that are even now affecting the life of the young people in their churches. This ability of the Christian leaders to face both ways, as it were, is an especially important qualification in situations where a church has become established and the children of the originally converted group are growing up as "second-generation Christians."

Although there is still much to be desired and much left to accomplish, we believe Caso to be correct when he affirms that "Mexico can be justly cited as the country that has made the greatest effort to solve its Indian problem" (21). But the very fact that this is true in the secular sphere makes it incumbent upon the churches of Mexico to bring their own country's progress to bear upon the problems of the Indian groups for whose spiritual welfare they are responsible, and thereby to help in the establishment of patterns for church development among Indians elsewhere in Latin America as well. In other Latin American countries there is also progress in *indigenismo*, and in each situation the churches and missionary organizations should recognize their responsibility (1) to relate these developments to the growth of the Indian churches and the meaningful proclamation of the Biblical message and (2) to help the Indian groups maintain, in the face of cultural change, a sense of direction and spiritual stability which is necessarily outside the domain of the secular *indigenista* movement, due to the very nature of the latter.[8]

---

[8] Since this paper was written, there has come to the writer's attention a brief but informative report in English on the work of the Instituto Nacional Indigenista, in the following two articles: Alfonso Caso, "Ideals of an Action Program," *Human Organization* 17, Spring 1958, pp. 27-29; and Julio de la Fuente, "Results of an Action Program," ibid., pp. 30-33.

Georges Condominas

The "Gospel" Comes to Sar Luk

Embedded in Georges Condominas' fascinating account of his anthropological research among the Mnong Gar peoples of south Vietnam is the following vivid picture of the preaching visit of a party of Christians in the village of Sar Luk. On page 84 of this issue we begin a new department, TO SEE OURSELVES. As in the article there presented, so here in this description by Condominas, we have a splendid opportunity "to see ourselves as others see us."

At 1:30 in the afternoon there came a tremendous surprise. The son of the pastor at Banmethuot, a young boy about 16 years old, arrived at my house accompanied by a Rhade evangelist and two other Protestants belonging to the Rhade tribe. The boy was taking advantage of the dry season to take a chance on coming as far as this point by bicycle, and from here going on to try to reach Dalat on foot by way of the Mbur Mountain. To kill two birds with one stone, his father had sent along with him the best evangelist in the mission in order to "preach the Gospel" in this valley which had not yet heard it.

The young American did not seem particularly interested in the life of the village and he stayed at my place. That day, however, Truu was in great form and was repaying his debts. He had just given Toong two jars from Djiring, one large one and one small one, in payment for a pig which he had borrowed in order to make a sacrifice for a French official. In honor of the occasion he offered him a drink. Stimulated by the alcohol he made a sacrifice of a white rooster (helped along with a large jar of beer) for me to thank me for the raincoat (an ancient topcoat which I had had waterproofed) which I had given him as a gift. Finally he opened a third jar of beer in honor of the visitors. But none of the strangers, White or Rhade, wanted to taste the alcohol in the jars. I explained to Truu that this is a taboo which their Spirit imposes upon them. He accepted that, but was none the less disappointed. . . .

Finally, in the evening for the first time there was a preaching service, a spectacle of a kind that had never before been seen at Sar Luk. The son of the pastor, tired by his trip, went to bed, but all his companions were gathered at Truu's. I missed the first part of the meeting. But when I arrived at the chief's house, after leaving my guest in his bed, I went in to find

---

Georges Condominas is an outstanding French anthropologist who has worked extensively in Indochina and Africa. The present selection is translated from his *Nous Avons Mangé la Foret* (Paris: Mercure de France, 1957, pp. 183-185), by permission of the publishers. Any of our readers who know French will find this book very readable, well illustrated, and full of human interest as well as sound anthropological observation.

a hut crowded with people. There was not an inhabitant of Sar Luk missing, and what was going on was extraordinary. The evangelist was seated on a mat rolled out on the sleeping bench at the side of the house. He was between the two other Rhade. Before him Truu was seated on a stool placed upon the floor. And all that compact mass of listeners was tightly crowded around them. The scene was brightly lit by the torches fired with resinous wood. The evangelist preached his sermon in Rhade. In effect, he told these Gar, "You still obey spirits which are wicked beings, greedy, demanding sacrifices. As for me, I come to tell you about a good God who demands nothing. He watches over all of us, French people, English people, Vietnamese, Ghams. All believe in him. This God is Ae Die. He created the world and all the creatures that are found in it." Then he began to recite the Biblical story in summary from Genesis to the New Testament, with each episode illustrated by colored pictures which were admired all around.

The unfolding of this tremendous collection of ancient lore to these people who had never heard of it before in itself was something terrific. However, this evening it benefited by Truu's exceptional form, for he elaborated the sacred history he was translating with splendid decorations which increased the sensational character of the event considerably. Since the beginning of the afternoon the chief had drunk from three jars which had been offered successively to Toong, to the anthropologist, and to the Protestant group. At each one of them he had drunk freely and, as he is not a particularly modest individual, the alcohol made him elaborate his speech to demonstrate his abilities. The sermon brought him a way to increase his prestige. Serving as an interpreter he showed the profound knowledge he had of a foreign language which was not known by the majority of the women. More than that, the episodes of this history were unknown to everybody. And what a variety they represented: The creation of the world, the flood, a man swallowed up and vomited by a monster, water covering a whole army, the Son of the Spirit offering a feast to a whole crowd with only a few pieces of bread. . . . In translating he gave the impression of reciting these ancient tales himself, of knowing these astonishing stories thoroughly. The Gar appreciate well-told stories very much, and someone who is capable of telling a sacred narrative in a satisfactory way, even if it is known by everyone, is highly honored, not to speak of an account which no one had heard before! Well, Truu was more and more caught up and like many others, alcohol opened up his gifts of eloquence. This evening the crowd was big and never so attentive. The stories were unknown and extraordinary, and Truu shone as in his very best days. In his mouth the Bible was no longer an ordinary recital but an epic oration. His elegance superbly stimulated by the rice beer cast a beautiful coloring over the exploits of the heroes who were suggested as models by a religion which, so far as the sect which had come today was concerned, forbade the use of any intoxicating beverage.

Such was the first contact of the community of Sar Luk with the religion of White people.

Bertram Hutchinson

Some Social Consequences of Missionary Activity among South African Bantu

The article which follows is the last half of a paper published in AFRICA. *In the first half of the article the author traces the beginnings of missionary work among the Bantu in the early nineteenth century, stressing its initial friendly reception, the development of its patterns of instituting culture change, and its gradual effect on African cultures. In the following section, the author goes on to trace later developments, and the disturbing social changes which resulted from some missionary policies, the final effect being sometimes opposite to what was intended.*

As the real purpose of the missionary became clear, opposition to Christian teaching became widespread. The missionary had never found it easy during the first decades of the 19th century to gain acceptance for the Christian religion. Bantu men enjoyed and were accustomed to argument and discussion. Instead of finding human material readily receptive to his teaching, the missionary (and the itinerant missionary especially) found himself obliged to defend his faith against the reasoned arguments which his Bantu listeners brought against it. Outside the mission stations preaching was very often carried on in the form of a discussion.[1] The Bantu people, said a Wesleyan missionary,

> . . . disputed every inch of ground with us; they were willing to go into inquiry, but we found them very different in that respect from the Hottentots in the Colony, who always receive with implicit credit what is stated to them by their teachers. The Caffres exhibited considerable powers of mind, and were not willing to receive any dogma until it was proved to their satisfaction.[2]

Active Persecution

But this obstacle to Christian teaching was small in comparison with the active steps which a tribe might take to discourage the conversion of one of its members. People who manifested exceptional interest in the new religion were reproached by relatives and friends. They

---

Dr. Bertram Hutchinson is a sociologist, at present director of the Social Sciences Division of the Brazilian Centre of Educational Research. He is author of *Old People in a Modern Australian Community*, as well as of shorter papers. The article is reprinted from *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute*, Vol. 27, No. 2 (April 1957), pp. 167-175, by permission of the International African Institute and of the author.

[1] Methodist Missionary Society *Notices*, Vol. 7, 1832-34, p. 307.

[2] Report from a Select Committee on Aborigines, *Parliamentary Papers*, 1836, Vol. 7 (538), p. 60.

were accused of deserting their families, of forgetting the traditional life of their own people, of being insane.[3] Some thought that conversion brought dire calamity upon family and tribe:

> Many are well convinced of the (Christian) truths they hear [reported a missionary from Natal in 1856], and approve the same, and would gladly embrace them but for fear of their superstitious countrymen, who seem to think that any departure from national custom would endanger even their national existence. Thus if any particular affliction befalls a family — if their cattle die, or even their gardens are unproductive, the doctor is called for: he may decide by stating, "Utongo (the family god) is angry because such a one is turning English"; he is therefore warned of his danger, in which the whole family is concerned, lest all should suffer by some serious calamity.[4]

Similarly the Pondo people, whose chiefs offered no resistance to missionary activity, for many years looked upon Christianity as a destructive and dangerous innovation.[5] By the turn of the century Christian converts in general were "frequently despised as degenerates and apostates, who have lost all the reverence for tribal authority."[6] In consequence of the antagonism of the tribe towards them, those who wished for any reason to identify themselves with the Christian religion found it easier to live apart from the tribe, either on the mission stations or in communities which they, with other converts, set up for themselves. This had serious consequences for the cohesion of Bantu life, for it emphasized the cleavage of the tribe into seemingly irreconcilable parts. Tribal persecution of converts had become so severe in 1844 that in that year a group of missionaries petitioned the Governor of the Cape Colony to extend his protection to converts in the territory of Kaffraria. While some chiefs "acted on the most enlightened principles of religious toleration," the violence of others was discouraging converts from making known their convictions, and from going to the mission stations.[7] Even when the missionaries enjoyed the approval of the chiefs themselves (as, for example, Moshesh in Basutoland and Khama in Bechuanaland), commoners, led by tribal elders, sometimes showed a strong resistance to them; and in the case of the Basuto a considerable section of the tribe threatened Moshesh with deposition if he persisted in encouraging Christian innovations.[8] Missionary work was considerably hampered by such open opposition from powerful factions.

In the course of time, community opposition was echoed by many chiefs who had sought and welcomed the missionaries in earlier years. It became apparent to them that Christianity was a threat to the old order, and to themselves who represented it.[9] There was widespread suspicion that missionary effort was deliberately directed towards the undermining of chiefly authority, that Bantu families moved to mission stations in order to organize political opposition to the chief, that missionaries were acting as informers for the colonial government (as, indeed, they often did). Chiefs threatened to kill any of their people who moved to the mission stations;[10] and in 1851 one celebrated chief of the period summed up the matter in the following words:

---

[3] Methodist Missionary Society *Notices*, Vol. 6, 1829-31, p. 371.

[4] Ibid., Vol. 3, 3rd series, 1856, p. 142.

[5] Cape of Good Hope: *Blue Book on Native Affairs*, G. 13 — 1880, p. 162. In modern times the members of the family of a new convert in this tribe continued to dislike his acceptance of Christian teaching: M. Hunter, *Reaction to Conquest*, London, 1936, pp. 353-55.

[6] J. Du Plessis, "The Missionary Situation in South Africa," *International Review of Missions*, Vol. 1, 1912, p. 386.

[7] Correspondence regarding the State of the Kaffir Tribes, *Parliamentary Papers*, 1851, Vol. 38 (424), pp. 240, 502.

[8] J. E. Casalis, *The Basutos*, London, 1861, pp. 90-91; J. D. Hepburn, *Twenty Years in Khama's Country*, London, 1895, p. 125; *Basutoland Records*, Vol. 1, 1839, p. 27.

> I like very much to live with the teachers [i.e. missionaries] if they would not take my people, and give them to the Government; for they are my people. Let these school people pray for me. How is it that the Government takes them to spill blood? How is it that you teachers take them away? Whenever one believes, he goes away from me. Why is it that you call them all to live in one place? Is it God who tells you to do so? I do not like your method of breaking up the kraal. Let the believing Kaffir look to his own countrymen, and not go away, but teach others.[11]

Limited Missionary Influence

It would be mistaken to assume, however, that such expressions of annoyance and foreboding were a reflection of widespread missionary success. Throughout the 19th century Europeans frequently complained that the influence of the missionary was less than had been hoped for. During the first half of the century his influence rarely extended beyond his own immediate district or station,[12] even though it was not unknown for an African to travel some four or five hundred miles to visit a station.[13] Among the Tembu people, where missionaries had enjoyed early success, the easier conditions of life that followed the cessation of warfare, of cattle-raiding, and chiefly tyranny had by 1845 resulted in a falling away in conversions.[14] In some parts of Southern Africa even the small progress that was evident at this time was the outcome of the converts' own enthusiasm rather than of the missionaries' teaching.[15] Successive governors of the Cape Colony, Sir Henry Pottinger in 1847 and Sir Harry Smith in the following year, made pessimistic reports. While they paid tribute to the energy and sincerity of purpose of the missionaries, they saw little advance in conversion to Christianity, and only a limited success in the introduction, by the missionaries, of a desire for European merchandise.[16] A few years later Sir

---

[9] In Kaffraria the mission stations were an especial object of this distrust: see the Report from the Select Committee on Kaffir Tribes, 1851, Vol. 14 (635), para. 2,221.

[10] For example, Methodist Missionary Society *Notices*, Vol. 8, 1835, pp. 187-88.

[11] United Presbyterian Church *Missionary Records*, Vol. 7, 1852, pp. 57-58; cf, G. Brown, *Personal Adventure in South Africa*, London, 1855, pp. 155-56.

[12] Report from a Select Committee on Aborigines, *Parliamentary Papers*, Vol. 7 (538), pp. 363-64; Report from the Select Committee on Kaffir Tribes, loc. cit., paras. 1,051-52.

[13] Report from the Select Committee on Kaffir Tribes, loc. cit., para. 703.

[14] United Brethren *Periodical Accounts*, Vol. 17, 1845, p. 224.

[15] Report from the Select Committee on Kaffir Tribes, loc. cit., para. 3,113.

[16] Correspondence regarding the Establishment of the Settlement of Natal, *Parliamentary Papers*, 1847-48, Vol. 42 (980), p. 490; Correspondence regarding the State of the Kaffir Tribes, *Parliamentary Papers*, 1847-48, Vol. 43 (912), p. 61.

George Clerk, reporting in 1853 on the position in the Orange River Territory, made the tart comment that the effect of the missions seemed to be little more than the growth of a desire for ardent spirits, muskets, and gunpowder. No instance of "real conversion" had come to his notice, and this view had been confirmed by the British Resident in the Territory.[17]

At the mid-century the early optimism of the missionaries and the hopes of the colonists had not, in fact, been fulfilled. Whatever the general sociological effects of Christian teaching, there had been no popular movement to the new religion. Hitherto conversion had been more apparent than real. Although some tribes had accepted, or had even sought, the presence of a missionary among them, and while there had been a steady trickle of Bantu people to the mission stations, yet their motives were by no means always religious, as we have seen.

Basis of Missionary Problems

This comparative failure was due very largely to certain aspects of missionary policy. The socially disruptive effects of Christianity did not arise solely from what may be regarded as the essentials of its philosophy, important though these were. For most Christian missionaries the acceptance of their religion by the Bantu people demanded fundamental changes in their traditional way of living, and the demands which missionaries made upon their converts, and potentially upon chief and tribe, were onerous. It cannot be a matter for surprise if those who agreed to follow the missionaries should seek some material compensation for their psychological discomfort in the form of land and European goods. For there were few aspects of Bantu traditional life which escaped missionary censure. In particular, the main object of missionary assault, the customs of *lobola* and of polygyny, were those which the Bantu were extremely reluctant to change.

Strongly opposed though they were to the traditional forms of Bantu marriage, for long the missionaries were successful in suppressing them only on the mission stations, and there only partially. It was usually a condition of residence on the stations that *lobola* [the marriage payment system] and polygyny be given up, although some missionaries permitted a man to retain the wives he already had, while prohibiting the acquisition of others. It was claimed at the end of the first quarter of the century that by these means polygyny had been entirely banished from Wesleyan stations. Hopes were entertained of the early and complete eradication of the custom from the entire Bantu people.[18] On the other hand, there were other missionaries who saw that it was these very demands, and others like them, which stood in the way of the rapid advance of the Christian faith in South Africa.[19] The whole problem of the admission of polygynists to the church became notorious in the middle of the century on account of the general reaction to the views of Bishop Colenso, who argued that those who already possessed several wives should not in consequence be denied the benefits of Christianity. In doing so he aroused the anger and contempt, not only of a large part of the missionary body, but of Europeans at home and in South Africa who had an interest in such matters. He was blamed as the source of a confusion of thought which the spectacle of acute disagreement among the bearers of the culture might be expected to bring about in the minds of watching Africans. And it seems true that, while Africans were naturally in agreement with the views of Bishop Colenso (in so far as they were aware of them), the influence of Christian values on their lives began at this time to wane rather than increase.[20]

---

[17] Correspondence regarding the Orange River Territory, *Parliamentary* Papers, 1854, Vol. 43 (1758), p. 472. See also the comments of Theophilus Shepstone on the position in Natal during this period: Natal Native Affairs Commission, 1852-53, *Report*, Part 5, p. 84.

[18] Report from the Select Committee on Aborigines, *Parliamentary Papers*, 1837, Vol. 7 (425), p. 169.

[19] United Brethren *Periodical Accounts*, Vol. 12, 1832, p. 285.

Social Problems for Bantu Christians

Many personal and social problems arose for those Bantu people who came under missionary influence, and some of these problems stood in the way of rapid conversion. For example, baptism into the Christian church, involving as it did the "putting away" of all wives but one, was often postponed indefinitely:

> I said to a heathen polygamist [a missionary reported], You have long been under the Christian law, why do you not follow Christianity by receiving baptism? He answered that he observed that many who had done so had driven away their wives and children, like so many things of no value; that although he might live with only one wife, yet he liked the others, and he could not think for a moment of driving away his children. Such is the feeling of most of the natives. . . .[21]

For Bantu men the adoption of monogamy was a considerable sacrifice if they had no children by the first wife. Since great emphasis was placed traditionally upon the continuance of the family line, a Bantu convert whose wife was childless found himself under considerable pressure from tradition to seek another wife to continue his family. In such circumstances even sincere converts were prepared to violate church regulations to the extent of taking another wife; and they would persist in this even when banishment from church and mission station was the penalty.[22] For Bantu women who became converted while their husbands did not, the problem was reversed. In such cases the husband might refuse to release his Christian wife or to dispose of his other wives in order that she herself could continue to live with him without breaking the rule of the church. Not infrequently there were instances of a converted wife deserting her husband and taking her children with her.[23] Since in these circumstances she was not always welcome in the kraal of her father (who legally might be required to return his daughter's *lobola* to his son-in-law), women would turn to the missionaries for assistance, or drifted to the towns where, an ironic outcome of their conversion, they lived adulterously or became prostitutes.

The Function of Lobola

Disturbing to the fabric of the Bantu social order as missionary opposition to polygyny may have been, the effects of the discouragement of *lobola* were probably greater. The discouragement of this custom by the missionaries appears to have arisen from their misapprehension of the function of the marriage payment made by the bridegroom's family to that of the bride. The missionaries, mistakenly applying the categories of their European upbringing, assumed the transaction to be the purchase of a chattel. On the contrary, instead of reducing the responsibilities of husband and wife as a purchase might do, *lobola* increased them, and tended to make marriage more stable. In the first place, the payment of *lobola* indicated the *bona fides* of the bridegroom and his family, and without it no marriage was possible. It also compensated the bride's family for the loss of her presence in their kraal and of her value as a unit of labor. It established resources from which the bride could be supported if the marriage failed and the husband turned her away from his kraal. In a sense it facilitated legal divorce, since the return of the marriage payment to the bridegroom's family effected the annulment of the marriage. Finally, and in a more general sense, the system of marriage payments, being a kin responsibility, served to cement kinship ties through the ramification of the principle of reciprocity. The cessation of marriage payments, or uncertainty regarding them, was therefore an important source of disequilibrium within the structure of traditional Bantu life.

---

[20] Methodist Missionary Society *Notices*, Vol. 4, 3rd series, 1856, pp. 23-24.

[21] A report by the Rev. H. T. Walters, quoted by H. Cotterill (the Bishop of Grahamstown), *On Polygamy amongst Candidates for Baptism*, Grahamstown, 1861, p. 50.

[22] United Brethren *Periodical Accounts*, Vol. 27, 1867, p. 86.

[23] Methodist Missionary Society *Notices*, Vol. 1, 3rd series, 1853, p. 11.

Nevertheless, the missionaries, arguing from the mistaken assumption that *lobola* was wife-purchase, felt that they were obliged to oppose the custom. Their attack upon it, in combination with other social and economic forces of change, began to show its results during the second half of the 19th century. Marriage payments were then no longer an unquestioned and essential part of every marriage. The social results were various. Charles Brownlee, describing the position in Kaffraria in 1881, told the Native Laws and Customs Commission:

> Most if not all the missionary societies have set their faces strongly against the custom of paying cattle for women. In some cases they have succeeded, but in others, though professedly no cattle are paid, presents are made, which amount to the same thing; but a greater evil has arisen in connection with these Christian marriages in which a young man spends on his marriage feast quite as much as would be considered sufficient for an *iḳazi*, or the dowry paid to the wife's relations. No one is benefited by this waste, which if it had not taken place, the proceeds might have been handed over to the girl's relations, and which in case of need would give her or her children a claim on those who received the *iḳazi*.
>
> But on the whole, in regard to these marriages in which no cattle have been paid, there are quite as many if not more separations than in the case of purely native marriages in which cattle have been paid. The exceptions are when the parties are true Christians, and not only persons who may have been brought under the influence or control of native Christians, without themselves being brought under the direct influence of Christianity.[24]

The evidence of Africans to the same commission made it clear that they themselves continued to favor the old system, and many of them gave evidence of the disadvantages they believed to flow from the lack of it. There was evidence of the decline of reciprocity within kinship groups who had given up marriage payments;[25] and one Bantu witness said that he regretted that he had not made a marriage payment for his wife because, as things were, the younger brothers of his wife were continually asking him for cattle. "They come to me," he said, "and quarrel, and it causes bad feeling."[26] Another witness, a father of two married daughters for whom no *lobola* payment had been made (by an arrangement in which he himself had been barely consulted), described his uneasiness as to the outcome of the marriages, because, should the girls be returned to him, he would be obliged to support them without the economic aid of a marriage payment which he would otherwise have had.[27]

---

[24] Cape of Good Hope. Commission on Native Laws and Customs, G. 4 — 1883, *Minutes of Evidence*, Appendix B, p. 34.

The Western Marriage Forms

On the other hand, for many years the Christian form of marriage, which was to take the place of the traditional form, remained an ineffective source of social control. In so far as those who adopted it withdrew from the surveillance of the traditional ways, there is evidence that they did not simultaneously realize to the full the expectations of the Christian church as to their future manner of life. The new form of marriage ceremony, without the moral implications that, for the established Christian, went with it, had a certain popularity from the earlier decades of the century. By 1840, for example, the Fingo people in the Trap Valley had already adopted the ceremony and were wearing European wedding dresses for the occasion.[28] But despite such outward acceptances the problem remained of establishing effective control through the values of the new religion. Some missionaries late in the century found that promiscuity was so great a problem among their converts that they thought it necessary to adopt two forms of Christian marriage. Converts with a "good" reputation were married in church "in a better and prettier way," while if one or other of the parties to the marriage had made "mistakes" in conduct, they were married in the schoolroom or in the missionary's study, in which case the ceremony was little different from a civil marriage.[29] In neither case does the effect on subsequent behavior appear to have been great, and at the turn of the century the Inspector of Native Locations at Barkly West said:

> So long as sufficient money can be scraped together to pay for the finery connected with a church wedding nothing more is required. The contracting parties return to their kraal, and having no check either under their old laws, or socially under ours, they inevitably go wrong. The result is more widespread immorality and a generally lowering effect on the Native. Both men and women are constantly coming to me with complaints of matrimonial troubles and difficulties resulting from these "church" marriages.[30]

From the missionary's viewpoint, however, changes in the form of marriage, the decline of polygyny and of the *lobola* system, though the most important, were only part of the reforms that had to be made in the Bantu way of life. He frowned also upon the traditional sex division of labor which gave to women responsibility for the greater part of both agricultural and domestic work. It was in consequence made obligatory upon male converts that they undertook the heavy manual labor of field and kraal, leaving the women free to care for children and home. As early as the first quarter of the century a Wesleyan missionary claimed that women were already "attending to house duties almost exclusively" and were "entitled to the same meat with their husbands, and permitted to eat out of the same dish."[31] In 1838, Tembu men were said to be willing to perform manual labor which they had formerly considered "the greatest disgrace to engage in."[32]

---

[25] Ibid., paras. 1,637-38.

[26] Ibid., paras. 1,665-66.

[27] Ibid., paras. 1,603-08.

[28] T. Smith, *Memorials*, London, 1848, p. 31.

[29] South African Native Affairs Commission, 1903-05, *Minutes of Evidence*, paras. 4,359-60.

[30] Ibid., Appendix D, p. 39.

Division of Labor

Such changes were not brought about by mere exhortation. Of far greater significance were the changes in agricultural methods which the missionaries did much to introduce. Through direct instruction or example, they introduced the iron hoe, which lightened considerably the work in the fields. They did much to popularize the ox-drawn plow. Because it employed cattle, which women were by tradition forbidden to handle, this had to become a man's responsibility; while the cattle themselves so ennobled the work of the fields that men felt less shame in undertaking it. Men's participation in cultivation was gradually extended from tasks in which cattle were employed to other, formerly menial, tasks, such as weeding. But such changes in the division of labor were part of a general blurring of the former distinction between the functions and characteristics of the sexes. This process continued throughout the 19th century, and among the new developments one was particularly important — a gradual decline in the performance of traditional initiation ceremonies for male adolescents. Most missionaries disapproved of this custom and discouraged it. Yet converts who failed to take part in an initiation ceremony at the time appointed by the tribal authorities never, in traditional terms, attained manhood: they remained social adolescents. The initiation ceremony had not only a sexual significance, although this was important in that it marked the transition to an age-grade in which marriage was possible. It was also the opportunity for the initiate to learn tribal traditions and religious beliefs of which he had hitherto been in ignorance, but which it was necessary for him to know in order that he might play his proper role in the adult life he was about to enter. Tribe and chief together were in consequence strongly opposed to this missionary policy. Girls declared that they would marry none but the initiated.[33] African church workers who were not initiated found that their activities met with much opposition because of it, some being threatened with death.[34] Boys living on mission stations were still being initiated in secret in 1873, their fathers defiantly justifying themselves when discovered.[35] Where the chief was not himself converted to Christianity, his attitude sometimes hardened to the extent of insisting, to the point of violence, upon the initiation of converts.

The consequence of such attacks upon these and other traditional customs was the reinforcement of a process of individualization among the Bantu people which was already being encouraged by other powerful social and economic factors inherent in the contact situation in South Africa. The literature of the period makes it clear that conversion was an important factor in the confusion that was overwhelming personal, familial, and tribal relationships. The effect upon the family was perhaps most significant, for it was from this that much of the individualized behavior sprang.

---

[31] Report from a Select Committee on Aborigines, *Parliamentary Papers,* 1837, Vol. 7 (425), p. 169.

[32] United Brethren *Periodical Accounts,* Vol. 14, 1838, p. 330. Compare the comment made at a later period in the South African Native Affairs Commission *Report,* 1905, para. 276.

[33] J. D. Hepburn, op. cit., p. 125.

[34] J. A. Chambers, *Tiyo Soga: a page of Mission Work,* London, 1878, p. 54.

[35] United Brethren *Periodical Accounts,* Vol. 29, 1873, pp. 22-23.

> The Natives were averse to the mission stations [said a Resident Magistrate in Natal, in 1895], as enticing first their daughters, then their sons, and so severing their families. . . . Some become in that way so severed from their parents as to be homeless, and wander to towns or elsewhere and come to grief; but if they remained at home under entire control of their parents, out of school hours . . . whatever little schooling or industry they learnt would be made good use of. Much misery and trouble is brought on parents by the interference and enticing away of their children, and this has become a general grievance, and to such an extent that in several instances owners of kraals have, in a body, objected most strongly to have a school or teachers located in their vicinity.[36]

Parallel to this schism between parents and children, conversion was responsible for acute differences between husband and wife, when one was converted but the other was not. The kraal was becoming the scene of disagreement, of arguments, of indecision, where authority for patterned behavior was lost.

Cause and Effect

The sociological disorder, of which such confusion in individual behavior was a part, was characteristic of many Bantu communities at the end of the 19th century. Although we have been concerned with the part played by missionary activity in bringing about this position, this was only one among many social and economic forces which were leading to the same conclusion. Among these, the growth of the European industrial economy, and the entry of the Bantu people into this economic nexus, was probably dominant, especially after 1870 and the development of South African mining. The case of missionary influence is singular, however. For in contrast to most of the influences of change to which the Bantu people were subjected, that of the missionary was premeditated. Knowing the social changes he wished for, the missionary worked deliberately to achieve them.

Our material shows how far, during the course of the 19th century, this attempt failed in its real objective. In general, the missionary has envisaged little more than a mass conversion of the Bantu people to the Christian religion, coupled with the suppression of certain customs which he disliked, among them polygyny, the marriage payment system, initiation rites, and the "subjection" of women. While he may have regarded the traditional Bantu manner of life as an inferior one, it was the immediate purpose of the missionary to change it only so far as expediency and consistency made it necessary. The missionary's failure lay, not so much in the slow progress of real Christian conversion, as in his inability to see what is now commonplace, that any social change (and *a fortiori* a change of religion) has its reverberations and repercussions throughout the structure of society. We have seen how many of the changes wrought by the missionary were inadvertent by-products of his desire for religious change. The history of the 19th century missionary activity in South Africa is a history of men struggling with only limited success for the religious and social changes they desired, and watching with consternation an aftermath of their intervention which they did not foresee and could not control.

---

[36] Natal Department Reports, 1894-95, B. 10.

◆

PRACTICAL PROBLEMS

QUESTION

Education: Colonial or Tribal Language?

Arni and Irene Shareski

We are practically being forced in our schools to switch entirely to French. In the new government program it will be required. What should be our attitude? Should we push it hard, too, and give up, gradually, the local Kikongo or should an attempt be made to keep our students well taught in the native language? Of course, it will be another generation or so before any great noticeable change will be seen. But the policies and practices of the mission will greatly affect this change.

REPLY

Present Needs and Future Trends

William A. Smalley

This is indeed a difficult, perplexing situation, but it is typical of developments in many parts of the world. There are several aspects of the problem that might be mentioned. One is that no government policy will ever make the Kikongo people or any people lose their native language, except a policy of scattering those people so that they cannot talk to each other. If they do lose their native language under present conditions, it will not be because of government schools, but because of some other cultural pressure *within* their own society. The government program can well build an educated *élite* of French-speaking people who will know French well as a second language. It will not replace the Kikongo as the mother tongue.

It is inevitable, however, that a mission program has to reckon with the pressure of educated people. This means that education in French will be necessary for church leaders. It is tragic, on the other hand, if the mission program, in recognizing and following such a policy, does it to the exclusion of the native language. I think it would be very shortsighted at this stage to minimize the importance of Kikongo for another two or three generations to come.

There is another aspect to all of this. If the day ever comes when Kikongo people turn in resentment against the colonial power, a group which has fostered the Kikongo language through education (although it has not hindered French and has encouraged French wherever that was practical) would be in an advantageous position.

Frankly, speaking as an anthropologist, I think that the principal thing is to keep your ear close to the ground to determine what the Kikongo people through their leaders really want. Then the second thing is to think also of what the possibilities of communication of the gospel are. If on both of those counts the Kikongo language still stands as winning out, you have, it seems to me, a clear-cut answer. Certainly French will not win out on the one count — that of the communication of the gospel to any but the *élite*. It is possible that the Kikongo people really prefer education in French to education in Kikongo because they might never have seen the value of the latter. In that case the question would be more difficult. Perhaps some of the readers will have observations to make.

CHRISTIANITY IN CULTURES

The Spiritual, the Material, and the Western Reaction in Africa

William D. Reyburn

"My father, an African tribal chief, had six wives and three children. Two were boys and one was a girl. Then one of my mothers gave birth to a son whose hair and skin were very light in color. He was not an albino, but a light colored baby. From the day of his birth it was generally believed in the village that his life was delicately hanging in a balance. He was a weak baby and did not have a loud cry. My father and his brothers all feared for the child's precarious life and sought out which taboos must be kept in order to protect the child's life. The one day an old uncle came to my father and said that he had dreamed that someone killed a goat in my father's house. He added that no one in the family should kill a goat or shed any blood before the new baby should be old enough to walk. The child became sick after several weeks and was taken to a mission hospital. His stool was black and formed like a goat's. Another uncle, a catechist, searched through the Bible trying to find something to do for the child. Then one day an animal was killed in the forest by one member of the family. At the very instant the animal was killed the baby screamed and died."

The above account was related, not by a pagan African with no knowledge of Christianity or civilization, but by a highly educated Christian. Another example cited to me by a college graduate in Africa:

"Mr. —, a well trained gentleman whom you know, was told by his sick wife before she died that if he should remarry after her death she would reappear to him and tell him the name of the girl he should marry. Mr. —'s wife died, as you know, and within a few days Mr. — was sitting alone in his house when suddenly his wife appeared to him and announced in a clear voice the name of the girl she wanted her husband to marry. Mr. — went immediately and made the arrangements and married this girl."

Recently while lecturing to classes of Cameroun college students on the relation of African pagan religious beliefs to Christianity and Islam, I asked them to write out for me at least one mysterious incident which had happened in their lives, and which they felt was totally without rational explanation. These college students had no trouble filling up pages with accounts of personal encounters with the world of mysterious events such as the two cited above.

Integration of the Pagan View

The pagan view of life expressed in most of Africa south of the Sahara does not make a rigid distinction between the religious and the secular life as found in European society. It goes without saying that the pagan African does not make medicine and throw it into the forest expecting to return tomorrow to find a garden growing. His secular world exists in the sense that he reckons with nature with his iron tools in so far as he can. He sharpens his cutlass and hacks down the forest and plants his seeds and does everything he knows to cooperate with nature in the production of his food. In the hunt he uses his highly trained sense of perception in studying animal tracks and moves in to the kill according to the movements of the wind in order to take his prey by surprise. The integration of the religious and the secular is expressed in the way in which the religious feeling for things is carried out in social life and exists to give social relations a sense of the holy. The intrusion of the West into the African's socio-religious life has created a tendency to separate the two into several distinct spheres into what is often called the secularization of African life.

This secularization of African life or the separation of religious sanctions and values from other aspects of tribal life has been partially produced from contact with colonization and Christianity. This subject is an entire study in itself and we can but indicate the nature of it by giving a few examples. These may be taken from the area of law and authority, economic, as well as from many other phases of life. However, we will part with the view that this secularization is as complete as some are inclined to think.

Prior to the arrival of the German military conquest of what is now the Cameroun, many tribes held adultery to be a very serious offense. Adultery was conceived as a violation of family or clan rights of ownership and was punishable by death or by declaration of war on the family or clan of the guilty man. In this way adultery was not thought of as an act between two individuals, but between two large family groups, clans or villages, depending upon the nature of the social relations involved. If the guilty man were apprehended he was killed outright, or if he succeeded in escaping some other member of his family was killed. This blood vengeance is expressed in Kaka by a commonly heard proverb: "The chimpanzee goes up one tree and comes down another." The man who commits the crime is not always the one who will pay. In addition to this offense being considered a group affair, there was the further belief that such a sin produced an impurity in the village and in the family which had to be removed by religious ritual. This consisted mainly in a rite requiring the sprinkling of chicken blood on the house of the offended party and ritual bathing to remove the personal impurity.

Into this picture came the French colonial machine which simply codified adultery along with many other offenses. Cases of adultery along with dozens of other infractions of the law were placed into the hands of the tribunal. There a fixed penalty in the form of imprisonment or fine was levied and the entire matter was soon removed from the area of the religious and stuffed into the world of economics. The matter was righted in the sight of authorities by paying the fine or spending the time in jail. Since only the guilty party could be sentenced under the law, only one man was required (or allowed) to go to jail. This had the further consequence of conceiving the adulterous act as being entirely personal and no longer the offense between two socially stable groups. However, even though the act of adultery was placed upon a private and individual basis, there was not, and perhaps still is not, produced a personal and individual sense of guilt. Money to pay the fine was and is secured from the clan or family group and the individual is fortified in the sense of a collective act which tends to remove any one individual from blame. Since most any offense can now be arranged by the payment of a fine, the need for righting of the wrong has a material rather than a spiritual dimension. This partial substitution of the material for the spiritual and the individual for the group is a basic process which underlies most of the developing commercial centers of West Africa.

The hunt in the Cameroun is another example of this materialization of religious experience. Under more primitive conditions in the open savanna or jungles, the hunter with his crude implements such as bows, spears and traps hunted the ferocious elephant, gorilla, bush cow and lion with a very real sense of potential failure. All of his hunt was prepared and carried out with the very precise execution of rites and ceremonies. With the gradual introduction of effective and accurate firearms and the obvious superiority of these over local methods, there was a tendency to replace the spiritual concern in the hunt for a material concern for the possession of the firearm and ammunition. However, it is here that one must be careful not to despiritualize the materialism. *There was little reason to seek the aid of spiritual forces if these forces were obviously already contained in the magical firearm.*

It is just at this point that we must inquire briefly into the nature of what is referred to in French areas as "*le matérialisme des noirs.*"

African Materialism

Is the desire for the material, wealth and its rewards, really a mechanical materialism as understood by many writers who see Africa shifting from pagan magic and sorcery into a crass materialism devoid of ethical, moral and spiritual values? Or is there not a conception of the material as containing the spiritual? When I once was told by a group of African school boys that the white man possessed *lémbo* (magic power) because of his inventions, I asked them how they could know whether it were *lémbo* or not. They answered that it is not something which you know in itself. Instead you see the things which *lémbo* can provide for its owner. This is expressed in the words of one writer as: "Ye shall know them by their fruits" (Matt. 7: 16). Regardless of what name is attached to it, the African is concerned that the fruits of his power or being show their presence and guarantee their force by bringing to him material rewards. The lack of such rewards is a poor man, lacking in spirit and therefore in goods.

The manifestation of the material witnessing to the abiding presence of one's *force* plays its role in the social world also. The man who is poor has few friends. This is expressed in another Kaka proverb which says: "The birds roost long in the trees with the leaves." That is, a man whose material possessions witness to the quantity of his personal force, his quantity of life, attracts many others who, basking in his presence, hope that his power will be transferred to them.

Again, the possession of the material transfers a person's status in his group. Upper mobility depends upon the presence of power. If one has no such power he cannot be granted authority over others. If he has such possessions it is generally held that his power will grant him the ability to lead and to decide tribal questions.

Our discussion to this point has brought us to say that the meaning of the materialism of modern Africa has many aspects to it and that the African even in his *search to acquire* is perhaps not primarily moved by the possession of the object as an end in itself as often is the case with Europeans. He is rather attempting to prove to himself and to his world that the presence of *spiritual forces* are at his service and that he stands in good with these. The thick façade of the material is then merely covering this desire to let himself know that all is spiritually well.

Under these conditions Christianity often becomes, not the spiritual reality underlying his behavior, but rather a manifestation that the spiritual reality exists.

The Spiritual Reality

What then is this spiritual reality? We have referred to it here as a force or power. It is best expressed in African languages with the word *life*. In many of the languages of the Cameroun the Christian terms for "salvation" and "to be saved" are "life" and "to live." Now if life or something similar to it is the essence of this spiritual existence, it is most clearly characterized by its relation to time and space which reveal many aspects in African behavior. Life as conceived in the western world is a series of timed events which come and go, and to all things there is a point of beginning and of ending. Time in this view is a sense of experience as running down and ending. Life in the African view does not have these fixed points of beginning and ending. The past is not historically conceived and does not flow out from a starting point. The end of life on this world is not the end because of the very real spirit world which continues to ever exist. Life is not that span which adds up to the time units counted between birth and death. The constant appearances of the dead to the living both among Christians and pagans reflect the fact that life is not a dwindling to zero, but a change in space without reference to time. A careful study of this concept of life and time could throw light on many bewildering practical aspects of African life. One should not be deceived by the possession of the ubiquitous wrist watch in Africa. Counting time units in a day and a concept of time are two different things. To the African there is simply no sense in the statement that "life is a race with time."

Christianity proclaims a view of life which is eternal, and it is this which the African grasps and makes of it an authoritarian expression of his own belief. In saying this it should be emphasized that I do not refer to "African" and "Africans" as individuals or even as groups of tribes or nations, but am rather equating the word African with the view of life and time as I have described it. Of course Christianity also conflicts with many of his beliefs and practices. However, it is precisely here that we return to the original point of our discussion, the relation of African religious beliefs to Christianity.

Western Christian Reaction

The problem is great due to the fact that African beliefs are a bewildering variety and Christianity, like Islam, has a complicated set of expressions. However, we are concerned here only with certain implications of the African view of life described above and the reaction to it by Christian missionaries. This greatly simplifies the problem and makes it possible to come to a few conclusions.

Missions in Africa were often founded upon the principle that the lost heathen had nothing in his life and that his religious mind was totally void of any revelation. He was a *tabla rasa* on to which religion was to be engraved for the first time. All his beliefs fell into the missionary's category of the superstitious. Fetishism, magic, sorcery and the more underlying religious beliefs for their existence were too often discounted. The European or American missionary who approached his work in Africa with this attitude did so partly because his own history had proved for him that, given enough scientific knowledge and rational thought, all nonrational phenomena could be disposed of as simply superstition or the work of Satan. It did not require much time for the African Christians to become aware that their own world of mysterious phenomena was discounted by the missionary as devilish or not valid at all.

The consequences of this attitude on the part of the western Christian churches caused the African spirit world to go underground. The official position of the church was merely to deny the African reality or to hand out church discipline to the member who delved in this realm. Since missionaries preferred to deny their reality rather than work with the African in appreciation of these phenomena, the African has in many areas of Africa held his Christian faith in one hand and his belief in the mysterious world of his pre-Christian days in the other.

I have never talked confidentially with an African Christian who would deny that the dead appear to the living and affect them in their plans and activities in this life. However, these same Christians are quick to admit that those things are never mentioned in church and that they are not supposed to occur, according to the church.

The attitude of the western missionary toward the African spirit phenomena struck the African at the same time as the invasion of the European secular and material world. The acceptance of clothes, tables, and a wide assortment of European merchandise helped conceal the spiritual gap that existed between the African and the western missionary. The African became aware that the real separation could be covered over by adaptation through the material means made available to him by European industrialization. However, this meeting of two worlds on the material plane has not been a true meeting at all. The underlying orientation for the African view is essentially spiritual, and the grasp for the material has not been entirely what it appears to be on the surface.

This is the nature of a conflict in African Christianity. The conflict is not the fault of the African church but rather the closed attitude with which it was approached by the western church missionaries. This attitude was formed largely out of our secular western world and not out of a true attempt to understand Biblically the nature and validity of the African's "superstitions."

The task which lay before Christian missions in Africa at the beginning still remains largely the same. However, at this time the problem is even more complex, due to the fact that so many social and religious changes have been produced. The African Christian tends to withdraw from the western missionary and to maintain his beliefs in isolation. It is not that the African is any less a Christian believer for this. It is rather that he does not wish to share with outsiders that which brings on ridicule and misbelief.

If the churches of the West are to prepare and work with African Christianity in the face of Islamic advance, there must be an entire rethinking of the deeper reality of nonrational phenomena. Beside this formidable task, all the other problems of Christianity in Africa are of secondary importance. The Western churches and Western cultures are not producing a satisfactory interpretation of religious phenomena. Unless they do, the result for Christianity in Africa is going to be felt soon. A great hope lies in the developing theological education in Africa, provided the lines of inquiry are formulated by African thought open to discussion and sensitive to Christian truth.

TO SEE OURSELVES

Wisdom which the West Should Learn from the East

Mu Tsung-san, Hsü Fu-kuan,
Carson Chang, and T'ang Chün-yi

We are here introducing what we hope will be a regular department in PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY. *In it we want to publish original articles and reprints in which non-Westerners look at the West, or in which anthropologists (or others) without any Christian convictions look at Christian missions, in ways that may be helpful for us to see ourselves. The following article is part 11 of "A Manifesto to the World on Behalf of Chinese Culture." We think that every reader will be struck, as we were, by the description of the feeling the Oriental has in the face of the Westerner, and by the thoughtful analyses of the difficulties in the Western outlook on life. At the same time it tells us as much, if not more, about the Chinese scholar's outlook on life, about his all important values, as it does about ourselves.*

WE cannot deny that Western culture is synonymous with modern world culture. But does Western culture suffice as a guide for the culture of mankind? Has it nothing to learn from Oriental culture? What do we wish Western culture to learn from Oriental culture? How do we envisage the future of such mutual study?

Notwithstanding its creativity and its rapid progress, Western culture carries along its problems and conflicts too. Divisions and wars, religious and political, capitalist exploitation leading to communism, imperialist colonialism inducing awakening nationalism to look towards communism for help, the possibility of the destruction of humanity by guided missiles, all these are the consequences of the rapid progress of the West. How, then, do we evaluate Western culture today, and what do we expect from it?

In one sense, many of these problems are already being solved by the West. Religious wars are no longer possible, and the institution of the United Nations counteracts narrow-minded nationalism, etc. There has been much planning towards the independence of colonies. But the great problem today is the antagonism between the Communist absolutist world and the Western democracies. The Afro-Asian bloc is still partly uncommitted. Yet, Chinese, Indian, and Muslim cultures are essentially closer to the West and anti-materialistic. Why, then, does this bloc not yet side with the West?

Deficiency of the Western Spirit

The first thing which the West ought to ponder is its inheritance of former colonialism, which evoked adverse reactions. But the real deficiency of the Western spirit was that when spreading its cultural influence it only tried to transmit its own ready-made ideals, while it neglected the peculiar nature of the cultures of other peoples. This led to lack of interest and sympathetic understanding, which can be explained from the multiform background of Western civilization (Greek national thought posing natural phenomena over against the ego; Jewish religious thought conceiving of man as having to work in accordance with God's plan; the idea of mutability of nature and society by means of human reason and power greatly enhanced by technology). Mere Western resolve to set the colonies free cannot overcome this lack of respect and sympathetic understanding. More is needed.

To the feelings of us Orientals, individual Westerners in their varied encounters with Orientals (diplomatic, political, missionary or educational), and also in their research, emanate an atmosphere which it is difficult for us to accept, though it is equally difficult for us to formulate what it is we find difficult.

Prominent in this atmosphere is the Greek heritage of cold, rational analysis; and behind this attitude the Western mind plans ideals to be realized after his investigation has been completed. Under these circumstances, we Orientals feel ourselves to be subjected to cold scrutiny by Westerners; simultaneously we feel that these Westerners are preparing to concentrate upon us according to their ideal plans and doing so as our superiors. Hence, we Orientals experience a feeling of coldness, being looked upon from a distance, and we feel a spiritual revulsion from being concentrated upon according to ready-made ideals.

Such feeling tends to lend unreal air to direct contacts between Orientals and Westerners. Hence, the Westerner who believes that his ideals are universal and also good for Orientals, will encounter the Oriental's physical presence, but not with his inner consent, because of the Oriental's feeling of remoteness or inferiority, his embarrassment or even hatred, or his narrow nationalism, or his cultural consciousness. If we understand the pluriform cultural background of this Western attitude, we may understand and forgive the Westerner. But if the West genuinely wishes to gain intimate contact with the East, it must progress beyond its own heritage and learn some things from Oriental wisdom. We mention five points:

Accept the Present

The first is the spirit of accepting the present without always striving for change and progress; there should be a sense of progress *and* a sense of retreat complementing each other. Because of this dominance of progress, of following ideals or the commands of God, there is no place for acceptance of the present, and

---

The signatories of the manifesto from which this article is reprinted are Prof. Mu Tsung-san and Prof. Hsü Fu-kuan, (both of whom are teaching in Tung Hai University, Taiwan; Prof. Mu also teaches in the Taiwan Provincial Teachers' Training College), Prof. T'ang Chün-yi (Dean of the Faculty of New Asia College, Hong Kong, and currently teaching philosophy at Hong Kong University), and Mr. Carson Chang (writer and politician now residing in the U.S.A.). The manifesto was originally published on New Year's day, 1958, in two Hong Kong magazines, *The Democratic Review* (Vol. 9, No. 1) and *National Renaissance* (Vol. 1, No. 18). It was translated into English by Dr. R. P. Kramers, and published in the *Quarterly Notes* of the Christian Study Centre on Chinese Religion (Series 11, No. 2, May, 1958), from which it is reprinted by permission.

hence for example, old people in the West are lonely people. Coupled to this there should be the feeling of laying down the entire burden of having to fit life into ideas (a heritage from Greek thought), because the feelings cannot expand if the spirit is constantly burdened by them. This deficiency is the prime cause of the difficulty of real authentic communication between people from East and West.

Ideas are, of course, also a means of establishing communication, but they may ultimately hamper communication too. The wisdom of "release from everything" is in Indian philosophy called the wisdom of the void, of release; in Taoism it is called the wisdom of emptiness, of non-being; in Confucianism "the state of void," "no foregone conclusions, no arbitrary judgment, no obstinacy, no selfishness," or "vast impartiality." This wisdom shows man the vanity and relativity of all his doings in business, politics, science, philosophy and diplomacy. Westerners should really learn to detach themselves from their traditional concepts, they should learn to understand and enjoy the boundless flavor of this Oriental wisdom.

Cultivate the Spiritual

The wisdom of being "round and spiritual" (I follow Wilhelm's translation of "The Book of Changes"; it could also be translated in an interpretative manner as: "spirituality as symbolized in the circle"). The release mentioned above is still negative. This wisdom, however, is positive. The phrase "round and spiritual" is parallel to the phrase "square and wise" (or, more fully translated "knowledge as symbolized in the square"). We may say that Western science and philosophy harbor straight, rectilinear rational principles. Because Western thinking proceeds from the abstract, it will always neglect and suppress something of concrete reality. It cannot do full justice to *einmaligkeit*, to the specific.

Here our wisdom is needed, the wisdom of following the winding path of the specific and concrete and not the wisdom which starts off from the general leading to the specific. The specific should rather determine the general. This general principle which is here determined from the specific becomes a general principle again through man's consciousness. Then it is again necessary to merge it into the specific. Thus, man's mind can progress and modify the general principle and we attain a wisdom which lives, moves, and pulsates together with all things. It is like a projected straight line following one direction and moving round and round until it has become a circle surrounding the central motion of concrete things.

If man observes things from the viewpoint of abstract general ideas, he is partly in harmony with these ideas and partly not. Where there is no harmony, there is stagnation. Where there is stagnation, the inner spirit cannot fully deploy itself. The wisdom of changing the abstract and general in accordance with the concrete and specific is necessary to achieve "roundness" (full completion) and as a result the inner spirit will be able to deploy itself without hindrance. Hence, the term "round and spiritual" (or "round and all-pervasive"). This is not merely dialectic wisdom (because dialectic wisdom remains within the rational intellect), but it is close to what Bergson calls "intuition." But whereas Bergson's "intuition" is but his personal philosophical concept, the Chinese with his "round and all-pervasive" wisdom understands the life of nature, observes the turning points of the universe, rejoices in the affirmation of life, and thus bases himself on this wisdom for his learning in discussions which do not yield definite answers but which roam as far and wide as the span of heaven.

This can be discerned in all our learning, literature, and art. Only after deep immersion in Chinese culture can this be understood thoroughly. This spirit is also necessary for Westerners if they really wish to meet with other peoples and cultures unhamperedly and in an atmosphere of sympathy and respect; and also if they wish to recognize beyond the departmentalization in their own traditional cultural realm, the realm of true, concrete life.

The Wisdom of Compassion

A feeling of mildness, of commiseration and compassion is the third lesson the West might learn. It is true that Westerners often have what Orientals do not have to such a degree: loyalty to ideals, a spirit of social service and enthusiasm, and love towards others. But the highest feelings between human beings do not consist of enthusiasm and love only. Man's will to power and his possessive urge can pervade enthusiasm and love. To prevent this the West relies mainly on humility moulded by religious faith: considering all one's own merits to serve towards the glory and service of God and received by God's grace too. But man's will to power can also use God as a backing leading to the belief that one's own activities are sanctioned by God. Man can also selfishly wish to possess God (e.g. he can invoke God's help for victory in battle). In such cases God's way and the devil in man's heart can fuse. Hence, Christianity tries to counter this evil by teaching forgiveness towards one's enemies. But this, carried to the absolute degree, ends in complete renunciation of the world in an effort to obtain individual blessing.

To counter this evil, again love and enthusiasm are needed. Thus we have a vicious circle without any definite solution. An ultimate solution can only come from removing the roots of the will to power and of the possessive urge. To do this, love must be truly fused with respect. The most significant feature of this fusion of love and respect is the feeling that, since love towards others is based on God's boundless love, my respect for others is likewise boundless. It means that I must equal my respect towards others to my veneration of God. This is what is meant in China when it is said that the good man "serves his parents like serving heaven" and "governs the people like performing a great sacrifice."

There is no room here for any reflection on the fact that I myself believe in God and that I know His love, but that the other does not. Such an attitude places the other person on a lower level, and then my respect towards others remains unfulfilled. True respect must be unconditional and absolute. Then human love, expressed in the forms of etiquette, preserves its inner warmth and becomes mellow and mild. Thus, the deepest human love is transformed into the feeling of commiseration and humanity. This is identical with the Buddhist notion of "compassion." Commiseration and compassion differ from the usual love, because in love there is only the feeling that one's own life-spirit is directed towards others on the principle of "considering others as yourself."

But here the possessive urge can creep in. Commiseration and compassion, however, mean communication and intercourse between mine and the other's real life-spirit. Here, too, there is a true fellow-feeling for the other also flowing towards him. But this flow of feeling is partly outwardly directed and partly absorbed by the self. Thus, it produces a returning emotion in the self and then the soiling admixture of the possessive urge can be expurgated. There is a very subtle truth in this. More philosophically: if the love which is stressed by Westerners is to be truly transformed into compassion, then it is necessary that God, the source of this love, be not merely the one who transcends the human spirit, be not merely the Unifier, the object of man's prayer; it is necessary that God be regarded as the one who is together with man's heart of hearts, the one who, through our bodies, manifests His direct communication in the spirit of life wherever it truly exists.

The Wisdom of Making Culture Endure

We believe that culture is the expression of the spiritual life of each people. According to the laws of nature, all manifestations of vigor drain the energy of life. This is also true of man's spiritual energy of life. If this is not to diminish, man must, on the one hand, possess a mind which has been formed by historical consciousness in communication with past history and future generations, and moreover he must with this mind encounter the life-giving source which underlies the heart of man and the principle of all things. In the West this cosmic life-giving source is called God.

By means of a religious life, Western man also can encounter this cosmic life-giving source. But if the usual religious life means an encounter with God merely through prayer and faith, then God can only be transcendent and external over against man, and man can only think of God's eternity. Thus he cannot yet directly acquire a mind which is formed by historical consciousness linking up past and future generations.

Moreover, encountering this God, the cosmic life-giving source, through prayer and faith means that we encounter Him only through man's transcending, upward-striving mind; it does not yet mean encountering Him directly with one's own existing self. This requires yet another great labor; the starting point of this labor is to see to it that all outwardly directed expression in life does not merely follow a natural course, but that from time to time it goes against nature in order to return to this cosmic life-giving source and from that only to fulfill nature again.

This is precisely what earlier we have called the wisdom whereby Chinese historical culture could endure. This is not just a theory of Chinese philosophy, but it is something which permeates the whole of Chinese literature, art, and etiquette. With this wisdom the Chinese have in all their cultural life striven to find never-ending resources. This is the way to store up man's life energy, so that it will not be sapped excessively, but, going against all natural ways by which man seeks to express his energy, will communicate with the cosmic life-giving source. Looking at modern Western culture from this viewpoint, its quest for efficiency constitutes a great problem. Of course, the former easy-going attitude of the Chinese is in many ways not suitable in meeting the present situation. Yet this tendency in the Western world, which entails the entire world, to sail into space with spaceships, ultimately encounters a still greater void, and this is not the way in which human culture can endure. There must come a day when Westerners, too, will realize that, with God's eternity alone and without the continuity of historical culture, man cannot live peacefully on this earth, nor on other planets. Then they may develop this wisdom of the continuity of culture and with a mind formed by historical consciousness, linking up past and future generations, they may come to a true appreciation of the meaning of filial piety, of the wish for posterity motivated by the wish for a continuous endurance of the culture of the ancestors.

The World Is One Family

We admit that today there are still many countries which must develop democracy, but behind this there is the wider feeling of world brotherhood. This feeling is more richly represented in the Orient. In China, all schools of thought and religion contributed to it. The concept of human goodness in Confucianism is clearly aimed at this ideal in its final and universal implications, and hence it is close to the universality of Christian love. But Christianity insists on stating first that man is afflicted with original sin, and the Christian bases himself upon God's will, on something imposed from above for the salvation of men. The Confucianist rather believes in the goodness of human nature, in man's possibility to attain sagehood and to be in harmony with the good influence of Heaven.

There is a sharp contrast here, but differences in doctrine still do not prevent a beneficial influence on mankind and culture along different ways. In fostering the feeling of world brotherhood, we think it is better to rely on a combination of Christian and Confucian thought rather than on Christian thought alone. This will not be easy, because Christianity is a systematic religion with many organized branches. Christianity has the concept of heaven and also of hell to which non-believers are relegated. There is never a unanimous stand among the denominations, and a distinction is made between those who do and those who do not belong to one's own denomination. Those who belong may go to heaven; the others go to hell. Thus, though Christian love seems unconditional, yet there is one condition: that one must "believe my doctrine."

Actually this matter is far from certain. According to Confucianist thought, the only condition for being able to attain sagehood and to be in harmony with the good influence of Heaven, is to be a human being. There is no church organization, nor is it necessary for everyone to worship Confucius, because basically everybody can become a sage like Confucius. That is why the Confucian doctrine is not inimical to any of man's religions. Confucianism has a concept of heaven and earth, but not of hell. It does not have a hell to accommodate non-believers. "All things are nurtured without harming each other; many ways can be walked to the truth without hindering each other" — this is the Confucian belief. Such an attitude is also to be found in Hinduism and Buddhism. The Westerner has much to learn here.

The five points mentioned above do not exhaust the list, but they are representative. It does not mean that these five things are totally absent from Western culture, but we hope that they will come to germination for the benefit of world culture and Western culture itself.

EDITORIAL

Some Questions about Missionary Medicine

William A. Smalley

In this editorial I expect to raise some questions which I cannot answer. Perhaps there are readers who will want to speak to them. In fact, I feel singularly ill-equipped to discuss missionary medicine as it is entirely outside of my experience, and I have no knowledge of its problems. Yet, as I observe it from a distance, I get the same feeling of "unrealness" from it that I get from many missionary activities — the same lack of coming to grips with the realities of society in the less westernized parts of the world.

This uneasiness was forceably brought to my mind again by the reading of a fascinating little book, *The Edge of Tomorrow,* by Thomas A. Dooley, M.D.[1] Not that Dr. Dooley said anything about medical work in relation to Christian missions. He is the doctor who, out of his own pocket, and out of the contributions which he received from other Americans, led a medical team of Americans and Lao on a year-long venture of bringing medical relief to two isolated communities in Northern Laos in Southeast Asia. Dr. Dooley's motives were humanitarian. An Irish Catholic himself, he was driven by the desire to perform medical service to wretched people. He had become familiar with some of the problems of such medical aid through his work in the Navy in Asia, particularly in the evacuation of refugees from Northern Vietnam, when Vietnam was divided at the end of its bloody civil war. The significance of Dooley's book and the work which he did lies not simply in the number of individuals who were treated or healed through his medical skill. So far as the viewpoint represented in PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY is concerned, the significance lies in his attitude toward his work and its relation to the society around him.

Dr. Dooley started out to spend only one year in Laos. That year was spent in two different communities, both relatively isolated: Van Vieng and Nam Tha. He and his men plunged into their work with the facilities available, and utilized the materials at hand. Here is a description of their home in Van Vieng:

> Our living quarters presented a tougher problem. Ojisan's house was a typical Lao hut perched six feet above the ground on stout poles surrounded by a "porch" and reached by a steep ladder. We climbed up, took one look inside, and came out shuddering. The place was filthy.
>
> The boys tore out everything inside the hut including the bamboo partition between the two rooms. They swept the ceiling clear of soot, cobwebs, and rats' nests, then went to work on the walls. When this accumulation of ancient crud had been swept out, they hauled up buckets of river water, broke out

---

[1] Published in New York by Farrar, Straus and Cudahy, 1958.

> boxes of soap-powder and bleach, and swabbed the deck Navy-style.
>
> The villagers presented us with woven bamboo mats for floor covering, and we laid out our bedrolls and hung mosquito netting. Then we installed all the packing-crate bookcases, benches and tables, and placed two cots against the wall as lounges. This would be our "living room."
>
> Pete Kessey insisted that even the poorest white-trash back in Texas wouldn't live in such a place. Maybe so. But, at least, no one could ever say that the men of Operation Laos lived apart from the natives in an air-conditioned American compound.[2]

Their hospital was just as simple. There was no X-ray machine, no elaborate equipment. Everything was designed so that it could be carried on, when Dr. Dooley left, by the Lao individuals who were trained on the spot. Americans in the enormous Economic Aid Mission which has poured millions of dollars into Laos, with almost no grass roots service resulting from that expenditure, accused Dr. Dooley of practicing 19th-Century medicine. They are correct, said Dr. Dooley, "I did practice 19th-Century medicine, and this was just fine. Upon my departure our indigenous personnel would practice 18th-Century medicine. Good, this is progress, since most of the villagers live in the 15th Century."[3]

There lies the significance of Dr. Dooley's work. His cultural instincts are sound.

> There were about four practicing mid-wives in Van Vieng when we arrived, and perhaps as many more young girls who aspired to the calling. We won them over to our side, had them help around the hospital, and made them promise to call us for each childbirth. When we went on a call, we would take along one or two of the younger girls. And, always, we carried a bag containing the wonderful midwife's kit prepared and distributed by CARE. Each of these kits contains gowns, gloves, cord ties, basins, bowls, dressings, soaps, towels, etc. — all the essentials for the delivery of twenty-five babies.
>
> We taught the girls the principles of modern, aseptic midwifery, and the importance of post-partum care of the mother, including removal of the placenta. Then, after each one had delivered twenty-five babies under supervision, and had proved her proficiency and dedication, she was "graduated" with appropriate ceremony, climaxed by the presentation of the CARE kit — always the bag that I personally had carried and used. (This was extremely important for "face.")
>
> Just as in America nurses are "capped" at graduation, so we "bagged" our midwives in Van Vieng. It worked. Those wonderful young women, armed with their CARE kits and somewhat dedicated to the aseptic principles we taught them, have removed many of the old horrors from maternity in that part of Laos.[4]

Participation and Cooperation

Dr. Dooley and his men participated largely in Lao life and were part of the Lao communities in which they lived. "Participation," as always, is a relative matter. Dr. Dooley calls "lousy stuff" some of Lao food which I consider delicious! They subsisted largely on Navy C-rations. In the evening they provided entertainment for the community with movies supplied by American Information

---

[2] Pp. 20-30.

[3] P. 54.

[4] Pp. 35-6.

Service, and throughout the day the community watched fascinated as they performed much of their medical work in full view. People never ceased to marvel that injections were given in the patient's "bottom" for a pain in the head!

The local "shamans," the witch doctors or medicine men, were disturbed by the Dooley mission when it came to Nam Tha. Finally they declared the hospital to be taboo by putting up the characteristic woven bamboo sign used all over Southeast Asia. No one, no matter how ill, dared come near the hospital for help. At that point Dooley did the culturally most sensible thing. He made friends and colleagues of the witch doctors.

> One afternoon I returned from an emergency call in the jungle to find Pete holding an earnest professional conference with Old Joe (a medicine man.) Pete gave me the eye, and I squatted down and listened respectfully.
>
> Old Joe had spread out before him a weird assortment of sticks, bamboo slivers, betel nuts, boiled leaves, pig grease, and cow dung, and was explaining the theory behind his *materia medica*. Most of it was fantastic. But here and there I recognized fragments of the universal folk remedies (like the use of spiderwebs in open wounds), the effectiveness of which are acknowledged by modern medicine.
>
> "Well," said Pete, "we just belong to different schools of medicine. We use different drugs, different methods, but we are both working for the same thing — to free the people from the evils of disease and suffering. The important thing is for us to work together. We'll teach you what we know, and you will teach us." That sounded fair enough to Old Joe.
>
> From that time on Old Joe rarely missed a sick call. We would administer a shot of penicillin, Joe would invoke the proper spirits. We would splint a fracture, then permit Old Joe to tie the indispensable red, white and black strings around the splints. If we were paid two coconuts for fee, Old Joe received one. (In America this practice is held in a bad light; they call it "fee splitting.")[5]

Expendability

Laos has only one foreign trained doctor, who is the minister of health. There are about fifteen locally trained men, many of them with little more education than would correspond to junior high school in the States. These are the doctors of the larger communities. Dooley deliberately turned his work over to these men at the end of a year's time. He wanted to return again at a later date, but he wanted to start again fresh in a new community and to begin his training work once more. He did not want to build up his own institution.

Here are the details of his final arrangements with the Lao government:

> We had established the hospital at Nam Tha, and wanted to insure that after our departure it would continue to flourish. All the things we had done were so carried out that our departure would not create a void. We installed no X-ray machines, nor any large electrical plant. We had no complicated or extremely delicate instruments. We utilized ten or twelve basic antibiotics and other medicines, so that their exact usage and dosage was well understood by the local nurses. We turned over to midwives the CARE kits, making them completely self-sufficient. The

---

[5] P. 79.

vaccination program, carried out by the locals themselves, would add a marked degree of immunity to many thousands of people in the high valley. The instructions would make them more cognizant of the relationships between dirt and disease. I did not want these accomplishments lost after our departure. I wanted to make sure that we would leave something real and substantial behind us.

I proposed three points to the Minister. I asked, first, that he give our hospital a charter. This would mean that a specific amount of money would be earmarked for the hospital based on the number of patients treated and hospitalized. This would mean that certain monies would be allotted for upkeep and care of the buildings. Instead of paint and wood being bought with my own money, the hospital would now be administered and financed by the government of Laos, and their medicines would come from the government warehouse.

Second, I asked that he send to Nam Tha two Bangkok-trained nurses to replace my men. These nurses were well trained in Thailand's school of nursing. There were only a few in the whole Kingdom of Laos, but I asked for two for Nam Tha.

Third, I asked that a *médecin indochinois* be sent to replace me. There are no other doctors by international standards in the kingdom, except the Minister himself. There are fifteen men who have had some medical training, though by our standards very little. These men could practice medicine in Laos.

If Dr. Oudom, the Minister of Health, would agree to this, I in turn would agree to leave everything that we had brought to Laos in the hospital at Nam Tha. This meant that absolutely everything would stay there, beds, mosquito nets, linens, drapes, surgical instruments, stethoscopes, house gear, and about $25,000 worth of antibiotics. All these we would turn over to the *médecin indochinois*. Then I would myself return to America.

The Minister immediately agreed, but expressed some surprise that I wanted to become expendable. I told him that in my mind America should not attempt to build a dynasty in a foreign land. We should not attempt to make a foreign land dependent on us for its maintenance.[6]

As a missionary in Laos, I have seen these local poorly trained "doctors" at work. I have seen them literally kick their patients around if those were of the mountain tribe. I know how their offices have been characterized by graft and personal gain. I can imagine what may well happen in that hospital which he left behind. But I insist that Dr. Dooley is right. Medical aid or any other kind of aid that simply results in a permanent dependency of one country upon another is in this age as bad an enslavement as the military colonialization of a past era.

> Let us stop all this blather and bleat about the beatitudes of democracy. Let us get out and show, with simple spontaneity and love, our ability to work at the level of the people we aim to aid. Let us stop proclaiming ourselves as the world standard. Democracy, as championed by the United States, does not translate well into Lao. Not yet. We evolved it from 1776 to 1958. Let us be patient with the Asian. The Lao need only time, education, and stimulation.[7]

---

[6] Pp. 192-193.

[7] P. 203.

Missionary Medicine

What is the function of a medical missionary program? It is easy enough to define its humanitarian function, as thousands of the world's most miserable sick pass through the doors of mission clinics and hospitals daily. It is easy enough to define its function in terms of service to mankind as doctors leave valuable practices and excellent incomes for the reward of seeing the world's less fortunate healed of diseases which are scarcely known any longer in the West.

But what is its missionary function? And what is its function in the society within which it operates? What is its motive?

The only true motivation for missions is the extension of the church of Jesus Christ, the redemption of men. Aside from an opportunity to give a witness to a captive audience, what does the typical mission medical program contribute to that end? These are questions which missionary doctors may well be able to answer, and I would like to hear the answer. I frankly do not know what it is. It seems to me, however, that any worthwhile answer will have three ingredients at least: Christ, church, and local culture.

But, dropping the question of missionary motive, what about medical goals? Should we want to practice 20th-Century medicine everywhere? Or should we not, like Dooley, be content with 19th-Century medicine in rural areas, in the hope that some 18th-Century medical practices might be developed and used locally?

Of course 20th-Century hospitals are not out of place in the big cities of Asia, Africa, or Latin America, any more than they are in Europe or North America. For rural areas, however, are they really functional? Would not a decentralized medical program in which a few individuals were taught some elementary skills and a degree of self-reliance and initiative in their use, be better than the full dependence of a mission medical program on a well-qualified foreign staff?

And what about practice? Is it better to take someone who is ill to an antiseptic hospital where he is terribly frightened, or to leave him in his very unantiseptic home where he feels much more secure in the face of illness and death? Many hospitals abroad, it should be noted, are much more humane than American hospitals about allowing the relatives of the ill to camp with him, cook his food, and give him the reassurance of friends about him.

And what of the medicine man? If healing were the only motive, certainly the cooperative use of the medicine man would be all-important. With the antibiotics of modern medicine and the reassurance of traditional remedies, religious and magical, the patient would get a powerful dose. Dr. Dooley gives a lot of credit for success in some of his cases to Old Joe.

Some missionary doctors shy away from such reinforcement of "superstition" and pagan religion. If it is only a matter of "superstition," I feel that they have no right to quibble. Much of their own medical lore will be classified as "superstition" two hundred years from now. If it is true that such cooperation will place a barrier between men and Christ, I would not advocate it. I suspect, however, that this again is more often a problem of the missionary's understanding than we usually think, and that lack of such cooperation may often in itself be that barrier. Here, it seems to me, is an area where some imaginative feeling for the culture could find an effective outlet.

Perhaps in medicine, as in so much of our missionary work, we think of our techniques more highly than we ought to think. Ultimately, it is the missionary doctor or nurse's reflection of Christ which will be important to His cause. Humanitarian healing work can give a splendid lens to brighten that reflection. But little reflection will take place without participation, without empathy. For a man most at home around a smoking fire in a bamboo house, participation and empathy are hard come by within whitewashed walls and bleached sheets.

Dr. Dooley, in a few months' time, succeeded in making friends on a scale which very few missionaries do. With him perhaps the Lao sensed a freedom from contempt, which is one of the most cherished of all freedoms. But what if the work he left behind disintegrates into a political plum, with the unsterile instruments, moldy medicine, and apathetic personnel so characteristics of Lao medical practice? Any answer will depend on what one's goals are, on the absolutism of one's attitudes toward the perfection of 1959 (as opposed to 1958 or 1858), medical fashion, and the realism in one's knowledge of history and of culture change.

My answer is that the type of rural medicine Dr. Dooley undertook, the respect of local culture which he showed, and his insistence on training people to do the medical tasks which they could do independently of him is more realistic for rural areas and more relevant for Christian missions than much of what we are doing. I would like to hear from the doctors on this.

LETTERS

Just What I Was Looking For

I had not heard of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY until a fellow missionary was so kind as to lend me his Jan.-Feb. 1958 issue. I enjoyed it very much as it is just the kind of material I have been looking for. Unfortunately I had no training along this line but am now trying to make up for it through reading material on this subject. I especially enjoyed the article on the Kaka people as I am working among the Bayas, a tribe just north of them.

Jack Bradfeldt, French Equatorial Africa

Looking for the Key to Communication

Your efforts put forth in the publication of the periodical are certainly appreciated. It has been a source of mental stimulation as I prepare and present the gospel to these people.

Lately, I have been praying and thinking about my inability to really communicate with the people in terms of their culture. Then, picking up PA, I found my thoughts crystallized in W. D. Reyburn's proposal: "Is it possible to merely announce the 'good news' in the language of the people? Definitely not." Though

I can preach the fundamentals of salvation, I am looking for the key that will make it "live" to the people in terms of their understanding. Let's keep praying for each other.

One of these days I hope to write up a good example of how a misunderstanding of the Busa people's clan relationship has precipitated enough hard feelings to provoke an interclan war. Were it not for the French being here, I am sure there would be a battle tomorrow morning.

R. Blaschke, Dahomey, French West Africa

Stimulating

I do not know to whom I am indebted for the introduction to PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY this past year by subscription, but have found it very thought-stimulating and helpful. I believe your committee has done a tremendous job this year, and trust that many of your publishing problems are being solved.

Alice Blodgett, R.N., Sierra Leone, W. Africa

We like PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY very much. The articles are well written and informative; they often bear directly on the customs and culture of the Africans, and we find it very stimulating reading.

Howard Emary, République de Guinée

We do appreciate your magazine very much. Keep up the good work. We need to be awakened out of our deep sleep in mission policy.

Our work for the past year has been the distribution of literature in the Soudan as well as assisting some struggling groups of Christians. My prayer daily is that through the distribution of Scriptures we may be able to spark a peoples' movement which will result in many coming to the Savior.

G. S. McRostie, French West Africa

Thank you for the sample copy of PA that has been given to us. We are a young couple finishing a degree at Iowa State College, and are looking forward to a place of teaching in Africa, probably with the Sudan Interior Mission.

Your magazine is the best reading we've found on attempting to understand the life of the nationals. We've included several friends' names who we feel might be interested also.

Mark and Joyce White, Ames, Iowa

I'm glad that I can introduce [new recruits] to this magazine before they get to the field. Thus, I think they have every reason to be well prepared. I know we certainly appreciate PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY.

Albert Buckwalter, Chaco, Argentina

Appreciation from Europe

We have had the benefit of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY for a while. It has been a great help in our tribal work among the Blue Miao in North Thailand.

We wish PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY a greater and wider reach, and wish there was something like this in one of the continental languages.

Otto Scheuzger, Staffelbach, Switzerland

The Indigenous Church

Wm. Smalley's article (March-April 1958) on the Indigenous Church is best I've ever seen and first I can fully accept.

Frank Kline, Willmore, Kentucky

CONTENTS

THE CHRISTIAN CONCEPT OF FORGIVENESS AND ANANG MORALITY 97 JOHN C. MESSENGER, JR.

SOME PROBLEMS OF CULTURE CONTACT 103 G. GORDON BROWN

THE ROLE OF CULTURAL ANTHROPOLOGY IN CHRISTIAN MISSIONS 110 EUGENE A. NIDA

AFRICA IN TRANSITION — I BEFORE EUROPEAN COLONIZATION 117 K. A. BUSIA

RITUAL VALUE-WASHING AMONG THE WEINERKREISER 124 DOUGLAS N. MORGAN

MISSION AND ANTHROPOLOGY IN THE SOLOMONS 128 T. E. EASTERFIELD

TO SEE OURSELVES

The Structure and Symbol Underlying "Conversion" in Bantu Tiriki 132 WALTER H. SANGREE

PRACTICAL PROBLEMS

What Are Indigenous Churches Like? 135 WILLIAM A. SMALLEY

EDITORIAL

The Moral Implications of Social Structure 140 WILLIAM A. SMALLEY

John C. Messenger, Jr.

The Christian Concept of Forgiveness and Anang Morality

This paper examines the major causes underlying the spread of what African elders and Westerners alike regard as immoral behavior among Anang youth in Southeastern Nigeria. The Anang have experienced profound cultural change since World War I, at which time they were finally pacified by the British and the first trading post and Christian mission were established among them. When this change is assessed, it is apparent that most of the forces contributing to immorality among young people in other African societies are also operative in Anang society, namely the breakdown of traditional political, religious, and kinship forms and the adoption of Western values, especially those in the economic realm.[1] This paper treats these common causal factors, but emphasizes one in particular which is important in producing immorality among Anang youth: their acceptance of the Christian concept of forgiveness. Probably this new doctrine is affecting the behavior of other African peoples in a similar manner, but, if so, it has not received adequate attention in acculturation studies.

CERTAIN beliefs embodied in the indigenous Anang religion partially explain why the adoption of a new conception of divine intervention in human affairs has so strongly influenced the conduct of youth. The Anang are monotheistic, the central theme of their religion being the worship of a sky deity, named *abassi*, who rules the universe and mankind. He is assisted by numerous spirits residing on earth in shrines, and by souls of the dead awaiting reincarnation in the underworld. Although he is considered both omniscient and omnipresent, he lacks ultimate omnipotence, for ghosts, witches, and the

---

John C. Messenger, Jr., is Assistant Professor in the Departments of Social Science and Sociology and Anthropology of Michigan State University. He has the Ph.D. in Anthropology from Northwestern University, and in addition to the field work represented in this article he has done general ethnographic research among the Arran Islanders of Western Ireland. He is author of several previous publications on the Anang. The present paper was delivered before the American Anthropological Association in 1958, and is based on research conducted in Nigeria during 1952.

[1] For a general account of culture change in Anang society, I refer you to my *Anang Acculturation: A Study of Shifting Cultural Focus*, Ann Arbor, University Microfilms, Pub. No. 23525, 1957, pp. 196-290; also to my "Religious Acculturation Among the Anang-Ibibio," in *Continuity and Change in African Cultures*, ed. by W. Bascom and M. Herskovits, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1959.

spirit of evil magic possess powers over which he sometimes exerts no control. The Anang do not know where these malevolent powers originate, so they must be combatted with preventive magic.

Fate as ordained by *abassi* directs the course of each human life, but rather than remaining immutable following assignment at conception, it may be modified within narrow limits through the exercise of free will by the individual. A divinely enunciated moral code embracing every aspect of human behavior forms the basis for evaluating acts transcending fate. Should these acts conform to his code, the deity will alter a person's fate so that future misfortunes are canceled. On the contrary, should the freely perpetrated deeds of an individual transgress against this code, *abassi* will compound predestined misfortunes.

Supernatural retribution takes many forms, from the extreme of causing an object of little value to be misplaced to that of transforming a soul into a ghost at death. The severity of the sanction depends upon the nature of the misdeed and the predilection of the deity. The most favored sanctions, however, are to have a person be found guilty of a crime in court and be subjected to judicial punishment, or to have the oath spirit attack one who has sworn an oath falsely or who has committed one of several other specific crimes.

The recognition of a divine moral code and the ability of *abassi* to punish any divergence from its tenets constitute the most powerful mechanisms of social control. The Anang individual is far more sensitive to external controls, most of which are ultimately religious, than he is to internal ones, and there is little evidence of a well-formed conscience that evokes feelings of guilt for a socially disapproved act.[2]

Anang Response to Christianity

The foregoing features of Anang religion provide a framework for appraising the impact of Christianity and other aspects of Western culture. The first mission in the region was founded in 1919 by the Wesleyan Methodists. Seven other Christian bodies, two of them African in origin, were installed between 1919 and 1948,[3] and today all maintain churches, some schools, and several hospitals. Most of the denominations have had marked success in gaining converts during recent years, and slightly more than half the people now profess the Christian faith.

The Anang have reacted to religious acculturation differentially according to sex and age groups. Women as a whole have embraced Christianity,[4] whereas only boys and young men among the males have done so. Old men are either antagonistic or indifferent toward the encroachment of Christianity and, almost without exception, are attempting to preserve traditional beliefs. Incapable of arresting emergent change, since they no longer possess the political and kinship authority they once did, the old men spend much of their time together extolling the past and criticizing Western innovations. In particular, they remonstrate against the immorality displayed by youth, holding that the assorted political, economic, and social ills which have befallen the Anang during the past three decades have been perpetrated by *abassi,* who is angry with young people for disobeying his moral mandates.

---

[2] The relationship between internal and external controls in personality and its consequences is discussed in R. Benedict, *The Chrysanthemum and the Sword*, Boston, Houghton Mifflin Co., 1946, pp. 222-227; F. Hsu, "Suppression vs. Repression," *Psychiatry*, Vol. 12, 1949, pp. 223-242; D. Riesman, *The Lonely Crowd*, New Haven, Yale University Press, 1950, pp. 10-31. The Anang culture is a "shame culture" rather than a "guilt culture," "suppression" rather than "repression" is the basic mechanism of socialization, and the Anang personality is predominately "tradition-directed" rather than "inner-directed" or "other-directed."

[3] These are the Kwa Ibo (English interdenominational) established in 1920, the Roman Catholic (Holy Ghost Order) in 1925, the Lutheran (Missouri Synod) in 1936, the African Apostolic (nativist) in 1936, the Christ Army (nativist) in 1940, the Assemblies of God in 1946, and the Seventh Day Adventist in 1948.

[4] The major reason for their acceptance is their belief that the Christian God affords them greater protection in child bearing than does

Middle-aged men, on the other hand, have been much more susceptible to conversion, but among those declaring themselves Christian, few are orthodox in their beliefs, according to mission reports.[5] They tend to reinterpret and syncretize Anang and Christian dogmas while preserving many traditional forms of worship. The two nativist denominations are supported almost entirely by men in this age category and by women.

The strongest supporters of Christianity among the Anang are those who were born after religious proselytizing commenced. Many were reared as Christians, and most claim to be Christians whether or not they are members of a denomination. They tend to join missionary churches, mainly because only these can finance well-equipped schools and hospitals. Formal education is highly prized, since it is a prerequisite to positions that bring high income and prestige, such as medicine, law, business, teaching, and the civil service. Young people express admiration for most things European, and the person who adopts Western customs, including religious ones, gains recognition as a result. The nativist denominations are denigrated in the urban centers, as they are financially incapable of sponsoring schools and hospitals, and are severely criticized by missionaries for their pseudo-Christian doctrines. Belonging to either of the African churches means "losing face" in the estimation of Westernized Anang youth.

Ignorance of Anang Religion

Young people tend to have only a vague understanding of the indigenous religion. Systematic probing of the religious knowledge of numerous children and young adults revealed that they were either ignorant of or misunderstood such basic Anang beliefs as the role of fate in guiding human affairs, the nature of the nether world, and the functions of numerous shrines and sacred groves. They

abassi. One of the principal prestige symbols for both men and women is offspring, and prior to the introduction of Western medicine the infant mortality rate was over forty per cent. Women soon learned that care by European-trained midwives and delivery in mission or government hospitals ensured increased success in child bearing. European medical specialists are believed to gain their abilities through manipulation of supernatural power emanating from the Christian God, just as indigenous workers of magic and diviners are thought to control power bestowed by *abassi.* The reduction of infant mortality following the use of Western medical techniques convinced women that God is superior to the traditional deity.

[5] Lutheran statistics indicate that although fifty per cent of the Anang and neighboring Ibibio have been converted to Christianity, only an estimated ten per cent are "true believers." See H. Nau, *We Move Into Africa.* St. Louis, Concordia Publishing House, 1945, p. 161. It is my opinion that the author has considerably overestimated the latter percentage.

betrayed an even greater ignorance of sacred rituals. Only in the areas of magic, witchcraft, and oath administration did they reveal extensive knowledge of traditional customs.

One of the important reasons for this ignorance is that teachers in both government and mission schools inculcate Christian doctrines and denounce Anang religion. In government institutions this is done by instructors who, for the most part, have received their education in mission schools. Nigerian law limits formal religious instruction to fifteen minutes each day, but since many of these institutions offer room and board facilities, there is ample time outside the classroom for students to be proselytized. Those children who do not attend schools and express an interest in the indigenous religion are held up to ridicule by friends who are students.

Another reason for the vagueness of religious belief among youth is that many of them leave home at an early age to pursue occupations in urban communities, and thus never receive adequate religious instruction from their parents and other kin. Even when living at home, children spend much of their time away from adults as members of organized gangs, and the adults themselves are frequently absent while engaged in farming, trading, and political activities.

In addition, it has been noted that women have accepted Christianity to a greater degree than their husbands. Most of them object to having their children taught what they consider false beliefs. Family quarrels often center about whether or not younger members should be allowed to attend traditional religious ceremonies, join secret associations having religious functions, or become members of a Christian church.

Finally, with the loss of authority as a result of acculturation, older men are no longer in a position to command the obedience and respect of youth, and thus are unable to impart religious knowledge to them effectively. Indigenous governmental and judicial forms have been abolished in large measure by the British, and new leaders have arisen who serve as models for young people, men who are educated, financially successful, and Christian.

Spread of Immorality

Theft, bribery, fraud, perjury, adultery, murder, and many other infractions of Anang and Western morality are committed on a broad scale by Anang youth, largely in pursuit of wealth and prestige. The spread of immorality is attested by the rapid increase during recent years in offenses tried by Native and Magistrates' Courts and by traditional judicial bodies which, although illegal, continue to meet in a few villages. Prison capacities are overtaxed as well, with youth making up the bulk of the prison population. Village life is disrupted because of the deep schisms between young people and their elders. The latter bitterly resent the adoption of Western customs by the former and are, as indicated above, especially critical of deviations from Anang morality. They place the primary blame for this condition on Christianity, in particular on the concept of God and salvation embodied in Christian dogma.

Protestantism, by preaching an "intellectual" gospel emphasizing salvation through faith, and Roman Catholicism, by introducing the sacrament of confession, have fostered, however unintentionally, the widespread belief among young people that the Christian God forgives all sins. The youth tend to accept Christian morality as expounded by the missionaries, largely because of its similarity to Anang morality, and they understand that it is divinely sanctioned, yet the opinion is widely held that its tenets may be disregarded without fear of spiritual punishment if belief is maintained or if sins are confessed and absolved.

Sermons by Protestant ministers stress the extreme sinfulness of man and the possibility of salvation through faith, seldom urging the practice of good works as a principal means of expressing faith. Lutheran and Methodist missionaries, as far as could be determined, are unaware of the powerful impact of this doctrine on young people, although several Catholic priests who were interviewed recognize, to some extent, what is transpiring and admitted stressing punishment in hell for sinful acts when instructing youth.

Many young persons wear Christian crosses because they believe that this will assure God's forgiveness for an immoral deed, as well as protect them against the machinations of evil spiritual forces. They also believe that the Holy Spirit is especially capable of obtaining the forgiveness of God, and they direct prayers and sacrifices to this being. A favorite song among the youth reveals the attitude of this age group when criticized for misdeeds. It has the following words: "I don't care. I will tell the Holy Spirit. He will tell my Father. All will be well."

Few converted Anang comprehend the nature of the Trinity. Most believe that three distinct entities exist: God, the creator of the universe; Jesus, his human son, who was sent by him to spread the Christian doctrine to the peoples of the world; and the Holy Spirit, whose major tasks are to heal the sick and injured, to foretell future events, and to gain from God forgiveness for sins. Seldom were Anang able to explain the significance of Jesus' dying on the cross to atone for the sins of mankind, although most realized that belief in this act must be maintained to ensure salvation. It is not an exaggeration to say that worship of the Holy Spirit dominates the belief system of young Christians, even though God is known to possess ultimate power.

The nativist denominations, whose chief support comes from women, middle-aged men, and youth from rural villages, owe their considerable success to the emphasis they place on the Holy Spirit and salvation through faith and confession. "Evangelists" assigned to each nativist prayer house are able to become possessed by the Holy Spirit and heal and prognosticate, much in the manner of traditional workers of magic and diviners. When foretelling the future, the evangelist speaks in a jargon purported to be the voice of God interjected into his mouth by the Holy Spirit, and only the specialist can translate what he has uttered once the state of possession is terminated. These denominations are known as "spiritualist" ones, and their dogmas are based upon various Biblical verses stressing the nature of the Holy Spirit, healing, prophesying, and speaking in diverse tongues.[6] Christ Army "catechists" instruct their communicants that *abassi* will forgive all sins so long as belief is held in Christ as Savior and these sins are confessed in a ceremony resembling that of the Catholic Church. Thus this body has incorporated into its doctrine elements of both Protestant and Catholic dogma.

---

[6] For example, the Christ Army Church bases its legitimacy on the following Biblical excerpts: Joel 2: 28-32, Matthew 10: 1-14, Mark 16: 17, Luke 9: 1-6, Acts, 2: 17, and I Corinthians 12: 4-11.

Whereas *abassi* is conceived in the indigenous religion as one who is largely unforgiving and will punish all misdemeanors, the Christian God is regarded as a forgiving deity. We saw that belief in a divine moral code and the ability of *abassi* to punish any deviations from its strictures are the most potent social control devices in Anang society. The acceptance by youth of the concept of a forgiving deity has greatly reduced the efficacy of supernatural sanctions and has actually fostered immorality. Lacking well-developed internal controls and freed from important external restraints, the Christian can deviate from prescribed ways of behaving with impunity.[7]

Effect of Legal Sanctions

The major regulator of conduct now is the threat of legal punishment for civil and criminal offenses. However, the British-introduced judiciary is viewed with contempt, and the Native Courts, in which most cases are tried, are notoriously corrupt. As a result of missionary influence, oath swearing before indigenous practitioners was discontinued in Native Courts in 1947 and swearing on the Bible substituted. Since young people believe that the Christian God will forgive perjury, and they are no longer forced to take the dreaded oath spirit into their bodies, there is no compulsion for them to speak truthfully. This eventuality has slowed judicial procedure, placed undue emphasis on circumstantial evidence, and caused many unfair verdicts. Persons wronged in court usually resort to sorcery in order to obtain redress, and as a result the practice of "black magic" has increased rapidly during the past few years.

Even though accepting Christian doctrines on a broad scale, most youth maintain indigenous beliefs concerning the power of the evil magic and oath spirits, witches, and ghosts. Despite attempts by most missionaries to discount the reality of these supernatural entities, traditional attitudes persist, or else these beings are collectively regarded as manifestations of the Devil, a view some missionaries support. Young people are fearful of the attacks of sorcerers, ghosts, and witches, and they employ preventive magic as frequently as do their elders to defend themselves. The only success traditional leaders have had in exerting any measure of authority over many recalcitrant youths is by resorting to the use of the oath spirit, who, in addition to castigating those who have sworn oaths falsely, is also able to punish other forms of immoral conduct.

It is important to note that immorality is more prevalent among young men than among young women. The latter are prone to be less honest in their trading affairs than in the past, and husbands generally claim that their young wives are more quarrelsome and adulterous than their counterparts thirty years ago. The Anang consider women to be more strongly motivated sexually than men, and the problem of adultery on the part of wives, especially those living in large polygynous households, was regarded as a rather serious one before the advent of the British. Many women when interviewed admitted that Anang wives are more adulterous today, but asserted that the Christian God forgives this offense. Most wives refuse to swear an oath when first married that they will not commit adultery, as was customary before the introduction of Christianity.

---

[7] It would appear that the nature of the personality controls of a people being converted to Christianity is an important factor explaining the success or failure of the proselyting effort. Roman Catholic missionaries are often more successful than their Protestant counterparts in converting Nigerians because of their willingness to employ strong external religious sanctions, which often involves modifications of Catholic dogma and rituals. This willingness to reinterpret Catholic and traditional religious forms, supplemented by a greater emphasis on ceremonialism and the use of icons, appeals to the Nigerians.

In conclusion, let it once again be pointed out that acceptance by youth of the Christian doctrine of a forgiving deity is only one among a number of major causes of immorality. The importance of non-religious forces, referred to only briefly and tangentially above, cannot be overemphasized in accounting for this phenomenon, so it is hoped that the accusation of "religious determinism" will not be directed against the paper.

G. Gordon Brown

Some Problems of Culture Contact

By drawing on data from East Africa and Samoa, Dr. Brown stresses the point that culture change, even the economic penetration of the West, may be resisted by a strong and elaborate social organization. Or, if not completely resisted, the innovation may be altered. He makes an analysis of the missionary role in the changes which have taken place in the two areas.

THE problems of culture contact are so complex that it is useful to analyze them and discuss separately the various factors which have influence. In these notes I shall confine myself to certain factors which can, to some extent, be abstracted and some data of their importance be obtained.

My examples are taken from the Hehe tribe of Tanganyika Territory in East Africa and from Samoa, the only non-Western cultures of which I know anything at first hand.

Period and Nature of Contact

When a primitive people is exposed to contact with representatives of the European cultures, it is obvious that the modifications of the native culture will depend upon the volume and intensity of the contact. At one end of the scale, we know the fate of the Hawaiians, whose culture was practically destroyed

---

The late G. Gordon Brown was Professor of Anthropology at the University of Toronto. His article is reprinted, by permission, from *Human Organization,* Vol. 16, No. 3 (Fall, 1957), pp. 11-14.

because of the variety and numbers of whites who visited and settled there. Only fragments of their culture remain, and, incidentally, only a small proportion of the people themselves. On the other end of the scale, there are tribes in the Sudan, whose cultural life is only essentially changed to the extent that tribal wars are prevented by the administration. Those acquainted with the American Indian will probably think of examples of both extremes.

Cultural change will also be affected by the nature of the contact. The people may have economic, political, and religious influences brought to bear upon them simultaneously, but one or the other may be predominant. In certain African tribes, the administration has the most influence; in others, mission activity is the dominant factor; and in others, economic factors such as wages, labor or trade are the most effective of foreign forces. Whatever the dominant influence, its nature will be a determinant in the cultural changes which occur.

These are all factors external to the native culture, and, although of utmost practical importance, will not be further discussed here. It is the other side of the problem which is of more interest to us. That is, given any kind and degree of foreign influence, the form and social values of the native culture will be a considerable factor in determining the nature of the cultural changes. It might be said that the native to some extent selects, from the mass of new elements of culture offered, those elements which most suit his own needs as determined by his own social values, and rejects or at least resists those things which do not fit into his indigenous system of social values. This is a statement of the obvious, but it is useful to make it clear, as that is the point of view from which illustrative examples will be presented.

Social Values and Material Culture

It is in the material culture that the influence of native social values in selecting new cultural elements can be most easily seen. In Samoa, for example, iron and steel were found to be vastly superior to stone implements. Consequently, iron and steel implements are much in demand. But not all the steel tools presented have been widely adopted: axes, knives and chisels are now used everywhere there, but a saw is not so common. A saw requires upkeep, it must be set and sharpened periodically, and a relatively small number of Samoans know how to do this. The favorite tool of the craftsman is the old adze but with a steel instead of a stone blade. The old form is retained but the new and superior material is substituted.

A better example is the choice of utensils for preparing *kava*. The serving of *kava* is highly ceremonial, from the time the fragments of dried root are put into the bowl to the drinking of the last cup. Nowadays the water is invariably brought in and poured from an ordinary bucket, purchased at the local traders, but the *kava* is mixed in the traditional wooden bowl, and no basin or utensil of Western manufacture is ever used for the purpose. The water container is merely a matter of convenience and the bucket is found to be superior to the bored coconut shells formerly used. The *kava* bowl, however, has important ceremonial functions, and has, therefore, a social value so that substitution of a modern trade vessel does not occur.

Similarly, the Samoan house, probably one of the most beautiful in the world, is holding its own against the American frame house. The frame house is cheaper to build and easier to keep in condition than the Samoan house, and a few are built. But, apart from the fact that the Samoan house is much better adapted to the climate, the American house makes little headway because of the social observances which have grown up around the Samoan house. The Samoan house is essentially a roof, held up by a system of posts, and there are no permanent walls. The people sit on mats at, or near, the posts. Each post of a large house has its social function. One is for the chief, others for talking chiefs, others for guests. Each part of the house is named, and the important posts are also named. Hence the Samoan house is necessary to the dignity of a ceremonial assembly. Accordingly when there is a choice, the Samoan house is always preferred. It is notable that in those parts of Apolu (Western Samoa) where the cash income is relatively high, there are architectural and structural modifications, such as the use of cement and the introduction of a second story, but they are modifications developing naturally from the Samoan house, not the substitution of the frame house for part or all of the Samoan house.

One or two examples from Tanganyika will further illustrate this point. One of the first articles of European furniture to be adopted by the Hehe was the bed. They already had native-made stools, and tables have not been of much use until recently with the slow growth of literacy. The beds replaced skins on which the Hehe used to sleep. They are rough articles, made of four rough hewn timbers nailed together to make a rectangular frame and across this frame are stretched lengths of thick cord making a primitive bedspring. The interesting point is that the bed was adopted with many restrictions. It can be used in health, but it must not be used by the sick, by mourners or by a menstruating woman. The restrictions formerly placed upon the marital sleeping skin were extended to the new bed. The cultural values did not forbid the adoption of an implement of comfort but they restricted its use.

Social Relationship

If the social structure is fundamentally strong, social relationships may change, but they will change slowly. For example, among both peoples under discussion, the relations between the sexes have undergone changes, but have not fundamentally altered. Two relationship may be mentioned to illustrate contrasts. First as between husband and wife, in Samoa the husband is actually and ceremonially superior, though the wife has inalienable rights which she can enforce and some women may have very great personal influence. All Samoans are real or nominal Christians, and the dominant mission group, the Congregationalist, has always tended to emphasize social equality. The result is, that in assemblies and feasts associated with the Church, men and their wives eat together, a formal recognition of approximate equality. But in ceremonial gatherings of a secular nature, men sit together as a rule, and the distinctions of rank and sex differences are again ceremonially expressed.

Both peoples, Samoan and Hehe, used to practice polygyny in the days before contact with Christianity. In Samoa, practically all people were nominal Christians after the first generation and polygyny disappeared. Among the Hehe, after a generation, only one-eighth of the tribe are Christians and even among them there are a certain number of unions of a man with more than one woman; these unions, though irregular in the eyes of the Church and the law, are marriages sociologically, because they are permanent, involve no stigma to the woman or her children and are respected by public opinion. There are probably many reasons for this difference between the peoples but it is here suggested that polygyny has more social value among the Hehe than it had among the Samoans. To the Hehe, plural marriage is a means of increasing the man's annual income (growth of crops), his prestige (hospitality, etc.) and his family (by relationship with the families of his wives and by his increased offspring). For the Samoans, polygyny was confined to high chiefs. It seemed to have a double utility; it was a means of extending political alliances; and each marriage was the occasion for much distribution of wealth. Thus it had functions but they were limited. The wealth of the chief depended not upon the number of his wives but upon the services and contributions of members of the extended kinship group who lived under his authority and protection. So also did his ability to practice hospitality on a generous scale. His prestige depended upon the title he held and the maintenance of the rites, ceremonies and obligations associated with that title. Where the population is dense, and when succession is not necessarily father to son, as among the Samoans, the rearing of a large family is not a primary necessity. Thus polygyny is of far greater social value to the Hehe than it ever was to the Samoans. It will disappear much more slowly, will be a factor retarding the spread of Christianity, and will tend to survive irregularly to a far greater extent than in Samoa.

The other relationship to be noted is the one between brother and sister. In both societies, this relationship is marked by restrictions and avoidances. The general facts of similarity are two: First, there must be no act suggesting familiarity between them and, particularly, all situations must be avoided in which there are words or acts suggestive of sexuality. Secondly, the relationship is extended, both in nomenclature and in social observance to a large circle. The differences are that the Samoans express this relationship ceremonially to a far greater degree than the Hehe, and that, the systems of kinship being different, the classificatory sisters are not the same in the two cultures. Among the Hehe, descent is primarily patrilineal and classificatory sisters include all female members of the father's clan, and all daughters of the mother's sisters; while cross-cousins are not called sisters, and are not treated as such. In Samoa, descent is bilineal; all women of the man's generation with whom blood relationship can be traced are classificatory sisters. These differences need not be emphasized here, but are given to complete the brief account.

In contrast to the relationship between husband and wife, which has changed to some extent in Samoa, and to a lesser degree in the Hehe, the relationship between brother and sister has changed hardly at all in either culture. The reasons are probably that they are essential to the organization of family life as conceived by both peoples; and also there is no pressure from the alien culture to change them. The relationship between husband and wife was repugnant to Christian missions and administration, and both religious and administrative efforts were made to effect a change. The relationship between brother and sister is not of such a nature as to worry either missionaries or administrative officers.

Economic Life and Social Responsibility

In economic life, both peoples strangely resemble each other. Both have acquired economic wants and must have a cash income to satisfy these, but both have resisted the tendency to be absorbed into a completely money economy. The position may be described briefly by saying that for the essential necessities of food and housing, the large majority of both peoples are outside the cash economy. Certain other needs may also be satisfied without the use of cash. Both peoples, however, are dependent upon imported goods for certain things now essential and must, therefore, have money. Both have also obligations to the Government which necessitate money. The Samoans import cotton dress goods, tinned foods, tools, kerosene and other articles. They support their churches and their pastors by money contributions. In American Samoa, they pay a money tax to the Government, though Western Samoa has abolished direct taxation and relies principally on customs duties.

The needs of the Hehe are similar though not so varied. Their chief imported goods are cotton dress goods and tools, and they pay a money tax to the Government.

Money is thus essential to the present economic life of both peoples, but only to a limited part of their economic life. The result is that every year an attempt is made to get the amount refunded for these needs and to seek no more. Various influences press to raise the level of cash income. In Samoa, the governments try to extend the range of exports and to increase the quantity, with some light success, but essentially the Samoans resist any attempt to make them work regularly either on their own plantation with a view to raising crops for export, or for wages. (An exception to this statement must be noted: In Western Samoa, the export of bananas has expanded considerably, but this affects only a limited area.)

Similarly, both the Government and planters have tried to induce the Hehe to increase their cash income by going out more freely to work for wages and experimental attempts have been made to develop crops for export; but the Hehe have not responded. Each family requires an income of between 30 and 40 shgs. a year for its cash requirements and some limited studies which I was able to make showed that this amount was maintained with remarkable regularity and exceeded by comparatively few.

Among both peoples, of course, there are a few individuals who have moved into a money economy, either trading or working for wages. About 5% of the Hehe work for wages all the year around. I have no estimates for the Samoans; the percentage of traders and regular wage-earners is probably much greater than 5% but it is still a minority.

The reason is the same for both peoples. Both value the full performance of their social and political obligations, and the adoption of regular work would make this impossible.

In Samoa, social and political obligations are expressed and emphasized by elaborate ceremonial, almost ritual. This takes time, both in preparation and actual performance. It also involves a large display and distribution of wealth, both foodstuffs and less perishable products. This ceremonial life is highly valued by them, both for the social values it expresses and as an end in itself, as something dignified and pleasant. It would be impossible for a people who spend most of their life working, such as a European peasant or a plantation wage force.

The Hehe have not created a highly ceremonial form of life, but they have a very great sense of social responsibility. This takes two forms. First, they must be ready to fulfill the proper obligations to a large circle of kindred. This involves assistance in planting crops, attendance at betrothals, weddings and funerals, participation in care for and attendance upon the sick, and many similar actions. Secondly, every man who aims to be respected in the community must assist at the settlement of legal disputes. The vast majority of these are settled by arbitration, without resort to the native courts recognized by the government, and all able men in the community are expected to take their share in this task. They are keen lawyers, being able to quote custom and precedent and at the same time to realize the modifications necessited by present conditions. It is obvious that their obligations to their kindred and to the community would both suffer if the bulk of their time were consumed in working for money.

Thus both Samoa and Hehe, although they have evolved cultures almost as widely different as it is possible to conceive, have the essential points in common that they are members of cultures still basically sound, that they respect their cultures and that they must devote a considerable portion of their time to the social obligations necessary to the proper expression and maintenance of the society. Thus neither are good subjects for economic development on Western lines. Neither, of course, are fools, and both would welcome an increased wealth if not accompanied by the necessity to devote much time to it; but beyond conventional requirements, the preference is to devote the time to social duties.

Thus, in this regard, the Samoans and the Hehe cannot be contrasted. The only point made is that a strong and elaborate social organization resists economic penetration. We can, however, offer another tribe as contrast. The tribe living next to the Hehe, the Bera, are closely related to the Hehe in custom and in language; they are; in fact, of the same basic culture. Nevertheless, they have not the same intense interest and pride in their own society and they go out to work in large numbers. In the country of the Hehe there are a number of European plantations. The Hehe supply a portion of the labor force but the Bera supply far more. In brief, both Samoans and Hehe have interests which are greater than the economic, once fundamental necessities are satisfied. These are associated with a healthy and enduring social order, and a pride and attachment to the cultural observances. This prevents the ready adoption of a money economy and their exploitation as wage-earners. In at least one tribe, the Bera, where these conditions do not hold, there is little to prevent the growth of a large body of wage-earners, if only there is a market for their labor.

Religion

Mention has been made several times of various effects of the Christian religion upon social institutions. The whole question of the reception of Christianity by the people might now be considered.

In Samoa there are three religious bodies to be considered (two others have only a very few converts). The London

Missionary Society, predominately Congregational, first arrived in 1830, the Methodists in 1832 and the Roman Catholics in 1835. Last year, the membership was Congregational 40,000, Methodists 9,000, Catholics 10,000, the remaining 5,000 Samoans belonging to the smaller bodies. The interesting point to note is the predominance of the Congregationalists. It is true that they arrived first, and suffered no interruption to their work, but it is also arguable that it is because their form of church organization is best suited to the Samoan political organizations.

The most coherent end enduring Samoan political unit is the village. Federalization or traditional alliances existed between larger groups, and there was even a titular king at times; but these larger entities only became effective under special circumstances, and seldom endured; the village alone endured. The Congregational Church fitted into this organization because the individual church is autonomous. It lends itself to village separatism and enables the Samoans to identify church and village as one. The Samoan Congregational Church is also a unit, but it is rather a federation of churches, granting limited powers to the central organization, rather than to an ecclesiastical hierarchy, thus it makes an appeal to the Samoans who are tenacious of local autonomy and who have absorbed the church and transformed it to their own uses. The more rigid central control of the Methodists has less appeal. As for Catholicism, while superficial observers suggest that its impressive ritual would appeal to the ceremony-loving Samoans, its hierarchical organization is a serious handicap. There are at least grounds for suggesting that the Congregational Church owes its growth to its adaptability to Samoan politics rather than to its earlier start.

There appeared to be little Samoan resistance to mission effort. I have already suggested that polygyny was no bar and there is also the probability that the indigenous Samoan religion was in the process of internal decay before Christianity arrived. The Hehe on the other hand have an initial resistance to new religions. At present if they wish to adopt a new religion they are faced with the choice between Catholicism, Lutheranism or Mohammedanism. All have their drawbacks. If they become Catholics they must give up polygyny. If they become Mohammedans they must give up their native beer, which plays an important part in their lives. If they become Lutherans they must give up both.

This, together with a firm belief in the power of the ancestral spirits, may explain why, after a period of contact of forty years (conquest 1898), out of a total of 85,000 there are 9,000 Catholics, 6,000 Mohammedans and 45 Lutherans in the tribe. I would venture the opinion that eventually all the tribe will be divided largely into Catholics and Mohammedans, with a small minority of Lutherans. The ultimate success of missions seems inevitable, but their triumph will take a longer time, and will suffer many setbacks.

Eugene A. Nida

The Role of Cultural Anthropology in Christian Missions

After making a survey of some of the different attitudes toward culture and the mission of the church which have stimulated the study of culture and anthropology, Nida suggests that none of them are adequate. He considers the prime service which the study of culture has to offer to be that of a valuable basis for relevant communication, whether it be in the choice of words, in the cultural relevance of the message, or the issues to which the gospel is addressed. He feels that communication based upon a perceptive understanding of a culture can stimulate some members of the culture to make vital decisions for Christ in a responsible way.

THERE have been a number of quite different concepts as to the role of cultural anthropology in Christian missions. For some the application of anthropological techniques to missions has seemed nothing less than a panacea for all ills, that is to say, the most effective means of transforming the society through newly discovered insights. Such persons have thought that if they could just understand the culture, they could easily set about changing it.[1]

Other missionaries have regarded the study of cultural anthropology as providing the data on which the missionary might build the Christian message. As Edwin W. Smith so strongly advocated, the missionary was to find in the indigenous religious system the equivalent of the Old Testament viewpoint and background, and on this foundation he was to work out a Christian orientation. The equating of the Old Testament experience of the Jewish people with the indigenous religious traditions was thought to provide the essential contact and basis for the proclamation of the Good News.

Still a third point of view, and one not wholly dissimilar from the second, has been that the application of cultural anthropology to missionology would ease the transition from indigenous religious superstitions and practices to Christian beliefs and rites. By a carefully planned series of adjustments the people could be led progressingly toward the acceptance of the gospel, with the least disruption of native cultural values. This view has been vigorously endorsed and followed by the Jesuits in their missionary efforts,[2] and not without remarkable success, in terms of Jesuit goals.

---

[1] Dale W. Kietzman, "Conversion and Culture Change," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 5, Nos. 5-6 (Sept.-Dec., 1958), pp. 203-210, has suggested those areas of personal interaction in which the application of this subject of cultural anthropology is highly relevant. Our concern is more in the direction of those procedures of acculturation which must be carried out with due concern for the culture of the people if significant or permanent changes are to be realized.

Despite the popularity of these applications of cultural anthropology, it would seem that fundamentally none of them is satisfactory. In the first place, the knowledge of cultural anthropology is no panacea in the development of a mission program. Merely knowing how people function within their culture does not provide the answers to how certain aspects of this functioning can be changed. This does not mean that cultural anthropology cannot be highly instructive to the missionary in introducing modifications in the beliefs and practices of a people, but a mere descriptive view of a people's culture is not enough. Moreover, the methods by which the data of cultural anthropology may be effectively applied to a practical problem are not inherent within the facts of cultural study. There is much more involved — and this we shall try to explain below.

The view that the indigenous religious system, regardless of its nature, orientation, or practices, can provide a kind of "Old Testament experience" for the people is the result of a superficial understanding of either the Old Testament or the local religion. There are, of course, many similarities between religious practices recorded in the Old Testament and the so-called animistic features of primitive religions, such as ordeals, sacrifices, seers, mediums, scapegoats, taboo, etc., but there are more important matters which make the fuller religious revelation of the Old Testament unique: (1) monotheism, in contrast with henotheism (i.e. one exclusive God in place of merely one high god), (2) the relationship of moral behavior to religious holiness (i.e. the moral content of taboo), and (3) the initiative of God in loving and redeeming mankind. These three factors (and there are a number of others) set off the theology of the Old Testament from the concepts of animistic religions in such a way as to provide fundamental and basic differences, which can never be reconciled by pointing out superficial similarities and then trying to build a New Testament structure on an indigenous foundation.

Jesuit Syncretism

The Jesuit system of accommodation did not begin with the Counter Reformation, which brought the Jesuit movement into being. It actually had its start in the year 601 when Pope Gregory VII wrote to the priests attempting at that time to convert the heathen Britons:

> We must refrain from destroying the temples of the idols. It is necessary only to destroy the idols, and to sprinkle holy water in these same temples, to build ourselves altars and place holy relics therein. If the construction of these temples is solid, good, and useful, they will pass from the cult of demons to the service of the true God; because it will come to pass that the nation, seeing the continued existence of its old places of devotion, will be disposed, by a sort of habit, to go there to adore the true God.
>
> It is said that the men of this nation are accustomed to sacrificing oxen. It is necessary that this custom be converted into a Christian rite. On the day of the dedication of the temples thus changed into churches, and similarly for the festivals of the

---

[2] Peter Duignan, "Early Jesuit Missionaries: A Suggestion for further Study," *American Anthropologist*, Vol. 6, No. 4 (August 1958), pp. 725-32.

> saints, whose relics will be placed there, you should allow them, as in the past, to build structures of foliage around these same churches. They shall bring to the churches their animals and kill them, no longer as offerings to the devil, but for Christian banquets in name and honor of God, to whom, after satiating themselves, they will give thanks. Only thus, by preserving for men some of the worldly joys, will you lead them more easily to relish the joys of the spirit.[3]

In the Jesuit development of this principle (and not without opposition from many quarters of the Roman church, especially from the Franciscans and Dominicans) the technique was to assume "a thousand masks," "being all things to all men" and with "holy cunning" to accept the limitations imposed by the local situation. One must not, however, be too severe in one's criticisms of the Jesuit position, for fundamentally they recognized the fact of cultural relativism, namely, that the same practices in different cultures had quite different meanings and values. They rejected the Platonic concept of "idealistic ethics" and endorsed the Aristotelean view of Nichomachean ethics, based on a sense of cultural diversity and practical application.

Moreover, the Jesuit practices were an understandable reaction to the wanton disregard for the indigenous culture, so often practiced by other Roman Catholic orders. (For example, in Mexico the Franciscans by 1531 had pulled down 500 temples, broken 20,000 idols, burned countless manuscripts, and smashed thousands of priceless objects of art.)

Perhaps the greatest irony of the conflict between Jesuit and non-Jesuit efforts on the part of the Roman Catholic missionaries has been the fact that both incorporated such a high degree of syncretism, whether consciously (as in the case of the Jesuits) or as forced by circumstances, that in the end the "converts" became related to a different set of practices, but with very little fundamental change in basic beliefs. What actually happened in so many cases was that Jesuits did not carry through with a total plan for adjustment, and non-Jesuits found that the shortest road to the goals established by the church necessitated adjustments, not dictated by theory, but imposed by force of circumstances.

For example, the early Franciscans destroyed the imposing temple in the ancient religious capital of Mitla, Oaxaca, Mexico. With the stones from the pagan structure they built a church in the valley, but the people continued to worship amid the ruins on the hilltop. At last, the missionaries adjusted to the pressures of the situation, had the churched pulled down, and rebuilt it on the site of the original Zapotec shrine. Of course, if the purpose of any missionary undertaking is to bring the people into the jurisdiction of the church, then a syncretistic approach is both efficient and expedient. However, if the purpose is to bring the people into a new orientation to life through a new relationship to God, as revealed in Jesus Christ, then a system of syncretism tends to cancel out any gains and the distinctiveness of Christianity becomes almost totally lost. In Orura, Bolivia, for example, during the fiesta of the Day of Temptation, not only do the devil dancers utterly fail to depict any Christian themes or motifs (despite their perfunctory blessing by ecclesiastical authorities), but the very concept of the day is perverted, for this day, which is supposed to commemorate

---

[3] Ibid.

Christ's resistance to the wiles of the Devil, is reinterpreted by many people as a time during which people may yield to temptation without incurring penalties.

The Basis of Communication

If, however, as we have suggested, the legitimate role of cultural anthropology is not to be found in reconstructing a base for Christianity in pagan practices or easing the transition by syncretistic adaptations, what then is it? I would like to suggest that basically the study of anthropology provides a means of effective communication. In and of itself cultural anthropology does not provide the answers to how, when, and why certain approaches should be made. But it can and should resolve some of the major problems of communication which are inherent in any missionary undertaking. The implications of such a proposition are naturally very extensive, but in their simplest forms we may say that the knowledge of cultural anthropology, as it applies to the cultures involved in any missionary task (i.e. the cultures of the missionary and the people to be reached — the so-called source and target cultures), provides an orientation as to (1) the relevance of the symbols by which the Good News is communicated and (2) the means by which these symbols may be communicated in a context which is meaningful to the people of the target culture.[4]

We seem to have no difficulty in understanding the phrase "born, not of blood" (John 1: 13) as being some reference to lineage, for we often speak of "royal blood," "a true blue-blood," and "the blood line." However, in many cultures the word "blood" has no such implications. In Apache, for example, such a phrase would be relatively meaningless, but if someone tried to attach meaning to the utterance the only significance it could have would be that a child was born without any blood in his veins or that the mother in question did not bleed at childbirth. A study of cultural anthropology can provide a missionary with a basis for recognizing the differences in the two symbolic systems, and to know that in Apache for example, the English word "blood" in this type of context must be equated with "family" or "clan."

In one area in West Africa missionaries have for years used a word for "spirit" which has quite a different meaning from the Biblical expression. In this region the word actually means "soul stuff," the basic substance which gives life to all animate existence. God Himself is regarded as possessing such a substance, and it is variously distributed throughout the universe, and quantitatively allocated in various degrees on different levels of existence, so that insects have very little, animals have more (depending upon their strength), and man most of all (with corresponding degrees of such power reflecting levels within the socio-economic structure). When in this language missionaries declare that God (whom they designate as Allah) is "soul-stuff," they are expressing nothing more or less than pantheism, and it is not without reason that these Islamicized peoples seem unimpressed, if not downright shocked, by such a heretical message.

Of course, a study of cultural anthropology will not guarantee that a message communicated to any group of people will be accepted. Far from it! Cultural anthropology only helps to guarantee that when the message is communicated, the people are more likely to understand. And it is this very fact of understanding it which may result in the people's rejecting it! But this is much better than to have them appear to accept it, when they really do not understand its significance. Once, however, the missionary has a thorough understanding of the cultural relevance of the symbols which he must employ in order to communicate, it is very much more likely that he can at least speak with meaning to the people, thus establishing the first and indispensable level for any missionary undertaking.

---

[4] It would be a mistake to assume that all the communicative symbols employed by missionaries are words (they actually include much more, e.g. gestures, acts of kindness, art forms, music, etc.), but for the sake of our limited analysis we shall restrict ourselves to verbal forms for they are indicative of the basic problems encountered in other areas of symbol utilization.

Basis for Cultural Relevance

Any proclamation of the Good News must, however, advance far beyond a mere recognition of the proper equivalence of word symbols. It must be so oriented that the total impact may be evident to the hearers. This means that the gospel should not be presented as one of the accoutrements of Western civilization, as a watered-down compromise with indigenous beliefs, or as merely another and more powerful technique for doing business with the supernatural. (There is no legitimate place for encouraging the view of "this Jesus-God, he strong god too.")

If the communication of the Christian message is to be culturally meaningful, in terms of the total lives of the people, certain features are essential: (1) It must use meaningful indigenous symbols wherever any concepts are crucial and (2) the implications of the message must be explained in concrete terms which are culturally applicable within a given society.

Because of the inadequacy of indigenous symbols, missionaries have often felt that they could best introduce borrowed words. This may be quite all right for terms for *camel, phylacteries, Pharisees,* and *dragon,* for the proper understanding of these terms is not crucial; but in the case of a word for *spirit* or *God,* such borrowings are almost fatal. Certainly much of the effectiveness of the preaching of the gospel to the Navajos through the years has been hampered by the use of the English term *God,* which actually resembles in sound the Navajo term for juniper bush. In Apache, on the other hand, missionaries have employed an indigenous term meaning "by whom life comes into being," in other words the Creator, but also the Sustainer of life. This expression is culturally meaningful and has served, together with other well-chosen expressions, as part of the basis for effective communication.

Communication does not, however, consist merely of strings of utterances, meaningful as they may be within the language in question. Such words must be related to life, or they are nothing more than catechisms to be memorized (as a passport to heaven) rather than as programs for living. One must tackle real issues and in a thoroughly Christian manner. What, for example, is one to do with ritual drunkenness which occurs as a manifestation of many religious celebrations among primitive peoples? It is certainly not adequate to denounce such practices as being "naughty-naughty" or to apply to them the often unthought-out tenets of Protestant Puritanism. Such drunkenness must be treated for what it is, namely, a false kind of religious estasy,[5] a sincere but misguided attempt to find communion with God. But in its place the missionary must be able to demonstrate real communion, which lifts men above the drab experiences of the secular humdrum and gives them the thrill of being the children of God.

---

[5] Eugene A. Nida, "Drunkenness in Indigenous Religious Rites," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 6, No. 1 (Jan.-Feb., 1959).

An emphasis upon moral righteousness may lead the missionary to denounce excessive "bride payment." This should not be done, however, on the basis that there is anything morally wrong in the concept of such transactions, for in their proper application they can do much to stabilize marriage and to consolidate clan relationships. However, in their selfish excesses such bride payments deprive many people of their moral rights, they tend to commercialize the sacred institution of marriage, and they often thwart the expression of genuine love. The proclamation of the Christian way of life must involve one in just such problems, not as a despiser of all indigenous institutions, but as one who sees in all human forms the potentiality of corruption. In other words, one must take seriously "the theology of man," including a realistic evaluation of man's egocentric orientation.

Such an attempt at a realistic view of life will not prevent serious misinterpretations by the sending constituency as to a missionary's message or motivations. For example, he may feel his mission is not justified in refusing to grant communion to sincere believers who are polygamists and who have a high sense of moral responsibility toward obligations incurred before learning of the gospel, or to those living together in common-law arrangements which may not be resolvable because of arbitrary laws about divorce. His judgment may be based on the fact that though such refusal may preserve the sanctity of the church, it prevents the spiritual growth of men and women for whom also Christ died. In other words the spotlessness of the church may not be so important as the spiritual nurture of human souls, who are admittedly bound for heaven because they believe in Jesus Christ but who are kept out of the fellowship of the church.

Stimulus to Radical Decisions

A study of cultural anthropology makes it possible for one to see life through the eyes of those who participate in it. Hence, the proclamation must challenge men and women where they are. The Good News for poor workers in the slum *barrios* of Lima, Peru, must not be a translation of some sermon framed for a small-town congregation in America's Bible Belt (which this writer once heard delivered). In Congo the message must deal with such matters as *gaza* rites (involving cliterectomy), equal opportunities for girls, the rightful place of education, the correct employment of natural resources, such as land and game (which are being mercilessly exploited), righteous dealings between employers and employees (including everything from joining trade unions to paying decent wages to mission help), plain ordinary honesty, respect for leadership, abuse of power, etc. But all of these themes, which arise out of the Good News as revealed in Jesus Christ, must be related to the crucial issues of each man's life.

If the gospel is to be presented with utter abandon to the claims of God upon men, it will mean that many persons who might go along with a neutral, syncretistic, a "white-man-he-knows-better" presentation of the Christian message, will reject culturally relevant proclamations. They are too hard to take — even as they were rejected by so many who listened to the Master Himself. This means, therefore, that a knowledge of cultural anthropology and the application of these data to the proclamation of the gospel may actually result in fewer responses to the Good News (at least at first). But the point is this: the relevant witness to the revelation of God in Christ will force upon men and women the necessity of making vital decisions. Such a declaration of the full claims of God upon men (for not only their souls but their lives) will make possible an ultimate acceptance of the message which will mean more than adherence to a set of ritualistic observances. It will be nothing less than a rebirth by the power of God, who alone can take this witness to the truth and communicate it to the life and heart of people.

The application of cultural anthropology thus becomes the effective instrument by which men may be pressed (by the Spirit of God) to make radical decisions about life's fundamental crises.

K. A. Busia

Africa in Transition – I
Before European Colonization

In this issue and the two following, we present a series of articles by a leading African sociologist on three important phases of changing Africa. In this first part the author discusses some of the fundamental characteristics of African point of view. The description is of the spiritual world of African people before they were influenced by European civilization and Christianity, but much of it is by no means lost today, as the author often personally testifies. The parts which follow are "Africa under European Colonialism" and "Africa and Technical Civilization."

Metaphysics of Primitive Africa

In discussing the African conception of a supreme being as a creator, it must be pointed out that though ideas may vary from tribe to tribe, all believe that this supreme being is charged with power and that this power can be both beneficent and dangerous. They also believe in lesser deities who are also charged with power. These deities may be associated with hills, trees, rivers, and even with animals and other things in nature. But they all derive their power from the supreme being and they need to be propitiated by men. They take notice of men's actions, they desire human attention, they confer favors upon men and they punish wrong doing. (Please note, they punish wrong doing in this world, not in the next.) The punishment may be misfortunes or illness or even death. These deities have moods; they do not always do what is good and sometimes they are destructive.

In this connection may I draw your attention to a very interesting problem. How do you preach about the problem of evil to a congregation with this kind of background? It is only when a god who is not only omnipotent but also perfect and loving is postulated, that the problem of evil becomes puzzling. But when you have a world peopled by gods of different potency, some of whom can be doing mischief to men, the problem of evil does not arise. Evil results from the action or counter action of one of the many gods. Nature, too, can have power.

What is this concept of nature? I remember listening to a talk not long ago by a world-famous agriculturalist who was bemoaning the fact that modern man's irreverent attitude to nature had resulted in the wanton destruction of

---

Professor K. A. Busia was, until recently, Professor of Sociology at the University College of Ghana. He holds a doctorate in anthropology from Oxford and is author of several studies on the Ashanti. His article "Ancestor Worship" appeared in Vol. 6, No. 1 (Jan. - Feb., 1959) of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY. The present series of articles is reprinted, by permission, from *Project Papers No. 10* of the Department of Church and Society of the World Council of Churches.

nature, to such an extent that everywhere men were faced with the problem of the scarcity of food. Be that as it may, amongst many African communities there is the concept that nature, too, can have power, power both beneficent and dangerous. And nature, too, can have evil spirits. This is the doctrine which is often called animism. (That is to say, a tree or a rock can be the habitation of a spirit.)

May we just dismiss these ideas as the superstitions of an ignorant people? Or is there something here that we have to deal with? In my country it was not unusual to see an African standing in the presence of a huge tree and offering an egg to the tree and repeating: "The cedar tree or the cotton tree, I am about to cut you. Do not let any harm befall me. Do not let this knife spring back and cut me." Here is a reverent attitude being shown to a natural object; and along with it, the fact that this tree can also be useful. The reverent attitude does not preclude the tree from being useful. In the same way the farmer may offer a sacrifice to Mother Earth. Mother Earth is conceived as having herself a power, a potency which makes things grow; and the farmer must be on the right side of that power.

I would like to pose one or two problems especially for those of you who have grown up in Western culture, to be considered in relation to these matters. I grew up in a community full of such ideas as these. I saw libations poured to the spirit of the dead ancestors. Walking through the paths of my village I often saw eggs offered at the bottom of trees. Then I went to Oxford to read philosophy. There I was told that the things which I saw and which seemed real to me may not be real at all. They may just be figments of my own imagination. Sometimes I grinned and my grinning irritated my teachers. It was the sign to them that this ignorant African was incapable of philosophical thinking. Maybe or maybe not. Because my mind continually flew back to what I had seen my own people do, I began to ask questions. First of all were they not also expressing something that could be put in a philosophical term? They were not expressing merely their ignorance of material substances or natural causes, but may also have been expressing a theory of reality, namely that behind the visible substances of things lies an essence, or power, which constitute their true nature. I refer you to some of the modern descriptions of natural objects. When you read modern physicists' descriptions of the power and energy which not only lie behind but also compose all matter, you become aware that you are in a world that either demands your worship or your incredulity.

The African view of nature is that this nature has power and that this power may be both useful and harmful. It may be revered as well as used for man's benefit. The African may sit in church, and join in a harvest ceremony praising the creation of the Father and the gifts of the earth, but it will not stop him from thinking that the earth has power in itself. It probably will not stop him from taking part, without any sense of contradiction, in a ceremony of thanksgiving to the earth for her favors.

Concept of Man

What about man himself? There is a widespread belief amongst African peoples that man is a compound of material and immaterial substances and is both a biological and a spiritual being. The concept that physical death is not the end of man is illustrated throughout Africa in rituals, libations to ancestors, and dances. On this dualistic view of man the social organization is sometimes built. The Ashanti people, for example, have a maternal kinship structure. They conceive of a man as being more closely identified with a mother's group than with a fathers', because the blood, according to their belief, is transmitted through the mother. Therefore, a person's status, citizenship, rights of inheritance, etc., are all derived from the mother. But the father transmits spirit, that which gives a man his personality, and this again is expressed in society in different ways. The man is responsible for the upbringing of his child although he shares this responsibility with the mother's group. But there is one responsibility which is solely paternal — the responsibility for the moral upbringing of a child is wholly vested in the father. A man may be an adult, yet if he commits adultery with somebody else's wife, his father is held responsible for the payment of the satisfaction, because he is responsible for his moral upbringing.

Now among African people are found many and elaborate concepts of the soul. For example, as a spiritual being, the Ashanti is conceived as having a twofold gift of the spirit. There is one which determines character, individuality and personality (what in the native language you might describe as a "face or countenance"). This he receives from his father. There is therefore a bond of common worship of the soul between father and son. The Ashanti has a second gift of spirit received directly from the supreme being. This determines his destiny and what he does on earth. Among some other tribal peoples it is not unusual for a man to possess as many as four souls. One is inherited from the ancestor and is the guardian spirit of the individual, the second is the personal soul, while the third is a small bit of the creator that lives in every person's body, and the fourth soul, transmitted through the adult male, is associated with a concept of destiny. The heavy accent of heritage in this fourfold concept of the soul makes it impossible for an adult to know fulfillment of himself apart from a fulfillment shared by all ancestral contributors to his spiritual wholeness.

The concept of kinship amongst African peoples is marked by an emphasis on ancestral worship. The concept of the family is that it consists of a large number of people, many of whom are dead, a few of whom are living and countless numbers of whom are yet to be born. Amongst the Ashanti people the land which they occupy does not belong to the living alone. The living have only inherited the right to use it. Therefore they are not permitted to sell their land in the way in which European law conceives of the sale of land. A man may temporarily transfer to another his inherited right to use the land but he can never permanently part with land. A successor can redeem leased land because the real owners of the land are the ancestors. Of course, such a concept of group kinship obligations are hardly congruous in a world being invaded by competitive capitalism.

Problem of Change

When we deal with the problem of change in Africa, we must deal with the problem in a slightly different way from the treatment of social change in Europe. In Europe we are dealing with change resulting from technological development mainly initiated from within the framework of European society. In Africa you are dealing with changes and disruptions resulting from an invasion of technology into the framework of African society. And the results, as I shall try to show, are more revolutionary because here we are dealing with changes resulting from foreign initiation.

I used to tell my teachers in economics that I could not understand their economic theories because they did not apply to my society. All the theories about demand determining supply just did not work in Africa. A man goes to a shop having sold his cocoa. He sees there a machine that he has never conceived of. A machine called a gramophone that plays records. He buys it. It is not demand that dictated that supply, it is supply which has initiated that demand. And when he takes it home he must adapt himself to that supply. It may very easily lead to a whole series of social changes. In fact, he has often to adapt his whole attitude to turn a new personality in order to fit in with Western concepts of industrialization.

Many people who work with Africans will tell you that they have no concept of time. When you are given an invitation you must ask whether the three o'clock on the invitation is European time or African time, the reason being that whereas European time indicates an exact point in the day, African time, at best, suggests the part of the day the inviter is referring to. Africans have to learn that they are now living in a competitive capitalist economy demanding punctuality and making man a slave to a clock. A man who is illiterate has his own time. He gets up when he feels like it and goes to work when he feels like it. Slowly he is being forced to make a complete adaptation to a new situation which radically changes his old personality, even his concept of time. There is then in this whole gamut of changes a demand for changes in attitudes, habits, and sentiments. When church services are planned to begin at ten o'clock, missionaries are probably unaware of the fact that they are introducing a revolution into the community. The church itself is a vehicle of a new culture. In some respects the influence of the church is a thin veneer. In other respects the church as a vehicle of Western culture has made a very pronounced impact on Africa. What I have to say about the church as a vehicle of culture may be slightly distasteful to those whose primary interest is the evangelistic work of the church; but to evaluate the benefits of the church and its real influence on society in my own country, I would give higher marks to its cultural achievements than to its spiritual evangelistic achievements.

The Sociologist's View

Now I think I have sufficiently introduced the problem of culture differences. What has a sociologist to say about this? The sociologist does get involved with philosophical questions in his studies, but his real job is to study societies in action. Here he finds that characteristic of men's dealings with one another is a scarcity of goods and a scarcity of positions. Therefore the problems of justice, rights, and power always arise.

In a sense, community life is a network of combinations of power. All group relations require some coercion. The question is not only how much power, but also how much freedom does an individual have. That is the sociological question. It is expressed in terms of the relationship between the chief and the subject, father and son, husband and wife, etc. How much freedom ought we to have? is not a sociological question, and I do not think that the sociologist *qua* sociologist has an answer to such a question. When a sociologist studies such things as land tenure, property, kinship relations, marriage, the reciprocal relations of parents and children, of brothers and sisters, of chief and subject, he learns about ideas of right and wrong. All these have reference to differing concepts of moral principles. And so we can say that the empirical studies of the sociologist and the social anthropologist point to the pluralism and relativism of cultural and moral values.

This is a problem because motivations of right and wrong differ greatly and take on varying expressions in different communities. Are there certain broad principles which are applicable to all human societies, or must we regard every society as having its own concept of right and wrong and its own moral system which all must respect? A well-established sociological principle points out that virtue is not something which the individual can possess or enjoy independently of his fellows. A man attains fulfillment only in and through his participation in a culture. The inner harmony which constitutes his virtue must belong to the larger harmony of his life with others. The standards of virtue everywhere must be relative to culture. There is naturally a difference between the personality of a man who grows up in a culture where competition is keen, and that of a man who grows up in a slow and stable society where the emphasis is on gentleness, on patience, and on keeping the same job in order to "win a gold watch after twenty-five years."

Many African societies emphasize human behavior and generosity. Men are respected not by what they accumulate but by what they give. The chief, for example, must maintain his position by his largess and liberality. (In the contemporary situation where his funds are limited, his beneficence suffers sometimes.) Now contrast this example with an economy in which you must defer immediate consumption in order to build up capital for further investment. Everybody who has studied African economy is aware of the lack of capital among African people. The fact is that the African family system and family structure make it impossible for them to build up this capital. Therefore they are considered underdeveloped.

Main Thesis

Now I come my main thesis. Some sociologists have claimed that the data accumulated support the view that, since cultures are relative and since you must respect every culture in its own right because we have no scientific technique for evaluating cultures qualitatively, all we can do in order to live peacefully in this world of ours is to be tolerant of one another's culture. They have even criticized the idea of a universal declaration of human rights on the grounds that no one moral standard can be universally applied in a world of differing cultures.

Now you can see the obvious implication of this for Christianity. Christianity claims to be a universal religion because it is based on the supposition that it is possible for all men, irrespective of their cultural background, to share values in common. What then are we to make of this cultural relativism which some sociologists proclaim? Among the sociologists there are some who say, in fact, that things like justice, right, and beauty can be discovered in every society but these universals have no common expression.

The sociologist cannot settle the general and abstract questions of philosophy and ethics implied here because his questions are posed differently. The questions considered by Butler or Bentham or Hume or Comte among other moral philosophers are not the questions normally or legitimately considered by sociologists. A sociologist does not ask what is the chief good, what is a right act, what is the ground of obligation. I am not implying that these questions have no social implications, but they are not the central concern of the sociologist. What I am saying is that the primary job of the sociologist is to examine a particular society to ascertain the ideas of right and wrong (without imposing his judgment) that are held to determine the degree to which these ideas are embodied in the mores of the group. In this type of study, sociologists have discovered cultural diversities and similarities. They have discovered, too, that cultures are learned.

I have tried to show you ideas which are held in a community totally different from your own. We now turn to the question for the church. Is it possible for Christians to have the kind of fellowship and communion which is based on shared values, or is cultural relativism so powerful that East is East and West is West and never the twain shall meet? I do not think that the sociologist's questions are posed in a way which will enable him, as a sociologist, to answer this question. In my view we have to look for the answers along other lines. It is a sociological fact that cultures are learned. It is true that sociologists have shown that in the midst of cultural diversities cultural characteristics can be transplanted from one culture to another. If a person is given a sufficient exposure to a culture, he learns it. Therefore cultural relativism is not an adequate argument for a permanent division among men. And I believe that we have to take the Christian society itself as a sociological fact. When Christian people from different cultures and backgrounds do meet they find an intellectual and spiritual communion which is often closer than the communion they have with people of their own culture who do not share their faith. That, too, I think, is a sociological fact.

Hallmarks of Culture

Now there are some who are inclined to judge African cultures as backward and attach to Africa the descriptive title of "an underdeveloped country." Is this judgment made in terms of material culture orin terms of moral culture? What is the criterion of progress or what is the criterion of cultural judgment? As you know, this is a question which philosophers and sociologists have asked and to which a variety of answers have been given. For myself the most convincing criterion for progress is the enlargement of human sympathy and a growing appreciation for justice and individual rights in their widening application over an expanding sphere of influence.

I want to conclude with a story. In 1817 the first British resident arrived in Kumasi in Ashanti, in Ghana. He witnessed many things with a very keen eye. His book is full of very accurate descriptions of places, practices, and attitudes. One of the things he described at length was a tribal purification ceremony. The chief came out bedecked in all his glory and his people followed him to the river where he sprinkled water on his people as a sign of the beginning of another year and thanks to the gods. This is all very beautifully described by the author. He also mentions the fact that leading the dancing procession there were two people who had been condemned to die. These two people had knives pierced through their cheeks and were being paraded in front of this procession, in their agony and pain, to their execution. The author with the sensitivity of a civilized man concluded his description with the judgment: "I was glad that I belonged to a civilized country."

In the year 1945 an Ashanti, namely myself, was browsing around a bookshop in Oxford. I picked up an interesting book of photographs, illustrations of some of the concentration camps in Europe. I saw photographs of caves where human bones were piled on top of one another and where human bodies were reduced to ashes. I saw train loads of people stacked in a carriage, put out at their destination, all dead. I cut out one of these pages and I pasted it in my book of descriptions of Ghana in 1817. Across the very big picture of a barbarian chief in all his glory I put one of these photos from a European concentration camp. Beneath the one I wrote "Ashanti 1817" and beneath the other "Europe 1945," with no other comment.

Here I made a cross-cultural judgment as did the author of these 19th century descriptions who did not say to himself: "These people have a culture different from my own, and therefore this torture of two people is something on which I cannot pronounce a judgment." Neither was I saying that these people in Europe have a civilization — they can ride on the earth, above the earth, and beneath the sea and can do things that I have never dreamt of before — and therefore I have no right to pronounce judgment on these murders.

I did make that judgment. Is that not an answer, on the basis of experience, to the problem of cultural relativism? But do we not likewise give an answer to cultural relativism every time a Christian community meets and within a short time, despite the diversities of backgrounds and cultures, breaks down these barriers and establishes a true community? Is that not also a living sociological fact? There are sufficient illustrations to show that the problems of intercommunication can be overcome and real understanding of different cultural situations is not simply a theoretical possibility. Such calculated optimism based on sociological facts reacts against any opinion naïve enough to suggest that East is (or could be only) East and West is (or could only be) West and never the twain shall meet (or can keep from meeting).

Douglas N. Morgan

Ritual Value-Washing Among the Weinerkreiser

In this tongue-in-cheek article, Dr. Morgan describes and criticizes that highly sophisticated "tribe" of people with the philosophical point of view called logical positivism. But even if the average reader of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY *has no particular abiding interest in logical positivists, he may well be struck by Dr. Morgan's discussion of human values, and of the fact that we cannot extricate ourselves from them. Not only can we not escape them, but neither can we escape responsibility for them.*

PRELITERATE cultures are now being widely and well described, but little anthropological attention has yet been paid to the only postliterate tribe in the world: the now widely-dispersed Wienerkreiser or, as they are extra-tribally known, the logical positivists. Having learned to write spoken languages, these curious people have also learned *not* to write them; instead, they construct logical schemata for the hypothetical expression of everything hypothetically "scientific," as they use this term. During the past twenty years, they have extended their kinship relations among the social scientists. Especially characteristic of the Wienerkreiser, and the subject of this brief note, is their quaint Viennese custom of ritual value-washing.

This custom has become a kind of scientific methodological purification ceremony. It consists in immersing each rich, human, social fact in a vat of skeptical corrosion; when lifted out again, the fact is thought to have been magically cleansed. It has become a transparent and trivial sense datum or "neutral empirical observation." Out of such denatured data, the Wienerkreiser dream that they will be able to construct a schema for understanding not only psychology but also (though hardly anyone has yet been bold enough to try) society as well.

Within the tribe, this ritual functions to maintain prestige, and each initiate is required to give evidence of being able to recognize the out-group deviation and to respond with the proper in-group tribal cry: "Nonsense!" Valuing tautological clarity and purity above all else, the natives feel able by these incantations to protect themselves from contamination by merely human value-facts.

We should perhaps be guilty of ethnocentrism were we to point out the self-defeating stultification of such procedures, or the logical absurdity of erecting into an absolute value the unique value of denying the reality of anybody else's values. But we should also be der-

---

Douglas N. Morgan is chairman of the Department of Philosophy of Northwestern University. His article is reprinted by permission from *American Anthropologist,* Vol. 59, No. 5 (1957), pp. 871-874.

elict if we did not try to indicate the danger to serious social scientists of such cutting off (or, as we might term it, *Wienerwertschnitzel*) of human values.

Anthropological Relativism

Anthropologists today seek mutual understanding of varying culture patterns, but this understanding is impossible if we impose *a priori* the exclusive norms of one culture group upon another. We therefore seek, within the limits of our ability, to see the Dobuan world as the Dobuans see it. This is a valuable gain, and must not be given up. We must no longer assume that our own culture exemplifies all good, and that other cultures, so far as they deviate from ours, are for that reason alone either "primitive" or "abnormal." We believe also that value systems are learned, not innate. This platitude is especially easy to defend, since almost no one in our culture now seriously challenges it.

But we who live in society and study the social sciences must not conclude from these elementary observations that we can or should try to make any serious sense out of value facts if we insist on neutering them in advance by squeezing out all their juices and hanging them up to dry in the smoke-tents we call museums. By denying that anyone can escape his culture's values, we are relinquishing this claim for ourselves as well.[1]

But by imposing upon all men the demand that the values of other cultures be respected, we are once again asserting a value judgment. By insisting upon intercultural tolerance, mutual respect, and cooperative scientific inquiry, we are acting as valuing human beings. This, I think, is good; this is the way we should act. Scientists or no, we are human beings, and therefore value some things and disvalue others. We want and need from others the same tolerance and respect we offer to them.

Anthropological Value Systems

We should confess that when we preach intercultural tolerance, we are moralizing, frankly imposing one set of values upon field procedures and the interpretation of their results. Other values could be imposed — such, for example, as would condemn all non-Christian cultures. But we believe such values are wrong, narrow, and inadequate to the presently available scientific information.

We possess one marked advantage over the Wienerkreiser: we at least can take society and science and the science of society seriously, so long as we refuse to blind ourselves to every man's inevitable value commitments. But we also implicitly undertake compensating value commitments: we commit ourselves to face values frankly, to challenge the validity of the value-systems we ourselves inherit and impose, and to correct those values in the light of our gradually growing knowledge. Should we not think it a pity if the dogma of tolerance toward the values of other cultures were to calcify, and result in an emasculated indifference toward the values of our own?

As one working example, let us take some stable preliterate culture. Let us suppose that we fully esteem and honor its values. Its citizens, we shall assume, live in happy peace; they love and worship and sculpt and paint in beauty. Untouched by the white man's "blessings," they remain in harmonious tune with their universe. With respect to such a culture, we ask: Can moral considerations be totally divorced from anthropological inquiry?

---

[1] See David Bidney, *Theoretical Anthropology*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1953. pp. 415ff.

We could not claim to know even as much as we have already posited about our exemplary people if we ourselves had not adhered to the rigid moral code which governs our scientific inquiry. We have presumably studied this people honestly and respectfully; we have sympathetically come to understand their way of looking at the world by cooperating with them and soliciting their help. Honesty, respect, sympathy, and cooperation are frankly moral terms, but they become vapid when value-washed by the Wienerkreiser. Conceive, if you can, positivistic-behavioral definitions of these terms. Yet neither we nor the Wienerkreiser could really begin to do our science without them.

In our exemplary culture, as in every other, men pass value judgments. It is supposed by the Wienerkreiser and their kin that we can painlessly extract such intracultural judgments with scientific tweezers and hold them up for cold-blooded inspection, without involving ourselves in any intercultural or transcultural value judgments. There are two central reasons why neither we nor the Wienerkreiser can do this.

First, we are responsible scientists, responsible for selecting and reporting typical and important aspects of a culture. But selection obviously implies evaluation: we report what we value as worthy of reporting. We are saying, implicitly, that these things *ought* to be reported, and that an anthropologist who returned from work among these people and failed to report these things would be scientifically remiss.

Second, we are men and cannot escape our human predicament, and consequently our human involvement, by putting on any scientific mask and pretending that we are *tabulae rasae*. For better or worse, we are complex, reacting, responding, highly conditioned valuing organisms. We are human beings, often too timid to pass human judgments lest we be called "missionaries."

The Anthropologist and the Missionary

The principal difference between the much-maligned missionary who goes to Africa to bring the gospel to the benighted heathen, and the enlightened anthropologist who goes there to study a wise and rich people, is not that the former makes value judgments while the latter does not. Both do, naturally and inevitably. The difference is that the missionary embraces a reasonably clear, coherent, and dogmatically closed system of values, and goes to Africa to teach; the anthropologist today embraces a confused and unclear but open set of values, and goes to Africa to learn.

Upon his return, this anthropologist may tell us that the missionaries are helping to combat disease, but that they are also interfering with and even undermining an old and precious culture. These are perfectly legitimate scientific observations, but they are most certainly value judgments — and transcultural value judgments, at that.

Assume that the plague strikes this people, and that their entire culture is in danger. Who could really call it "unscientific" to act medically to halt the suffering (assuming, of course, that our action is taken with intelligent respect for local tradition)?

Or ask whether the people should be taught to read and write their own language. Would it be (as the "*wertfrei*" Wienerkreiser might claim) somehow "unscientific" to point out that, other things being equal, the people might thus find an additional avenue for the expression of their aspirations, a tool to help them do what they want and need to do, and a means for preserving the richness of the culture they (and we, too, though in a different way) so deeply prize?

Necessary Human Values

Mutual tolerance, respect, friendship, peace, and justice are human values. They are not merely Eastern or Western, literate or nonliterate, civilized or primitive alone. They are values without which there can be no anthropology, nor any other science. It may well be that without them, there will be no mankind. Must we not properly condemn those who, in or out of our culture, oppose these values?[2]

This is not intended to be merely one more specious, pseudoscientific grounding of any localized, specific set of values. It is intended to make clear the absolute centrality of moral commitment in human interaction, scientific or otherwise.

Scientific moralizing is a dangerous occupation. It is also an inevitable one, given the world as we know it. Our choice does not lie between moralizing and not moralizing. It lies between moralizing honestly and openly, with full awareness of the danger, and moralizing by dogma or by default. The latter course is elected by the Wienerkreiser.

Even a literate culture like our own can cheapen itself to the point of idiocy. We are not "unscientific" in comparing, to our own disadvantage, the televised myopia of Detroit with the open-eyed nature-wonder of Dobuans. They see what we do not see; they make what we do not and cannot make. We need to learn from them. How, then, are we being "merely ethnocentric" in condemning what we are in the interests of what they are — and what we might perhaps in some measure become?

To those tempted to marry into the Wienerkreiser tribe, we ought therefore to say, "Go . . . but know that you cannot escape making value judgments. You cannot escape responsibility for the judgments you cannot escape making. And leave us, who are honest enough to use our science to judge without the dogma of righteousness or of artificially imposed neutrality, to see social values as clearly and broadmindedly as we can, and to act as men and as scientists in the world we are coming to know."

---

[2] Again and again philosophers have pointed out (and positivists have tried to blur) the crucial distinction between a value as that-which-is-espoused and a value as that-which-should-be-espoused. It is obvious that not all peoples of the world do in fact espouse values of mutual respect, friendship, peace, tolerance, and justice. But this is beside the point. To limit the use of "value" to the *de facto* espousals is *de jure*, uncritically and dogmatically to value the *status quo*. See, among the numerous studies, John Dewey, *Freedom and Culture*, New York: Putman, 1939, pp. 145ff; Michael Polanyi, *Science, Faith and Society*, London: Oxford University Press, 1946, passim; and especially J. Bronowski's brillant essay, "Science and Human Values," *The Nation*, Vol. 183 (1956), pp. 550-566, in which these words are found: "The positivist holds that only those statements have meaning which can in principle be verified. Statements which contain the word *is* can be of this kind; statements which contain the word *ought* cannot. But we now see that, underlying this criterion, there is a social nexus which alone makes verification possible. This nexus is held together by the obligation to tell the truth. Thus it follows that there is a social injuction implied in the positivist and analyst method. The social axiom is that we OUGHT *to act in such a way that what* IS *true can be verified to be so.*"

T. E. Easterfield

Mission and Anthropology in the Solomons

When several parties have to work together, it is possible for them to differ, or to be at cross purposes, because they differ fundamentally in aim; but it is very likely that their differences arise because, although their aims have much in common, they differ on means of attaining them, which indeed they may elevate to the status of ends in themselves. Both situations can easily arise when a colonial government, a Christian mission, and an indigenous people are in contact. An extremely interesting case of such differences, both on ends and on means, is described in a recent paper, "Natural Disaster and Political Crisis in a Polynesian Society," by James Spillius.[1] *What gives especial interest to this case is that a further party was present, Spillius being an outsider who, by force of circumstances, was drawn into helping both the colonial government and the Polynesians, and who, in addition, was by training and temperament disposed to look at the whole pattern of relations between all parties. Moreover, the natural disaster that caused him to be involved in the affairs of the people he was studying was such that the possibilities of famine, disorder, discord, misunderstanding, and intrigue that had been latent in the society were starkly revealed.*

SPILLIUS described how, while engaged in anthropological field work on Tikopia, in the British Solomon Islands, he found himself more and more personally involved in helping to deal with the local crisis caused by devastation of the local food supplies by two successive hurricanes. The crisis was partly political: traditional ways of dealing with it proved ineffective because of the removal of some of the local sanctions against antisocial behavior by either the government or the Anglican mission, while the crisis was made more serious than any previous one because these influences had also destroyed customary ways of limiting population growth. Spillius found himself evolving into an interpreter of behavior and attitudes between the government and the Polynesians. Some of what he did could have been done by any intelligent and honest outsider who understood and was trusted by both sides. Often, however, his professional training as an anthropologist gave him an advantage in the form of concepts in which to think about the forms and the machinery of both the government and the local culture, and a keen desire to understand these and to find the basic reasons for what happened, even when it was ap-

Dr. Thomas E. Easterfield is Deputy Head, Grants Division, Department of Scientific and Industrial Research, in England. His article is reproduced here by permission of the editors of *Frontier*, in which it originally appeared (Vol. 1, No. 2, April 1958, pp. 121-125).

---

[1] *Human Relations*, Vol. 10 (1957), pp. 3-27, 113-125.

parently unreasonable. It so happened that Spillius, initially because of his intended field work, had more friends among the pagan than among the Christian islanders. Unfortunately the latter contained almost the only people who could speak or write English. In the course of the crisis, the mission priest, himself a Tikopian, used the fact that Christianity was the white man's religion to try to secure political power for the Christian chiefs, and his knowledge of English to pass on libels on Spillius to the government representative.

The Conflicting Forces

His account (which I have deliberately oversimplified here), shows features of general interest. The government appears as an honest, rather detached figure, anxious for local welfare but with little interest in changing the established order of things. An outside party (the mission) has admirable reasons for trying to change that order but, in its enthusiasm, is too little troubled with thinking out what, at rock bottom, it is trying to accomplish, or even whether the means it uses are compatible with those ends. This combination is common. On the one hand, the desire to leave the local people "innocent" or "unspoiled," or even "not to give them ideas above their station," is widespread, however much changing conditions make this desire impossible to attain. Indeed, trouble can arise just because changes made in one aspect of the society make lack of change elsewhere incompatible. Thus Gorer (in *The American Character*) suggests there is a happier and more harmonious solution in Texas (where there is no nonsense about all men being equal, colored people and Mexicans being brought up as being of inferior status) than in the Deep South of the U.S.A. (where colored people are taught that all men are equal, but equality is denied in the way they are treated). Certain former colonial civil servants from West Africa have suggested to me that formerly the British system of education bred up a generation in the belief that it should be moving rapidly towards self-government, without at the same time training it in the administrative skills that self-government would make necessary.

Examples of lack of understanding on the part of the enthusiasts for change are naturally far more widespread. The feeling that, because one has a good thing to offer, it must be offered in a parcel with all the incidental trappings it wears in its home country, is very widespread. Honor Tracy (in *Kakemono*) describes how, in their very proper desire to introduce democratic methods and welfare services into Japan, the Americans insisted that social security should be administered, not through family groups (which was the natural Japanese way of doing such a thing), but by individual contact with a local official (which was the American way). It requires quite a high degree of sophistication to see the difference between the end in view and the means of securing it: even in the simple case where all can agree that one should show appreciation of one's host's hospitality, yet fail to understand that it is equally reasonable to do so verbally or, as others do, with a resounding belch.

Principle and Means in Missions

Such failures to distinguish between principle and means of application are particularly likely to be noticeable in the missionary field, for two quite different reasons. First, a high standard of behavior and, if not toleration, at least love and understanding of his fellow men is rightly expected of the exponent of Christianity.

It is arguable that the missionary is a man as other men, as liable to faults and weaknesses as others, so that to expect a higher standard of him is unfair. One can reasonably say against this that he has gone out to show others a better way, and even if his creed is one of faith rather than of works, his faith will be a poor thing if it does not issue in works. Whether the criticism of the missionary for being no more charitable or understanding or tolerant of inessentials than his fellows is fair or not, it will certainly be made.

But, secondly, while such a high standard is expected of him, he is very likely to be less able than other men to live up to it. For to be able to stop and think whether what one is doing is right, whether the traditional way of attaining good ends is the only one or whether what has traditionally been set up as an end is only a means; whether there may not be, among the errors of those one is trying to convert, "something in it after all" (as the missionary in Stevenson's fable found): such an ability appears unlikely to go with the burning faith and zeal that will make a man go out into danger, discomfort, or even low pay and less pension. It is understandable that the man who is convinced that he is right and that he has a unique understanding of God's will is the one who is most likely to go out and preach in spite of all obstacles. It is therefore understandable that examples can be multiplied of missionary intolerance, and lack of understanding of the good things that may be breaking down along with the bad. For example, an Aro of Eastern Nigeria described to my wife how, when a local chief embraced Christianity, he was expected to put all his wives away save one; but it was thought quite unnecessary that he should make any provision for the loneliness or even the subsistence of his former wives. The missionaries stopped all native dancing, whether this was for religion (to which they could rightly object) or for recreation. And the custom of shaming people who had offended against local moral standards by vigorous and ribald lampoons they dismissed as mere bawdry, though in fact it was one of the strongest sanctions to keep behavior up to the mark. Again, in the name of decency, many peoples have been forced into the wearing of ugly and unsuitable clothes, of no more genuine decency than the scantier traditional garments, often also to the great worsening of their health. C. P. Mountford (in *Brown Men and Red Sand*) describes how the wearing of European clothes has caused an enormous increase in the death rate from colds and pneumonia, since the clothes will not dry off after the violent showers that occur from time to time. On Tikopia, many practices limiting the population had been stopped; and though some of these, such as infanticide, must have been objected to by Christians, others, such as limitation of marriages, seem to have been ethically neutral. Moreover, it would have been well to find reasons for these practices, and to try to put something in their place.

The Anthropologist's Contribution

The activities of Spillius brought a breath of fresh air into the Tikopia situation. His aim was first to understand the local customs and forms, and to find what purpose they served; and, in the light of this understanding, he could help both the government and the Tikopians to achieve ends that basically they had in common, however much they appeared to be in conflict at first glance. Possibly he could have also done as much with the mission, had his work not led him originally to make his contacts mostly with the pagans, so that the Christians tended to shun him and, later, to intrigue against him. Even if he could not, understanding by the mission priest could have led to a truer demonstration of Christian behavior and values.

Supporting Subscribers

Supporting subscriptions and contributions received since the last report are:

H. M. Beardslee, Jacksonville, Fla.
Harold Key, Orange, Texas
George R. Spee, Mkar via Makurdi, N. Nigeria

Walter H. Sangree

The Structure and Symbol Underlying "Conversion" in Bantu Tiriki

My wife and I spent sixteen months among the Tiriki in 1955-56 under the auspices of the Fulbright program. The Tiriki are a Bantu tribe of North Nyanza, Kenya, of about 40,000 members. They have been heavily "missionized" by American evangelical missions since 1902. This paper will discuss some of the major currents in the recruitment of Christian converts in Tiriki.

Over the last 55 years the missions have fostered the development of a comprehensive network of community churches and primary schools which are now under the charge of African pastors and teachers. These mission-spawned churches are providing a very important religious and social core for an otherwise increasingly socially disorganized segment of the Tiriki population. Under more or less direct supervision of American missionaries are a high school, teachers' training center, Bible school, and a well-equipped hospital, all of which draw students or patients from a number of Kenya tribes. The missions have been almost entirely responsible for the establishment and administration of the school system, the value of which is becoming more and more appreciated by the Tiriki as they seek better jobs in Nairobi and other East African urban centers.

All the missions in Tiriki, with the exception of a small, rather recently established Catholic mission, preach and profess that drinking of alcoholic beverages is incompatible with leading a Christian life. In our early days in Tiriki, missionaries reported to us that the Tiriki have been less receptive to Christianity than have the surrounding Bantu tribes, and that all but the most intelligent Tiriki men still reject Christianity because of the appeal of beer. The Tiriki elders, both pagan and Christian, very quickly made it clear to us that they themselves classified all beer drinkers as traditionalists and all abstainers as Christians. Thus abstinence has come to be a general symbol to both missionary and African of being a Christian.

As we stayed on in Tiriki, systematic questioning of missionaries revealed that few of them had much insight into the motives of so many Tiriki men for staying

---

Walter H. Sangree is Assistant Professor of Sociology and Anthropology at the University of Rochester in New York. He has done field work among the Mesquakie Indians in Tama, Iowa, and among the Bantu Tiriki, Nyanza Province, Kenya, under the auspices of a Fulbright grant. The present paper was presented first to the Central States Anthropological Association, May 2, 1957, and later appeared in *Anthropology Tomorrow* (University of Chicago, Department of Anthropology). In a somewhat expanded form it will appear in a forthcoming book, *Society, Culture, and Drinking Patterns,* to be published by John Wiley and Sons.

pagan or for returning to paganism as they grew older. When asked to qualify what he meant by the appeal of beer, a missionary would generally say that all but a few very outstanding Tiriki men simply feel the pull of their tribal ways too strongly to leave them for a Christian life.

The Tiriki pagan elders, however, soon revealed a very realistic working knowledge of the structural factors underlying the choice to become a Christian. They perceived quite correctly that it always had been and continues to be those people outside the tribal *age-group organization* who join and remain members in good standing of mission churches.

I shall now briefly sketch the nature of the Tiriki age-group organization.

There are seven named age groups, each embracing an age span of approximately fifteen years. The system is cyclical, a span of about 105 years being covered from the time a named group starts through the cycle to when it appears again at the cycle bottom. Initiation into an age group takes place after a young man has reached puberty, and the initiation entails circumcision. Before the abolition of tribal warfare by the British, the age group immediately senior to the age group of the initiates carried on the offensive warfare. At fifteen-year intervals ceremonies were held which handed over the functions of an age group to the group immediately junior to it. For example, at such a ceremony the warriors would retire and become advisers to the new warriors, the former advisers would in turn move into the succeeding role of judicial elders, while the former judges would become ritual elders. Here I have mentioned five age-graded roles, each fulfilled in turn by succeeding age groups. To recapitulate, these five roles are: initiates, warriors, war advisers, judicial elders, and ritual elders. Members of the two remaining groups have no recognized roles, as their members are all either senile, dead, or still too young to be initiated.

Only people who have been initiated may be included in age-group activities. Group members may be cursed and expelled for various well-defined crimes, witchcraft being probably the most common. The age group structure is the basis of Tiriki tribal identity. Every age-group member feels that loyalty to this organization comes before everything else; and whenever a choice must be made between the age groups and other affiliations, either indigenous or introduced, the age group loyalties almost always win out.

Now I shall return to the actual course of missionization in Tiriki over the last 54 years.

During the first 25 years of missionization, very few people except those excluded from the Tiriki age groups were attracted by the alternative affiliation and status offered by mission church membership. In other words, virtually all the converts to Tiriki missions during this period were tribal aliens, outcasts, women who wished to escape from uncongenial husbands, and children wooed by food and clothing or sent by their parents to work on the mission coffee plantation for money, and sometimes also to attend school.

Then in 1927 the government-appointed Tiriki chief was converted to Christianity. Although a member in good standing of his age group when first appointed chief in 1911, he tried to continue to maintain an advisory executive type of role as chief even after he had reached the age when his age group had retired to a judicial role. Thus by 1927 he had come to antagonize the traditional members of the age groups, and this was very likely a major factor in his turning to a mission for a new source of support and prestige.

Around 1932 the mission persuaded the converted Tiriki chief to rule against Christian women being forced to brew beer for their pagan husbands. Women had customarily brewed the beer for their menfolks' beer parties, which are an integral part of initiated male sociability and also of the initiation feasts. The women, however, were never included in the parties. After this legislative decision, women started joining the churches in increasing numbers, and today hardly a woman can be found who is not a church member. Thus they have escaped the drudgery of brewing beer.

During the last two decades the economic advantages of European-type schooling, which can be acquired only through mission schools, have become more and more widely recognized by both Christian and pagan. In consequence, increasing numbers of both Christian and pagan fathers have been sending their sons to school. After having finished schooling and having returned from initiation, the politically ambitious young student not uncommonly curbs his appetite for tribal beer and sociability and joins a church. Perhaps he may become a preacher, and thence with mission and church group backing secure a position within the British-instituted tribal governmental bureaucracy. Shortly after getting the government job, he almost invariably starts attending the beer parties of his age group, and consequently he is suspended from his church positions.

Thus today, just as 25 years ago, aliens, witch suspects, and other outcasts form most of the senior African mission church leadership in Tiriki. The rest of the uninitiated — the women and the children — comprise the great mass of the congregation. The Tiriki age-group elders are very contented to see their younger men profit by mission education and church connections without incurring a lasting second loyalty among witches and women, thanks to the mission's stand on beer.

William A. Smalley

What Are Indigenous Churches Like?

It seems that the only optimism that can be generated with respect to reaching the millions without Christ is not to be found in the number of missionaries who go to the field, but in the rapid multiplication of Christianity among nationals reached by nationals. How effective are indigenous churches? How free are indigenous churches? How numerous are they? Is the use of the term "indigenous church" simply lip service to a concept? [Question by Frank E. Houser, Jr.]

"The indigenous church" is an expression on the lips of almost everyone (especially in non-denominational missionary circles) who wants to sound up-to-date in his missionary thinking. Some of the denominations do not use the term so much, but their work and vocabulary reflect a similar kind of outlook in their shift to boards of "ecumenical relations" instead of mission boards and to "fraternal workers" instead of missionaries. There are some fundamental differences between the "indigenous church" thinking and "ecumenical mission" thinking, but they both represent ways of trying to deal with the same basic problem, the same historical mistake in missionary activity, and the same difficult world situation in which the Christian witness in non-Western lands finds itself.

The problem with which this whole missionary emphasis is trying to deal is that of the traditional colonial paternalism with which Western missions have historically approached their task. I will not go into a description of that traditional missionary behavior here. The literature is full of missionary breast-beating on that subject — some of it a bit Pharisaical, I fear, but much of it sincerely and thoughtfully recognizing and analyzing a difficult problem.[1]

The direction of this modern missionary emphasis is to place greater responsibility on the younger churches, to delegate authority to them, to encourage their participation in evangelism and other means of the extension of the gospel, and to expect of them a greater economic responsibility in paying their own way. Unquestionably there has been enormous gain almost everywhere in this direction. In some areas it has been greatly stimulated by political developments, by increasing feelings of nationalism, by the demands of an increasingly more vocal and educated church leadership. In other cases, changes just as extensive have been made arising out of the conviction and the troubled conscience of the missionary group.

---

[1] See, for example, many articles in the *International Review of Missions*, and such books as Donald McGavaran, *The Bridges of God* (published by the World Dominion Press and distributed in the U.S. by Friendship Press, 1955), and the classic work by Roland Allen, *Missionary Methods, St. Paul's or Ours?* (reprinted by Moody Press, Chicago, 1956).

Example 1: Within the Ecumenical Movement

In order to illustrate the two kinds of approach which seem to be developing, I would like to describe briefly, as examples of these trends, the recent behavior of "missions" (one of which no longer calls itself that) in Thailand. The first is an enthusiastic participant in the ecumenical movement. Its board at home is now a "Commission on Ecumenical Missions and Relations." Recently its missionaries became "fraternal workers." Its properties in Thailand, worth a great deal, were turned over to a local board. Its large budget is channeled through the church administration. The net effect is that the Thai and Americans are now trying to do jointly what the Americans usually did more nearly alone before.

In spite of some remarks which I shall make, I believe this is progress. It is a step away from an increasingly intolerable situation. It tries to eliminate such problems as the word "missionary," which for all of the richness of its theological implications, is weighted with bad emotional overtones of cultural imperialism to many peoples of the world. It tries to reverse the status arrangements between Thai and Westerners by rearranging the organization, to put Thai into places of equal prestige with Americans. It gives Thai leadership increased opportunity for experience and responsibility.

Example 2: Outside the Ecumenical Movement

The second group has followed a different course of action in trying to respond to some of the same problems. It maintains a distinction between "mission" (consisting of foreigners) and "church" (consisting of Thai). Over a period it has set about to "indigenize" the church by encouraging it to assume full financial responsibility for its own affairs, to govern itself, and to engage in vigorous evangelism independently of the efforts of the "mission" in this line. This group conceives of an "indigenous church" as being "self-governing, self-supporting, and self-propagating." It has studiously, with great care, engaged in restructuring the Thai church to which it is related, to make it fit this pattern. It has withdrawn outside financial support from the Thai ministry, and has insisted that business affairs within the Thai church be carried on by them.

Again, I believe this is progress. Clearly, the Thai church has taken more initiative, has shown more life, is growing somewhat faster than it did before in this area. Thai leadership is given the opportunity of more experience and responsibility.

The Joker

In neither of these situations, however, have things changed as much as the participants think they have. There have been shifts and adjustments, but the differences are not necessarily very fundamental. In both cases the missionaries (whether they are called by that name or not) who previously had political power within the church still have that power. It is exercised in less direct fashion, but it is there. Paternalism in missions is in danger of changing to puppeteering. The fathers have become brothers, but they are brothers who pull strings. A foreigner cannot make a "native person" become "indigenous." The cards are stacked. Both mission programs, over a period of many years, taught an ecclesiastical structure, a pattern of government, a system of relationships which amounts to an ecclesiastical culture. The newly elevated churches have little imagination or liberty to depart sharply therefrom.

I have discussed some of the cultural implications of an indigenous church before. I will not go into them now. The term is, of course, relative. There is no such thing as an absolutely indigenous church in any culture, because Christianity is always intrusive to a certain degree. However, some churches more nearly than others approximate a group of people "living out their lives, including their socialized activity, in the patterns of the local society, and for whom any transformation of that society comes out of their felt needs under the guidance of the Holy Spirit and the Scriptures."[2]

What are Indigenous Churches Like?

In a most interesting article J. W. C. Dougall has described and discussed the significance of some of the indigenous church movements in Africa.

> There are certain features common to African separatist churches in East, West, or South Africa. There is a characteristic love of color in the adoption of hoods, purple cassocks, chasubles and white robes with blue, red, or purple sashes. There is also an emphasis on ritual different from that of many Western churches. African churches of the separatist type find and afford an outlet for religious feeling in movement, hand-clapping, and dancing. The Western form of worship practiced in many mission churches is felt as an unnatural strait jacket.[3]

Dougall goes on to describe other typical characteristics of these separatist churches (and indigenous churches everywhere tend to be separatist). There is emphasis on baptism by immersion, confession as a real purgation (delivery of the body from evil matter), healing by prayer, and survival of belief in magic.

The African sects normally forbid their members to use Western medicines.

> Why does this teaching appeal so strongly to the African if it is not because Western medicine has so largely neglected the spiritual issues inherent in health and disease? It has given a mechanistic view of the body. African thinking is completely opposed to this. It looks for a spiritual cause and spiritual cure. African thinking is closer to Biblical thinking because it recognizes the whole man.[4]

We cannot generalize from these African churches to indigenous churches in other parts of the world, but people who have seen them elsewhere will be struck by some similarities.

I am not meaning to imply that all splinter movements and synchretistic religious developments are Christian. No matter how "indigenous" they may be, they may also not be "church." The dividing line, of course, lies in their relation by faith to God through Christ. This is a supercultural matter.[5] It lies outside of culture, although it must have cultural expression. I think it is clear, however, that a very large number of such groups are "church" in this fundamental sense. The missions, and the mission churches

---

[2] "Cultural Implications of an Indigenous Church," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 5, No. 2 (March-April, 1958), p. 55.

[3] "African Separatist Churches," *The International Review of Missions,* July 1956, p. 259.

[4] Ibid., p. 261.

[5] William A. Smalley, "Culture and Superculture," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 2, No. 3 (May-June, 1955), pp. 58-71; G. Linwood Barney, "The Meo — An Incipient Church," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 4, No. 2 (March-April, 1957), pp. 31-50.

(including the "indigenized" ones and the "fraternalized" ones) usually do not know quite what to think of them or do about them.

How Effective Are Indigenous Churches?

Judged in terms of reaching men for Christ, many indigenous churches are marvelously effective. The rapidly spreading Pentecostal-type indigenous movements in Latin America simply cannot be matched by the churches which belong more closely to the Euro-American Protestant tradition. These groups often grow by splintering. They worship by participating. God is alive. He speaks to them. He heals them. Theirs is a highly emotional religion, but it has enormous vitality.

Ben Elson wrote the following in a letter after his visit to the Tzeltal church, which shows many signs of being an "indigenous" church in spite of the fact that it was sparked through the work of Marianna Slocum, of the Wycliffe Bible Translators:

> The preacher took his text from Matthew 13, proudly reading from the Tzeltal New Testament which they have had since last August. The sermon was an expository one. When he finished making a point he would ask the congregation, "Did that reach your heart?" And they would reply, "It did." Once, however, a young man said, "No, it didn't reach." So the preacher went over the point again. The sermon lasted until 12:40 p.m. If anyone got sleepy he stood up, to stay awake. After the sermon there was pray, during which the congregation knelt.
>
> At 2:00 everyone again gathered in the church for the announcements. These consisted of recognizing those who had come from a distance to the meeting, of reporting on evangelistic trips, and of announcing the names of those who were to meet with the elders for discipline, and of announcing the discipline meted out to those who had met with the elders during the week. One reason for the success of the Tzeltal Church is the strict church discipline: "sin is not allowed in the Camp." Discipline consists in being excluded from the church building — though one can listen at the window — and offenders are not to be treated as brothers by the rest of the congregation — they do not greet them, they do not visit them, they do not wish them well, they do not pray for them except that they will repent. Those who do repent ask forgiveness before the congregation and are thus reinstated into fellowship.
>
> The thing that impressed us most was that the church was a Tzeltal church. Though it is now affiliated with the National Presbyterian Church in Mexico, it is not an American church, nor a Mexican church; it is a distinctively Tzeltal Indian church. Almost no money from the outside has ever been used to help the people; all the church buildings have been built by the Indians themselves and with their own money (the metal roof was given). There are no paid workers — elders and preacher-boys donate their time. If they spend a lot of time in evangelistic work the others may help them with their cornfields. The Tzeltal Church sends money out to other missionary projects!

On the other hand, some indigenous churches die out. Through lack of leadership, lack of spiritual force, inability to solve some perplexing cultural problem which makes existence as a group impossible, or for some other reason, they stagnate and disappear. Sometimes the mission-related churches, or the mission itself, helps to squelch them. If not, they are often relieved, at least, to see them go.

The Church in Culture

In this modern day it seems inevitable that church forms will move somewhat in the direction of Western forms. This is the direction of most culture change. In many places older economic and social structures are becoming obsolete. The weary procession of churches with ecclesiastical structures which ape their Western teachers will not diminish. In time even some of the separatist groups which survive will take on more of this "respectable" Westernness. This will happen because life around the world, for better or for worse, is moving in that direction. Education is weighted toward the West. However, no group will go all the way. No group will, or can, become fully Americanized. There will develop in each group a synthesis between the old and the new. Each group, if we know anything at all about human nature, will look upon its own synthesis as a more perfect expression of the gospel than any other, no matter how tolerant its outlook.

In the lands of the younger churches probably they will continue the process already begun in so many places, a trend so universally exemplified in Western Protestantism. This is the tendency for the church to move up in social class and away from the masses.[6] When that happens, if there is any spiritual vitality at all, there will be new mass movements, new splinter groups, new "indigenous churches," if you like, which will speak to the humbler folk of the new generation. It will be by such signs as these, perhaps, that we will know that the power of the gospel has already taken root, that the Holy Spirit has found another cultural vehicle. Thus reads the history of the church in culture.

---

[6] Eugene A. Nida, "The Relationship of Social Structure to the Problem of Evangelism in Latin America," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 5, No. 3 (May-June 1958), pp. 101-123.

William A. Smalley EDITORIAL

The Moral Implications of Social Structure

It has not been often that the editor of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY *has received a letter raising serious objection to any of the many viewpoints which have been expressed in the pages of the magazine. We welcome such letters, of course, as they draw attention to weaknesses of presentation, faulty logic, wrong data, unwarranted conclusions, and many other possible problems with material published in PA. We did receive one such letter from the Rev. Paul Abrecht of the Department on Church and Society, Division of Studies of the World Council of Churches in Geneva. Since it was in reference to something I had written, I am taking this opportunity of printing the letter along with an explanation of my earlier statement.*

The Letter From Mr. Abrecht

With much of Mr. Smalley's interesting statement on "Planting the Church in a Disintegrating Society" (PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, September-December 1958) I can agree. However, I would like to take issue with some of his remarks on page 232. He writes:

> There is nothing intrinsically moral or right and wrong about social structure as such. The many different social structures as found today in the world are simply many different ways of organizing group behavior into useful channels and of making life more valuable to the participants in the society. The missionary's role in relation to this as in relation to other cultural matters is to let history take its course and to concern himself with more important issues.

There is, I agree, no "Christian" structure of society; all social structures stand under the judgment of God. But from the Christian point of view, might it not be argued that some social structures are definitely *bad*? How to go about changing them is another question. Would not Mr. Smalley agree that the Christian has a responsibility today to work for change in the structure of racially segregated communities in the U.S.A.? And suppose a Christian convert in a colonial society complains of the injustice of the political setup. Is it not within the missionary's responsibility to help him understand his responsibility — as a Christian — in working for change in the political structure? Or suppose that a woman living in a polygamous society has become a Christian and begins to understand the meaning of the monogamous family ethic developed in the New Testament. Is she not to be encouraged to think out the meaning of responsible change in the structure of family life?

Mr. Smalley reacts very rightly against missionaries who have attempted to promote change or resist it in a tactless way in the past. But in reacting to this he goes to the other extreme adopting a positivistic attitude of ethical neutrality to structures. It is true that later in this message Mr. Smalley qualifies his statement by declaring that the missionary may point to "possible avenues of change." But the suspicion remains that Mr. Smalley believes social structures are really outside our Christian concern.

Toward the end of his statement Mr. Smalley says in regard to the problems of illegitimate birth and extramarital sex behavior, "They too will not be remedied by any direct action upon them as such, but only through a restructuring of the whole value system of the people involved." Who is to do this restructuring of the value system? The government administrator? The lawyer? The anthropologist? May not the Christian community itself have a role in such "restructuring"?

The Christian, I believe, is concerned with the whole of life including the moral basis for the structures of society. In the change or reform of such structures the Christian has the duty to work for responsible human relations. Mr. Smalley's view would seem to deny the obligation of the church to express its concern for man in all his social relationships. At least his way of stating his position might give rise to that suspicion.

Form and Meaning

In replying to Mr. Abrecht's well-taken comments, I would first like to point out a distinction in my own thinking which I obviously did not make clear in my earlier article under discussion. It is the difference between a structure, and the meaning of that structure. To take a clear-cut case from language, many different structures can convey roughly equivalent meaning, and the same structure can carry different meanings. To illustrate with two languages which are rather alike in structure, as languages in the world go, "He read it to me" and "Il me l'a lu" (literally "He me it has read") are pretty much the same, meaning-wise, but very different structurally. They belong to entirely different language systems, involve different kinds of grammatical agreement, consist of different sounds, etc. On the other hand, "He is in the dog house" (to use a hackneyed example) has two entirely unrelated meanings for the same English sentence.

To say that language structure and meaning are different is not to say that they can ever be divorced from each other. But they are different, and the ability to keep this difference in mind is of great importance to the linguist who works with a variety of languages in an analytical way. It can make his understanding of both form and meaning clearer as it separates out the variables which are found from language to language. An extreme case of the confusion of form and meaning in language is the situation where the actual phonetic form of the name of God becomes sacred, as it did among the ancient Jews, where to utter the name of Yahweh was sacrilege. Less extreme examples of this kind of confusion of linguistic form and meaning may be found in many churches today.

It seems to me that it is important to keep this kind of distinction in mind for other kinds of cultural behavior as well as for language. Let's take one of Mr. Abrecht's questions as an example: "Racially segregated communities in the U.S.A." carries a charged meaning to almost any American. But is it the structural fact of segregation of race which is bad, or is it the tremendous variety of meaning overtones which such segregation happens in this cases to imply: "second-class citizens," unequal opportunity, contempt, suppression, congenital inferiority, etc.? The simple formal, structural fact of segregation in itself is not evil. French- and English-speaking Canadians live relatively segregated lives. So do the various ethnic groups of Switzerland and Belgium. Why is the segregation of Negroes and Whites in U.S.A. communities evil but the segregation between millions of African Negroes and American Whites (or Negroes) not bad? It surely is not the Atlantic Ocean which makes the one immoral and the other amoral. The meaning underlying the two forms of segregation is entirely different.

To us, slavery is "bad." It was a burning issue at one time in American history until we eliminated it to replace it with other evils. The Biblically oriented Christian, however, would have a hard time justifying the idea that the structure, the institution of slavery, is universally bad. St. Paul was certainly not bothered about it. It was not one of the issues that Jesus made anything of. The "badness" of slavery is related to new meanings which have been read into it since New Testament times, meanings of the degradation of the individual, deprivation of spirit, destruction of human dignity and independence, to name only some.

Restructuring Comes from Within

If it is granted that there is a distinction between structure and its meaning, what is the practical relationship between them when it comes to culture change? Structures which acquire unfavorable meaning often have to be changed. In language we see clear examples of this. A word like "damn" (and many much more vulgar words) in English has nothing wrong with it so far as its structure is concerned. The sequence of sounds is no better or worse than any other sequence of sounds. "Nice" people are careful about the use of it, however, and some children will in fun use the homophonous word "dam" because of the association of the sound of the two words. The meaning makes it relatively taboo. The illustration could be made stronger if it were not that some other words are so more decidedly taboo that I do not even feel comfortable in using them as an illustration.

In similar manner, as the meaning of slavery in the Western world gradually changed because of new ideas about human dignity and justice, the form of slavery became intolerable. An internal restructuring of values resulted in the elimination of those social structures which seemed to reflect outgrown attitudes. But here lies a very interesting fact about human culture. Such a change in values results in change in social structure only in those social relationships which at the time symbolize the repudiated meaning. Slavery was abolished, but it was to be another generation before issues of colonialism would be called into question. The same changes in values concerning human beings eventually found a new symbol to fight against in the structure of colonialism. I doubt that the men who worked so energetically for the freedom of the American slaves would have seen colonialism as being a related issue at all. At that time colonialism meant Christianizing the heathen, medical facilities for the sick, philanthropy for the underprivileged, education and enlightenment for darkened minds.

In other words, a change in values, new ideas, a sharpened sensitivity will produce structural change, but it will produce it only in those structures which *seem to the participants* to be symbolic of the "badness." The new values, the new sense of right and wrong, the new feeling against injustice, may well be due to stimulation from outside the culture. I suppose that it usually is. Any significant change, however, comes only from within the culture. It is only as people in a particular society begin to attach new meanings to old forms (or old meanings of badness become intensified to the point where the form becomes intolerable) that change in structure which has any significance takes place.

The new meanings which bring about changes in habits of behavior are not necessarily what the outsider would expect. There is, for example, an ancient custom among some of the mountain tribes of Vietnam, in which the upper incisors of adolescent children are sawed or hacked out as a beauty measure, and as a symbol of growing up. Missionaries have long opposed the custom as being unhygienic (because of resulting infections), cruel, and evidence of heathen superstition and degradation. The custom has been disappearing, until now it is rather rare except in remote areas, but I am sure it is not disappearing primarily for the missionaries' reasons. There are certainly some cases of Christians who have been taught and believe that this is an unchristian type of behavior, but they believe this ritually, without emotional conviction. The real reasons for the change are probably simply that the mutilation symbolizes cultural "backwardness," and that there are more and more people who want their children to look more like the neighboring Vietnamese and even the Westerners living there. What was once a beauty mark has become a symbol or mark of lack of cultural progress and development. There is certainly not the same horrified meaning of savagery and badness which the outsider feels about the custom. This change, then, has little or no significance in terms of Christian ethics, humanity, mercy, or anything of the kind. It is much more a matter of keeping up with a new set of Joneses.

Mr. Abrecht's question about the Christian convert in a colonial society who complains of the injustice of the political setup is a case in point. Is it, or is it not the missionary's responsibility to help him understand his responsibility, as a Christian, in working for change in the political structure? Put in those terms, terms of helping a man understand his responsibilities, there can be only an affirmative answer. But it is precisely here that the rub comes. The missionary in this situation may assume that the man's responsibility is to work for culture change. But is that necessarily so? Biblically, the themes of resignation to one's social lot are as strong as the denunciations of social injustice. What is the man's responsibility in working for change in political structure? This is something the alien missionary can never really know. The missionary's role here as always must be primarily that of leading the convert to an ever-deepening understanding of God, of His revelation in Jesus Christ, and of the relationship of responsible obedience and fellowship which God seeks in His people. He must encourage and stimulate the Christians to seek that cultural expression which will best reflect within the meanings of their cultural habits these new values which they are gradually coming to understand. He must help them see in the Scriptures some of God's history of dealing with men in an enormous variety of cultural circumstances, and to seek from the Holy Spirit that intimate personal guidance which God seeks to give His church in all times and cultures. If, as in so many places in the dwindling colonial world today, such new values focus upon a meaning of overwhelming "badness" in the colonial political structure, certainly that will come within the sphere of change, in one way or another.

But the restructuring comes from within. It is in a sense the by-product. Responsible allegiance to God within any human cultural framework will show up in culture change, sometimes enormous change. It is, however, the allegiance, not the change, which is ultimately significant, and which it is the missionary's role to foster.

Sometimes culture change can be enforced on such a large scale that it becomes permanent. Headhunting, scarification, polygamy, or human sacrifice have been eliminated from several cultures by the police-reinforced diligence of an alien administration. I am not necessarily opposed to all such activity on the part of administrators, but it is very clear that resulting change has no moral value whatsoever. The meanings expressed by these cultural forms are preserved in some other way, and as long as the same meanings are preserved nothing of moral value has been accomplished.

Some individuals may have been saved from suffering or death, and from a Western viewpoint this is of enormous value, but within the local culture it may have no significance whatsoever. It is only when a sense of respect for the personality of other individuals, for their physical welfare, and above all, for them as actual or potential brothers in Christ, gets reflected in a change of behavior toward reducing suffering and death within the culture that such change has moral significance.

The Role of the Church

Who is to do this restructuring of the value system? The government? No. It cannot. Neither can the lawyer, the anthropologist, or the missionary. No alien can, although new ideas, stimulus for change, awareness of new horizons, alternative forms of behavior, may all well come from these outside sources.

It is precisely the community itself, including the Christian community, which has the principal though generally quite unconscious role in the change of values and habits. For the Christian community there is yet another force, and that is God in culture, the Holy Spirit dwelling within the children of God. It is interesting, though, that God seems more willing to work through the existing forms of culture than many of His more intellectual followers want to admit.

The missionary, no matter how complete his identification with the local community, remains an alien. I have discussed his role in culture change elsewhere.[1] If he honestly and perceptively faces up to the issue of leading men to God, to total commitment to Christ, to an awareness of Christian life in culture, *their* cultures, stimulating them to find the structures which will best express their new faith, he has fulfilled his role. He may then well "let history take its course" because he has "concerned himself with more important issues."

---

[1] William A. Smalley, "The Missionary and Culture Change," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 4, No. 6 (Nov.-Dec., 1957), pp. 231-237. See also, William A. Smalley, "Cultural Implications of an Indigenous Church," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 5, No. 2 (March-April, 1958), pp. 51-65.

CONTENTS

MUSHROOM RITUAL VERSUS CHRISTIANITY 145 EUNICE PIKE AND FLORENCE COWAN

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND AMERICAN AID IN LAOS 151 JOEL MARTIN HALPERN

AFRICA IN TRANSITION — II UNDER EUROPEAN COLONIALISM 171 K. A. BUSIA

CRISTIANITY IN CULTURES

Gbeya Prescientific Attitudes and Christianity 179 WILLIAM J. SAMARIN

PRACTICAL PROBLEMS

Vocabulary and the Preaching of the Gospel 182 WILLIAM A. SMALLEY

EDITORIAL

The World Is Too Much with Us — II 186 WILLIAM A. SMALLEY

REVIEWS

A Century of Darwin (S. A. Barnett) 189 HENRY W. SEAFORD, JR.

Introduction to Cultural Anthropology (Mischa Titiev) 191 JOSEPH E. GRIMES

LETTERS 192

Eunice Pike and Florence Cowan

Mushroom Ritual versus Christianity

How can one effectively present the message of divine revelation to a people who already have, according to their belief, a means whereby anyone who so desires may get messages directly from the supernatural world via a more spectacular and immediately satisfying way than Christianity has to offer? The Mazateco Indians equate the hallucinogenic mushroom with Jesus Christ himself, believing that when Jesus lived on earth he spat on the ground and his saliva sprang up as the mushroom. Through it as his mouthpiece, he speaks to them in the hallucinations which its chemical content induces. Christian hymns taught by the missionary are sometimes believed to be inspired by the mushroom and are probably sung to it by its devotees. Taboos applicable to mushroom eating are transferred to the Bible and result in fear of reading it. The partaking of the divine mushroom poses potential problems in relation to the Christian concept of the Lord's Supper. The use of the mushroom in southern Mexico in the quest of visions and supernatural revelations would appear to have many points in common with the use of peyote by the Indians of northern Mexico and the U.S.A., where there has been extensive syncretism of peyote ritual and Christian forms. PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY *would welcome further contributions on the problems of communicating the Christian message in this type of context. It is a subject that still needs much careful and prayerful study.*

SOME of the Indian groups of southern Mexico make ritual use of certain species of mushroom which have hallucinatory powers. The ceremonies are performed by a *curandera* or shaman but with the participation of other persons. Pagan and Catholic traits blend in the ritual, which is carried out in the presence of Catholic images. This use of the mushroom is centuries old, having been described by the early Spanish writers. The present article is based on the ritual as it is observed today among the Mazateco Indians of the State of Oaxaca. Our information for the most part comes from four sources: from the people who participate in the ceremonies, from shaman women who have become our friends, from overhearing the ceremony as it took place in a house next door to us, and from tape recordings of two all-night

---

Miss Eunice V. Pike and Mrs. Florence Cowan are members of the Wycliffe Bible Translators, working among the Mazateco Indian group of Oaxaca, Mexico. During their years of service in this field they have participated in the translation of the New Testament in Mazateco, which is currently in the process of publication.

sessions which were made by R. G. Wasson and which he permitted us to hear.[1]

Deceptive Mixtures

From all four of these sources we learn that the old tribal beliefs and Christian ideas and terminology have become mixed. One minute the shaman (a woman in both ceremonies which were recorded) would chant that she had the heart of Christ or the heart of the Virgin Mary; the next minute she was chanting that she was a snake woman, a moon woman, a bird woman. At both sessions she sang the Lord's prayer as it is sung in the Catholic church in the town of Huautla; but the next moment she was chanting about being a southern cross woman, or talking about a tiger eating someone's soul.

Many kinds of mushrooms grow in the Mazateco area, but only certain ones are used in the ceremony and only these will be discussed in this paper. Some informants say that the mushroom grows wherever a drop of Christ's saliva fell, and that for that reason when the mushroom speaks it is Christ himself speaking. Other informants say that the mushroom grows wherever a drop of Christ's blood fell, and that for that reason the Huautla region has living land — land where the mushroom does not grow is dead.

The most common reason for eating the mushroom is in behalf of someone who is ill. One informant said, "Jesus Christ himself gave us the mushroom because we are poor people and have no doctors or medicine to help us" At other times the mushroom is used for divining such things as who stole a certain horse, who killed a certain man, whether or not a sick person will die, or the welfare of a person who is away from home. At the ceremony anyone present may eat the mushroom, but the shaman eats several times as many as the others. All see visions (beautiful colored moving pictures, they say), but the shaman chants and sings while the others lie quietly on straw mats. They may speak encouraging words to the shaman or make comments to one another. Somehow when the session is over, they have the impression that 'Jesus' has given them the answers. They know that the sick person will get better or die, that they must get the help of the doctor, call in the witch doctor, or look for certain herbs. They know that their relative in the faraway city is well or in trouble.

However, we have conflicting reports on how 'Jesus' goes about telling them these things. Our information differs sharply depending on its source. The patients, or people who hire the shaman, say, "Jesus said that my son would get better," or "Jesus told me to stop drinking liquor," or "The little mushroom said so." The patients never say, "The shaman said that Jesus said. . . ." But one of our shaman friends insists that 'Jesus' doesn't 'tell' her anything. She insists that he never actually speaks to her. She 'sees' the sick boy well, or she 'sees' a tiger eating his soul. Her visions are like movies or television and she just talks about what she sees going on.

---

[1] For specific details see V. P. and R. G. Wasson, *Mushrooms, Russia and History*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1957. A popular but valuable presentation of the mushroom ritual appears as a feature article by R. G. Wasson, "Seeking the Magic Mushroom," in *Life*, May 13, 1957, and *Life International*, June 10, 1957. See also Valentina P. Wasson, "I Ate the Sacred Mushroom," in *This Week Magazine*, May 19, 1957. For a later news report on the medicinal qualities of the hallucinogenic mushroom, see "Mushroom Madness," in *Time*, June 16, 1958.

In the tape recording of the two ceremonies we were not able to pick any place where a supernatural being talked in first person giving a message. It was just the shaman singing about what a wonderful person she herself was. However, a mother told one of us that the mushroom had told her that her daughter would die and then added, "But don't be afraid, I'll take her soul to be with me." We have had hints that 'Jesus' talks directly to the sick person, or to the relatives by means of the mushrooms that they themselves have eaten. All our sources, however, agree that somehow those asking for guidance receive it, and that 'Jesus' is the one who gives it to them.

Attempts at Separation

We find that the deep-seated belief in the mushroom frequently causes the Mazatecos to misunderstand our witness for Christ. We must ever be alert to their way of thinking so that we may choose unambiguous words. Examples of some of the problems follow.

1. At least twice when describing heaven as a beautiful place, a place where there are no tears, etc., Eunice Pike has been asked, "Have you seen it?" She answered, "No," and at that time thought the question very queer — didn't the person know that only the dead have seen heaven? Later she realized that a high percentage of Mazatecos claim to have seen heaven — the mushroom gives them moving pictures of it. Now she tells people, "The Book which tells us about God says that heaven. . . ."

2. A shaman is respected and called a 'wise man' by the Mazatecos. One time a shaman stood listening to one of the authors witness about Christ. The expression on his face was one of sympathy and understanding. After a bit he spoke up, "I, too, am a wise man." The missionary didn't recover fast enough to tell him that she differed from him in that the things she taught were only those things which are in accord with God's written Word.

3. One time when one of the writers was objecting to the use of the mushroom she was told, "But what else could I do? I needed to know God's will and I don't know how to read."

4. One cloudy day the missionary was sitting at the local airstrip hoping that the plane would arrive. A number of Mazatecos were also waiting. To redeem the time she sang a hymn, planning to use it as a starting point for witnessing. The hymn she happened to choose was a new one that no Mazateco knew yet; in fact, she had translated it just the day before. As she sang she heard two of the women talking. "Isn't that beautiful! How lovely! It's just like the mushroom." They had not been talking to her, but she couldn't keep out of that conversation. "No, it's not like the mushroom. This is different." The women would not listen. Emphatically they broke in to say, "We mean, wasn't it gracious of the mushroom to teach you that song!"

Many people have learned a number of the hymns in Mazateco, since at least five hundred phonograph records with hymns and a gospel message have been sold in the area. We now suspect that some of the hymns have been sung to the mushroom by the shaman. In fact, one Christian Mazateco warned one of the authors against teaching any hymns to her shaman friend. "She may sing them to the mushroom if you do!" All this poses many problems. Should we limit the sale of records to Christians only? But the wonderful thing about a record is that it can go where there are no Christians and no missionary. Should we teach hymns only to Christians? But singing a hymn is one of the easiest ways to start a conversation about Christ. We have gone on teaching the hymns, but now we are alert, ready to point out that a hymn is in accord with the Scriptures, whereas many of the shaman's chants are contrary to them.

5. There is one taboo that most people consider very necessary to observe when eating the mushroom. That is, they have to be ceremonially 'good' or 'clean'. Specifically, they must refrain from sexual intercourse for four or five days both before and after eating the mushroom. One of our shaman friends said that she had started eating the mushroom in behalf of others when she was twenty years old, but that she had stopped completely when she married. After her husband died she took up that work again. Then she married a second time, and again she stopped. Widowed the second time, she took up the work of shaman again.

This taboo which is imposed in connection with eating the mushroom has, it seems, been a direct source of difficulty in the distribution of the Scriptures. We tend to call the Scriptures 'God's Word'. The Mazatecos have considered the mushroom a means of getting a message from God, and hence the two things tend to get grouped in the same category. If such a taboo applies to the one, in the minds of at least some Mazatecos it applies to the other.

One young man of marrying age had been reading the Scriptures and enjoying them. Then one day he told us that he was thinking of getting married, and he wondered whether he could go on reading the Scriptures, or if he must stop once he was married. A leader in one village, a married man, seemed hungry for the gospel, listened eagerly when taught, asked pertinent questions, and seemed to accept the Lord and prayed for forgiveness of sin and for the Lord to bless his wife and children. But although well off financially he refused to buy the Scriptures and never read them for himself. When urged, he objected with, "People say that we will go crazy if we read God's Word." It was at least a year later that it dawned on us that the same reason is given for observing the taboos when eating the mushroom. One of our neighbors went crazy and we were told in a whisper that is was because he ate the mushroom when not 'clean'.

These and other incidents make us suspect that the taboo is so interpreted as to make people in general afraid to read the Scripture. Parents are afraid that their children will die. We are struggling with the problem and perhaps we are making progress. When selling Scripture in the market, we no longer use the term 'God's Word'; rather we say, "This book teaches us about God."

Also we have made up a wedding song which gives advice to the Mazateco couple. (Old folks are supposed to give advice to a Mazateco couple.) The first verse tells of a couple getting married, and urges that they take the Jesus road. The husband is urged to love his wife. The wife is urged to respect her husband. Then in the second stanza they are urged to read the Scriptures. In the third stanza they are told to teach their children the Jesus way. That song is a good jumping off point to urge that the couple read and pray together.

6. It would appear that the eating of the mushroom has features in common with the Christian Eucharist, which are a potential source of confusion. During the mushroom ceremony the people all nibble on the mushroom at the same time. They make a kind of unit listening to the shaman sing and seeing visions together. In his description Wasson applied the word "agape" to the ceremony, and we have been asked (by outsiders) if the Mazatecos confuse it with the Lord's Supper. Does the eating of the divine mushroom have for the Mazateco a psychological value comparable to that which the Eucharist has for the Christian? What teaching must accompany the introduction of the Lord's Supper to the Mazatecos to prevent the Christians among them from seeking the same experience from the bread and wine that they have formerly gotten from the mushroom — and being disappointed? All this needs careful study and development in the local church context. We can see possibilities of confusion. One Mazateco said that the mushroom must not be cooked because it is considered as a living person. However, since there is still no organized Mazateco church there has as yet been no celebration of the Lord's Supper, and therefore as of this date we know of no confusion. We have hopes that there will be none, for at least a handful of individuals have not stumbled when they received private instruction.

Supplying the Need now Filled by the Mushroom

Medicine has given at least some Christians the courage to reject the mushroom. When a non-Christian sister-in-law says, "You are killing your husband! Why don't you call the wise man?" (meaning that, if the wife does not call a shaman when her husband is sick, then she is the same as a murderer), the Christian can save face by answering, "I'm using medicine instead." That not only keeps the relatives from pressing so hard, but the medicine sometimes cures the patient.

The Mazatecos have occasions when they desire some special knowledge for which they usually turn to the mushroom. Sometimes this desire has been met by citing the admonition in James 1: 5. We point out that God has promised to give us wisdom if we ask him. Once, when a Mazateco Christian asked, "How does a Jesus-follower go about finding a horse?", we prayed with him, asking for wisdom and guidance, and then suggested that he go out and hunt. He found the horse!

Perhaps part of the reason for using the mushroom is to have a party-like thing, or some special attention for the sick relative. If that be the case, then the need might be filled by public prayer for the sick one during the Christian service.

Surpassing the Mushroom

The shaman sings that the mushroom says she is clean, good, victorious. It calls her a humming bird, the moon, the morning star, the southern cross. She is an interpreter, a woman by whom others live, the law, medicine, justice. The mushroom says that she is the child god, a spirit, a saint, a creator, the heart of Christ, the heart of the Virgin Mary. She is light, speech, thought. But in spite of the pretty words the shaman is afraid. Even as she sings she fears her earthly enemies. She is afraid of the harm that may be done to her or her family by witchcraft (i.e. by a type of witchcraft that is completely apart from the mushroom). We had noticed in listening to the tapes that at times the shaman was weeping as she chanted. Upon being questioned, she explained to us that she was weeping because she was remembering that one of her sons had been murdered and she was concerned for the one that was left.

The mushroom often breeds fear. The visions may show the shaman that the patient is dying of 'fear sickness' with no suggestion of how to cure him. The relatives accept the diagnosis and prepare for the funeral while they wonder what it was that frightened him. In contrast, our Lord said (John 14: 27), "Peace I leave with you, my peace I give unto you; not as the world giveth, give I unto you." In practice we have found this passage of Scripture to be true; many of the Mazateco Christians, with turmoil around them, have come to have hope and an inner peace — a peace that comes from knowing that they have a Savior, and Someone who loves them.

By contrast, in neither of the two mushroom tapes could we discover help for someone who knows that he is a sinner and needs salvation. The shaman sings of the greatness that she is said to have, but that greatness is of no real help to her; she is as bad off as any of the other 90,000 Mazatecos. Our Lord, however, can take a down-and-out repentant sinner and clean him up until he can bear the fruits of the Spirit.

The ethical values mentioned in the mushroom ceremony are in keeping with the values generally recognized in Indian cultures, but they fall far short of the ethics of Christianity. In the long list of virtues that the shaman claims for herself during the ceremony, there is no love, joy, peace, kindness, grace, or gentleness — none of the qualities that we recognize as fruits of the Spirit. These, however, are things that mark one who has become a Christian in the Mazateco society: love for family and for fellow Christians, joy in spite of hardships, peace in the midst of village wars. "By this shall all men know that ye are my disciples, if ye have love one to another" (John 13: 35).

Conclusion

Some Mazateco believers, chiefly new Christians, have continued to use the mushroom for a while. Arguments against it have accomplished very little. The thing that has helped is study of the Scriptures — any and all parts of them — until the person concerned comes to understand God's idea of sin, his love and plan for the sinner, and something of God's greatness. That seldom happens after the study of a few brief passages; it seems to take a considerable amount before a person's eyes are opened.

SUPPORTING SUBSCRIBERS

Supporting subscriptions and contributions received since the last report are:

Frank C. Tichy, Jr., Monrovia, Liberia
Charles E. Hoch, Sulphur Springs, Ark.

Joel Martin Halpern

Economic Development and American Aid in Laos

American economic aid to other countries would not, at first glance, seem to fit within the purposes and scope of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY. *A reading of the following article, however, may help the American who is concerned primarily about his Christian witness among peoples of other cultures to see himself more clearly. Certainly the major characteristics of "Little America" described here have their counterparts in Christian mission programs, though most observers would feel that Christian missions, for all of their serious cultural oversights, have not been quite so superficial as the U.S. economic aid program. Although the following discussion is written from the viewpoint of a cultural anthropologist utilizing the traditional participant-observer technique, the motivation in preparing it is less anthropological than it is to present the ideas of an interested citizen.*

Much that has been written about the foreign aid program can be classified as destructive, since few positive suggestions have been offered. The author firmly believes that some type of aid program is essential but that certain changes in current policies are indicated. The intention here is to offer constructive criticism. Many of the points raised have doubtless previously been made for other areas; here the objective is to provide documentary material based on the situation in Laos.[1]

THE Kingdom of Laos[2] shares with a few other newly independent countries an almost complete reliance on foreign aid. Natural resources do exist, but they are largely unsurveyed and undeveloped. Because of a rugged terrain and poor transportation facilities, Laos is unable to support her growing urban population without imports. For the present and an indefinite future she will remain dependent on some form of outside aid. Currently this aid comes from the West, chiefly from the United States. This situation is far from stable, for in recent elections Communist-dominated parties have made considerable progress. An offer of Communist Chinese financial assistance has also been made. It would not seem too unlikely that Laos may one day come to terms with her giant neighbor to the north.

---

[1] This article is a cultural anthropologist's personal viewpoint. The author would appreciate comments from the readers.

[2] Laos is a landlocked country of Southeast Asia bounded by China, Burma, Cambodia, and Vietnam. Its recent independence from French control puts it in a very critical transition period economically and in other aspects of its culture. See William A. Smalley, "The Gospel and the Cultures of Laos," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 3, No. 3 (May-June 1956), pp. 47-57.

Viewed in this context, an analysis of the American aid program takes on increased importance.[3] It is not the intention here to discuss the United States Operations Mission to Laos in relation to Laos' political situation. Although political and economic factors can be as significant as cultural ones, this paper focuses on the latter, which have been largely ignored. Such matters as details of politics, urban economic development, and military assistance are clearly outside the scope of this paper, which has its central focus on the Laotian villager. Although the country is governed almost exclusively by a French-educated aristocratic intelligentsia, the ninety percent or more of the rural population cannot be ignored, and the primary purpose of this article is to discuss the aid program as it has affected or failed to affect the villager.

Because of the extreme conditions in Laos, many of the general problems confronting American aid programs are exaggerated here, making them stand out in sharper perspective. Perhaps some of the following comments may apply, however, with modifications, to other parts of the world.

The Americans and the Aid Mission

Many reports have been written on the American aid program in Laos. Most of these have gone into great detail in describing the organization and administration of special projects, particularly the one relating to the import program and currency reform. These matters are doubtless of great importance, but we will be concerned with their actual operation only indirectly; our main interest here is a problem that to date has been pretty well ignored — the interaction of American and Lao culture patterns in a Laotian milieu. Since Laos is an independent country, the aid must go through the government before it can reach the rural population. Further, since the aid originates with the American government and is implemented only through individual Americans, their ideas

---

[3] There are a number of other aid programs operating within Laos, such as French Economic Assistance, various United Nations agencies, and the Colombo Plan. With the exception of French technical aid, which is of great importance in supplying specialized personnel and funds in many fields, the other programs are relatively small.

Joel Martin Halpern (Ph.D. in anthropology, Columbia University, 1956) served with the Community Development division of the International Cooperation Administration in 1956-1957. He spent the year 1957 as the representative of the American aid mission in Luang Prabang, the royal capital of Laos. It is on research conducted during that time that his article is based, in addition to research on Laos for the Human Relations Area files in Washington, D.C. His article here was originally prepared, in slightly more expanded form, under the title "Economic Development and American Aid in Laos," for private distribution as a supplement to to his *Aspects of Village Life and Culture Change in Laos* (a special report prepared for the Council on Economic and Cultural Affairs, Inc., 1958). These materials will subsequently be incorporated into a book on the peoples of Laos. Dr. Halpern is Assistant Professor in the Department of Anthropology, University of California. In addition to his Laos research he has done field work in Lapland, Alaska, Yugoslavia, and the U.S. Southwest. He is author of *A Serbian Village*.

and preconceptions are obviously of great importance.

Before the Vietminh War few Americans had visited the country and almost none had lived there aside from a few resident missionaries. Yet in 1957 there were approximately 200 American officials and their families residing in Vientiane and a few in the provinces. Some of these were career diplomats with long overseas service records; the majority, however, were associated with the Aid Mission, and for most of them it was the first time they had been outside North America. Some may wonder if these individuals received any preparation to face a culture and way of life so radically different from their own. The answer is that aside from a brochure which specified that the climate was tropical and suggested proper clothing, there was virtually none. Most of the aid personnel were put through an orientation course in Washington, but this was limited almost entirely to personnel procedures, health matters, and the proper ways in which to fill out forms.

A few attempts were made to indicate that the country to which the person was going was unlike his own, but the tone for the orientation meetings was set in a planning session at which technicians were asked to devise a program in their fields for "Country X." Facts on physical geography and general economy were provided, yet nothing was said about the country's history, traditions, ethnic problems, or values — in short what the anthropologist calls culture. The basic assumptions appear to have been that it is only the economic facts which need be considered in the planning of an aid program.

It is impossible to control the geographic climate of the country to which the new personnel is being sent; the cultural climate can be controlled, however, at least in part. Thus, although it is necessary to bring tropical clothing and to take certain health precautions, it is evidently not felt necessary to bring new ideas or to be aware of a different way of life. A key factor in creating a controlled cultural climate is to assemble the accouterments which comprise a basic part of American material culture. It is, of course, possible to restrict one's own mental climate without any material possessions to reinforce it. Many foreigners have "never left home" mentally, even though they may have adopted some of the day-to-day living habits of the country of residence. The process of nonadaptation is obviously much easier.

Little America

These material accessories and accompanying attitudes present in American culture, when transplanted, form the framework for a Little America overseas.[4] Although Little America basically reflects a state of mind, some of its material manifestations are most easily defined under some basic categories such as clothing, shelter, food, earning a living, and recreation. Then, too, how do Americans compare to other resident Europeans such as the French? How do they relate to the Laotian environment?

---

[4] As used in this discussion; Little America may be defined as the intellectual culture of official American government personnel residing in Vientiane, Laos, in 1957. It also includes the various American material imports which have made possible to a significant extent a way of life fundamentally similar to that of a middle-class government worker in Washington, D.C.

Clothing, as might be expected, originates in America. In the matter of wearing apparel the Americans are not too different from the French and the urban Lao male officials who commonly dress in Western clothing. This is true to a certain extent in rural areas as well. Of course, the cut and styling of American clothing is always readily distinguishable.

Housing is another story. One could not expect to see Westerners living in Lao-style bamboo and thatch dwellings, especially since most ranking Lao officials in Vientiane reside in Western-style French villas. The French have similar housing, varying with their status. They have one or two compounds providing housing for military advisory personnel, and the other French, both official and unofficial, are scattered throughout the town. American housing is characterized by barbed wire compounds. Although a few Americans do live in different parts of Vientiane, the overwhelming majority reside within three compounds. They are segregated according to agency: one houses American Embassy and Information Service personnel, and the other two are for Aid Mission employees.[5] These three compounds differ in type of housing. The former is composed of prefabricated aluminum units with air-conditioning. The main Aid Mission compound consists of modified Lao-style bungalows on concrete piles, plus one motel-type structure. In this compound are also located the barracks which serve as office building. The newest and most highly desired housing consists of American ranch-style homes modified for tropical conditions, complete with adjoining breezeway, driveways, and lawns. This community is located several miles outside of town, necessitating special taxi service. In all compounds furniture is of western style made in Bangkok or occasionally shipped from America.

To a limited extent some Americans (usually their servants) buy certain food in the local market. The greater part of the food they consume, however, originates in the American commissary situated within the main compound. Almost all its stocks, including canned and frozen food, come from the United States. Special American-type perishable foods such as baked goods are imported from Bangkok. In addition, a restaurant serving only American food functions within this compound.

As to earning a living, almost all Americans with the aid program work within the confines of their main compound.[6] The Mission, headed by a director and a duputy director, is divided into several sections. One includes specialized technicians in the fields of education, health, agriculture, public works and community development. The second, dealing with program planning, designs the overall aid plan and negotiates agreements with the government of Laos. The third section is largely devoted to maintaining the other Americans in their offices and supplying them with food and housing; employees in this section include among others a personnel officer, controller, and warehouse supervisor. The Americans have also imported so-called third country nationals to assist them in various phases of their work, since almost all Lao outside of the government ministries lack the necessary technical and educational qualifications. For example, there are Chinese, Vietnamese, Thai, and Filipinos who function as bookkeepers, mechanics, and interpreters. Laotians are employed only as chauffeurs, coolies, and cleaning women.

---

[5] The aid technician should, by the nature of his job, have close contact with Lao officials and village people, while the diplomatic representative can often do an effective job even though his contacts are limited almost exclusively to officials; thus, living in a segregated compound is not as significant to the work of the diplomat as it is to that of the aid technician.

[6] The above description applies only to the American Aid Mission; both the Embassy and Information Service have their own administrative personnel. During 1957 three Americans with the aid program (including the author) were stationed in the provinces. A group of agricultural personnel was also located in Xieng Khouang.

Little America is of sufficient proportions that it is occupied largely in maintaining itself. That is, most day-to-day contacts are among Americans and third-country nationals. Actual degree of contact with Lao officials varies from almost none in the executive division of the Aid Mission to occasional daily or weekly contacts in the technical divisions. The most meaningful contacts, in terms of importance to the American personnel, are those within the Mission and not with officials of the host country, to say nothing of those with Lao villagers. Perhaps a significant reason for this is the large amount of correspondence with Washington necessary on all matters ranging from the trivial to the policy-making level. A good deal of this business is caused by the fact that a new program must be planned every year, in accordance with varying Congressional appropriations. There is also considerable correspondence on organizational and other matters within the Mission itself. The foci of Mission paperwork is illustrated by the constant stream of mimeographed notices issued for the information of all personnel. These refer to such matters as personnel policies, commissary hours, recreational activities for Americans, requisitioning of supplies, and administrative procedures. During 1957 there was not one notice which dealt directly with the Lao or with our objectives in that country.

Government offices in Laos operate from approximately seven o'clock in the morning until two in the afternoon six days a week, while the Americans follow the standard five-day, forty-hour week, with all stateside holidays. In accordance with diplomatic custom, major Lao holidays are also observed.

Outside Contacts

Where contact is necessary with Lao officials, it is made difficult by the linguistic barrier. Of all the Americans stationed in Laos in 1957 a very few spoke French fluently and only a few more had sufficient knowledge of the language to conduct even a limited conversation in it. Within the Aid Mission, among the various technical divisions there was but one American who spoke fluent French. To help the aid personnel a number of other Americans were employed as "interpreters," their qualification being a knowledge of French — none of them spoke Lao. Among all Aid Mission, Embassy, and other American personnel one was moderately fluent in Lao and three others had some knowledge of it.

Religious and recreation patterns are almost exclusively American in content and take place within the American community. Those who attend church do so at the Protestant or Catholic churches maintained by local American and French missionaries. As for entertaining, those few Americans who invite Lao to their homes are the exception. Most visiting is done among the American community. Additional diversions are provided by weekly imported American movies shown in a recreation hall located in the Aid Mission compound, a bingo night, and Sunday evening buffet dinners at the restaurant. A special recreation committee was in 1957 considering the building of tennis courts and a swimming pool exclusively for the use of American personnel. That same year a small lending library was in operation, and an American Women's Club of Vientiane ran a thrift shop to help local charities. The club also heard speakers on such topics as local history and Lao village life.

The basic concern of the Aid Mission was with goods and materials rather than ideas, with equipment rather than training. Countless jeeps, elaborate road-grading equipment, trucks, fire engines, sprayers, electric generators, and outboard motors were among the materials presented to the government at specially organized ceremonies. A few scattered attempts were made to train Laotians in the use of this equipment, with varying degrees of success. Most of these efforts were limited to one- or two-week courses.

Information Service Activities

Although the program of the United States Information Service cannot be classified as technical assistance, its basic objectives are the same as those of the Aid Mission, and one of its chief purposes is to give publicity to the latter's accomplishments. Because of the lack of development of government facilities in Laos, USIS also assists the Lao Information Service in informing the people of Laos about their country and government. Dealing as it does with both urban and rural peoples, the activities of the American Information Service will be briefly discussed here.

In the absence of radios in Lao villages, the Information Service pursued its 1957 program by two principal means — publications and films. The printed materials, issued in large quantities, were relatively efficiently distributed to Lao villages throughout the country. A much smaller amount found its way to tribal villages. A colored lithograph of the King is felt by some Lao to be endowed with magical qualities and is highly valued. Greatly appreciated by teachers and school children is a large colored map of Laos in the Lao language. Some villagers, however, had difficulty in understanding the concept of a map, but once it was explained to them their interest was aroused. This was particularly true of the Meo.[7] When given these maps along with an explanation locating the principal towns, the Mekong and the area of their own village, even the majority who were illiterate in Lao were fascinated by them. An elementary Lao primer issued by the Information Service is used in all schools as well as in many *wats* (Buddhist pagoda compounds) where Lao was taught. Copies of a magazine on Buddhism in Southeast Asia, which contains photographs of American Buddhists and Buddhist art in the United States, are warmly received by Buddhist priests and laity. These varied publications on Laos in Lao are in contrast to posters with photographs of the French countryside, captioned in French, distributed by that country's information service and found in many rural schoolrooms.

---

[7] An important minority group in North Laos. See G. Linwood Barney, "The Meo — an Incipient Church," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 4, No. 2 (March-April 1957), pp. 31-50.

The mere use of the local language in publications does not, however, ensure understanding. Maps of the United States, booklets on the life of Benjamin Franklin, a poster of the flags of the United Nations, a chart of the organization of SEATO, or a photo-sheet of a Lao Embassy reception in Washington, although seen frequently on the bamboo walls of village dwellings, do not have too much meaning to people whose schooling is limited to religious education at the *wat* or a few years under a teacher who himself may have only six years of education. Newspapers do not exist outside the towns, and radios are infrequent even in urban areas. Photographs of Admiral Radford visiting Vientiane, the administrative capital, cannot signify much to people who think that American is the personal name of a missionary family.

It does not take any intellectual sophistication to enjoy a movie, any movie. Lao villagers give the same rapt attention to Information Service films that many Americans accord their television screens. A Lao movie audience squats in a circle around the semi-transparent picture screen, viewing it from both sides. Thus many rural Lao see for the first time in their lives the elaborate ceremonies and festivals which take place in their royal capital. They see their King and Crown Prince, the Lao army on parade, and neighbors in Thailand raising prize farm animals at agricultural demonstration centers. These films are accompanied by a Lao sound-track. Drama is provided in a film called "The People Win Through," written by Burma's Prime Minister U Nu and dealing with a fight against local Communists. At some of these film showings interest is stimulated by the singing introduction in Lao rendered by an Information Service projectionist.

Films of any type are welcomed in villages which have few means of recreation outside of the annual cycle of holidays and crisis rites. Sometimes Information Service films are requested by village headmen to help create a carnival atmosphere at traditional festivals called *bouns*. They are shown next to the outdoor platform on which Lao couples are dancing the *lam vong*[8] with the loudspeakers blaring forth modern Thai music.

A Look at the Aid Program

The most important aid program activity, in terms of effect on the rural population, is the one under which various types of consumer goods are imported into the country. This activity is described in a Mission publication summarizing the operation of the aid program:[9]

> The Lao Government does not earn enough money to pay the salaries of the soldiers, policemen, teachers, and civil servants it needs.

---

[8] These *bouns* occur in villages near the larger towns and would not be seen in more remote areas. The *lam vong* is a dance imported from Thailand, in which men and women move slowly in concentric circles without touching. The dancers move their arms gracefully in motion reminiscent of some of the movements in classical Thai dancing.

[9] *Cooperation for Peace and Prosperity, Laos — America.* Vientiane: United States Operations Mission to Laos, May 28, 1957 (mimeographed), p. 12.

> The United States has decided to help, not by paying these people dollars, but by providing dollar exchange to the Lao Government for which the Lao Government provides *kip* at the rate of 35 to one. This *kip* is then used to pay the salaries of soldiers and policemen and others.
>
> The salaries are spent, the *kip* thus made available to business men can be deposited with the Lao National Bank and dollar credits made available for purchase of the needed imports.
>
> And so, U.S. aid is put to a double purpose — first it is used to defray expenses of Lao Government soldiers, policemen, and other civil servants; then the same money is used again to bring to Laos all those goods which are increasing the economic capacity of the country and make life more worth living for all the people.

These immediate objectives agree with the broader, long-range view stated by President Eisenhower in a speech early in 1957 and quoted in the same publication:

> With other free nations, we should vigorously prosecute measures that will promote mutual strength, prosperity, and welfare within the free world. Strength is essentially a product of economic health and social well being. Consequently, even though we continue our programs of military assistance, we must emphasize aid to our friends in building more productive economies and in better satisfying the natural demands of their people for progress. Thereby we shall move a long way toward a peaceful world.

This and numerous other pronouncements have indicated that our basic objective is an economically stable, independent, and democratic Laos. Therefore, American aid programs should be judged on how successful they are in helping to realize these objectives. Some people might question the whole idea of an aid program to a country such as Laos and say that in the relatively stable, traditional society existing in Laos it might be just as well to leave things as they are, most of the population being content with the status quo. All this has an element of truth, in that the average Laotian villager is not acutely dissatisfied with his lot. Nevertheless, even people in remote parts of Laos are gradually becoming aware that conditions formerly accepted as inevitable need not necessarily be that way. Although the problems of the Laotian villager in terms of his economic survival are not as acute as those confronting, say, the Indian villager, where great population pressures make imperative some sort of economic and cultural change, still there are in Laos a number of felt needs. In any case, since the Indochina war radical changes have become inevitable. The only question that remains is under whose auspices they will be carried out.

Some of these needs have been discussed in a monograph on village life.[10] These include schooling, adequate salaries for village officials, a reciprocal relationship between government and villager. How far does the American aid program outlined above go toward meeting these needs? What are the positive and negative effects? Even the bitterest critics of the aid program cannot deny some of its positive implications. As a direct result of the aid program there are now more rural school teachers, even though the number is still far from adequate. There are more consumer goods available, which are accepted and desired by village people. These are especially clothing, iron bars, flashlights, soap, kerosene, and a few foods such as canned milk and tinned fish which provide a needed variety in the diet. Capital goods such as jeeps and outboard motors have made trading in locally produced and imported goods easier. The complete abolition of such a program would undoubtedly impose hardships and represent a step backward.

---

[10] Joel Martin Halpern, *Aspects of Village Life and Culture Change in Laos.* Special report prepared for the Council on Economic and Culture Affairs, Inc., prepublication copy, 1958.

Aid Program Abuses

On the other hand, there have been a great many abuses and adverse effects. Some of the more obvious ones have been noted in the American press. It is worth quoting here the observations of a conservative economic newspaper. After noting that about $100,000,000 have been spent in Laos since the aid program began there, the reporter goes on to state:[11]

> The principal effect of the U.S. largesse, however, has been a wild and rather weird boom, based on nothing more solid than cash on hand and an unquestioned assumption that there is more to come.
>
> Sleek Cadillacs, Buicks, and Fords have been imported by the dozen, although the principal highways still are hardly more than jungle trails. Other items on last year's import [1957] list make delightfully wacky reading — four and a half tons of feather dusters, 73 tons of sporting goods, fishing tackle, and thermos jugs, 180 tons of automobile covers, $23,400 worth of festival decorations, $11,500 worth of musical instruments, and thousands of dollars worth of costume jewelry.
>
> Retail shops are stocked to their bamboo ceilings with items that the Laotians have hardly ever seen before — American toothpaste, badminton racquets, roller skates, Japanese dolls, and French perfume.
>
> A lot of the U.S. money went to buy products from Red China — cherries in syrup from Shantung and Five Goats Beer from Canton. Much of this stuff is unsalable, but it doesn't matter; the importers have already made their profits from foreign exchange manipulations.
>
> To understand this, one must acquaint himself with the magic *kip*, the highly overvalued Laotian currency unit. The official exchange rate, set by the Laos Government, is 35 *kip* to the American dollar. But in the hardheaded money markets of Hongkong, Bangkok, or even Vientiane, a Laos trader can buy 100 *kip* for a dollar. This sets the stage for fantastic profits.
>
> A Laotian trader can buy 100,000 *kip* in the free money market for $1,000. He then applies for an import license for say $1,000 worth of building cement, but puts up only 35,000 to get the $1,000 from the government at the official rate. This leaves him 65,000 *kip* before he has even moved the goods. Then he can simply sell his import license for more cash, if he wants.
>
> If an importer decides to use his license, he still stands to profit heavily. Suppose he imports inexpensive men's shirts at $1.00 each. Buying his dollars from the Laotian Government at the official rate, each shirt costs him 35 *kip*. But then the

---

[11] Igor Oganesoff, "Living it up in Laos," Wall Street Journal, April 9, 1958, pp. 1, 14.

free market money values come into play. When the shirt goes on the market in Laos, it is priced at about 100 *kip*. So the importer has nearly tripled his money. Repeating this process under Laos' free and easy import rules, a businessman quickly can amass a considerable fortune. . . .

Many shipments, it is said, are diverted in Thailand (95 percent of Laos' imports pass through Bangkok and then are transported to Laos overland), where there is a lively demand for a wide range of goods. Other items arrive in Vientiane only to be shipped out again for greater profits. Thus industryless Laos has become an exporter of automobiles and outboard motors.

Effects on Lao Values

Other consequences are not so easily visible. One is the effect this program has had on traditional Lao values. For example, many young men are now attracted to the police and military, and fewer are entering the priesthood. The high salaries given them contrast with the minimal wages paid to school teachers. A few years ago there were many more applicants for teaching jobs than there were vacancies; now it is increasingly difficult to recruit teachers with even minimum qualifications.

Money accumulated by Lao officials and merchants via the aid program has also tended to accentuate social and class differences. Although class and caste (ethnic) differences are of long standing in Laos, there have never been really great differences in material wealth. Even the King lived in a wood and bamboo house until the French built him his modest palace in Luang Prabang. Ministers who now have European-style villas with one, two, or even more foreign cars parked in their garages formerly rode bicycles and lived in bamboo houses. One student of Lao affairs has pointed out that it is easier to approach a man on a bicycle than one in a chauffeured Mercedes-Benz. The denunciation of such luxuries by the Pathet Lao Communists and their refusal to date to accept any of these luxuries for themselves has been one of their chief sources of strength among the rural people and among many town dwellers as well.

One high-ranking Lao official, who is not among those who have enriched themselves, recently remarked, "Young people now value money more than honor." When asked if he thought termination of American aid would solve the problem, he replied that there was a lot more involved and that there was no simple solution. All these developments cannot be blamed entirely on the mishandling of aid funds, however, because the introduction of an increasing amount of cash into a society which has traditionally handled relatively little has many undesirable side effects and dislocations. This is true even when not accompanied by widespread corruption.

What are some of the basic assumptions underlying this type of aid program? The pros and cons of military aid for Laos cannot be discussed in detail in this report. Still, it is possible to question the utility in Laos of a 25,000-man army, particularly when the Pathet Lao forces whom they have been fighting have now been incorporated into the government and Royal Lao Army. A police force is without question necessary to maintain internal security. At the same time, whether high salaries make for high morale and maximum efficiency has never been clearly proved.

Then there is the matter of how newly introduced consumer goods have affected the way of life of the Lao and tribal peoples. After rice, the chief indispensable trade commodity is salt, and both of these are produced locally. If Laotian village culture is not to regress, iron bars for tools are also necessary. Manufactured clothing is generally desired, but acceptable substitutes can be made from locally grown cotton and silk. Yet a good many of the new items in the shops must certainly be considered amenities or luxuries and not necessities. The border line between these categories is not always clear and may vary among ethnic groups. Soap is an example. Lao villagers would consider it essential, but a prosperous Khmu would rather buy a cigarette lighter than a year's supply of soap. Although imported cigarettes are preferred for prestige reasons, the roll-your-own varieties can be made from local tobacco. These illustrations can easily be multiplied.

In this context the last paragraph of the statement quoted above describing the import program is worth repeating. It contains a value judgment derived from American culture but by no means shared by all Laotians!

> And so, U.S. aid is put to a double purpose — first it is used to defray expenses of Lao Government soldiers, policemen, and other civil servants; then the same money is used again to bring to Laos all those goods which are increasing the economic capacity of the country and *make life more worth living for all the people.*

Much of stateside advertising contains the theme that a new toothpaste, soap, or cigarette will "make life more worth living," and to a certain extent these declarations are believed by many Americans. Although the Laotian villager may accept some of these goods eagerly, their value in his overall way of life may be questioned. Certainly prosperous Lao officials and merchants have shown an eagerness to accumulate such goods, but it would be mistaken to say that they view them the same way an American views similar items. There is a strong recreational aspect to Lao culture, that is, it is considered important to "do things in a pleasant way." This goes for driving a car, drinking refrigerated beer, or dancing a *lam vong* to over-amplified music. But the beer and music end quickly and the car eventually breaks down due to lack of repairs. The American will go to great lengths to repair his car; the Lao may also make some efforts in that direction, but there is no compelling force. *Bo pen nyang* ("It doesn't matter; it can't be helped") is a favorite Lao expression and an indispensable idiom.

Lao Religion and Material Goods

The importance of the Buddhist religion in Lao life cannot be overestimated, despite the fact that many young men appear to be attracted to the police or army. The ultimate reality to most Lao is not in their material possessions or expendable goods, but in the cycle of rebirths in which they are involved and in acquiring merit for a better rebirth. Merit is not obtained by accumulating goods; on the contrary, generosity with one's material possessions is a virtue. After the age of fifty or fifty-five, most Lao men and women desire to retire from active life and spend time in meditation. Even for young people life in the *wat* (temple compound) is of great importance, and becoming a *bonze* (a Buddhist priest) is a common experience. Relatively enormous sums, often equivalent to lifetime savings, are spent on personal religious festivals.

Becoming a *bonze* does not represent complete renunciation of wordly possessions, and certain of the Buddhist rules governing these matters are not strictly observed. For example, a Lao *bonze* can earn money from his religious services which he can use after he leaves the priesthood, and various material gifts are customarily presented to *bonzes*. Yet even by Lao standards their life is simple and their possessions relatively few. Although a *bonze* might welcome renovations to the pagoda or an additional statue of Buddha to adorn the altar, he would not regard these items as essential, nor would he or the average layman feel that consumer goods make life more worth living.

But Buddhism is only part of the story. What about the spirits, the *phi*?[12] So far as is known, they have not developed a taste for toothpaste. We are dealing here with a culture where destroying consumable goods and income-producing property in livestock for religious sacrifice make life more worth living. This is not so in Little America, for the commissary, with its stock of goods, does make life more worth living for the local Americans. It would be unfair to claim that these consumer goods form the most vital aspect of their lives abroad, for American missionaries have for years subsisted on a good deal less. There is no doubt, however, that such goods are of much greater importance in American cultures than they are in Laotian culture.

Road Construction

What, then are some of the accomplishments and problems in the fields of transportation, agriculture, and education? Road construction has been one of the biggest projects of the Aid Mission, and the significance in Lao trade of the road between Vientiane and the royal capital at Luang Prabang has been brought out earlier. The following is the official description of this project:[13]

> The reopening and maintenance of the national roads of Laos and the allied program of training Lao personnel are among the most important projects being aided by the United States Operations Mission. Distribution of goods is one of the most expensive and difficult problems faced by the Royal Lao Government, because transportation on many of the roads is possible only by jeep or oxcart, air-freighting of goods is prohibitively costly, and the Mekong River — the main artery of the country — is unnavigable by large craft during much of the dry season.
>
> Almost $1,500,000 worth of road-building equipment has been brought in, serving the dual purpose of rebuilding the roads and training Lao personnel in the care and operation of equipment, so that maintenance may be carried on and new roads built by Laotians themselves in the future. Although rehabilitation work on the Luang Prabang-Vientiane road had been in progress less than three months, in April it was unofficially opened when a diplomatic

---

[12] The Buddhist Lao, like the non-Buddhist mountain tribes, believe in and conduct religious and magical rites for spirits of various kinds. See "Aspects of Village Life and Culture Change in Laos," op. cit.

[13] *Cooperation for Peace and Prosperity, Laos — America*, op. cit., p. 26.

> convoy which included the American Ambassador made the trip by car to the Royal Capital for the New Year's celebration. In addition, many Lao officials also made the journey by auto. They reported that excellent progress had been accomplished; that the road was easily passable for its entire length. The Prime Minister and the Minister of Public Works were so impressed that they publicly expressed their enthusiasm at the near-miracle results.

This program was a success in that during 1957 a road was temporarily opened for traffic. This success lasted only a short time, since the monsoon rains soon washed away stretches of improperly constructed roadbed and caused landslides which will have to be cleared anew each year.

Additional difficulties in the public works program are indicated in the newspaper article cited earlier:[14]

> Transport improvement is the largest single current aid project, with $5.6 million provided by the United States. Beside the new ferry, there is a $3.7 million plan to rehabilitate roads. Most of this has been spent for heavy earth-moving equipment: tractors, bulldozers, and shovels. Maintenance cost of this machinery is about seven million *kip* monthly, or more than double the Laotian government's normal total revenue — which gives some idea of the problems ahead if the U.S. aid funds are permanently terminated.
>
> Actual road work is largely in the hands of the Universal Construction Company, an American firm which operates on a direct contract with the Laos government and has a large force of Okinawans on the job. The principal project is maintaining the dirt road between Vientiane and the summer [royal] capital of Luang Prabang, 150 miles to the north. No new roads are contemplated.

Even more important than the cost of maintenance is the training of Lao personnel for this work. From this point of view the project has been an almost complete failure. By way of illustration, the operation of the project in Luang Prabang town was carried out by a crew of Okinawans who were assigned to work on the road and also to bulldoze certain streets in the royal capital. In a sense this work proceeded under the general direction of the local Department of Public Works and although a few Lao worked with the Okinawans little real training was accomplished. During 1957 two American construction workers were assigned to Luang Prabang to install a rock-crusher. They worked almost exclusively with the Okinawans who, after the Americans' departure, were responsible for the maintenance of the new installation. In view of similarities between Okinawans and Japanese, it is not surprising that local Lao townsfolk and villagers thought the road was being built by the Japanese who had occupied the area during the war.

When asked about the lack of a training program, Americans responsible for the road project replied that their primary job was to build roads and not act as instructors. Similar responses were given by other Americans who were theoretically in Laos to train people in import and export procedures but who expended their energies just trying to set up a workable system, with no time left for training.

---

[14] Oganesoff, op. cit., p. 14.

It is natural that there never was a question of priorities between construction and training, although the two objectives need not necessarily be incompatible. This easily relates to the Little America state of mind which finds it more expedient to deal with things rather than ideas, with machinery and construction rather than teaching and training. It should be emphasized that this is an implicit "official policy" attitude and not one felt by individual American technicians. Once removed from Little America, the two construction men briefly assigned to Luang Prabang survived on local housing and food, and despite linguistic barriers made friends with local officials, went hunting with them, and in general got on very well. But they could not initiate a training program by themselves and so were recalled to headquarters in Vientiane after the completion of their technical work.

Agriculture and Irrigation

In the field of agriculture a vital felt need of the villagers is for irrigation works. Part of any irrigation system is some sort of dam, and projects for construction of dams have figured prominently in the program of the agriculture division of the Mission.

The completion of one small dam was regarded as a significant achievement. Dedication ceremonies were attended by two cabinet ministers, agricultural technicians, representatives of the Lao Ministry of Agriculture, local officials, and United States Information Service personnel who took photographs and films to publicize the event. The agricultural technicians made a few suggestions for minor alterations in construction and inspected the connecting irrigation ditches. As far as they were concerned the project was then finished business.

In any democratically administered aid program the foreign technician must work through the officials of the host government. To by-pass these channels and deal directly and only with the villagers would be a violation of the political independence of that country. At the same time, it is this author's repeated contention that an aid program consists of ideas as well as techniques and machinery. In the basically conservative, status-conscious society of Laos, the technician should not try to transplant his own social and political system. Such attempts would be justifiably resented, but if American aid is to make any sense at all, surely the technician should be interested in the effect of his project on the people whom it is designed to benefit. He should also be interested in the extent to which his technical knowledge is transferable and transferred.

Again this brings us to the problem of communication between the foreign technicians and the host officials. The course in irrigation techniques referred to in the official statement above was given through a French-English interpreter. As is common in most societies where class and age are important social distinctions, the Lao officials attending the course had a strong sense of etiquette. Even had the American technicians been able to speak French with them directly, it would be likely that if their comments were not understood they would not be unduly questioned, especially since in most cases the Lao officials were younger than the Americans. The informal give and take of similar courses in American society is not part of Lao culture. In addition, it is customary for most Lao officials to use the interpreter not as a tool but as a third party in the conversation. If the interpreter happens to be Vietnamese or Thai, he too has a personal sense of etiquette, and will phrase his translation accordingly. It is not unusual, then, that in most cases contact between American technicians and their Lao counterparts cannot be anything but formal and does not lend itself easily to an interchange of ideas. Sincere friendliness, good will, and polite and tactful English speech do not always succeed in overcoming these barriers.

Now what about the Lao villagers? Although the dam will benefit them, they do not feel that it was built for them. A significant portion of the land watered by the dam is owned by the royal family, with many villagers working as tenants. It was therefore assumed by them that the dam was constructed for the royal family. The villagers did not contribute their labor for this project but were paid for their efforts, so that they felt it was strictly a government enterprise. As far as the American technicians and materials were concerned, the villagers assumed that the Americans at the dedication ceremony were simply some foreign visitors and did not associate them with the dam at all.

Permanent dams have been built by landlords in other areas near Luang Prabang. When repairs were necessary villagers did not undertake them on their own initiative, but instead waited for the owners to act. Even in areas where villagers work only on their own land, if a dam is to be properly maintained it is necessary to explain its operation to the villagers in an attempt to ensure their interest and cooperation. In that way the dam may be a more lasting improvement.

Education and Tools

There are also those instances where the technician does not come from Little America but works for an international agency and lives in and off the local economy. Of course, this does not automatically ensure the success of his work. An isolated training course, no matter how well presented, which is not followed up by other activities almost inevitably fails of its objective. This is illustrated in the experience of a French-speaking UNESCO technical education specialist who in 1956 conducted week-long courses at several of the provincial capitals in the use of the tool kits donated by the American Aid Mission for the rural schools. This course as it took place in Luang Prabang is described in romanticized but sincere terms by the technician's wife:[15]

> American Aid has donated a tool box for each rural school in Laos and has asked the UNESCO expert for technical education (who is my husband) to conduct these courses. Two have already been completed with good success, one in Savannakhet, Central Laos, and one in Pakse, South Laos.
>
> After the official opening we go to a large classroom with white tiled floor. The tool boxes are neatly arranged there, quite an impressive block. With the help of an interpreter who speaks both Laotian and French, the expert gives the name of each tool and explains briefly its usage and advantages.
>
> A beautiful level is the first item on the list. It is passed round and well admired. An ax with a long

---

[15] Quoted in Ras Oliver Johnson, *A Study of Education in Laos*. Vientiane: United States Operations Mission to Laos, Nov. 23, 1956 (mimeographed), pp. 49-56.

> handle is not known to them. They laugh as my husband shows them how to hold and swing it. Brace and universal square, hand drilling machine and pipe vise, and many more unknown tools have to be explained, and the boys follow the lecture very attentively.
>
> One boy had asked: "And when do we learn to make nice furniture?" The expert explains how they can use the little knowledge they could acquire during these five days to make doors, window frames, and simple furniture as well. He gives on the blackboard the drawings for a plain working bench and a table to be built as the next exercise upon return to their village.

Judging by this abridged account both students and teacher enjoyed the course, and some pleasant contacts were established. However, no concrete action resulted. The presentation was planned on a national level, and although the provincial education officials were pleased to be hosts to the sessions they never received official instructions from the national Ministry of Education about the action to be taken following the completion of the course. Thus, the tool kits were not distributed to the teachers but were stored in the education office's supply room.[16] Had the government had previous experience with technical education, no doubt they would have continued on their own. Since there was no local person equipped to continue the work of the UNESCO expert, the tools remained idle. The fault lies in a lack of planning and lack of continuity. A one-week course such as this could hardly be expected to have a lasting effect.

Need for Continuity

This lack is illustrated in still other aid projects. One was the distribution of vegetable seeds to village schools which was carried out one year with good results. The seeds were well received by the teachers and villagers and produced some useful garden crops. That is as far as the project went. Unfortunately one year was not a sufficient time for the villagers to get their own seeds from the new plants. More seeds were eagerly awaited the following year, not only by the villages which received them the first time but by other villages which had heard about the project. The next year, however, the Aid Mission did not have a seed program.

Much the same situation prevailed with village medical kits. These, too, were distributed to the rural school teachers, some of whom received a month's training in their use. Again, supplies to refurbish these kits were not forthcoming the following year so that in both instances expectations were built up which were never fulfilled.

It is small wonder that the Lao officials concerned with these projects became confused as to the methods used in planning American aid programs. Perhaps a better impression would have been left with both officials and villagers if the projects had never been undertaken. One Lao remarked, "It is better not to give at all than to give and stop when the greatest need is felt."

A final American aid project to illustrate the lack of contact between Little America and the Laotian economic and cultural situation is the case of the distribution of several truckloads of American-made agricultural implements such as hoes, axes, and shovels. The lack of familiarity of the Lao with certain American-designed tools has been indicated. One day a large shipment of implements arrived in Luang Prabang by plane, with instructions from the Ministry of Agriculture that they be distributed. The provincial agriculture official followed his superior's instructions, and they were distributed a day or two later. Most of them were given as handouts to local townspeople on a first-come, first-served basis. Some of these town dwellers cultivated gardens on the river bank. Part of the implements went to the Thai Dam refugee village where gardening is an important source of cash income, and a few neighboring Lao villages also received some. None were given to Meo or Khmu because, according to the distributing official, "No Meo or Khmu were around when I was giving them out."

---

[16] Some of these kits eventually did reach the village schools (see first teacher's essay in Chapter 5 of *Aspects of Village Life and Culture Change in Laos*, op. cit., p. 136-37).

There are blacksmith villages in the environment of Luang Prabang, where the chief source of income is in the production of locally used agricultural tools such as digging sticks, Lao-style hoes, and machetes. It would have seemed a more fruitful approach for an aid project to have worked toward improving traditional equipment and production processes in the villages rather than to have handed out unfamiliar implements in an unorganized manner.

Suggestions and Conclusions

It is easy to criticize a program which has had as many difficulties as the one in Laos. Some of the main objectives of the Laos program, such as political and economic stability, have so far not been realized, and the mistakes in the administration of the aid program have undoubtedly made it easier for local Communists to increase their political influence.

The aim in this paper is to criticize constructively and suggest possible solutions. Even under ideal conditions the transfer of techniques from one culture to another is a difficult process. It is not only a matter of transferal of a technique; one must also consider its side effects on the surrounding social and cultural matrix.

Basic to the administration of the aid program in Laos is the material organization and frame of mind implicit in Little America. It is both inconceivable and undesirable that Americans working overseas should seek to adopt the culture of the host country, for they would then lose their ability to function independently and objectively. On the other hand, it is not profitable to ignore the local culture. Knowledge of the local way of life will not in itself solve political problems, but it may aid in their resolution, and it is a necessary prerequisite to an effective aid program.

Both the United States and the Soviet Union share fundamentally the same technical culture, that is, both countries produce fairly similar jet planes, hydrogen bombs, trucks, medicines. These vary in details of design rather than in essential principles of operation. The important difference is one of values, not of equipment. What American aid should represent overseas, therefore, is primarily ideas and methods of procedure rather than functioning as a distributing agent for supplies. Little America makes possible the transfer of supplies but places obstacles in the way of transferal of ideas or even of the establishment of relationships of understanding and trust, which are an obvious requirement for their successful transfer.

The following suggestions are intended specifically for the situation which exists in Laos, but in some cases may apply to other areas in which American aid programs operate.

1. Learning a Language

There may be reasons why adult Americans do not know French, but there is no reason why they cannot learn. It would be impractical to spend years teaching American technicians on two-year contracts to speak flawless, grammatical French. But if it is considered important for American personnel to have first-hand contact with Lao officials, some minimum training in French should be provided. Highly technical negotiations of bilateral agreements require interpreters, but certainly no interpreter should be necessary for a discussion of rice cultivation, school curriculum, or malaria spraying. A technician working without an interpreter will make more mistakes at first, but even the imperfect exchange of ideas done directly is far more meaningful and rewarding than translations which, although mechanically perfect, do violence to ideas and concepts. It is the job of the foreign technician to use the language established in his host country. A knowledge of the technician's own language should not be forced upon his counterpart. Learning English should be encouraged, of course, but Lao officials should not be rated on their ability to speak English.

A knowledge of Lao is not very useful outside of Laos. At the same time, the small effort spent in acquiring a vocabulary of a few hundred words is amply rewarded by the closer personal relationships it fosters. Even a slight knowledge of the language of one's host country shows that the foreign technician values and respects her culture. If the technician can greet a villager and ask him a few simple questions and reply in turn to the villager's questions, a small bond of understanding has already been established. Even minor linguistic achievements will make the technician's job easier and possibly more fruitful, and may also provide him with indications that he is running into difficulties which might not come through in a formal exchange via an interpreter.[17]

2. Modifying Little America

Realistically speaking, it probably would not be possible to completely abolish Little America even though it might be desirable. American technicians often come overseas at what they consider to be great personal sacrifice. It would not be reasonable to expect them to live like Lao villagers. If families accompany aid personnel, some local medical facilities must be available and ready access to more extensive facilities must be maintained at all times. One cannot expect to recruit exclusively dedicated idealists, but, if sufficiently high salaries are paid, competent personnel can be attracted. An American commissary is not essential, nor is an American restaurant, although both are probably justifiable.[18] Nevertheless, Americans who cannot survive without canned fruit juices and minute rice are perhaps better off remaining at home.

---

[17] In 1957 Congress appropriated $8,000,000 to help improve the caliber of the ICA personnel overseas. Language training is now (November 1958) a prerequisite for many jobs.

While bamboo houses are not adequate for Westerners, at the same time air-conditioned barbed-wire compounds are not vital to maintain health. The American housing compounds in Vientiane were developed because of the lack of local housing facilities for the large numbers of Americans sent over. This raises the question as to whether it was absolutely essential to bring in so many Americans. As indicated earlier, Little America, once established, is self-perpetuating: the larger the community, the easier it is for it to have an existence completely independent of the local culture, and consequently the larger the number of Americans needed to maintain other Americans and keep Little America functioning. Perhaps decentralized housing would help this situation. Air conditioners help make life easier in the tropics, but their acquisition and maintenance should not cause one to lose sight of our main objective.

The number of technicians should be kept to a minimum rather than increased. Supporting executive office personnel should be limited and reliance placed on local facilities. Local personnel should be used wherever possible within the Mission. If competent local personnel are not immediately available, they should be trained. Certain operations may be more inefficient as a result, but local barriers will be fewer.

The morale of American technicians should be based on getting a job done and not on the supply of American beer and whiskey. The pioneer instinct has not disappeared in all Americans. Those who find living in Laos an enforced hardship should be encouraged to go home rather than made to stay on. Representing America abroad should be an honor and a privilege, not a burdensome obligation.

Many will scoff at these ideas and say they are impossible. This author would not agree. But if the skeptics are right, then it is better to either have no aid program at all or simply loan the money to the government of Laos and permit the Lao to hire their own technicians. Clearly Little America is basically a failure and waste of money. Another alternative must be sought.

3. Continuity of Projects

Technical assistance programs should have delimited objectives which are planned for a number of years. Annual Congressional appropriations make long-range planning difficult, but they do not make it impossible. Modest programs pursued consistently will yield better results than grandiose schemes conceived on a hit-and-miss basis. One of the reasons for difficulties in Laos is that attempts were made to do a lot in a hurry and as a result relatively little was accomplished, particularly in the field of technical assistance.

4. Ideas Before Materials

All the jeeps, road building equipment, and consumer goods in the world will not prevent the Communists from taking over Laos. If the people of Laos associate their welfare with that of their government, this may make the work of the Communists more difficult and perhaps impossible. Large sums of money heedlessly spent by American personnel help unscrupulous officials to get rich quick. It cannot bring about positive economic development. This can be done by successive steps only, and large amounts of new consumer goods are not necessary to implement it. Americans have concepts worth presenting: labor outside of office work is not something to be restricted to the lower classes, and trained officials can profitably get their hands dirty; the programs which succeed best are those which have the understanding and cooperation of the people they are designed to benefit, since "improvements" imposed from above do not make for true progress; an individual should be judged according to his ability and not his birth. Any American working abroad can easily name or redefine these concepts and probably add half a dozen more.

---

[18] Such facilities are essential, however, in cases where it is regarded as desirable to separate foreign troops from the local civilian population, as in the case of American forces stationed in Europe or Japan.

5. Appreciation of Local Culture Values

During the course of its operation the American Aid Mission has spent countless thousands of dollars on surveys for rivers, road, and airports. No comparable survey was ever undertaken concerning the Laotian's ideas with regard to specific development programs or even to the idea of development in general. It was merely assumed that American concepts apply. Political and economic matters are analyzed in detail, but no one has bothered to systematically compare Laotian and American values to see where they agree and differ. It would be considered sheer folly to build a road without first surveying the proposed route, but it is normal operating procedure, apparently, to plan an aid program with little if any foresight as to how it might affect the local population.

6. Importance of Rural Programs

The population of Laos is overwhelmingly rural, and approximately half of these people are non-Lao. No aid program can be effective which does not deal with the majority of the people. To date, much of the American aid has been concentrated, partly by plan and partly by indirection, in the towns, particularly in the administrative capital of Vientiane. New stores, offices, a bank, a hotel, have been built while villages are unable to obtain teachers or basic medical supplies. A power plant dependent upon imported fuel oil has been set up in Vientiane. A ferry service requiring heavy subsidies has been instituted to aid in the importation of consumer goods from Thailand, while local village crafts are ignored. The differences between town and village have been increased and so have the mutual suspicions.

7. Reaching Different Ethnic Groups

Of the small amount of aid that does reach rural areas, very little indeed has found its way to the non-Lao ethnic groups. Thus existing tensions have been multiplied. The Communist Pathet Lao have made good use of the dissatisfaction of the minority groups as well as of the Lao villagers. Some of the best Pathet Lao soldiers have been Khmu.

Clearly Laos does not need new banks and trading companies as much as she needs schools, a rural medical program, and some kind of agricultural extension service. Although prejudice does exist, many Lao officials in the technical ministries recognize the necessity to reach the non-Lao peoples, but have so far lacked sufficient trained personnel and facilities to do the job.

The United States Operations Mission to Laos is by no means a lost cause, but present methods and procedures will not ensure success; new ways and ideas must be found and tried.

K. A. Busia

Africa in Transition—II
Under European Colonialism

In the preceding issue of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY *Dr. Busia, himself an African, described the spiritual world of African people before they were influenced by European civilization and Christianity. In the present article he discusses political, economic, and mission influences as they have pressed upon Africa. The results of colonialism have been "a growing offspring of nations" seeking a higher standards of living, a better way of life. Prof. Busia, however, feels that the greatest potentiality of Africa lies in its human material, in its people. Part III, "Africa and Technical Civilization," will appear in the September issue.*

Colonialism Complex

The climate of opinion in the 20th century is in favor of the grant of independence to colonial territories and, therefore, there are many in Europe who appear to have a bad conscience about the subject. It is, in fact, becoming fashionable now to level the charge of imperialism or colonialism against a country that one seeks to discredit. The charge is immediately and indignantly repudiated, so that colonialism is now regarded as something to be ashamed of, and such an attitude is itself of historical as well as psychological interest.

The feeling of guilt is understandable. Colonialism has been associated with international wars, with slavery and exploitation, and with some of the worst examples in the inhumanity of man to man. But that is not the whole story. It is out of the relationship created during the period of colonialization that our contemporary international society has been born, and it is impossible fully to understand contemporary international relations without appraising them against the historical background of colonialism. Just think for a moment of Australia, Canada, India, Egypt, the Union of South Africa, the Middle East, and

Indonesia (and let it not be forgotten that the U.S.A. was once a colony), and you will realize what a force colonialism has been in the creation of the international society of the 20th century.

Motive

What led Europe into Africa? The reasons and motives which led European powers to seek colonies have been variously expressed at different times. The desire for markets and trading posts, made necessary by the expanding industrialization in Europe, has always been a predominant factor. To that extent the Marxists are right; but other reasons have also been given. Writing of the growth of the British Empire in the 17th and 18th centuries, Sir John Seely asserted (what has now become famous) that "the British conquered and peopled half the world in a fit of absence of mind." Without any design the British found themselves in possession of an Empire; and there are historians who maintain that subsequent research appears to bear out the truth of Sir John Seely's claim. It is true, for example, that in Ghana the British went out to trade without any design of founding an Empire. A study of the resulting policy bears this out. In the end they had to stay to rule.

Later, however, colonies were deliberately sought, partly because markets were desired and partly because the possession of colonies enhanced national prestige. One recalls Disraeli's Crystal Palace speech of 1872 in which he referred to the British possessions as proof of what he called "the commanding spirit of these islands." And there were many of his countrymen who shared his jingoism. During the period 1870 to 1910, economic development led to an intensification of the rivalry among European powers for colonies, particularly in Africa. "The scramble for Africa," as it is called in history, was justified on the basis of the latest Darwinian theories of social evolution which were then in vogue. Professor Karl Pierson, for example, in an article on the expansion of the Empire at this period, had this to say: "History shows me one way, and one way only, in which the state of civilization has been produced; namely, the struggle of race with race and the survival of the mentally and physically fitter race." So colonization was justified by the biological theory of the struggle for existence and the survival of the fittest.

Mission

There were others who saw the reasons for colonialism differently. In their view Europe had a mission, indeed a divine mission, to colonize. This is exemplified, I think very effectively, in an article by Mr. Wyatt on "The Ethics of an Empire." He wrote of the British: "To us, and not to others, a certain definite duty has been assigned: to carry light and civilization into the dark places of the world, to touch the mind of Asia and of Africa with the ethical ideas of Europe, to give to thronging millions who would otherwise never know peace and security these first conditions of human advance." I know that there are many nationals in Africa and Asia to whom this will sound rather hypocritical in the light of the economic compulsions they have experienced. But I think the truth should be faced. When the results of the impact are examined, there can be no doubt that one of the factors to be considered in this situation has been that Europe has carried the light of civilization into the dark places of the world, and that even if thronging millions have not been touched, there are hundreds who have been touched and whose minds have been opened by this contact. The results of this fact we shall examine presently.

Dual Mandate

In the present century there has been another theory which is very similar to the "sense of divine mission" theory. I refer to Lugard's theory; in his book on the "Dual Mandate in British Tropical Africa" he suggests that Britain had a dual mandate towards her colonies. This was first to help colonial peoples to advance, and secondly to develop the resources of the colonies for the benefit of mankind generally. The motives and reasons for colonization are thus very mixed. There was indeed the desire to profit or to enhance national prestige as well as the desire to serve others. Selfishness as well as altruism had a part in it.

The questions I wish to ask are: What did Europe carry to the colonial territories? What is the aftermath of the two or three centuries of the impact of Europe on Africa? This is really the situation with which we must be concerned. To me as an African there are several things that are most significant.

The first (not in order of importance or evaluation, but in its obviousness and in its width of impact) is the fact that Europe carried to the colonies the products of its science and technology; that is to say, the tokens of her power over nature. These included rifles and canons as well as the more positive contributions capable of raising the standards of life generally. Everywhere in colonial territories, from bicycles to motor cars and electric lights, and more recently atomic stations, stands the evidence over which a signpost bearing the words "Europe has passed this way" might well be erected. Europe took to the colonies the means for improving the conditions of living and for prolonging human life as well as introducing diseases and weapons for destroying human life.

Impact of Education

Europe also carried into Africa the heritage of education. Education has been defined as the action exercised by generations of adults on those who are not yet ready for social life. In this respect every society must have an educational system, by means of which the culture necessary for the survival, the continuity, and the unity of the society is transmitted by the older to the younger generation. In this sense Africans have had a system of education, for without it they could not have continued existing as a community. What Europe carried to Africa is a more specific kind of education, namely schooling, the process of teaching and learning carried out in schools by people set aside for that purpose. Europeans introduced schooling into Africa and, usually, the content of what was taught was based on European culture.

This is significant for an appraisal of the contemporary situation and some of the problems we are now up against. For example, the whole trend of the French system of education in French African territories has been towards the production of a civilization that is essentially non-African. The French philosophy of education does not consider that a curriculum for African schools can be based on African social life. In their view the best thing that can happen to an African is that he should become French. And education has been so directed. It is not so long ago that French pupils in French West Africa were using a textbook in which little boys and girls recited: "A palm tree is a tree which does not grow in our climate." The point I want to make is that education in Africa has been an instrument of social change because through education new skills and ideas were conveyed to the colonial people and a new class of literate people has been brought into being. This was bound to affect social relations within the territory itself as relations between the educated nationals and their educators.

Education is an explosive force because it conveys new ideas; as Lewis Dickenson put it, "Whatever we may say or think, ideas are the greatest force in the world." Indeed education can be an instrument of change and a deliberate instrument of policy.

In the Belgian colonies the idea became popular to give as many Africans as possible an education up to primary school level to fit them for the semiskilled vocations. In this way it was thought what the British in their folly permitted (allowing a few people to go to the top ultimately to cause trouble and to agitate for independence) could be prevented. This policy was defensible in the interest of justice and equality for it did make it possible for everybody to have a share in some education. It is when you make too much education available to too many people that they begin to ask awkward questions. Even in the French system a few people are ushered up to the top, but every effort is made to identify their interests completely with the colonizing power so that they regard themselves wholly as Frenchmen. They are divorced from the bulk of the masses of their own people. They are made to see what great benefits have been conferred on them personally and hence are no longer anxious to give leadership to their people against the ruling power. Both policies, for different reasons, have failed and will continue to fail. But they have become deliberate policies and factors that must be taken into serious consideration in analyzing the present situation.

European Law and Administration

Europe also carried to its colonies the benefits of European administration and law. European administration gave the framework for uniting tribes and setting new goals for governments, such as road systems, social services, schools, etc. Especially significant are the concepts of individuality and individual rights conveyed to the colonies through European law (especially French and British) which are based on the concept of natural law or the traditional emphasis on rights in European history. Those familiar with Prof. d'Entreves' book on natural law will see what an explosive force the whole tradition of European Roman-Dutch law can be with its emphasis on the rights of individuals. In Africa and India, just as in France and America before them, the concept of this type of law in fact sets off a revolution for liberty. Those who have read the history of the Indian national congress and the speeches of the great leaders of the congress know that they quote and defend their rights from British political philosophy which was made available to them through literacy. The same thing is happening in West Africa. You have only to read some of the speeches of members of Ghana's legislative assembly to see the use which they make of Dicey and Burke and other great philosophers, to see what a "dangerous" situation is created when the concept of British law and justice are conveyed to the colonies and when colonial nationals in British schools learn and become masters and interpreters of British law.

Missionary

Though they often precede the colonizers and settlers, the gospel the missionaries bear is in itself a force, not only because it conveys new ideas but because in its organized form as a human institution it is the vehicle of culture. After Christianity is established in these colonial lands, it continues to be a vehicle of culture. For example, it influences the new situation in many African towns where the tribal system and the system of kinship has broken down and is unable to cater to all the multifarious activities of the new life. The result is a birth of new economic and political associations, and in place of the old tribal village and kinship groups many close associations are based on the church. A group of people belonging to one church may be members of a singing band sponsored by a church meeting night after night. Out of this association may emerge a mutual trading association. This is the way in which many mutual benefit associations are coming to birth and the reason why we must regard the church and the preaching of the gospel as one of the factors in the changing conditions of Africa.

The Gospel out of Europe

Above all, colonialism is a sociological fact. It is essentially one of human relations between Europeans and non-Europeans, often between a few Europeans in the colony and a large number of Africans whom they go to rule in the name of the Queen or the King. We shall pass over in meaningful silence the relations between the slaveowner and the slave. We do not need to flog that horse. But we must draw attention to the fact that in the colonial situation the relationship between the European and non-European was the relationship between possessors of power and privilege and those who were weak and underprivileged. This is the human side of Europe's technological superiority. Every European in a colony was a representative of his powerful country, whose power was based on its superior technology. He carried with him the prestige of his nation, and quite naturally this prestige often attached itself to the missionary also. He belonged to the ruling race, whether he liked it or not, and it greatly affected his relationship with his flock. It could be and often was a barrier.

I myself have listened to many missionaries talking about the areas in which they have worked ten years or even twenty years, and imparting to their brothers in Europe a lot of misinformed and incorrect statements. Some African students, listening to these reports, have reacted so violently to what seemed to them to be lies and distortions of the truth that they have turned completely against the church. This, I think, is partly due to the fact that the missionary in Africa is a member of the ruling race carrying that prestige which has often been a barrier for him really to know the people. He has met his flock only as a pastor, and when they have paid him the deference due from an inferior to a superior, unconsciously he has been filled with the joy and pride that come to those who have favors to bestow on the humble who will meekly accept them. It is a dangerous spiritual situation for anyone who is privileged to carry the gospel into Africa. It feeds one's pride and thereby obstructs the thing which one is honestly trying to accomplish.

Colonialism and International Relations

In this situation of power and privilege there are lessons for international relations. The impact of Europe upon Africa has been the impact of the powerful on the weak. There the goals that are set for the colonial territory are those of power, and the major problem is how the colonial territories can obtain the means to this power. Its importance, therefore, for international relations is quite evident here. International relations are the most significant result of colonialism. Colonialism has led to the creation of new nations and to the birth of nationalisms resembling the nationalisms of Europe.

Sometimes I say to my fellow sociologists that to understand Europe one should go to Africa where Europe has reproduced its kind. And most important, Europe has produced nationalism in Africa. That is to say, people are joined together from different tribes, sometimes tribes previously at war amongst themselves, into a common administration, and they obtain a political consciousness and a common political aspiration. The French writer Maurier, writing on French colonies, has this to say: "The first effect of colonization is to lift the natives from tribe to town, from town to nation, to engender among them common interests and common feelings, to awaken in them a national spirit, token and consequence of the revolution in their social status. For the white man's rule brings them either territorial or tribal law. The conception of wider community was introduced by the French. It was contact with the French which gave the natives the feeling of a common destiny which is the basis of nationality."

One could say the same thing of the British rule in Africa. In Ghana today, with the withdrawal of the British imminent, this concept has become a reality. It was British sovereignty which bound together the four different territories of the south Ashanti, the northern territories, and Togoland. It was the hatred of the alien ruler which supplied the negative force for unity and a sense of nationhood. And now that that force is about to withdraw, the consciousness of their divisions is apparent and a new consciousness of unity must be built. Sir Alfred Zimmern noted the same thing of Asia. Writing in the Congregational quarterly in 1949, he had this to say: "More than half the population of the globe lives in southeastern Asia including China. Throughout that area with its crowded masses, the one dominant influence now and for some time to come is, and will be, nationalism. These are the inevitable reactions of people who had been living for generations under a humiliating sense of inferiority in the face of the pride, the prejudice, and too often the crude biological fallacies of their white superiors."

Hope for Harmony

This helps to explain why nationalism in the colonies starts by being anti-European — and yet the very nationalism which is anti-European is intensely European. It is the offspring of European technology, science, administration, and education carried into Africa. It owes its birth to European contacts, and to the values and ideas conceived through access to European literature. As to the crude biological fallacies of their white superiors, we hope that they have been nailed inside their coffin and buried forever; for wherever the nationals of colonial territories have been given opportunities of education, they have shown themselves capable of mastering the alien cultures of their rulers. Cultures can be learned and that is one of the major contributions that sociology has made to the study of international relations — to provide evidence of the fact that cultures can be and are being learned. It suggests that the road of equality of opportunity to acquire education, and especially higher education, is the one along which we may hope for harmony, particularly in multiracial communities.

Contact with Europe has given birth to new nations and has also decided for them the goals which they should pursue. The phrase "underdeveloped territories" by which these countries are known is itself significant. There are some who dislike the expression. But it is significant that it should have been chosen and used at all, for above all it tells us something about Europe. The countries are regarded underdeveloped in terms of technology and industrialization, the standards of output and consumption in comparison with Europe. Thus it betrays a judgment based on a choice of values on the part of Europe.

Result of Colonialism

The result of colonialism in Africa, as in India, has been this: The growing offspring of nations in quest of power, the power which will enable human beings to have more and more of the good things of life both popularly and technically expressed in the shorthand phrase, "higher standards of living." These, they have been taught, they may hope to achieve through science and technology which are the instruments of civilization. There are some who are prone to believe they are the instruments of salvation also. One has only to look at the discussions on contemporary education in Britain and America and the emphasis on trade and technology there in order to see what I am talking about. It is therefore not only for Japan and Russia that Europe has determined the values which should be sought by nations, and consequently their national policies, but also for many of the nations that have been born or are being born through colonialism.

In my own country within a few months [1956], if things go well, we are to have independence. This goal is so strong that at present our biggest and most important project is the mining of bauxite, a Volta River scheme which is to cost 300,000,000 pounds sterling. (This is a sign of our growth and of our emergence as a nation.) We have a river running right through Ghana. We also have bauxite deposits. The idea is to build a new harbor, to build a dam, and to start the production of aluminium in a Ghana-built aluminium plant. Canada, Britain, and the United States are interested in this also. In fact the concentration of interest on the coming independence of the Gold Coast is not primarily a moral interest at all. The Gold Coast wants to be independent so that it can sign agreements with Canada and America and Britain for working the Volta River project. In spite of the low standards of living of the farmers and of the ordinary villagers, in spite of the fact that you can walk through the northern territories village after village without seeing a single lamp post in the street, that during the dry season you can go through village after village in my own constituency which I represent in the assembly and see women walking five to ten miles in order to fetch muddy water for use in their houses, in spite of all this, we have accumulated about 100,000,000 pounds locked up in London, hoping to use some of it for the development of the Volta River scheme. For this will be a sign of our industrialization and therefore serve as acceptable evidence of our emergence as a modern nation. These goals are determined by the emphasis and the criteria which are used to judge nations — goals foreign to Africa, but the measure by which African nations are judged — the measure of scientific and technological power.

Africa Potential

The real potentiality of Africa, however, does not lie in its mineral deposits, or in its forests, or in the power of its rivers. The real potentiality of Africa lies in its human material; that is always an unpredictable thing. No one knows what the men and women of the present generation or the next generation in Africa are going to become. That is why I emphasize the simple and obvious thing that there is only one species of *Homo sapiens* upon the surface of the earth. They can learn, and what they are going to learn will be determined by what they are made to consider to be the values worth pursuing in this "power over weakness" situation.

The advances in science and technology have made men "nuclear giants," but failures in human relations (such as racial segregation in the U.S. or *apartheid* in South Africa, or tensions in the Middle East, or massacres in Hungary) give plenty of evidence of their ethical infancy. All this is relevant to the colonial situation, because colonialism has given birth to nations to which the benefits of science and technology have been handed, which in turn created in them the insatiate quest for more and more power to improve the conditions of life. It has become increasingly clear that the international society, in which the higher standards of life can be maintained through science and technology, must be based not only on the foundation of a common technological civilization, but also on the foundation of certain common ethical principles.

I believe that in this situation there is cause for optimism. There are indeed diversities of cultures and ways of life, but colonialism has also given proof that beneath those diversities every human heart is human; and we express a common humanity in cooperation, friendship, and mutual and active sympathy as well as in competition for power and more power. Just as technical advances are spreading a common material civilization, so also it is possible, I think, to advance in mind and spirit, not indeed for a common culture, but to an awareness

(Concluded on page 185)

William J. Samarin

Gbeya Prescientific Attitudes and Christianity

MOST of us in Oubangui-Chari have witnessed at one time or another the celebration of the killing of a leopard. But I dare say that most of us did not draw too near the merrymakers, for we did not know what to think of it. We did not know whether it would be "right" for a missionary to seem interested — or even inquisitive — about such "pagan practices" for fear of seeming to give our approval of them.

A missionary is struck at this time by the marked change in behavior of people who he thought were "good Christians." Most of the people are stripped of most of their clothing. (If the men happen to be wearing trousers, they roll up the legs.) The women put on makeshift leafy bustles over their cloth skirts. The men brandish spears. There is drumming and singing — songs which are never heard in regular church activities. There is dancing — the swaying of the body and the shuffling of the feet, as people keep in time with the music. Every now and then one of the crowd approaches the leopard, which is slung on a pole carried by the men, and cries out and jabs at the animal. The leopard's face is wrapped so that its eyes and muzzle are covered, for, we hear, "the leopard might see the person who killed it and get revenge," and "the leopard's whiskers are a very powerful medicine."

We stand at the edge of the crowd, unable to understand what people are saying and singing about, for we know only the lingua franca. So we remain embarrassed, not knowing whether to smile or frown, whether to stay and see more (so that we could have more to say on deputation!) or whether to leave in a hurry.

Need we be embarrassed at witnessing such a celebration? Are we justified in going so far as to condemn any part or the whole of the activities, or is it advisable to participate with the people? Questions of this sort about this particular event in an African's life, or any others about which we have some misgivings, cannot be properly answered without an analysis of the forms involved and their meaning or function in the culture complex. We shall shortly see that several very important features of African culture converge and intermesh in this event.

An Act of Celebration

Basically, we are concerned here with a *celebration*. The people rejoice because they have killed a destroyer of stock, namely, goats. This is no insignificant fact, for goats constitute one of the marks of wealth, and even in this day of money exchange goats persist as a stable and conclusive payment in many transactions.

Another reason for rejoicing is that a

man-killer has been liquidated. It is not that leopards are a real threat to human life, but that when they are accosted, they present themselves as a formidable foe, one that can kill or maim. When we realize that one of the foci of Gbeya culture, for we are talking only of the people with whom we are well acquainted, is survival — the daily fight against sickness and death — we can begin to understand what the defeat of such a foe means to them.

The leopard is not the only man-killer. The others are (in addition to man, of course) the elephant, the lion, the crocodile, the eland, and the anteater. It is significant that the buffalo, which certainly kill many more people than the eland do, are omitted. In fact, it is doubtful that many people can remember anyone's being recently killed by an eland. What characteristics these animals seem to share is their size, potential threat, or their rarity in the area occupied by the Gbeya. The anteater, however, seems to kill only with its sickness (about which more is said below).

But such celebrations, i.e. those characterized by the singing of certain songs and the brandishing of spears, do not follow the killing of all the animals listed above, but only the lion, leopard, and, before the arrival of the European administration, man. There are also scattered and less intense celebrations when the new moon introducing the dry season first arises. The dry season, the people explain, is the time when animals are killed.

Danger of Contamination

The second basic feature of the leopard celebration is that it is a *time of danger*. The corpse of any of the predatory animals listed above contaminates all who come in contact with it. It is said that these people, unless they are ritually cleansed, will be affected by a sickness described as a cough without any expectoration of mucus but of ultimate expectoration of blood (tuberculosis?). Therefore, he who first found the leopard (if it was in a trap), he who killed it, and they who carry and butcher it — all these are automatically contaminated. Special care is taken of the whiskers. They are removed and burned, for it is believed that one's enemies will use them to put them into one's food and cause one's death. Likewise, the claws of the anteater are used in such sorcery.

The cleansing takes place in the following way: Those who are contaminated give all that they had on the day of the killing, as well as the spear, to an initiate, someone who has already gone through the cleansing ceremony. They sleep outdoors, and at daybreak they are washed with a certain potion prepared by the initiate. He it is who gets all their contaminated articles of clothing or hunt that they had on them the day before. He then instructs them to observe certain taboos until the first rains. At that time he kills a chicken and prepares the sauce. Three times he dips a bit of the meal into the sauce and puts it into the palm of the one being cleansed, and three times the latter throws it over his shoulder. The fourth time, the initiate takes the other's hand and helps him to dip up the sauce and put it to his mouth. That being done, he is pronounced clean.

Relation to Pagan Religion

There appears to be no fetishistic worship connected with this rite. It is simply a matter of washing away the carrier of the disease. The main features of this rite (those mentioned above) characterize many other cleansing rites, some of which, of course, *are* connected with fetishistic practices.

Once the animal is butchered it is no longer "contagious." If one's clan is permitted to eat leopard meat, one can eat it. This leopard taboo is different from the taboo having to do with one's clan's totem. There are, however, rules which govern the eating of leopard meat, as with any "man's animal," namely, lion, lynx, hyena, civet, red monkey, and gray monkey. Only male elders may eat. Once one has become the father of two or three children, he qualifies as such an elder, but if one's father is still living, it is considered rude and disrespectful to partake. For these clans, anyone who violates the taboo is subject to the contaminating disease. In the clans which are not restricted by this taboo, the elders refrain from eating, deferring to the young men who are supposed to beget stronger, healthier children for having eaten leopard meat.

The Fabric of Gbeya Life

This discussion, brief though it may be, has revealed the fact that we have to do here not with an isolated incident in the life of the Gbeya, but the realization of an intermingling of cultural themes. Were we to analyze this event in such a way as to make a list of subjects for further study, information that would certainly help us to better understand the Gbeya, we would have at least the following: recreation (the lack of it, the need for it, the forms it takes), sickness and death (causes and remedies, including fetishistic and nonfetishistic practices), taboos (their ritualistic and "real" function), the concept of the relation of the material to the nonmaterial world and God's relation to them.

This event is not a burr which has attached itself to the fabric of Gbeya culture and which can be plucked off with impunity. Rather, it is a design in this fabric, not printed on, but woven into it. We can tear out this practice only at the cost of leaving a hole with loose ends to all the threads. Were we to legislate against it without applying our teaching and guidance to its roots, such as correcting the Gbeya's unscientific (not necessarily "un-Christian") views of the world, which we have wisely never done, we should not be making any contribution to a healthier African church. Rather, we should reveal to our fellow Christians that we had no confidence in their judgment, no ability to see evil when it exists. And if they should yield to the pressure of our exhortations without being convinced that there is an evil involved, we would be encouraging, nay, forcing them to shallowness and hypocrisy.

For, after all, what is there pagan or heathen in this celebration? Is it wrong to sing? Is it wrong to move one's body rythmically? And what about American football games and all of their hypnotic fanfare — the yells and songs and all?

We concede that the Gbeya have erroneous ideas of the world. We admit that they are wrong in believing that leopards can kill simply by contamination. But is this heathen? Is it even superstitious? — a term having more connotative than denotative value, a pejorative really. Is it not simply prescientific thinking?

Prescientific views are not banished by evangelical preaching alone. Before the scientific era there was a great deal of nonsensical thinking even among good Christians. And even today, among folk cultures one finds many views which the more sophisticated city-dweller smiles at. On the other hand, these members of folk cultures shed many of their views along with the old ways of living very quickly after being urbanized.

The Gbeya, then, are a prescientific people whose world view is still intact in spite of various cultural innovations, material and nonmaterial. Christianity has been well accepted by them, but they do not see any inconsistency in having faith in Christ and believing that animals contaminate people. Some day they, too, will be wiser, but in the meantime they are not really poorer, weaker Christians for it.

William A. Smalley

PRACTICAL PROBLEMS

Vocabulary and the Preaching of the Gospel

Readers who are familiar with Eugene A. Nida's books[1] have read his discussions of the fascinating differences between religious terms in different languages, and of the widely different areas of meaning which words in different languages may have because of the difference in cultural background of the people using the languages. We present here a most practical problem in the vocabulary for 'sin' and 'taboo' in one of the Senoufo languages of West Africa, as presented by Mrs. Howard Beardslee. When, as in this case, there is very little of either linguistic or cultural correspondence, the task of communicating the gospel is challenging indeed.

The Problem

As missionaries we have come to communicate the message that God sent His Son into the world reconciling the world unto Himself. A part of this message is the fact that sin separates man from God and obstructs the fellowship between God and man. We are puzzled as to how adequately to explain sin, for the word we have been using means both 'sin' and 'taboo.' The gospel was first preached to the Senoufos in the Bambara trade language which has different words for sin and taboo. When it was interpreted into Se-

[1] Especially *God's Word in Man's Language* (New York: Harper and Bros., 1952) and *Bible Translating* (New York: The American Bible Society, 1947).

noufo the word *kapini* incorporates the two ideas in one word.

Taboos among the Senoufos are innumerable. It is taboo for a man to see his wife sewing, or to hear her sing the "marriage song." It is taboo for a man to whistle in a field except when he is resting, or for a woman to whistle except to make a little wind when trying to blow the chaff off the grain on a still day. It is taboo for the women to see a certain fetish, or for anyone to watch the old women when they go out to perform a certain ceremony to bring rain in a drought. One night a woman said to me, "We have so many deaths in our country because our taboos are so many." They believe that they will be harmed in some way or that God will kill them for breaking a taboo.

A Senoufo who had often heard the gospel preached said that adultery and lying were 'sins' or 'taboos.' However, some who had had no contact with the gospel said that adultery was not a *kapini*, but that if the husband found out about it he beat up the wife and the guilty man. An adulterer is sometimes called a 'person without shame,' but adultery is still commonly practiced. When we inquired of the Senoufos about things commonly considered sinful by us, we found that before they ever saw the white man those who habitually practiced adultery, lying, and stealing were called *silegebafeebi*, or 'without-shame-people.'

It presents a problem when preaching to those who have had no contact with the gospel, since when we preach against sin they think of taboos. Would it be possible or practical to give an adequate explanation every time one preaches, showing the difference between their taboos and sin as we know it to be revealed in the law of God? How much do the Christians understand when we preach against sin? We are sure they continue to practice their taboos, with very few exceptions. This word *kapini* seems to be the most natural one for the Christians to use when they are testifying or preaching and it was they who first used this word when interpreting from the trade language into the tribal language.

Ann Beardslee

It seems apparent that *kapini* is not in itself an adequate way to translate 'sin' into Senoufo. No matter what explanations were given in sermons, hearers would tend to identify *kapini* with the kinds of behavior it covers, and not the extended meaning of the missionary. But how will we find better vocabulary?

The Catalog Approach

One way is to assume that we know in most cases whether a man's behavior is sin or not, and what the difference between sin and taboo always is. By such a point of view we could make two lists, one of "sins" and one of "taboos" and be guided thereby in our dealing with the Senoufos, in our preaching to them, and in our judgment of their behavior. The one list might contain items of behavior such as adultery, lying, and stealing; the other might include seeing one's wife sewing, hearing one's wife sing the marriage song, etc.

Now we want to talk to unevangelized Senoufos about these things. The behavior in the second list they consider dangerous, likely to bring death, possibly wicked or fearful. Many of the items in the first list they consider reprehensible, but not fearfully dangerous or subject to the punishment of God or nature. Our temptation is to consider the second group petty and irrelevant, the first extremely serious.

Our word 'sin' was probably translated *kapini* (the Senoufo word for the second group) because it was presented as fearful and bad, subject to divine sanction. A word to cover the first group is hard to come by. We understand that people who do these things are "without-shame-people," and at least this is a starting point, though there is no indication of divine displeasure in the term.

In other words we can have two terms for the two lists, but the "feeling" behind them, the really significant meaning seems reversed to us. We run into other problems also, because the longer our lists, the more certain it is that somewhere on them there are going to be items for which these Senoufo terms do not apply. Perhaps many of the items on the "sin" list will not be thought of as "without-shame" behavior.

However, at least we have a starting point, and we decide to teach people the rest of the list of "without-shame" behavior, as we have compiled it. We construct our catechisms, prepare our sermons, and organize our ministerial training program so that people understand completely that God will not tolerate "without-shame" behavior, and just what that behavior consists of.

In this way we have a terminological distinction between taboo and sin, and we have overcome what seems to us to be a serious mistake in informing people that God does not want them to whistle. Thus we feel that we are more adequately communicating the gospel.

The Communication Approach

Or are we?

On the other hand, we could start from another direction and ask ourselves what sin is, basically, theologically, and culturally. How is it defined cross-culturally?[2] If we decide that sin is that which disrupts man's fellowship with God, disobedience and rebellion against God, or indifference toward Him, rejection of His Lordship and of His Son, it casts the whole problem in another light. Specific acts then become symptoms of our allegiance, or of our rebellion, or even of our vacillation between. As our preaching and teaching starts with God, moves through the level of redemption through Jesus Christ into the behavior of Christian people in a given culture, we are faced with the profound question of the transformation of a world view of a group of people, and of their knowledge of God. As men learn to know God, His Son, and discipleship, a profound transformation can then take place in their lives.

But sin and sins are Biblical concepts, and the need to discuss them does not go away by changing the viewpoint. However, we have stopped shifting individual acts of behavior around from one category to another, and we have changed instead to inquire about motives, about the nature of sin, and about the character of God. This is a very Biblical thing to do, and it is basic to the communication of the gospel. Our search for vocabulary becomes less one of a search for a label to cover a catalog of actions, and more one to describe a range of attitudes.

---

[2] I am not here dealing with the question of who should make and enforce value judgments and decisions of right and wrong in a church. This complex problem has been discussed in a variety of articles in PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY.

In order for any Biblical sense of sin to become real to the Senoufos, their understanding of God must first become in some measure Biblical.[3] It is only as they recognize the antithesis between God's nature and their own that talking about sin takes on any relevance at all.

I would certainly want to avoid using the term *kapini* as a general term for sin or sins. "Without-shame-people" or some other expression like "without-shame-deeds" (if this is possible) may be applicable to some situations and some behavior. It could perhaps take on the meaning of divine sanction in time. I would seek, however, as much as possible, to preach about God and His revelation of Himself in His Son Jesus, our love and obedience to Him, and showing that love in behavior which does not come in to disrupt it. I would emphasize God's abhorrence of the human selfishness and disobedience which disrupt fellowship, in order to make sense, linguistically and theologically. It is God's relation to man which is the most significant from the Christian point of view, not whether an individual act is good or bad in itself alone.

The solution to intercultural communication is not so much to translate as to re-express in another language and cultural system. If words for sin are hard to come by, then other, longer, more paraphrastic ways may have to be found, which of course implies fundamental decisions about basic meaning rather than glib identifications of the vocabulary of one language with that of another. What do we want to say to the Senoufo? Do we want to tell them that they should not steal? Well, then, let's say it. Do we want to help them live in a way consistent with the Lordship of Christ? This is more subtle, and harder. It subordinates the question of finding the right vocabulary to the question of finding the effective way to express a whole range of message.

---

[3] See William D. Reyburn, "The Transformation of God and the Conversion of Man," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 4, No. 5 (Sept.-Oct., 1957), pp. 185-193.

AFRICA IN TRANSITION — II

(Concluded from page 178)

of a common humanity which would enable all to contribute to and receive from the common heritage of mankind, made all the richer by a diversity of gifts and contributions. As I see it, these are the greatest contributions that sociology can make or has made in this situation. In spite of its emphasis on its cultural diversities, sociology has shown: (1) that cultures need not permanently divide; (2) that cultures are learned; and (3) that across the frontiers of cultures can be erected the basis for mutual understanding because all men share a common humanity and common capabilities.

William A. Smalley EDITORIAL

The World Is Too Much with Us—II

It seems clear that culture patterns have a strong effect on the response which people make to the preaching of the gospel, and on the effect which any conversion to Christ has in the church or in the society as a whole. That Arabs are harder to win than Vietnamese is an obvious kind of illustration, and that a church in central Africa takes on a different ethos or "flavor" from a church in southeast Asia is another.

It is also clear, I think, that Christ's requirements of total commitment are at variance, in differing amounts and in different ways, with all cultures. In saying this I mean *all* cultures, including the religious culture (the approved behavior, the ecclesiastical system) of my denomination and every other denomination or independent church. Such denominational or church groups are individual subcultures within the larger subculture of Western (and world) Christianity. Even our churches stand in the way of that relationship to God for which we were created.

Evidence of this last point can be seen in the fact that occasionally a group which has been only recently evangelized shows a response and a degree of personal loyalty to God that is rare in our own churches. To take a very specific example, the Meo culture of northern Laos seems in some areas to stand less in the way of such a relationship than does the church I attend in White Plains, New York. This is true in spite of a pagan Meo religious system which is replete with an enormous number of spirit beings who are placated, bribed, or appeased, as the situation may warrant. These spirits, beneficial or not, are equated with "demons" by the Christians and by many of their missionary teachers.

This Meo movement in the Xieng Khouang area of northern Laos has been reported in PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY.[1] It is characterized by a rapid turning to Christ on the part of several thousand people, and an intense loyalty and dedication on the part of many. It is the intensity of this faith, the strength of this loyalty, which I am now contrasting with the American groups with which I am familiar.

There is a severe danger of oversimplification here. At least one other major factor enters into the picture, and that is the activity of the Holy Spirit as God works in history and in culture. I think, however, that in spite of this all-important other factor we are justified in making some generalizations on the basis of culture differences.

Some American Characteristics

If we grant that the Meo are in some ways culturally more "ready" for the gospel than Americans, and even American Christians, what are the peculiar *American* cultural barriers to a man's relationship to Christ? Some of these will be true of other groups as well, and some will not. Some of the cultural barriers which the Meo will have will not be true of us.

---

[1] G. Linwood Barney, "The Meo — An Incipient Church," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 4, No. 2 (Mar.-Apr. 1957), pp. 31-50.

The effect of "secularism" and a mechanistic outlook on life have been cited so often as to need no discussion here. The American characteristic of looking at certain classes of people as "landscape" or "machinery," rather than as "neighbors" and fellow human beings, belongs here too.[2] The tendency to substitute theology or dogma for experiential religion is another of our temptations.

The complexity and sophistication of our life is another very strong deterrent in keeping us from Christ. Our culture shows an amazing genius for organizing our lives into ever more complicated institutions. Even the simplest of our churches are no exception unless they have reached the point of disintegration where there is no life left. Our typical response to a church problem, or to an individual need, is to organize another church group. In a typical busy American church today, if we do not participate actively in many branches of this enormous program this is a sign that we do not love God. If we do participate fully, and at the same time fulfill our obligations to the equally complex business, civic, and social life we must lead to be responsible Americans today, it is impossible to love God as we should.

The Dilemma of the Christian in Culture

At one point or another, in every culture, the sensitive Christian is brought up against the inescapable dilemma created by the conflict between culture patterns and his own relationship to God. An Abraham leaves the civilization of Ur to follow God's call into a wandering existence, a promised land, a new understanding of God, and a new course for history. An Amos burns with indignation as he sees the rich crushing the poor, the merchant with the double standards of measure, the indolence of the leisured class (cows of Bashan), and he pronounces in lyric poetry the wrath of God and the destruction of the country at the hand of its enemies. A Martha is busy getting the house and meal ready for her Lord, while a Mary sits and listens at His feet.

The dilemma of the Christian in culture is that he cannot really escape his culture, but he must transcend it, in some measure at least. The pilgrim (or missionary) who like Abraham leaves his city and his culture behind him does not really do so. He carries most of it with him. His habits of life and thought, his social relationships, his sense of values, his language, his mechanical skills, these all come along. But an Abraham is different from the people he left behind, different from the very fact that he left them behind, different from the changes necessitated by the new circumstances of his existence, different by a new developing understanding of God.

Like all prophets, an Amos is also a part of his culture and is limited by its confines — but not completely limited, because the function of the prophet is precisely one of seeing beyond the horizon his culture poses, even though it be only a little. Whether he is a prophet of God or a man with unusual vision for his time and place, he is sometimes able to speak to his culture in such a way that it listens and is changed.

---

[2] William A. Smalley, "The World is Too Much With Us," Practical Anthropology, Vol. 5, Nos. 5 & 6 (Sept.-Dec. 1958), pp. 234-236.

In some of the stages of the history of Christianity there have been Marys who have felt that they could renounce their culture to live a contemplative life. But this, too, is at least partially an illusion. It is true that the hermit and the monk are shielded from selected details of life around them, but there is always the rest of a man's life, his background, his thoughts, his presuppositions. He carries them to the monastery or the hermit's cave. They, too, are of this world's culture.

Relation of the Christian to His Culture

What can it possibly mean to be "in the world, but not of it"? How can the Christian possibly be part of his culture and yet transcend it? There are at least two dimensions here. One is the dimension of personal ability, insight, "prophetic vision," which can be seen sometimes in non-Christians and is often not seen in Christians. In other words, there are people who by their own abilities step slightly outside the limits of their world. Some of them are Christians, though it is not this insight which makes them so.

The other dimension, one which is profoundly Christian, stems from that supercultural relationship to God which we call faith. Everyone who has that relationship to God which the New Testament speaks of in such vivid language: being brought back (redemption), making friends again (reconciliation), being rescued (salvation), has also transcended his culture. The supercultural fact of God in history, in individual life, is what really makes a Christian "not of this world."

Christians are quick to select elements of behavior from culture around them and to label these as "non-Christian" or "sinful" (like dancing or racial segregation, depending on the American denomination they belong to). In so doing they forget that the real grip of a culture lies in habits, values, and viewpoints which are not so well defined. The very complexity of our life is a case in point. It is not going to do us any good to pass denominational resolutions calling for a simpler American society. We could simplify our denominational and church structures, but I doubt that it would work. We know of no other way to operate in our complex world. The monastic escapism has been shown by history to be a false way out. It seems to me that in this tightening web of organizational activism our only hope of being in this world but not of it is to develop that independence of judgment and spiritual perception which makes it possible for us to refuse to participate when participation is required beyond the point of emotional health and spiritual wisdom.

Refusal to participate, of course, can be an escape, a way out. I am thinking of it here, however, as a creative step, a question of priorities, to make ultimately more worth-while activity possible, to foster intellectual and spiritual growth.

Frequent, and even occasional, refusal to participate in a prolifera of church activities, in a denominational survey, in a mission meeting, in an evangelistic campaign, as well as in selected secular activities ranging from PTA to a collection for the March of Dimes, will certainly be criticized in a culture which places its greatest values on prompt reports, committee attendance, and adding wheels within wheels. But in this day and age, if Martha is to sit at the feet of Jesus, even the dishes may occasionally have to stay dirty.

REVIEWS

A Century of Darwin, by S. A. Barnett (ed). Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1958. Pages: xvi, 576; 55 figures, 6 plates. $5.75.

Reviewed by

HENRY W. SEAFORD, JR.

In *A Century of Darwin,* the impact of Darwin's work upon biology, sociology, and ethics is discussed in relatively nontechnical language by 15 different scholars — mostly of the British Isles. Since each author's essay is complete in itself, some reduplication of data is inevitable, but this enhances the book's value since it allows the reader to see the same data in varying contexts.

The first three chapters deal with the genetic basis of evolution. Waddington sets forth genetic dynamics with most delightful literary skill. Dobzhansky follows with an enlightening discussion of the reality of species as a taxonomic unit, and the development of new species — the very basis of evolution. "If no instances of uncompleted speciation were discovered the whole theory of evolution would be in doubt; we would have to conclude either that evolution did not occur or that the formation of new species is instantaneous" (p. 48). The exciting new emphasis in genetics that certain extragenetical influences operate in heredity is lucidly described by Donald Michie in the ensuing chapter.

In his significant chapter, "Darwin and the Fossil Record," Harvard paleontologist A. S. Romer treats of the following questions often raised by skeptics of evolution:

1. Where are the "missing links"?
2. How could so many biological changes occur in such a short time?
3. If evolution be true, why are so few "family trees" clearly definable?
4. Where are the gradual changes in fossils from one geological stratum to the next?

Mr. Henry W. Seaford, Jr., in an instructor in Northwestern University (evening school). He has completed the residence and language requirements for the Ph.D. at Harvard. He is author of articles which have appeared in the *Gordon Review* and in Mexican anthropological publications. Mr. Seaford did anthropological field work among the Chocho Indians of Oaxaca, Mexico; he also served as interim director of the Christian and Missionary Alliance mission in Mexico City for one year.

5. Why do whole groups of animals appear abruptly?
6. Similarly, why is it that a whole series of animals appears in the Cambrian (505 million years ago) when there is little evidence of life before that time?

To the first question, Darwin himself pointed out that merely ascertaining an "intermediate" form in some cases would be difficult — intermediate between what? As Le Gros Clark quotes Darwin in the former's essay on "The Study of Man's Descent": "We must not fall into the error of supposing that the early progenitor of the whole Simian stock, including Man, was identical with, or even closely resembled, any existing ape or monkey" (p. 194). Now that certain facts of geology have become functioning parts of modern thinking (including that of Christians), the second question is of diminishing pertinence. That life has existed on earth for a few hundred million years is widely accepted — unmitigated heresy for Bishop Ussher's coterie!

Darwin countered the third question by calling attention to the gross imperfections of the fossil record: the low probability that geologic conditions would be favorable to preserve most animal forms. Now gaps are being filled. Shortly subsequent to Darwin's first edition of *The Origin of the Species*, the discovery of *Archaeopteryx* showed that birds probably developed from reptiles. Intermediate forms between amphibian and reptiles, and mammals have also come to light. As for the absence of a slow progression of forms in a single formation of rock, Darwin thought this was strong contrary evidence to his theory, but mitigated its force by reasoning in a manner still acceptable to modern geneticists. Since Darwin's day, there is less reason to ask the fifth question.

Even Darwin had no answer for the last question. Romer considers this still to be the "greatest of remaining palaeontological puzzles" (p. 149). He points out that there are thick sediments before the first fossil-bearing strata, but they are almost completely lacking in fossils. In fact, "the general picture is reasonably consistent with the idea of a special creation at the beginning of Cambrian times" (p. 148).

"Darwinism and Ethics," the closing essay, discusses three ways evolutionary theory has been associated with ethics: (1) in the development of ethic systems in spacetime; (2) evolution as a guide to this development; (3) the influence of ethics on evolution. Darwin believed that ethical ideas have developed, in part, from the process of natural selection. That evolution could indicate what is good, however, he did not believe. Even in this nontheistic discussion the Christian can feel right at home. The progressively clearer delineation of the moral *ought* is not incompatible with a Christian *Weltanschauung*, for the Bible was more than a millennium in composition. And certainly Darwin's belief that a natural process is incapable of determining good is equally acceptable. As for the last point, if the Christian is acquainted with recent biological research, he sees with alacrity the awful ethical responsibility of scientists who delve into the very process of life itself.

Another essay deals with the erstwhile influence of Darwinism in social studies. Approximately one third of the book pertains to aspects of Darwin's researches which are not immediately pertinent to average Christian interests.

Introduction to Cultural Anthropology, by Mischa Titiev. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1959. Pages, xiv, 464.

Reviewed by
JOSEPH E. GRIMES

The first quarter of this book is an evolutionary reconstruction of man's past, written with emphasis on the biological factors which influence man's behavior today ("Nature's place in man," as a colleague puts it). Three chapters trace man's history as known through archaeology, pointing up the replacement of biological mechanisms by cultural mechanisms at an exponentially increasing rate throughout human history. The remainder is a standard survey of cultural anthropology. In it the thing given a person at the moment of conception and the things taught him after birth are distinguished, and the theme of the dynamic growth of culture is elaborated. Sketches of three cultures, including our own, exemplify what Titiev has to say.

As another introductory text, this one seems to have its emphasis on biology and biocultural dynamics as its reason for being. It is nicely manufactured and the style is readable, which gives it a certain advantage over some introductory works.

However, ease of style may have betrayed the author into looseness of statement, as when in talking about the Aranda kinship system (p. 275) he actually describes the Kariera by leaving out the terminological and behavioral complexities which distinguish Aranda. It may be in the interest of simplicity that he projects kin terminologies on a standard chart which is equally applicable to the study of fruit fly mutations, with the result that characteristics of various patterns of social organization, such as marriage rules and unilineal groupings (to the theory of which he contributed materially in earlier work on space as a determinant), are actually made rather hard to trace out.

Some readers of PA will find the author's generalizations about Christianity amusing or infuriating, depending on temperament. By explaining Christianity in terms of certain religious concepts found in anthropological literature, some of which really are applicable to the forms of Christian ritual, he obscures the fact (or perhaps no Christian has ever made it clear to him, in which case criticism should be directed the other way) that the Christian world view is not a field apart from science, but that it actually includes science, including the more bizarre phenomena of anthropology, within itself as a unified field. Science, rather than edging out belief in the supernatural bit by bit (p. 426), merely clears the air of the religiously based obfuscations we are all just as well off without; it has nothing to say about the ultimates with which Christianity deals directly. Science must instead look sooner or later to Christianity to explain its own existence.

Joseph E. Grimes, of the Wycliffe Bible Translators and Summer Institute of Linguistics, is a Ph.D. candidate in linguistics at Cornell University. At various periods since 1951 he has been living among and working with the Huichol Indians of Mexico. Among various articles on the language and the culture of the Huichol is one which appeared in an earlier issue of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY: "Individualism and the Huichol Church" (Vol. 1, pp. 127-134).

LETTERS

Watch the Emphasis

I have enjoyed PA very much and have found it both interesting and helpful. However, I have found a certain attitude periodically running through the pages. A definition of "culture" might be "a way of life handed down from one generation to another." So we must learn their way of life and teach the way in Christ, and the Holy Spirit will show them and us what must go and what must stay. The Bible is the way of life handed down from God to man which must exceed and exclude (if necessary) that way of life handed down from one generation of humans to another.

I agree that we should not teach Western culture and way of life, but neither should we overemphasize their culture. The emphasis has been that of taking Christianity to their culture. Should it not rather be take their culture to Christianity (i.e. the Bible) and see where it fits? Here in Thailand Buddhism superimposes on Animism, and I am sure it was never meant that Christianity should be superimposed on that again. So watch the emphasis, please.

Thanks a lot. You're doing a good job.

Ian Murray

Maehongson, Thailand

Arbitrary Yardstick

Someone has been sending me Practical Anthropology and highly honored me thereby! I recognized the paper as of unusually high caliber by its very first issue, which challenged me to go beyond my own too easy acceptance of the "self-governing, self-supporting, self-propagating" yardstick for indigenous churches. Worthy aims for any church — yes! But I recognized easily that I had used the yardstick too arbitrarily — and seized on them without thinking through to the truly indigenous church. Thanks for "pulling me up" in my thinking.

Mary C. Kreide

Grantham, Pa.

Simplify that Language

Practical Anthropology has helped to clarify questions in my mind concerning missionary enterprise on the foreign field. I trust that as time goes on the Lord will continue to bless the ministry of this booklet and make it a source of blessing not only to those interested in practical anthropology as such, but also the average lay Christians who send thousands of dollars each year to the field to support missions. Because of this I would urge you to make your language as simplified as possible. I am sure you will agree with me when I say that the thing which strikes us most forcibly when we read the Gospels is the utter simplicity of the language that was used by the Lord. At times I feel that we seek to improve on this only to the confusion of many who read our articles. This is just a suggestion from the lay reader's standpoint.

Roy Brill

Roslyn, Pa.

CONTENTS

A FRANCO-AFRICAN CROSS-CULTURAL CLASH 193 ROBERT C. BLASCHKE

VILLAGE REBORN 198 ADIB GALDAS

THE FUNCTION OF RELIGION IN SOCIETY 212 ROBERT B. FOX

ARAB CUSTOMS 219 DOROTHY L. VAN ESS

AFRICA IN TRANSITION — III TECHNICAL CIVILIZATION 223 K. A. BUSIA

PRACTICAL PROBLEMS

The Missionary Role in "Marriage Palavers" 231 EUGENE A. NIDA

REVIEWS

Reader in Comparative Religion, an Anthropological Approach (William A. Lessa and Evon Z. Vogt, eds.) 235 IRWIN DAVIS

LETTERS 237

Robert C. Blaschke

A Franco-African Cross-Cultural Clash

French colonial policy and Administrators' lack of knowledge of the prerequisites for leadership in the Sabu tribe of Central Africa led to a clash between clans. Mr. Blaschke, who knew of the bitterness which had been built up between the groups, found out what had led up to it and here tells the story. Most interesting of all is the way in which the puppet chief appointed by the administration sought to defy the traditions of his fathers and acquire the real chiefly power which was in the control of the land.

THE sun stole quickly into the eastern sky on the 8th day of March 1958. Omar Gisa, chief of the canton of Sena, head of the *kaasu* clan of the Sabu tribe, sat astride his white Arabian stallion. He moved cautiously with warriors (armed with bows and poisoned arrows) out of the forest into the clearing surrounding the small village of Sogote.

Simultaneously, almost as if it had been planned, the French administrative officer and a captain of the French police drove into the same clearing from the motor road.

The strained look fell from the warriors' faces. The fingers which had been clutching their bows now relaxed. The tension-charged air was dispelled as the white and black leaders approached each other. The Africans, though momentarily unhappy with the white man's intrusion, somehow sensed that this was a providential meeting which had prevented much bloodshed. This feeling was confirmed some months later when it was learned that Giba, the head of the *nesa* clan and chief of Sogote, had laid a trap which Omar Gisa, unknowingly, was about to spring. He had been about to call down upon himself and his men a barrage of poisoned arrows from the ring of Giba's warriors who were concealed in the forest which surrounded the village.

Sabu History

In order to understand more fully the foregoing action, we must turn back the pages of Sabu history a bit. In Sena, during the days of preparation for this encounter, the most frequent answer to my question, "Why is the chief going to war?" was, "Giba and his people refuse to pay their taxes. Furthermore, they threatened that if Gisa and his son came to collect taxes, they would kill them!" It seemed strange to me that such a small group of people should rebel

---

Rev. Robert Blaschke has spent one term as a missionary with the Sudan Interior Mission in the Republic of Dahomey, West Africa. His formal study of anthropology includes the B.A. in anthropology from Wheaton College, and graduate study at the Kennedy School of Missions. He also has the B.D. from Gordon Divinity School.

against this French-empowered chief. In a sense, to refuse to pay taxes was a revolt against the French as well. I credited these people with more intelligence than to revolt against a modern-arms-supported power.

Further investigation, however, gave me new insight into why Giba had revolted. It was revealed that (1) the Sena chief had added 100 francs to the tax money already stipulated by the French official, (2) Gisa was demanding from Giba in addition his due tribute in food, etc., (3) Giba was desirous of splitting the already small canton in two, himself becoming a chief of canton along with Gisa, and (4) Gisa had tried to appropriate the land belonging to Giba. As I suspected, the fourth reason proved to be the most important.

A couple of months later a visit to Giba and his elders not only confirmed the truth of these four factors, but showed them to be quite secondary in light of the Sabu history that was to be unfolded to me.

Giba and his elders declared that their clan, called *nesa*, belongs to the royal family of the former Kingdom of Nikki. This clan had migrated from Nikki to Sogote, becoming the first inhabitants in this area. Many years later (no one knew how long) some strangers, possibly of the Kyensa tribe, came to salute Giba (the name for the *nesa* clan chieftaincy) and asked him for a grant of land. The property surrounding what is now Sena was given to them.

When troubles and difficulties arose at Sena, those involved were taken to Giba for a judgment. Even after a successful elephant hunt all the meat was brought directly to Giba for distribution. All important events, traditions, and ceremonies either originated or were performed at the seat of authority, the Sabu capital of Sogote.

Giba, realizing the inconvenience of the trek to Sogote for every little judgment, decided that he would inaugurate a chief in Sena. This chief would judge the minor cases. So, with much pomp, ceremony, and feasting, Giba named the first Sena chief. He was called Sena Gi of the *gaasu* clan. To impress me as to whose authority had priority, one of the elders inserted, "Until this day there have been seven Sena chiefs, but the number of Gibas there have been no one knows."

Arrival of the French

Life among the Sabu continued in this manner until the French conquered them. The army installed an outpost consisting of several huts for an officer and several noncommissioned officers. The ruins may still be seen just north of Sogote. All liaison between the French and the Sabu tribe was directed through this center until the time when the grandfather of the present Sogote chief died.

None of the eligible candidates for this vacant chieftaincy understood French at that time. Since the chief of Sena had attended French public school in his youth and was known to the French, they told him whom they had chosen and gave him the authority to name the chief so designated by the government. This was outrageous so far as the people and their customs were concerned.

Orders to be carried out in Sabu country henceforth were issued by Gisa, a descendant of strangers in this land and a member of a socially inferior clan. From this time on the French used Gisa as a liaison. No longer was Giba the recognized authority as far as the French were concerned. Gisa was not slow in recognizing the potential in this French-given power. He did not hesitate to exploit its possibilities. Though this action of the colonial power caused no immediate overt reaction, it had nevertheless sown seeds of discontent and rebellion in the hearts of Giba and the *nesa* clan.

After nearly twenty-five ignominious years of the "head" paying tribute to the "tail," the "man" serving the "woman," and the superior groveling on the ground before the impetuous inferior (as the *nesa* clan regarded their relationship to the *ḳaasu* clan), this ripened ulcer of resentment burst forth into open rebellion. It just had been too much. This to which they had been subjected was criminal.[1]

In retrospect, we wonder how the French could have blundered so badly. Yet this was the result of their regular colonial policy with regard to the status of chiefs.

French Colonial Policy and the Chief

The concept of *Liberté, Egalité, Fraternité,* which came out of the French Revolution, was applied not only to France but to her colonies as well. All the territories of the French Empire were considered one with the great "mother" soil, *la France*. The inhabitants in these far-off places were deemed full-fledged French citizens with all the inherent rights and privileges of the Frenchman born on French soil.

It was the desire of the French to develop an élite class, called *les évolués,* who would become the black Frenchmen through the acquisition of the French language and the assimilation of French culture. On the shoulders of *les évolués* would rest the privilege of carrying on and transmitting the great traditions of France to others in overseas territories.

In fact, the French conceived the eventual annihilation of the indigenous culture. Mair points out: "The tendency of the French administration to think in terms of grand general schemes applicable to a whole federation of colonies simultaneously militates equally against any recognition of local differences of culture."[2] In fact, any power or custom that could not lose its identity through assimilation into the French culture was either destroyed or irreparably weakened.

Implementation of French Policy

In order to establish protectorates organized and operated by direct administration, certain drastic steps were necessary. Thompson and Adloff noted that the first step was to dissolve the ethnic basis of political formations, and to set up a territorial type grouping. Deliberate or not, this had been done by both the French and English colonial powers as well as within the French territories themselves. For instance, the boundary line between Nigeria and Dahomey divides the Yoruba, the Fon, the Bariba, and the Busa. By the same token, these same tribes have been divided up within the French territorial system by the administrative organizational district called *le cercle*.

The second step was to remove the paramount chiefs. In spite of the fact that a chief may have exploited his own people and lived like a medieval feudal lord, the chief was the symbol, the depository, the trustee, and in some places the semideity with whom resided the sacred traditions of the tribe, with the promise of their perpetuation.[3] Regardless of the high honor inherent in the office of the paramount chief, Mair adds, "The idea of a native chief exercising any kind of independent initiative seems to be alien to the conception of most French colonial authorities."[4]

---

[1] The foregoing information was supplied by the present chief and the elders of Sogote. It was checked and confirmed, though sometimes reluctantly, by several informants, young and old men in Sena. The facts are true, but the names of people have been changed.

[2] L. P. Mair, *Native Policies in Africa,* London: Oxford University Press, 1937, p. 209.

The removal of a paramount chief did not mean the replacement of that office with a European administrative post. Since it was still necessary to have direct contact with the people, the French installed the "desirable" kind of chief. Mair enumerates the following qualifications for such a chief: "Literacy, ability in accounting, loyalty, assiduity in carrying out official orders."[5] These traits are strictly Western. Whether or not the puppet chief belonged to the indigenous royal family was immaterial. Quoting Mair again, we see that the French "... even set [a chief] in authority over alien people."[6] Whether he was capable of leadership within his own society was inconsequential.

For all practical purposes, then, traditionally speaking, the chiefs have lost all of their power, "... so that their function is reduced to that of a mouthpiece for orders emanating from outside, ..."[7] according to Mair. While it is perhaps true that they do not have their former power, nevertheless they do have a job to do. A list of these functions, as gleaned from Thompson and Adloff's volume, is as follows: (1) religious prestige, (2) traditional revenues, such as tribute, etc., (3) collecting taxes, (4) recruiting laborers and soldiers, and (5) conciliating minor chiefs.[8] In return for carrying out these responsibilities, the paramount chief is paid a small salary.

In the light of what happened in Sogote, one would be inclined to agree with Thompson and Adloff's evaluation of French policy when they say that by means of the "principle of the separation of powers, the French have unwittingly undermined what was traditionally an undivided religious, economic, and political authority."[9]

The African Custom of Land Tenure

Lest we denounce the French too vehemently for following such antitraditionalist policy, we should consider the fourth reason previously stated for Giba's revolt: "Gisa had tried to appropriate the land belonging to Giba." For here we see that Gisa in full knowledge of native customs, "riding the horse" of white man's power, chose to violate the traditions of his own people. The more one understands of the African custom of land tenure, the more audacious becomes this act of his.

Let us first of all recognize that, as E. W. Smith says, "... African society does not comprise the living only; the living and the dead compose a close interdependent community, and anything which disturbs the harmony between them is regarded as crime."[10] The African is repeatedly drawn back to this association.

---

[3] Virginia Thompson and Richard Adloff, *French West Africa*, Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1957, pp. 204-213.

[4] Mair, *op. cit.*, pp. 210-211.

[5] *Ibid.*, p. 209.

[6] *Ibid.*

[7] *Ibid.*

[8] Thompson and Adloff, *loc cit.*

[9] *Ibid.* p. 24.

Since he realizes that his ancestral spirits "are regarded as the guardians of tribal morality," he is very careful about "the land where their bodies lie buried and the forest which harbors their spirits," for "African religion is rooted in the soil and bound to the parcel of ground hallowed by the presence of the dead."[11]

It is here that the question of land ownership arises. T. O. Elias, quoting an African chief, says, "I conceive that land belongs to a vast family of which many are dead, few are living, and countless members yet unborn."[12] Under this system, then, not even the living can claim land ownership. Elias continues that it was just this desire to preserve land for the requirements of this owning group, past, present, and future community and family, that land has been held inalienable.[13] Obviously, then, no individual can hold land either. The individual, by reason of his being a member of either a community, a kinship group of families, or a family, has certain rights on that land, but never the right of ownership.

The chief is considered the trustee, the custodian, the representative of the tribe with respect to the land. Though he has the power to parcel out the land with the consent of all the elders of the village, he is not the owner, and he cannot alienate the land, for reasons already stated.

By reason of the fact that a chief holds sacred land in trusteeship, he becomes in this capacity a mediator responsible, both to the ancestor spirits and people alike, for the proper disposal of the land. One can understand then why, as Meek puts it, "the authority of chiefs, subchiefs, and heads of clans and families is bound up with the land."[14] An Akan proverb of the Gold Coast states it even more tersely: "All power lies in the land."[15]

Perhaps it was this power that Gisa was after when he strove to bring Giba's land, the *nesa* land, under his control. Traditionally, he knew that "... those who committed offenses against their kinsmen could be punished with moral, ritual, or ... legal sanctions";[16] he also knew that being French-sponsored, as he was, Giba would not be able to take any retaliatory action against him. However, Giba did display his contempt for Gisa by refusing to pay his taxes and threatening to kill anyone coming to collect them. This open defiance to Gisa's authority and prestige brought him and his warriors into the clearing surrounding the small village of Sogote. But here he found himself frustrated by the power which had given him the initiative from the start — the white man.

---

[10] E. W. Smith, *The Golden Stool,* New York: Doubleday, Doran and Company, Inc., 1928, p. 191.

[11] *Ibid.*, pp. 191, 202.

[12] T. O. Elias, *Nigerian Land Law and Custom*, second edition, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd., 1953, p. 173.

[13] *Ibid.*, p. 172.

[14] C. K. Meek, *Land Law and Custom in the Colonies*, second edition, London: Oxford University Press, 1949, p. 10.

[15] *Ibid.*

[16] P. Brown, "Patterns of Authority in West Africa," *Africa*, Vol. 21, No. 4 (October 1951), p. 267.

Adib Galdas (told to Davida Finney)

Village Reborn

This is the absorbing story of an Egyptian village which changed its way of life. In connection with a literacy campaign in the village came new hope, new ideas, and a new unity to carry these hopes and ideas into practice. The story is moving and simple, but its lessons are profound. Here was no mission- or government-engineered program of change forced upon a community, although a mission-sponsored literacy campaign was the spark which set the development off. Here was change coming from within, catalyzed by ideas from without. The most fundamental change was a spirit of love and harmony.

WHAT is happening today in our village of Deir abu Hinnis has changed all my old habits of thinking and living. This is true also of all the men, women, and children living here. I do not mean that anyone visiting us will see great changes in the appearance of the village or in the way people live. Certainly there are some evidences of change, but Deir abu Hinnis still looks like a poor village. The great change is in the spirit of the people, and I find this change in myself, too. Before literacy came to us, I had always had a regular time to prepare for the Sunday morning service, the afternoon Sunday school, and for the evening services held on the six weekday nights. I visited the four hundred members of my church and, since we have no doctor in the village, I cared for the sick as well as I was able. Then there were duties assigned to me by our Middle East Presbytery. I even had time to read in periods of leisure.

This settled pattern of life suddenly changed. I am now deeply involved in projects which are bringing about great changes in our village. Every day and at all hours I hear a knocking at the door and a voice saying, "I want to speak to Reverend Adib. It is urgent." It is the spirit of urgency that has crept into my life and the life of the village which has changed our thinking and habits. Now I prepare my sermons before breakfast and as I walk through the streets of Deir abu Hinnis and of the large towns across the river, where I must go in order to carry out the new projects we have undertaken. This spirit of urgency is something new in my experience, and it seems an extraordinary thing to me. I want to tell you about it,

---

Rev. Adib Galdas is a minister of the Coptic Evangelical Church of Egypt. Educated at Assiut College and the Cairo Theological Seminary, he has served a village church for twenty years. Dr. Davida Finney, born in Egypt, has lived fifty-five years of her life in that land, both as a child and as a United Presbyterian missionary. In 1953 she became leader of literacy work there. *Village Reborn* is reprinted from a booklet by that name published by the Committee on World Literacy and Christian Literature, 156 5th Ave., New York 10, N. Y. Copies of the booklet, as well as a filmstrip by the same title, are available from Lit-Lit.

and perhaps by telling you I shall understand better how events have come about and what directions all activities should take. It is the story of a whole village on the move, so that every villager finds himself thinking and planning in a way he did not dream of four years ago. The villagers, like me, are caught up in a movement they did not plan for and which keeps carrying us all forward step by step.

The Village of Deir abu Hinnis

Before I tell you about this movement, I must tell you a little about Deir abu Hinnis. It lies on the east bank of the Nile at the foot of the desert hills which here creep close to the river bank. It is an old "city of refuge" and its fifty-two hundred inhabitants are all Christian in faith. The reason it is called a "city of refuge" is because Christians in the third and fourth centuries A.D. took refuge here from the fierce persecutions of the Roman conquerors of Egypt. Today there are two churches in Deir abu Hinnis, the ancient and honored Coptic Church and the Coptic Evangelical Church (formerly a part of the United Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A.), which was established here in 1870. My brother in Christ, the Coptic priest, is called Abuna Masaël. He, too, is caught up in this irresistible movement in the village, so that his church and mine work together in all that is taking place.

This movement I am telling about began in the spring of 1956. It grew out of a literacy campaign begun in October 1955 by the Joint Literacy and Literature Committee of the Evangelical Church and the United Presbyterian Mission. When the Literacy Committee members came in answer to our invitation to help us carry out a literacy campaign, they explained to us that they would stay if we would promise to fulfill certain conditions. They said that they wanted very much to work with us, but that success would come only if we all obeyed certain basic agreements.

Prerequisites to a Campaign

I shall mention these conditions because we villagers saw later that we would never have had a successful campaign if we had not obeyed them. These conditions were: first, that every member in the two churches must agree to share in the work of the campaign; second, that the village would house the Committee members and the twelve employed staff members; third, that the two churches would produce literate men of standing and force of character to assume the responsibility for the campaign as soon as possible; and fourth, that all village feuds and quarrels must be healed before the campaign was begun. The first three conditions were easily met, but it took a full week to secure full and honest acceptance of the fourth condition. There had always been tension and quarrels between the two churches and between families. When we realized that God could not be present with us in this new work if we quarreled, we finally made peace with one another.

The Literacy Committee began work on the 11th of October. I shall not describe here all that happened in the literacy campaign during the next eight months. It is enough to say that by June of the next year eighteen hundred men, women, and children had learned to read. Six hundred of them had read the whole course of thirteen books, and many were reading other simple books. Hundreds of men, women, and young boys and girls were enrolled in Bible-reading classes. It is fair to say that now, two years later, few of our villagers able to learn still remain to be taught. You can readily see how deeply indebted we feel to the Literacy Committee.

A New Movement

One month after the Literacy Committee began work in October of 1955 the first sign appeared of the new movement in our village which changed our habits of thinking and living. None of us recognized this sign of a new movement. About three hundred people were learning to read and write. Among this number was Sheikh Sabit, the leading elder in our church. One day Sheikh Sabit said that he wanted to buy a Jersey bull from the Agricultural Department of Assiut College. He had heard that if he had a Jersey bull, later on he would have much more milk out of which to make cheese and butter for cooking. These would sell for a good price. A month later he bought the bull for one hundred eighty dollars.

The night the bull arrived at the river bank, standing upright in a little sailboat, hundreds of villagers were down there to meet him. They had borrowed pressure lamps from here and there so that all could see him. When the bull stepped ashore everybody laughed and shouted and clapped their hands, and some fired guns to express joy. The bull was very much alarmed, but we finally quieted him and also the crowd. Then we moved as in a royal procession along the dike leading to the village and Sheikh Sabit's house. This precious creature was finally called *Shacklock* in honor of Dr. Floyd Shacklock of the Committee on World Literacy and Christian Literature who had visited us. As I write now, this bull has many offspring scattered over a considerable area of the country around us. I might add that when the mayor of our neighboring village, Deir el Barsha, heard about *Shacklock* he also bought a Jersey bull and called him *Rex*, in honor of Dr. Frederick Rex.

I have said that when Sheikh Sabit bought a Jersey bull the first sign appeared of a new movement in our village, and that none of us recognized this sign. You will understand what I mean as I tell you what happened next. In December the villagers began to buy Rhode Island Red chicks from the College Agricultural Department. We had read in one of the simple books brought us by the Literacy Committee that eggs produced by these chickens sold for a much higher price than the eggs of our chickens. We bought several thousands of these chicks. One of our deacons later bought a hatchery to encourage this project and also to make some money for himself. It took him some time to make any profit because he could not believe what he read in one of our new books. It seemed fussy to him to keep an even temperature in the hatchery and he lost hundreds of eggs before he was persuaded to believe what the book said.

In January I bought a Swiss goat from Assiut College for thirty dollars. I hoped the babies of the village would have better health if we had a good breed of goat. I, too, had to learn by experience. My goat eventually died because I did not realize that during the winter he must have something warm to lie on during the night. I let him sleep on a tiled floor and he caught a severe cold from which he could not recover. Since then others have bought goats and succeeded in caring for them better than I did.

The Idea of a Cooperative

One day in March, the subject of Cooperative Societies came up in conversation with two of the Literacy Committee members. They did not urge us to form a Cooperative Society under the Government Cooperative Department, but they planted the seed of the idea in our minds. The more I thought about the matter the more I became convinced that we should form a Society. It seemed to me that since we would reap great benefits from joining we must somehow raise the necessary funds. After weeks and even months of consultation with Abuna Masaël and village leaders, we decided to pay fifteen hundred dollars to buy three thousand shares from the Government Cooperative Department at Minia. This large town is the capital of Middle Egypt and about fifty miles north of Deir abu Hinnis. To raise such a large sum would not be easy, but if we paid this much we would be entitled to borrow enough money to undertake many village betterment projects. For every dollar we paid to the Cooperative Department we could borrow sixty dollars, and we were allowed twenty years in which to repay our borrowings. When these facts became clear to our villagers, it did not take long to raise the amount.

Now, suddenly, the movement which first began when Sheikh Sabit bought *Shacklock* took on life and energy. The whole village was astir. Everybody was determined to buy a share in this new Society called "a cooperative." Each share cost one dollar and a half. The rich bought many shares and the poor met in family conclave to plan how to raise this sum between them. As many as three or four members of a family joined together to buy a share. Slowly there emerged a remarkable fact, although I was slow to see it. That they would benefit greatly in material things was very important to everybody, but there was a much more important result from their joining the Society. Until this time there had been a sharp division between the rich and the poor. Only the rich had been able to buy farm machinery and sufficient supplies to make them richer and more comfortable. The poor had been regarded somewhat as serfs. Now suddenly all this was changed. Each member in the Cooperative Society had a vote, and each man was entitled to express his opinion freely. His standing was just as good as that of a rich man. Nothing I can say will do justice to what happened in our village at this moment in its long history. Everybody talked about what he wanted to do and to have, and about improving the standard of life in the village. Believe me that at this moment of time our village was reborn. It was a miracle of God.

By this time nearly two thousand people had learned to read. Since we had been able to learn, we now felt that we could do whatever we wanted to do. As time passed and we were all mixed together in working for new projects we learned another great truth. This truth was that success depended entirely on a spirit of unity among us. It was often very difficult indeed to achieve unity in a village which had been torn by active feuds only four years before. We have had to relearn this truth many times during the last three years. Finally we began to notice that when we failed in what we wanted to do, it was because we were again quarreling. Now we thank God that we are beginning to understand this truth. We are learning that when we forgive one another and forget an injury we become conscious of God's Holy Spirit in our hearts and we receive His blessing on what we do.

The First Results of Unity

When we learned that if we wanted to succeed in any undertaking we must have the spirit of unity in our village, events began to move quickly. We found ourselves facing a new future. The old spirit of lethargy and hopelessness had disappeared. When a new project is proposed, men say, "Why not? It seems a good idea." There still remained a good deal of confusion in our minds as to what we should undertake first. This drove me to think carefully. As I thought about the matter I decided that our first need was a revived church. There had been differences of opinion between members and between families in our church. I therefore set my heart on a united and dedicated church Session. With God's blessing we have achieved this goal. This was the first result of seeking peace and unity in our village.

When I discussed the matter with our Session and asked the members what they thought we should do, they all agreed that our first duty was to set our own house in order. With a thankful heart, I asked them to plan where we should start. The result of their planning was that we set to work at once to repair and color-wash the church building and tower, to tile the floor, and to buy a church bell. Few people in Deir abu Hinnis possess watches, and our new bell brought our congregation to services on time.

Since glass is too expensive, we made wooden shutters for all the windows of the church in order to shut out the winds which are too hot in summer and too cold in winter. We repaired the room formerly used by our elementary girls' school and equipped another room as a small clinic.

Then we did an unheard-of thing. We built a church community room. In it we placed a newly bought church library, a ping-pong table, and provided seats by building a low mud platform around the walls of the room. This platform was long enough to seat more than a hundred people. In my eagerness to reduce the cost of this room, I split in two the iron beams I had brought from across the river to support the roof. On these beams we laid palm branches and fastened them to the beams. I had secured these palm branches from our well-to-do church members by announcing from the pulpit that we needed a camel-load from all of those who owned palm trees. Then I said that if any of these brothers forgot to send a load, I would myself go with a camel and remove ten branches from each tree. Needless to say, we secured all we needed!

When we began to tie the branches to the beams I made the mistake of forgetting how heavy these palm branches are. One day five men were plastering the walls with mud when suddenly many beams in the middle of the ceiling broke and threw great loads of palm branches all over the room. I was standing near a wall, and was terrified that some of the five men would be killed. When the dust subsided we found all five alive, for which we gave grateful thanks to God.

After this, I did not try to economize so severely!

For years the Coptic Church had supported a grade school for 150 boys. Now we reopened our little school for girls. Forty are enrolled and one of our village girls teaches them. Her salary is six dollars a month. Then we persuaded the family of a sixteen-year-old girl called Habasheya to allow her to go to the Swiss Mission Hospital at Aswan for a year's training in nursing. Habasheya had learned to read the year before in the literacy campaign. She did not read well enough to study books on nursing, but the hospital nurses helped her all they could. We shall always be deeply indebted to the hospital for taking so much trouble in giving Habasheya some knowledge of how to care for minor ailments and injuries. She is now back in Deir abu Hinnis and will soon begin this work. Her salary will be eighteen dollars a month.

Finances and Tithe

The most important obligation the Session took on was to be responsible to raise the church budget. We have four hundred church members, and only thirty were contributing to the budget.

Together we studied the church roll and decided that although two hundred of our members were too poor to contribute anything, the remaining two hundred members were able to pay. We agreed to adopt the principle of tithing. The Session then visited the two hundred members able to pay and helped each one to figure out his tithe. It is a profound relief to me to be spared the responsibility for the finances of the church. My salary is sixty dollars a month. The Session keeps out my tithe and pays me fifty-four dollars. Since the churches cannot afford to pay so large a sum, I receive my salary partly in cash and partly in kind. This may be some wheat or dates or other necessities of life. From the cash I receive, I pay for our family living expenses and for the education of our six children. Perhaps this will give you an idea of how we manage in our village. It always astonishes me that our villagers can raise the sums we pay to the work of the Cooperative Society. That we do raise these sums indicates how greatly we value the opportunity to better our living conditions.

What was more important than anything else was the new spirit in the two churches. New members began to join. Abuna Masaël and I had agreed that neither church would encroach on the membership of the other when accepting new members, so that our new members came from Protestant families. The Coptic Church as well as ours undertook new projects. It is no wonder that Abuna Masaël and I faced the new future in our village with growing courage and assurance.

We Form Our Cooperative Society

As soon as Abuna Masaël and I had sold three thousand shares and had fifteen hundred dollars in hand we decided that we must appoint a village Cooperative Society Committee. My brother in Christ and I, together with our church leaders, met one day to choose this Committee. Everybody recognized that this meeting was very important because we knew that neither church must have more voting power than the other. When we met we agreed that the Committee should be made up of ten men. In the general discussion that followed, names were mentioned. Suddenly I noticed that five names had been proposed and accepted.

These five men were all Evangelicals and had been proposed by the Copts. At once the Evangelicals proposed five Coptic men. I had been appointed treasurer of the Society; now we made Abuna Masaël chairman of the important subcommittee of three who would check on the work of the other seven. Thus did God's Holy Spirit help us in our first meeting together and bind us together in unity.

After the election of that Cooperative Society Committee, events followed quickly. The invisible movement in our village was increasing in volume just as the river Nile does in July when the snows have melted in Abyssinia and sweep down the valley to fill the river bed to its brim. Everybody wanted to know what was going to happen. All had opinions as to what we should first undertake. Why delay so long in arranging details when there was so much to do? Now it was midsummer and the heat was very great. I very much wanted my summer holiday, but I knew that the treasurer of our Society must study the rules of the Government Cooperative Department and know how to manage every detail of the projects it wanted to undertake. This meant that I must cross the river innumerable times in small sailboats and then travel forty miles north to Minia by busses in order to consult with Cooperative officials there. I knew that we must win and hold the confidence of these men. Finally, after months of study and consultation, I understood the regulations and requirements of cooperatives. We then began to ask and to receive.

Some Cooperative Projects

We have undertaken six projects during the last two years and are in process of undertaking several more. I want to tell you first about the six we have begun.

The first request we made from the Minia headquarters was for good seeds. Our crops had not been as good as they should have been because we had not been able to buy new seeds. Last year our crops were much better and we sold them at a better price. We grow wheat and other grain, cotton, alfalfa, some vegetables, and dates.

Recently I went to Cairo and bought two thousand sacks of cottonseed cakes. These cakes are used as fuel. The day after they arrived by mailboat we carried them to an open place in the village and sold them to the crowd of eager people waiting to buy them. We had already appointed two men to manage the sale. One of these men was one of our deacons called Abraham and the other was the son of another deacon called Thomas. For pay each of these two men received three cents for every sack sold. The two thousand sacks were sold in the course of the day. If a buyer could not afford to buy a whole sack, he bought one in behalf of others sharing it with him. Those too poor to pay the price of a sack at once were allowed two months to complete the payment. Since everything was done in plain view of all buyers, we had no arguments or trouble about what each man got and the price he paid. We sell sacks of seed and other commodities in the same way.

We have always understood that it is important to improve the fertility of the soil, but now we have a much better understanding of what fertilizers to buy and exactly how to use them. Now we easily buy as large an amount as we need. The thousands of sacks of artificial fertilizers we buy are sold in the same way that we sell cottonseed cakes and other commodities.

The Boat Landing Strip

The bank of the Nile river belongs to the Government under the Ministry of the Interior. Each village rents a strip of river bank for the anchorage of its own boats and for the landing of boats from other villages. The fee charged by the Ministry of the Interior for renting this strip of land is moderate. The traffic across the river is always heavy. Farmers must transport their produce in order to sell in the big towns on the western side of the river. We have no post office, so anyone wanting to send a money order or to register a letter must cross the river. Boys who have finished at the Coptic Church School must cross the river in order to attend the high school at Mellawi. If a man wants to cash a check, he must cross the river to a bank. Farm implements and machinery, pumps for irrigation, house furnishings, cloth for making clothes, newspapers, and almost everything needed in everyday living, can be bought only across the river. As a result there is a steady stream of people crossing the river each day.

Until last year two well-to-do men in our village rented this landing strip of river bank from the Government. They were in a position then to charge any fee they liked. The legal rate for our landing strip is seven hundred dollars a year. These men charged our village three thousand dollars and our three neighboring villages which used our landing strip nine hundred and twenty-three dollars. They charged each person embarking in a boat one and a half to three cents. The charge for the transport of a water buffalo or a cow was fifteen cents and for a camel thirty cents. For produce they charged fifteen cents for each *ardeb* of grain (about five and a half bushels) and twelve cents for an *ardeb* of cotton. The owner of the boat transporting these things collected this money and then paid it to the two men renting the landing strip. If he objected to the high rates, these two men would not allow his boat to land.

The result was that these two men collected nearly four thousand dollars each year. Well-to-do people did not mind paying these charges, but the poor found it a heavy burden. Each time they paid these men they had that much less with which to feed their families. I felt strongly that these two men must be persuaded to give up the profit they made each year and agree to let our village Cooperative rent the landing strip.

It took me months to persuade them. I cannot begin to tell you all the arguments and even threats I used. In the end they gave in because they began to be afraid of the strong village sentiment against them. In this story of the landing strip you see how quickly our village was learning to be democratic. Each man was growing into a self-respecting and responsible individual.

Last month our Cooperative bought a motor launch for fifteen hundred dollars. We are collecting this sum of money from our village and the neighboring villages which use our landing strip. I think no other village in Egypt has bought a motor launch, and we are very pleased with ourselves. We charge a very low fee for transporting people, animals, and merchandise, but even so we shall soon repay ourselves for the price of the launch. Then we shall deposit our savings in our Cooperative.

Loans from the Cooperative Department

In order to carry out these projects we have needed large sums of money. We borrow what we need from the Cooperative Headquarters at Cairo. As treasurer of our Cooperative I have had to travel to Cairo many times. To keep an accurate account of what we spend takes a great deal of time. In order to preserve confidence and trust I insist that my account book is available to any man who wants to review it. For my endless trips to Cairo and Minia and the large towns across the river where we buy what we need I receive nothing except my travel by boat and train. My relatives in Cairo relieve me of living expenses while I am there.

Another great financial help the Cooperative Department gives us is to handle the sale of what we produce. It is able to do so at a better price than we simple villagers can get. For instance, it sells a bale of cotton for six dollars more than the price we would be able to command. It has promised to open a loaning bank in Deir abu Hinnis in the near future. This will be a great help to us, and also it will make my work as treasurer much easier.

New Projects We Are Beginning

In what I have just written I told you about the six projects we have already undertaken and of the financial help we receive from the Cooperative Headquarters at Cairo. I now want to tell you about six other projects we are already beginning to undertake, and also the two projects we hope to begin later on.

For months we have talked endlessly about buying a pump big enough to irrigate hundreds of acres lying near our village. The acres we cultivate now are not enough to improve our standard of living. Over the years several well-to-do individuals have bought nineteen pumps which supply us water for the land we cultivate. These pumps are small because no one has had enough money to buy a big one. Yet to the north, east, and south of our village lie thousands of acres of uncultivated land, most of it desert. These acres only need water to become fertile land. The price of one acre of desert land is fifteen dollars. Even the very poor can somehow manage to find enough money to buy at least a part of a acre.

From the day we sold three thousand shares in the Cooperative I began to read all I could find about big pumps. This spring we chose our big pump and came to an agreement over its purchase with the Cooperative officials. It is a German pump costing twelve thousand dollars. It is capable of irrigating thirteen hundred and fifty acres. We have already chosen the land we want to buy. Eight hundred and fifty acres are fallow ground and five hundred acres are desert land lying at the foot of the hills to the east of us. It will take ten years to change these five hundred acres into rich soil. We shall be able, however, to grow some hardy plants even during the first year of cultivation.

In addition to buying the pump, we are borrowing eighteen thousand dollars for its installation and upkeep. We plan to hire an experienced mechanic to run the pump because we know that none of us understand machinery. Then there are all the irrigation ditches to dig and control. We must build a suitable shed for the pump and hire someone to guard it night and day. We know that this project is a very ambitious one, but we also know that we intend to make it work.

This pump will solve another difficulty for us. The Department of the Interior long ago fixed the rate a man must pay to have irrigation water run on his fields. This rate is six dollars for each acre. Since a man grows two crops on an acre, he pays twelve dollars a year for each acre. Our pumps are privately owned and we have been charged eighteen dollars for each acre. This means that our farmers have had to pay thirty-six dollars a year to irrigate one acre instead of twelve dollars. As soon as we install the big pump under our Cooperative, everybody will pay only the legal rate. This will be a financial relief for all.

You may be wondering how we have been able to persuade the men who owned the nineteen pumps to give them up and use their little gas engines for some other purpose. Again it has taken public opinion to win the victory. My life has often been threatened, but God has helped us to preserve the peace.

Home Industries

Some time ago we asked the Cooperative Headquarters to send us two experts to train our villagers in weaving and in the preserving of fruit. These experts have been promised and will come to us during this year. The Cooperative Headquarters have told us that it will buy all the small prayer rugs we can make, since there are never enough of these in the market. We intend to make these before we make large rugs for the public market. Last year a prominent lawyer and his wife came to visit us. They own a carpet-making factory in a large town south of us. This man offered to send one of his expert weavers to help us when we begin this project. Such kindly interest and generous help encourage us greatly.

In regard to the preserving of fruit there is much we can do. It is always hard for us to sell fresh fruit quickly enough to avoid losing a part of it by spoiling. If we preserve what cannot quickly be sold, we will be able to make some profit.

It is becoming increasingly difficult to care for the supplies we handle. When Cooperative officials come to visit us we need a room large enough to accommodate them and our own members. Some time ago we secured the agreement of the Cooperative Headquarters to loan us sufficient money to put up a building of two or three rooms for these purposes. Sheikh Sabit has given us a piece of land near the river bank. When this building goes up, all the business involved in carrying out our plans will be much more easily handled. We expect to begin to build in the near future.

The Cooperative officials have already agreed to loan us enough money to build a small post office room which will contain a telephone booth. At present we send one of our villagers across the river every day to get our mail in a village called Roda. This villager is a very simple man and we are always nervous for fear he will lose some of our letters and newspapers. It will be a great relief when we have mail delivered daily by some Government-appointed employee. To have a public telephone will be a great help to all. Until now the mayor is the only person in Deir abu Hinnis who has a telephone. We dislike to bother him at all hours when an emergency arises, especially at night. This is not a big project, but it is a necessary one.

Another small project is to build a room as a gas depot. We use gasoline for many things. It is fuel for our small pressure cooking stoves and for our lamps. All our machinery is run by gas. Since we are getting a large pump, we shall need much more than ever before. This project, too, is a necessary one.

Medical Services

For years we have realized that the most important project we should undertake is to secure medical help for our sick. Whenever an epidemic gets started our villagers die by the hundreds. Three years ago, while the Literacy Committee was still here, I tried for months to open a clinic for three days a week. The Literacy Committee allowed us to send one of their women employees across the river to Roda, where she received some elementary training in a clinic. She learned how to treat simple ailments and to give injections. We tried to interest three different doctors on the west bank in what we were trying to do. We wanted them to advise us and to check on what this girl was doing. These men were sympathetic, but each one decided against coming because of the great loss of time in crossing and recrossing the river. In the end we settled on sending the girl Habasheya to the hospital at Aswan for nurse's training.

A few years ago the Government built a hospital in a village about three miles south of us, and recently a doctor has been appointed there. He has agreed to give us what help he can in his free time. In this way he will check on the work Habasheya does. To keep a supply of emergency medicines on hand and to pay Habasheya's salary will require careful planning by the village, but we hope that we shall be able to give simple treatments and meet sudden emergencies. This plan will not meet our need adequately, but it will give some help.

Projects We Hope to Undertake

These are the six projects we have already undertaken. There are two more which we shall undertake as soon as we are able.

Our church club room has proved such a success that we want very much to build a community club room large enough to accommodate all who wish to come. Since we expect it to be popular, we are anxious to put someone in charge to act as the director of the club. For two years we have talked about sending someone to the Y.M.C.A. Youth Center at Cairo for a short period of training. We could never afford to pay for a well-qualified man. We would like to arrange for women and girls to use this building once or twice a week, but as yet there is no woman able to take on the responsibility of leadership.

After we have installed our big pump and have our new projects well started we shall take up the matter of a village community center room.

Our village has suffered for more than ten years from a plague of termites. They have attacked almost all the houses in the village. In the homes of the rich you see how they are destroying wooden ceilings and door and window frames. In the homes of the poor they eat away the palm trunks which are used as roof beams. In the past many people have been killed by the sudden collapse of roof beams at night. Some houses are in such a state of collapse that the owners have had to move elsewhere and surrender their homes to the termites.

We have consulted officials and friends about what to do in order to destroy this enemy, but nothing we have tried has proved successful. The termites came to us from the village south of us and advanced steadily through our village from south to north. At present most of them are in the northen section of the village, so we feel assured that in a few years they will move on to the village lying north of us. We shall then be free of this dreadful plague.

Since so many of our houses are not safe, we want to pull them down and build new ones. The village is very crowded, and the streets are often so narrow that only two people can walk abreast. We are now urging people to plan to build their new homes on the edges of the village. This will allow us to have wider village streets. As people buy the desert land lying around Deir abu Hinnis, families will have ground upon which to build.

This project is only in the talking stage. It is of vital importance to us, however, and I think I can say that it will eventually be undertaken.

The Dynamic of the Movement

When I began to tell you about what has been happening in our village during the last three years I said that a new movement had begun among us when men, women, and children discovered that they were able to learn to read. No one recognized this movement until we formed a Cooperative Society two years ago, and then it became very noticeable. The poor as well as the rich joined the Cooperative, and everyone began to express an opinion and to vote. When that happened the whole village was caught up in planning for a new future.

I said, too, that by writing this story I would perhaps understand better what direction our activities should take. The understanding has come while I have been writing, and I have begun to see that dangers as well as benefits lie ahead of us as we plan our new future. We must understand these dangers and benefits clearly so that we shall be prepared to meet them.

The danger I see is the development of greed in our hearts. I have noticed that when a man discovers that he is capable of improving his economic condition, his success often leads him into selfishness. This has happened in our village. Some men are more intelligent than others, but if our intelligent men become greedy we shall be no better in the end than we were before we learned how to help ourselves. In the Sermon on the Mount Jesus taught that no one can serve God and mammon. If a man loves money more than God, he will gradually begin to hate God. This is the danger I fear most.

Benefits of Literacy

On the other hand, we are already beginning to reap great benefits because of the new movement in our village.

For one thing, we are beginning to earn a little more money. It is not much, but this little gives us the promise of a better life.

Usually we lose many of our children because of malnutrition, and many adults die earlier than they should for the same reason. When we earn a little more we shall be able to feed our families better. Then we hope to educate more of our children because we shall be able to give them books and a clean *galabeya* (robe) to wear to school. When there is serious sickness in our family, we shall be able to pay a doctor his fee and the expenses of his trip across the river. These and many other benefits we shall have when we earn a little more money.

A second benefit is that we are now learning better methods of doing our work. Some of these methods we are learning from the officials and experts who come to us through the Cooperative Society. There are many other things we need to learn to do better. We want a trained agriculturist to visit us from time to time and stay long enough to teach us how to farm better.

Our women need someone to show them how to care for their babies and how to improve their housekeeping. We need someone to teach us how to develop youth work and to use our community room for the benefit of all. We want someone to help us build up our very small library of books and organize reading clubs for men and women and our eager children. Habasheya, in our clinic, needs training if this willing but simple girl of eighteen is to help us to better health.

I can mention many more activities we need to learn how to undertake, but those I have mentioned are needed at once. If we do not succeed in the activities we have already undertaken, the people will become discouraged. Then the new movement in our village will begin to weaken.

Motivation of Bible Reading

The third benefit we have received from learning how to read is the most important one and the one which we hope will save us from failure. This benefit is that the villagers have the open Bible in their hands, and many of them read a portion of it every day.

When the Literacy Committee came to Deir abu Hinnis, its members sometimes asked people why they were so eager to learn to read. The answer always was, "Because I want to read the Bible." The Committee members thought that perhaps many said this in order to please them. Later on, when hundreds had learned to read, the Committee members were astonished to see men, women, and children poring over a Bible in their hands as they sat in the doorway of their homes or on the sand. Everywhere they went they saw the same sight.

For centuries our Christians had not been able to read their Holy Book. Now it lay open in their hands and they could read it for themselves. When they went to church, carrying this precious book in their hands or in their pockets, they could open it quickly at the right place when the preacher announced where he would read. They were now truly like other men everywhere, just as able to share in the church service and in the worship of God. Even while the Literacy Committee was still here, we organized Bible-reading classes for all those who had finished the prescribed courses of thirteen books.

This eagerness to read and study the Bible was the outward expression of the spiritual nature of the movement which had become apparent in our village. Men and women have always wanted more than food and raiment, although they may not recognize this fact. Our villagers are a simple people, not yet divorced from their inherited belief in God. I want with all my heart to help them learn about God's purposes and love as revealed in the Bible so that they will not be swept into worldliness as their material condition improves.

It seems to me that the whole world is threatened with wars and annihilation because people no longer believe that Jesus was practical in His teachings. I want each one of you who reads what I have written to join with me in asking God to enlighten us in our study of the Bible so that the movement which is going on in our village will retain its spiritual nature.

Help from the Church

These are the three most important benefits we have received from the many which literacy gave us. Now I want to tell you about our hope that we shall receive help from others besides the officials of the Government Cooperative Department. These others are men and women from our own church in Egypt. The church has already appointed a rural church team made up of both church and mission experts. This team will visit us regularly and train us in better ways of living.

The first project they have promised to help us with is to carry on a Bible study campaign. Both churches in Deir abu Hinnis will share in it. The first two books we shall study are *What the Old Testament is About* and *What the New Testament is About*. Each requires three months to complete. At the end of that time a written test is given and each one who succeeds in passing it receives a certificate to hang on the wall of his home. After these two books the villagers will begin regular book studies in the Bible. The Committee has already published a book on the Sermon on the Mount and another on the Gospel of Mark. A study of the Gospel of Luke will soon be available. Other books are now being prepared by a Writers' Fellowship for simple writing.

In addition to Bible study campaigns the rural church team will help us in our work in agriculture, the breeding of farm animals, health, home life, baby care, sport, and in our other activities. We are still not sure when this church team will be able to visit us, but the hope that they will come gives us courage to do the best we can meanwhile.

You can see that all these many activities which we are carrying on might be a threat to the success of what we are trying to do instead of a promise of better living. Sometimes I am so hard driven to attend to the many business details involved in our planning that I find myself completely absorbed in them. At such times I forget that this new movement amongst us is of a spiritual nature.

There is another reason why we see that this is a spiritual movement. Whenever men join together in order to teach and be taught, all barriers of race and creed are broken down. This happened with us at Deir abu Hinnis. I have visited other villages where literacy has been carried on, and this fact has been true with them. Catholics, Coptics, and men of any creed come to learn. Each teaches another, and all are drawn together in this common task. Catholics and Coptics are asking for campaigns to be held in their churches and under their general supervision. One very successful campaign has been completed under the Coptic priests in a village across the river from us, and another is just beginning in a church not far away. As I watch this development I am reminded of the words of our Lord Jesus, "By this shall men know that ye are my disciples if ye have love one to another."

Robert B. Fox

The Function of Religion in Society

The religious beliefs and practices of a society and the units of the social organization (e.g. the family, the kin group) are functionally interrelated. Among folk peoples and societies such as those in the Philippines which we call non-Christians, the contribution of religion to the persistence of the social order is readily apparent. Hence, dramatic changes in the belief system of a people under the impact of missionary effort, or as the result of the activities of administrators concerned with directed cultural and economic change, often have far-reaching consequences. Not infrequently, rapid changes in the beliefs and values which are embodied in the religious and social matrix of the traditional society lead to a breakdown of the social order and of social controls, and vastly complicate for all the process of change.

As a result of the linkage of social and religious activities in a society, the missionary and the administrator have great responsibilities, not only to their own programs and values, but to the well-being and stability of the society with which they are dealing. Moreover, each person in the society under impact may be viewed as a responsibility, for the social and psychological stability of each person is dependent to a great extent upon the religious and social values which are familiar to him and which define the traditional ways of doing, believing, and thinking.

Marriage, for example, may be parentally controlled, in which children are pledged when they are very young, even in the womb. This may be analyzed as a social mechanism for reinforcing the ties between two kinship groups (or two families) in which the primary concern is with the future stability of the marriage. In short, the parents wish to provide for their children a social environment for marriage which will have the best chance for success. It is a "marriage" of many persons, not only of the boy and girl. Concern is with a harmonious, working relationship between the families. Organized religion may or may not play a part in these marriage arrangements

---

Dr. Robert B. Fox is Research Associate of the Council on Economic and Cultural Affairs, Inc., of the University of the Philippines, and Acting Chief of the Division of Anthropology of the National Museum of the Philippines, doing anthropological field work among Negrito, Dumagat, Ilongo, Tagbanuwa, Badjaw, Tagalog, and other peoples. He is the author of several articles on problems in the anthropology of the Islands. The present article is being reprinted, by permission, from the mimeographed report of the Baguio Religious Acculturation Conference (1958). It carries the subtitle: "Problems of Acculturation Among the Non-Christian People of the Philippines."

(in the Philippines, among non-Christians, it usually does not), but whether marriage is arranged by parents or sanctioned by religious beliefs, the marriage being controlled by religious functionaries, both systems have as an objective the stability of the new alliance.

In societies in which marriages are arranged by parents, as is still common throughout the Philippines, there will also be found a pattern of marked generational respect in which decision-making responsibilities are the privilege of parents and older individuals. Among non-Christian groups, for example, divorce may be forced by one or the other set of parents if the boy or girl does not satisfy his obligations and responsibilities to them. Thus each social act is linked with numerous others: marriage, decision making, patterns of respect, and so forth. A change in a social practice such as from a pattern of parentally arranged marriages to marriages which involve "romantic love" and religious sanctions may undermine the respect and authority structure.

In short, the missionary and the administrator must continually face the problem of introducing and directing change without creating *social* disphoria — without contributing to the development of "marginal" persons who have abandoned their traditional beliefs but who have not been integrated to the new life.

This brief paper does not wish to suggest that social and cultural change is not desirable — it is; or that the missionary and administrator have no legitimate role — they have. All societies are dynamic. Societies such as the Bontoc of Mt. Province and the Tagbanuwa of Palawan have undergone change in the past and they will continue to change. Rather, this paper will suggest caution in dealing with non-Christian peoples having a markedly different belief system and set of social values. It will argue that a thorough knowledge of a people and their culture, such as that which the anthropologist attempts to achieve, will be of great value to the missionary and administrator; that anthropological data will provide means for the more effective implementation of new beliefs and values with a minimal dislocation to the people involved. It would be desirable, in addition, if missionary and administrator were carefully trained to aid a people through the period of adjustment to a changing society; having a full understanding of the institutions of the society — how the society works — and being sensitive to the social-psychological problems of the individual.

The Tagbanuwa

To illustrate the depth of the responsibility of the missionary and administrator when attempting in a democracy to introduce new beliefs and values, as well as the possible far-reaching consequences of their activities, I have chosen to describe briefly the complex interrelationships of native religious beliefs and practices with social, economic, and political behavior as found among the Tagbanuwa of Palawan Island. As there is marked similarity in the basic institutional characteristics of all Philippine non-Christian peoples, the discussion of the Tagbanuwa will have broader relevance for the missionary and administrator.

The Tagbanuwa now inhabit the eastern and western coastal areas of central Palawan Island, largely within the Municipality of Aborlan. They are a sophisticated and peaceful people and have developed a complex custom law, a full ceremonial life in which rituals are linked with the expanding social units of the society, and a belief and value system which gives them reason-for-being and which defines the good life. They live in sizable, permanent villages, though they are shifting cultivators of upland rice.

Tagbanuwa social organization is bilateral; a child reckons his kinship relationship with both the maternal and paternal line. The elementary family is the basic social, economic, and household unit. Residence is matrilocal. The society is loosely stratified into "high bloods" and "low bloods" and there was formerly a "class" of servant-debtors. The "high bloods" are the bilateral descendants of leaders who hold a variety of titles, such as *maradya,* and who, it appears, were originally appointed to their offices by the Muslims in attempts by the latter to formalize and structure a trading relationship.

The hereditary leaders act as arbitrators and "lawyers" within a complex system of custom law which involves established fines and fees. The obligation of paying the fixed monetary levies, as in marriage or divorce, is established by the hereditary leaders in councils, and the obligations must be fulfilled if the person involved is to maintain his social and legal status. As will be seen, their decisions are strengthened by religious sanctions and by the activities of the *babalyan* "mediums," who are the primary religious functionaries.

Generally speaking, the Tagbanuwa are a conservative and ethnocentric people, though they have been in contact with other peoples for many years. Up until the turn of the century, the dominant external influences were from the Muslim Filipinos.

Religion and Society

The most striking feature of Tagbanuwa society today is the pervasive influences of native religious beliefs and practices. According to informants, there has been a recent intensification of ritual activities to reinforce traditional sentiments in face of increased culture contacts. The Tagbanuwa's economic, political, and juridical behavior are interwoven with the comparable institutions of the surrounding Christian people, but the rituals and associated drink fests which express traditional life ways are shared only by the Tagbanuwa — by the dead as well as the living.

Marked changes have occurred in the everyday material culture of the Tagbanuwa, for their dress, tools, and housing are similar to those of their Christian neighbors. Ritual paraphernalia, in contrast, consists almost entirely of trait complexes reflecting the "old life" — costumes, implements, concepts of beauty, and so forth. Social forms such as law and government have been modified by culture contact, but their rites are still permeated with traditional definitions of cause and effect and with ethical judgments echoing the past. The Tagbanuwa's ritual life is a reproduction of the past and projection of the past into the future. In sum, the persistence of Tagbanuwa society today as an entity, as well as its present stability, is dependent to a great extent upon traditional ritual practices and religious beliefs. "Being Tagbanuwa" is symbolized and expressed in their shared rites.

Analytically, the many ritual practices of the Tagbanuwa are closely linked with expanding units of their social structure — the elementary family, the bilaterally extended kin group, the village, and the "nation-state." Religion and society are interwoven on all levels and the characteristic social units of the society are maintained, in part, by religious practices and beliefs.

Cult of the Dead

The nave of Tagbanuwa religion is the "cult of the dead" which is correlated with the basic social unit of the society, the elementary family. This is not a system of ancestor worship, for the depth of this cult is consistent with the shallow depth of their bilateral kinship system.

The spirit relatives invoked in the ceremonies which link the family with the cult of the dead are invariably fathers, mothers, brothers, and sisters — they who were members of the elementary family. The primary importance of the elementary family in Tagbanuwa society is clearly symbolized in the developments of the cult of the dead. These spirit relatives who inhabit the underworld are believed to be the principal cause of common illnesses. But the Tagbanuwa are not afraid of or hostile towards the spirit relatives — one does not behave this way towards close kinsmen, living or dead. Rather, relatives become angry with one another, and if the spirit relatives believe that they have been forgotten, or if promises to them have been broken, they may become angry and cause illness.

Thus the interaction of the dead with the living provides the Tagbanuwa with a causal explanation for common illnesses, and each family is obligated annually to provide a ritual drink fest for its spirit relatives, in particular for the dead who have caused illness. The spirit relatives invoked may be either maternal or paternal kin or both and, in some instances, the dead of affines (e.g. a husband may invoke his wife's brother or wife's father). By ritually involving the dead of affines, the ceremonies have the latent function of strengthening the often tenuous bonds of individuals related through marriage. In addition, the cult of the dead reaffirms the fundamental social values of the kinship structure — right, duty, and obligation. These are restated over and again in the family rituals and are extended, as noted, to the dead as well as the living. Literally, the spirits of the recently dead are "living" members of the community, for they participate daily in the ritual and social life of the Tagbanuwa.

The dead are also an economic support. The success of the rice crop, of hunting and fishing, and of the ritual relationships with powerful deities is attributed to their help and intervention. As the basic economic unit of the society is the elementary family and as economic activities prominently figure the spirit relatives, the agricultural rites are centered on and are primarily the responsibility of the elementary family.

The Tagbanuwas, as noted, are shifting cultivators of upland rice in a climatic environment which is often unpredictable in detail. The uncertainty of success in agricultural activities is thus clearly reflected in their rituals. For nearly seven months of every year the Tagbanuwa is involved in the production of rice — making the clearing, guarding and weeding the field, and harvesting the crop.

Drink Fests

The harvest ushers in a period of intense social and ritual activities with increased interaction between persons, a true social-ceremonial season in which prodigious quantities of rice wine are drunk during rituals and the subsequent social drink fest. These ritual drink fests have become the focal point of contemporary Tagbanuwa life.

The underworld, the abode of the countless spirit relatives of the Tagbanuwa, is a mirror of earth except that all phenomena are inverted and there is *no* rice wine! As the dead have not lost their taste for this "perfect" intoxicant, the wine becomes the best means to lure the dead to participate in rituals in order to convince them not to cause sickness but to help their relatives achieve a full and satisfactory life. During the rituals and the subsequent social drink fests, the huge jars of wine (large Ming stoneware jars are used and the wine is drunk through straws) are shared with the spirit relatives. Many social activities exist only or primarily in connection with the drink fests, such as blood pacts, renewing friendships with persons from other villages, courting, and so forth.

The drink fests are never secular affairs, for the wine is a ritual gift, the product of the divine food, rice. The rice wine is looked upon, moreover, as having a strength-giving quality which contributes to the well-being of the drinker. Far from disturbing the euphoria of the group (I am reminded of the display of aggression which often accompanies drinking in Western societies), the use of rice wine among the Tagbanuwa binds not only the living with the living, but links the living with the dead.

The second group of rituals of importance in terms of the expanding units of the social system are correlated with the bilaterally extended family and are organized and performed by mediums who act as intermediaries between their followers (usually relatives, but including unrelated persons whom they may be treating) and the many major and minor deities. In the family rituals, as noted, only the spirits of the dead are called, but in the second group of ceremonies many deities appear whose influences extend beyond the elementary family: first *Mangindusa,* the highest ranking deity; then a succession of other deities who have many varying functions, such as protecting the followers of the medium against sickness. The common man does not deal directly with these types of deities, hence the important role of the religious specialists.

The elaborate *pagdiwata* rituals (the second group) usually last from dusk to dawn and are followed by the usual social drink fest. Each deity that appears acts through the medium, the latter performing, in part, in a disassociated or trance state. The deities sing, dance, drink rice wine, partake of the food offerings, and chew betel. Often individuals who have helped the mediums in the preparation of the elaborate paraphernalia used in the rituals will be asked by the deity to share in drinking the rice wine — a type of ritual reward.

The mediums are usually highly trained individuals who are sensitive to the social and psychological problems of their followers. Most, if not all, are "high bloods"; hence, there is an equivalence between them and the hereditary leaders, one supporting the other's role and position in the society.

The two villagewide rituals, the *lambay*, both performed by religious specialists who are also hereditary leaders, are concerned with incest — a public delict which challenges the very foundation of the social order — and with the unpredictable weather which influences the production of rice. The manners in which specific deities called during the *lambay* ceremonies are believed to influence the behavior of man provide causal explanations for abnormal social acts, for the idiosyncratic behavior of individuals, for insanity and suicide, and for heinous crimes such as incest and rape. These social incidents involve the whole society, as represented in village life, and not merely an elementary family or a kindred. Thus the *lambay* ritual represents a further expansion of the ritual system dealing with interfamiliar problems and relationships.

The *lambay* is held twice annually. The first *lambay* in January is an appeal, in part, for sunny days and dry winds which will desiccate the forests and facilitate the preparation of rice clearings. The second one, in May, is for moderate rains so necessary for the growth of rice. Finally, as noted, the *lambay* is concerned with incest and other public delicts, and is an appeal to the highest ranking deity to forgive the people for their behavior and not to punish an entire community, such as by withholding the rains, and an appeal to specific deities to refrain from harmful acts. Madness, for example, is believed to be caused by certain deities who must be placated.

Two pan-Tagbanuwa rituals have as their purpose the placation of the dreaded spirits of epidemic sickness. These ceremonies are for *all* Tagbanuwa regardless of their kinship or residence, for the spirits of epidemic sickness do not select souls from a particular family or village, but sweep across the nation-state in their fearsome quest.

I have briefly described the manner in which Tagbanuwa ritual life is interwoven with the expanding units of the social structure, providing a highly complex system of functionally interdependent behavior. A few additional remarks are necessary.

The Tagbanuwa's world view, their definition of the universe, is encompassed generally by the doctrine of the cult of the dead. A logical explanation for the ongoing processes is provided, for example, by the conceptualization of the underworld as an inverse mirror of Tagbanuwaland. Hence rivers in the underworld flow from the ocean to the mountains. Trees grow with their roots as the crown. When it is dark on earth, it is light in the underworld. In addition, the countless "little things" (bugs, insects, etc.) which inhabit the proximate environment are believed to be transmigrated souls. The legions of the dead and the multitudes of insects and smaller animals are thus cogently equated. Dramatic myths are told to satisfy the curiosity of the growing child about the processes of nature. The effulgence of the sunset is said to be the blood of the epidemic dead painted by the spirits of epidemic sickness on the huge tree trunks which support the sky cover.

The relationships of the Tagbanuwa with the proximate environment are organized in terms of their own social life. They make no distinctions, as does Western thought, between a social world and a natural environment. They see in the environment countless deities and potentially malign spirits, and interact with them daily. When a huge tree crashes on a person making a clearing, it is seen as the act of an angry spirit. In treating the environment as social, they are provided with an explanation of natural phenomena. In sum, one social and moral order encompasses the living, the dead, the deities and spirits, and the total environment.

Conclusion

The introduction of new ideas and beliefs which challenge the traditional social and moral order of non-Christian peoples, particularly if they are in conflict with the basic features of the social organization and the adjustment of a society to a particular environment and set of economic activities, may disturb the social and psychological well-being of the society and its members. It is not sufficient to introduce a belief which replaces only a segment of the traditional life ways, for, as I have shown, religion and society are linked on all levels. Rather, a new world view must be taught which provides the members of a society with a functionally stable way of life and prepares them to make choices of alternatives consonant with their new status. There are societies in the Philippines, such as the Agta or Dumagat groups in Polillo Island, Quezon Province, which have completely disintegrated under culture contact, and the members of these societies face severe problems of social and psychological adjustment.

I am particularly concerned in this brief paper with expressing the hope that the fullest utilization will be made by missionaries and administrators of the data which are available in anthropological studies of Philippine non-Christian peoples, and that they cast a more than casual glance at the methods and theories of modern social science.

The responsibility of innovating social and cultural change is an awesome task requiring a thorough knowledge of the complexities of social life and psychological process. With a deep feeling of humility for the complicated and often perplexing nature of man's social life, be he a Tagbanuwa, Negrito, or Ifugao, the missionary and administrator can provide the leadership necessary to effectively change man's attitudes, values, potentialities, and opportunities. But it is a difficult task, demanding tolerance and patience as well as knowledge and faith.

Dorothy L. Van Ess

Arab Customs

In cultures with highly formalized social behavior there may be an elaborate system of "etiquette." Mrs. Van Ess here describes some of the elements of Arab etiquette which are difficult or particularly likely to be overlooked by Western missionaries. Perhaps most societies in the world do not make as much of the importance of polite behavior as the Arabs. Most peoples are more forgiving of foreigners and strangers. In most folk and primitive societies etiquette is not as formalized. But among all peoples there are nice ways of social behavior and crude ones, polite acts and impolite ones. Mrs. Van Ess reminds us to find out what they are and behave accordingly.

ON entering the Arab world one is confronted by a wholly new set of customs and behavior patterns. Some have a religious origin, others are motivated by centuries of tribal and family habits and the social pressure of long usage. They have an importance in everyday living which is so immense that it takes a long time for people from free-and-easy America to grasp the idea, and to realize the necessity of our conforming, in a measure, to this pattern when we are with the Arabs. We have come to live among them to present our gospel and the Christian way of life, and it is of prime importance that we make ourselves socially acceptable.

Handling the Bible

When I first came to Arabia as a new young missionary, one of the first admonitions I received from my elders was about the way we should handle the Bible. Moslems observe great reverance in their treatment of the Koran. their holy book. It is never carried unwrapped, never handled carelessly, and never put in a place which would seem to dishonor it. Sometimes a beautiful silk square is used to wrap it, sometimes a large white kerchief. Houses used to be built with a special little room above the level of the living-rooms. There the Koran reader might sit while the rest of the house was being swept. Mosques and Koran schools have bookrests for the holy book so that it may never be below the waistline of the reader.

We should be equally careful in our treatment of every copy of the Arabic Bible, since failure to do so implies disrespect to a Moslem. He infers that we do not esteem our Scriptures as highly as he does his. A Bible should never be put on the floor nor left about carelessly; and torn or mutilated copies should be removed and destroyed privately. When talking in Arabic we refer to the New Testament as "The Honored Gospel." It is courteous to refer to the Koran

---

Dorothy (Mrs. John) Van Ess was a missionary of the Reformed Church in America from 1909-1955. She served with her husband in Arab countries, chiefly Iraq. She is the author of several articles on the Arabs. The present one is reprinted from *Arabia Calling,* by permission.

if we have occasion to mention it, as "The Honored Koran" or "Your Honored Book."

Respect for God

When we refer to Jesus, in formal addresses or in conversation with Arab Christians, we say, "Our Lord Jesus Christ." However, in informal conversation with Moslems, especially women, we often use the Koranic "The Prophet Isa" (Jesus) or "Jesus the Living." We always add, "To Him be the Glory," and after any mention of the Prophet Mohammed we add, "Upon him be peace."

The Arabs are deeply religious, always conscious of the omnipotence of God, and his name is always on their lips. Much of what sounds like swearing to us is not really blasphemy, but comes from their constant awareness of the presence and power of God, which makes it natural to use his name freely and frequently.

Evil Eye and Fate

The fatalism and superstition which are so deeply intrenched in the minds and hearts of "the masses," in spite of their implicit belief in God's omnipotence, are factors which we find most difficult to combat. The blue beads sewn on a baby's cap or jacket and attached to the religious charms and talismans which are hung on his cradle, are to avert the "evil eye." We have learned never to praise a baby or a little child, no matter how charming, lest it attract the evil eye, but must content ourselves with "May God keep him!"

We should not pay a call of condolence and of congratulation on the same day, never wear perfume when visiting a new baby and not go to call on a new baby at all if we are in mourning. One becomes used to names like "Dogs," "Garbage," "Angry," or "She-doesn't-belong-to-us," and many others equally graphic, as tribal or village Arabs often name their children something to indicate that they are not worth the attention of a malign fate.

The sand-diviner is a common sight outside the door of the bank in Basrah, ready to tell your fortune. "Taking the omens" by counting beads on a Moslem rosary is a very common way of finding out how to come to a decision. *Mullahs* are always consulted before a marriage date is selected, in order to have an auspicious day.

Social Etiquette

Social intercourse follows a formal and precise pattern. How you are greeted, where to sit, how you are seen off — all has a tremendous importance and significance. A friend of mine in a mission school in a neighboring Moslem country told me that she acquired the lasting enmity of a certain minister of education because he was not properly received when he went to pay her a business call at her school. She was not at home, nor were any of her teachers, and an inexperienced servant was ignorant of the procedure which should have been followed. My friend's school suffered for years because an important official had been offended by lack of what he considered necessary courtesies.

Lady Burton's *Inner Life of Syria,* published in 1875, contains amusing accounts of her receptions in Damascus while her famous husband was there as British Consul. She says: "There are many grades and ranks to be considered, and much etiquette to be observed; the more you observe them the greater respect they have for you. The dragoman in attendance upon me will whisper to me until I know it: 'One step,' 'two steps,' 'half across the room,' 'the door.' I thus know exactly the visitor's rank and by what term to address him."

We have no dragomans to help us, and society is not quite as rigid as it was eighty years ago, but the principle is still in force. In general visiting, the host or hostess assigns the place to sit, but even then the visitor, unless he is undoubtedly of higher social rank, does well to sit a little lower than indicated.

When paying a call, the visitor gives the preliminary salutation at the door, "Peace upon you," to which the host replies, "And upon you be peace." After this, when all are seated, "Good morning" or "Good evening" and other greetings are exchanged. At departure the guest says, "I ask permission to go," to which the answer may be, by a play on words, "You are costly" or merely "You have honored us." After this there is an exchange of farewells ending, "In the safekeeping of God."

A man should never ask after the health of the host's family, if they are Moslems (this implies interest in the women, which is unseemly), but a woman visitor may ask an Arab man, "How is the family?"

A sheikh is addressed in the plural.

The visitor may refer to the host's small child as "the protected one" or "the served one."

If it is necessary to give the information that someone has died, the bald statement "He is dead" should not be made. One uses a phrase like "May you live" or "Your head is safe," or some other expression which instantly conveys the fact. A person who is dead is always referred to, immediately after the mention of his name, as "Upon whom God has had mercy."

For many years the most common word used for a man's wife was *aqila* 'the tethered one' — the word used for a shackled camel — but recently *qarina* is coming into use. This means 'being joined together' and at least implies a little reciprocity!

Women who have children are invariably known as "Mother of So-and-so," either her first child or her first son, and her personal name is never used.

When you have occasion to refer to anything regarded as unclean by a Moslem, such as shoe or dog or Jew, or to mention anything not elegant, as donkey or garbage, the subject is prefaced by a word or phrase conveying the idea of apology. Moslem men would regard the common word for woman in such a category!

The right hand should always be used in passing anything to another person; and under no circumstances should the sole of the foot point to an Arab. Occasionally when we are paying informal visits, the hostess will grant us permission to stretch out our feet. But if I had my life to live over again, I would learn while young and supple to sit crosslegged, or with my feet tucked under me, as Arabs can do by the hour.

Food and Drink

The usages connected with food and drink have an almost ritual significance far exceeding a Westerner's idea of mere good manners and politeness. This is especially true of the intricate ceremony of serving coffee, which has a whole set of traditions. Coffee should not be received with the left hand, nor should more than three Arab cups be taken. The cup is slightly shaken upon being returned, if no more is desired, and an empty cup should never be put on the floor. Coffee served in Turkish style, in a small cup with a saucer, is offered only once.

A formal call is always concluded by the serving of coffee, and it would be a serious breach of good manners to leave before it is passed. I was once kept waiting for it over two hours in an important household, where the lady whom I went to see was not at home. Her partner wife, a very dominant and sharp-tongued dowager, received me and assured me that my friend would soon return. I was given sherbet, and various members of the family came in and out of the room and passed the time of day with me, but in vain did I say that I would come again tomorrow. By the simple expedient of not serving me coffee, the lady kept me there till long after dark. I did not know them well enough to run the risk of offending her by disregarding the conventions.

Coffee has also a deep significance in relation to an Arab's honor. Long ago I heard the story of a young tribesman whose sister had erred and brought disgrace on the family name. The young man avoided the sheikhs' tents in his district, knowing that he would not be offered coffee while there was a stain on the family honor. He pursued the evildoers and eventually killed both his sister and the man who had led her astray. He then rode his horse to the *mejliss*, or reception tent, of his sheikh, entered and took his place among the guests, and was served coffee. He had wiped out the stain and vindicated the good name of his family and could once more be accepted in honorable society.

Bread is deeply respected by the Arabs and has a symbolic significance as *rizk Allah*, 'the provision of God.' I have seen a small ragged boy take a piece which had accidentally fallen on the ground, kiss it reverently, and murmur, "*Rizk Allah!*"

All food is eaten with the right hand only — and it is quite an art to make a manageable ball of rice, dip it in gravy, and get it to the mouth without disaster, all with one hand.

It is courteous, on rising after a meal, for the guest to say, "May your table always be spread." In my particular corner of the Arab world, we likewise have a customary phrase, "With pleasure," when we hand back our coffee cup or tea glass.

There is an intricate pattern of customs governing mourning, marriage, births, and pilgrimages. The two great holidays of the Moslem year, the Fast-Breaking, at the end of the fasting month of Ramadhan, and the Feast of the Sacrifice, coinciding with the climax of the pilgrimage to Mecca, have their ceremonial usages.

Knowledge of these backgrounds greatly enriches our understanding of the Arab way of life, and familiarity with the customs which mean so much to them helps to establish a bond of friendship and sympathy between us and the people we have come out here to serve.

K. A. Busia

Africa in Transition – III
Technical Civilization

Industrialization in Africa must be defined broadly to include all technological developments in general and not simply the growth of large-scale manufacturing. These developments include industrial agriculture, mining, transportation, systems of communication, urbanization, etc. In the West when we deal with industrialization, we are concerned with processes, techniques, and machines resulting from a technical revolution, initiated from within the framework of European society itself. The problem of social adaptation to technology introduced into society from outside is the problem of Africa. In this article Dr. Busia discusses the social changes which such a situation demands.

One of the four principal forms of industrialization in Africa is mining. I begin with mining only for purposes of analysis and not to establish a chronological sequence. Mining in Africa leads to many problems, including the settling or resettling of labor, bringing out people from their villages to a mining camp, the erection of strange villages, wholly directed to the production or extraction of minerals.

A mining camp is a strange and interesting sight. There many people have come together from different villages. Usually it is a community constituted by a larger proportion of men over women, a larger proportion of young men over older men, few children, and a few old men. The average age in a mining camp is under forty.

The second form in which industrialization has come to Africa is along the development of plantations, involving the employment of a large proportion of workers, most of them seasonal. In Liberia, for example, the Firestone rubber plantation employs a large number of Africans from the neighboring villages, they work for short periods to earn money for particular purposes and then return to their villages until more funds are needed. In time a group develops which will establish permanent residence. They learn technical skill and become foremen and headmen for the more transient workers.

Plantation work means that a person leaves his tribe and village to go and sell his labor for cash. Here are introduced both a radically new concept of time and the idea of selling time as if it were merchandise. It also means the introduction (or extension) of a money economy and the growth of a wage system and a trading system. In the African situation the idea of wage-earning and trading are sometimes quite incompatible with tribal life.

Breakdown of Old Pattern of Life

By way of illustration, in the mining village people have to work by the clock. They get up in the morning, they have no time to do any cooking; sometimes a man has come away alone, so there is nobody to cook for him. This is a new situation; someone is required to provide cooked food, and so the restaurant is initiated in Africa. This means new habits. In Africa it would be unthinkable to see an adult person eating in the street. It just is not done. There you are in a community where eating is a family affair expressing friendship and relationship. In an industrial society you have to have your meals when you can. Now when you bring a man from his village to a mining camp and force him to buy cooked food, you are already breaking tribal customs and tribal ways.

Then there emerges the woman who is going to earn a living by selling the food. Quite often the laborer does not have the money until the end of the month. Now suppose the woman comes from a village also and is related to the laborer. A new and complex situation has been created. The idea that he should have food from a person or a kinsman and must pay in cash for it is unthinkable. Therefore it is very likely that at the end of the month the man does not pay and the poor woman is in difficulty. The tribal relations are incompatible with money economy. Therefore, in order to be successful the woman has to travel outside her own tribe to sell her wares or sell her food, where she can treat the people as mere customers. Thus a wage-earning system has brought about the necessity for changes and radical adaptations in human relations.

A second factor is that the things which are grown in plantations and in which European capital is invested are the raw materials which are needed to feed European industry or to feed the European. It means that in the economic development of African territories, priority of concentration has been given to the things that are needed by industries in Europe. Therefore an uneven development is inevitable. In a large agricultural community, efforts must be concentrated on growing cotton or cocoa, to such an extent that the people have to buy food from industrialized Europe, even though they are living in a predominantly agricultural land.

Bread, previously unknown in Africa, has now become very popular because it is easy to obtain and is filling. You would be amazed to see to what extent bread has become a staple diet in Africa. The wheat for the bread comes to us from Canada. We have to pay in dollars in order to get it. You can see what is already happening. Ghana produces, on about three hundred small farms, more than a third of the world's supply of cocoa. But in the meantime, while concentrating on such products to be used in industrialized countries, she is buying basic foodstuffs which she could just as well grow in her own area. This is not a process of conscious specialization, but it is the sort of thing which inevitably happens in uneven development where mining and other industries determine the types of agriculture. In the countries nearing political emancipation, similar conditions often exist. Political advance has outrun economic advance, and political emancipation may be succeeded by economic domination or economic imperialism.

Cash Crops, Transportation, and Factories

The third kind of development is the large-scale industrial crop, grown not by European capital but by large numbers of African small farmers hiring African labor. This is the way in which cocoa is grown in Ghana, rice and cotton in the French Sudan, and peanuts in Senegal and Gambia. Here another new kind of situation is presented. Production is still for exportation to an industrial country, but the farming is done on the basis of Africans hiring other African labor. This, too, is seasonal labor and sometimes it means that one tribe offers its labor to another tribe, which creates tribal relations of the same order as employer-employee relations and the power situations as existing between Europeans and Africans. There emerges a similar power relationship among Africans. Attitudes in this inter-African business relationship are similar to attitudes in a European-African relationship. It is just as easy for an African to exploit an African as it is for a European to exploit an African.

Another way in which industrialization presents itself is in the development of transportation and factory. This, too, leads to the provision of diverse ways of earning a living. Those who acquire new skills are able to earn more, which results in the emergence of a class structure. Also, in order to make factories and railways possible, people had to be brought together. I am emphasizing this to indicate the way that towns have had to grow in Africa where industry was introduced on the basis of the technology prevailing in the 19th and early 20th centuries. To give people a railway, they must have a railway center where the trains will be serviced. This means that opportunities are created for all kinds of differentiations, from the signwriter to the footplateman to the highly trained engineer. They are earning differently and therefore new relations are being set up all the time. The growth of urban population is thus one of the things that has followed the development of industrialization in Africa.

In these towns in their early stages one finds the preponderance of youth over aged, of men over women, the development of slum conditions, the emergence of a laboring class and, as I shall indicate presently, the formation of new types of associations. Because in some ways the organization presents problems that are similar to problems in Europe, the processes of town life have received more study in Africa than the effect of all this industrialization on rural areas. And yet this latter effect is no less important. The depopulation of the villages is a factor we must take into account. In 1942 a team from Oxford (an anthropologist, an economist, and a geographer) made a study of the Ashanti and found that in rural areas there was a deficiency of men and women between the ages of 25 and 35. They had migrated to the urban centers of the mining towns and to newer cocoa farms. This results in concentrating development in the town, rather than the village where the standard of living is bound to drop. Yet these country folk are the ones who are working to feed the town; a situation which creates a section of upper stratum in the society at the expense of the farmer.

Urbanization

An illustration was given by Schapera's study of Bechuanaland where in the third quarter of 1943 he pointed out that about 33,000 Africans, including women, were away from their tribal areas. Some of them had gone to other parts of the territory; some of them at that time were in the army; and the rest were in Southern Rhodesia. There are many reasons for this. Exhaustion of land is one. Then the towns provide a better market for the skill of the enterprising artisan. For the educated person who cannot sell his skill in the village the city is a necessity. In Bechuanaland, however, most of the tribes have sent laborers to the Union of South Africa for nearly 100 years. It is estimated that more than 80 percent of the men now alive have had some experience abroad in the Union and it has become an accepted pattern that at least once in his lifetime a man should visit the Union. He gains in social prestige by a trip, so that there is not only the desire for adventure but also an economic necessity.

This is all expressed quite adequately in a popular song originated in Ghana. It is what we call a "high-life" song, or our own version of jazz. Our song describes a girl who is wishing her fondest desires:

> "What shall I do to get a man of that type?
> One who is a 'been to,' (i.e. one who has been abroad, particularly to Europe)
> 'Car full' and 'frige full'? (i.e. possessing a car and a refrigerator)
> What shall I do to obtain a man like that?"

She wants a man who has been educated in Europe and who owns a car and a refrigerator. The elements of attraction are clear in this little popular song. It is a different version of the story of the pull of industrialization and the new values that it sets up.

The opportunities to earn cash wages offered by industry as well as desire for social improvement and prestige draw people to the town. The effect on the tribal life is that, in many cases, able-bodied men are away and women have to take responsibility for the family, and consequently there is a break in family life and sometimes even disruption and disorganization in village political systems.

Then there is the growth of urban life itself. That means that people are away from their tribes. In the town you get a large number of different people from different tribes having to make their living side by side with one another. In Europe I think a man tends to regard himself as belonging to the place where he lives and works. In Africa a man always lives in the context of kinship and he always belongs to his original tribal village. Even if he lives in the town for thirty years, he is still a member of his tribal village. You can see the effect of this on the development of any sense of civic responsibility within a municipal area. People belonging to a tribe and living in the town will often club together and form a tribal association. They may raise money to improve their village, but not the town in which they live. At the same time, because they are outside their tribe, they have to form new associations in order that some of their immediate necessities may be met.

In studying town life we find two different types of urban community. In West Africa most communities consist of an intermixture of tribes and a sprinkling of people from Europe and from further afield. But the problem of relationships here is different from the problem in East Africa or in South Africa where a permanent settlement of Europeans is found, where problems of multiracial relations and marked class distinctions reach a climax. In these situations kinship ties are usually giving way to other kinds of associations. Some of these associations will usually be tribal — that is to say, a membership in a tribe is still a primary factor in social organization. Although tribes may be geographically distributed through a town, they do form associations of their own. So even the urbanized tribe is not altogether disintegrating.

The problem in African communities where friendship groups and mutual aid groups (some of them along the lines of tribal membership) are multiplied is interesting. In Brazzaville, for example, friendship groups and mutual aid groups, and to some extent even occupational associations are well within the tribe. In Douala people form age-set groups; those born between 1915 and 1918 will form an association of their own. Sometimes it is mixed; sometimes men are alone, sometimes women alone. I was interested in investigating the aims of one of these groups. Three were stated: (1) to provide mutual aid in cases of illness or death; (2) to facilitate social contact between members of the same generation; (3) to assist members in quarrels with older generations.

Here is a striking example of the fact that this new situation does increase the tensions, which in any case are normal, between one generation and another.

New Associations

There have also been established numerous associations which cut across tribal lines. In Leopoldville, for example, Comhaire Sylvain talks about associations which are formed on the basis of the possession of a common Christian name. All Johns will form an association. It shows how strong is the yearning for association to provide the kind of mutual aid which people had lost by moving out of their tribe. Sometimes associations are, as in Nairobi, on the basis of a place of residence.

Now the effect of all this on the tribal life must be carefully studied, because it is precisely here where arise some of the problems facing churchmen today. This problem must be seen in reference to the old pattern of African kinship. In Africa an essential part of the indigenous social structure is the system of kinship and marriage. Africans regard marriage as an arrangement which enables persons to live together and cooperate with one another in a orderly social life, and this social life includes economic, social, political, and religious activities. Therefore, one way of looking at the kinship system of Africa is to regard it as a complex set of norms and usages and patterns of behaviors between kindreds, that is, as a means of providing all the activities which are necessary for a full life.

There are different domestic groupings in Africa varying from the monogamous household consisting of father, wife, and their unmarried children, to the polygamous family of two or more wives, where a mother and her children constitute a separate unit, or the extended parental family where a man lives in the same household with his married sons and their wives, or the domestic group consisting of a man and his wife and their daughters and their husbands. But whatever the size of a domestic group, you will find that the range of relationships which are recognized for social purposes extends beyond the domestic group. It includes other kinsfolk who are descended either in the maternal line from a common ancestress in those tribes where the emphasis is on maternal descent, or descended from a common ancestor where the emphasis is on paternal descent. Marriage is an integral part of this kinship society insofar as it is not only a socially recognized bond between persons, which in Africa is the less important aspect, but also a socially recognized bond between two kinship groups.

In a town, this situation naturally changes. In the tribal setting provision is made for the groups to exercise influence on the assumption that the older generation know better than the younger. They exercise an influence to keep the partners together and also to help them in the early period when they have to adjust not only to each other but also to their different kinship groups. Here it is said deliberately and advisedly that mates are chosen by the older people on the assumption that they know better. The reason is this: in many societies the consideration for a choice of a mate in marriage is not on the basis of romantic love or romantic attraction of the partners. That is a comparatively recent development in Europe, beginning about the 13th century and recently glamorized in Hollywood. Most societies train their people to recognize that any well-bred boy and girl, if properly brought up, can make a home.

For them love and affection are to develop within marriage and thereby the attraction of one for the other. I am not saying that love does not exist. It does, and grows, and may be shown in extremities by an elderly person.

Transition from Tribalism to Citizenship

The groups are very conscious of their rights and privileges. The point is that in marriage you have a group which is interested in you and which is keeping watch over you. Now when you move into the city they are not there, and therefore different arrangements need to be made in which the emphasis shifts from the group to the persons. There you get a new kind of life. There in the town situation you get the influence of Christian teaching and also of British or French law, operating on marriage and inheritance. There is also a shift in family responsibility and relationships. According to the old custom, a member of a family may claim food and shelter and even clothing from another member. In a tribal situation, where all are working on a farm as one big family, this may not be a heavy burden on anyone. In a new wage-earning system, where one man does well and becomes a clerk or an accountant or a railway man or a motor-lorry driver, and goes to live in the town, this can be a heavy burden on him because other relations going to the town to look for work expect not only to stay with him but also to be fed by him.

In that situation you painfully feel the ties of kinship; and either because the people in the town are too poor or because of their European influenced attitudes, you begin to see what is referred to as the breakdown of kinship. On the basis of entirely different standards of value, you will be told that the old system is not good, for it presents differentiation in standards of living and consequently it brings down the man who is trying to raise his standards; or it prevents the accumulation of capital and therefore it is altogether wrong. This is a judgment based on a certain standard of values.

Once I saw a man who was digging a grave by the roadside, where a relative who had died hundreds of miles away was to be brought back at an especially high cost to be buried. I asked him why he was doing that. His reply was, "Blood is more than money." That, too, is a judgment of values; so that, in spite of the effect of all this industrialization, family ties and family ideals are still holding their own, and they constitute a part of the contemporary situation. You can see that there are situations involving conflict, a conflict of values and ideas, and though attention may be concentrated on politics, the real ground of suspicion and distrust often lies elsewhere.

The Challenge before Us

I would like to end by pointing out just two things. First, the threat of industrialization is to break the self-sufficiency of African tribes, and this is its most important result. But we must mark that the self-sufficiency of African tribes is built on the basis of a low standard of living, and that to raise the standards of living requires interdependence. This is in fact what industrialization does. It breaks self-sufficiency and makes for interdependence between the town and communities outside, between Africa and Europe. If men have to eat bread, and if wheat is coming in from outside, they have already been made a part of a larger economic system. For areas that are interdependent and multi-racial, this is important.

To relate this to the problem of South Africa, the issue of economic interdependence puts *apartheid* in a new light. One of the best studies I know of this situation was done by Dr. de Kewit, who has pointed out that the growing shortage of labor in the Union of South Africa has, within it, the difficulty to enforce *apartheid,* and secondly that in South Africa the physical or geographical *apartheid* is impossible. There are more millions of people living outside the native reserves than there are within them. Geographical *apartheid* might possibly prove feasible, if the resources in the reserves were able to maintain the native population, but they are not. The fact is that the native populations are even more dependent upon industrial activities of the large towns than the whites themselves. In this situation we see how unrealistic *apartheid* is.

Dr. de Kewit said something which, I think, is rather alarming. "In the decision to impose severe measures of segregation upon natives and colored folk and Indians alike, there is a quality which arrests one's attention. It is more than consistency. It is the quality almost of integrity, of total belief in the right of white civilization to maintain itself at the expense of everybody else, of complete faith that *apartheid* is a goal to be courageously sought, whatever the danger and sacrifice. It has the power of moral compulsion over the minds of men with breadth of racial pride, national zeal, religious fervor, and historic anger. *Apartheid* may commit South Africa to great international embarrassment, to frustration, even to disaster, yet its zealots are refreshingly and naïvely unMachiavellian." This I think gives the problem an alarming dimension because here we are not dealing with facts or with logic or with personality, but with emotion and with faith. That constitutes one challenge.

My second point is this. When you look at industrialization from the point of view of human beings, you will find that African communities are able quickly to master the skills and techniques which are necessary for running machines. The point where the problem lies is that there is a certain moral quality and a certain system of moral values necessary for running a society in which machines are operated. In my view, it is at that point that Africans are faced with their biggest difficulty. It requires, for example, a wider sympathy, a larger responsibility, to live in a town which is operating on the basis of partial knowledge of a person, instead of the total knowledge which is possible only in a village community. It requires a certain integrity and a certain standard of honesty to operate a system of democracy, far more than the ability to operate a ballot box. So that the test in either case is not in mental ability, nor in technical abilities or skills, although people will write about the lack of engineers, technicians, and so on. These can be made good much more quickly than a realization of the fact by the populace that an industrial society, in order to work efficiently, requires not only efficient machines but the acceptance by its citizens of certain standards of values and a certain standard of integrity. In many of these African territories, the serious shortcoming is at this point of learning and practicing the values so necessary for wider communities. There, I think, the church meets both its challenge and its opportunity.

Eugene A. Nida

PRACTICAL PROBLEMS

The Missionary Role in "Marriage Palavers"

The Problem

To what extent, if any, should a missionary enter into a marriage palaver in order to help a national Christian? The Senoufos of West Africa "farm" for a bride in addition to giving a bride price. The men of the groom's household begin farming for a girl (after arrangements are made with her household) when the girl is about five or six years of age. This farming is continued for a certain number of days each year until the girl reaches "marriageable age" (fifteen to seventeen years). When the time for the marriage arrives there are one or two special days of farming — one day if eighteen men are available, two days if only eight or nine are available. At this time a bride price is paid and the girl goes to live at the household of her husband. This is often in a different town. During a period of two or three weeks one of the men of the groom's family goes to the elders of her household with a gift of kola nuts and seeks the bride's hand in marriage. It is already understood that the marriage will definitely take place.

This custom presents a problem for believers, for if a young man is converted and has had farming done for ten or eleven years for a wife who is not a believer, when the time for the marriage arrives he will enter into the arrangements made by the elders of his household and marry the unbeliever. In some cases the elders will refuse him his wife because he has left the way of his "fathers." If a young man refuses such a wife it is almost impossible for him to get another one. The ideal would be reciprocal farming among Christians but as yet there are very few Christians in this tribe and it is impossible.

About two years ago a young Christian man took a Muslim wife for whom he had farmed in the customary manner. The wife's family soon began encouraging her to leave him for another man because of his Christian profession. The Africans here are all French citizens and according to French law a wife must stay with her legal husband, that is, the one who farmed for her. In such a case, should the missionary step in and remind the elders of the French law or should he let the Christian work out his own problem rather than appear to be exercising the "white man's supremacy"? If the missionary does not step in to remind the elders of the law in the matter, then they take the wife away and give her to another man and the years of farming are lost. The only thing a man can do then is steal a wife from another man or wait until a member of the family dies and he is given the wife of the deceased man. If a missionary enters too often into marriage palavers, he will then be sought out by unbe-

> lievers as well as professing Christians whenever a Senoufo feels he is being mistreated and wants a white man to represent him before the law. It is difficult for an African to have a case tried in a fair manner in a law court without the help of a white man because the French authorities usually do not know the trade or tribal language and the interpreter can be bribed.
>
> *Ann Beardslee*

What Is our Role?

There are several reasons why the missionary's help is sought in trying to resolve social conflicts, and these reasons must figure largely in our anwers to the question of the missionary's role.

For one thing, a missionary almost inevitably becomes involved in social problems because he has introduced them. If it were not for the radical nature of the Christian message, such problems would not arise. People would not be changing their ideological loyalties, and therefore their social status would not be jeopardized and their traditional patterns of behavior would not be altered. When the missionary, by virtue of his very activity, creates problems, it is understandable enough that both he and the people would feel some responsibility for resolving them, or at least for judging what seems to be the equity of the case.

Even, however, where missionaries do not create problems by their preaching or by the behavior of their converts, people often like to come to the missionary to have their differences judged. Not infrequently non-Christians will agree to seek out the missionary in order to have their case adjudicated, for the missionary usually acquires a reputation for honesty. He certainly is regarded as less corruptible than the local judges and usually he is not surrounded by official interpreters who live off of bribes.

The help of the white missionary is sometimes sought in presenting a case to the colonial judge, for the missionary usually has a measure of prestige which only the rare indigenous person enjoys. The missionary, therefore, becomes the "friend at court."

For these, and a host of other minor reasons, the missionary may soon become involved in a myriad of legal responsibilities for people, and almost imperceptibly he will find his role being radically altered from what he may have first planned. That is to say, he went to the field as a prophet of a new faith, and he ends up as a judge of a new order. Rather than proclaim a new way of life, he acts as a kind of policeman to see that people keep in the straight and narrow path. Such a role seems almost impossible to escape when it is related to church discipline, for he is the one who feels called upon to keep the church "unblemished from the world," and furthermore the indigenous pastors certainly do not want to assume the onus of excommunicating the faithful, when it is so much easier to pass the buck to the white outsider.

The Missionary Judge

However, this role of judge, whether within the church or outside of it, is not quite so socially innocent as it seems, for though it may all seem quite reasonable, from our "disinterested standpoint," it certainly is not judged in this light by others. The reasons for this are, of course, not difficult to see, for the judging of the people is the function of the chief and the elders. The medicine man may be responsible for detecting witches, denouncing the violation of taboo, and arranging for an ordeal, but he does not judge civil suits, unless he wishes to vie with the chief and elders for political power. Likewise, the missionary as a kind of religious practitioner, must beware or he will find himself unwittingly a rival chief.

It is because of this fundamental problem involved in judging disputes that many missionaries have utterly refused to be embroiled in such difficulties. But this is not merely because of the practical results of making as many enemies as one ever makes friends — after all, for each one benefitted there must be at least one who is thoroughly alienated by any judicial verdict. Rather, missionaries have felt that they must keep out of such affairs because these activities are inconsistent with their role as prophets. This position is not, however, easy to explain to one's indigenous friends. One missionary, who had recently declared that he would hear absolutely no more marriage palavers, was immediately accosted by a man who declared, "But, Father, what will we do now?" His immediate reply was, "What did you do for the centuries before we missionaries came?" Of course, the people judged themselves by means of their own judicial systems, which though sometimes corrupt and often very different from our own, succeeded in resolving differences on the basis of a code of equity which was acceptable to the African value system.

The missionary's role must be essentially that of the conveyor of information. He is the new source of information about alternative patterns of behavior, and he must constantly explain these in terms of all their ramifications and complications. To gloss over the difficulties is to deceive people cruelly, but to attempt to right wrongs by taking on the executive and judicial functions of the chief and the elders will be even more disastrous.

To Whom Has the Gospel Been Preached?

Perhaps the real problem posed by this question is more subtle than appears at first glance. Is it possible that the solution to this difficulty lies in the very presentation of the Good News to this constituency? How does it happen that young men are principally involved in this problem? Has the mission sought primarily to reach young men rather than doing something for girls also? (It is quite true, for example, that almost 90 per cent of all the money that has gone into the education of Africans in the past has been for the education of boys and young men.) Has the proclamation of the gospel been directed to the family as a whole, or has the approach had the effect of "de-family-izing" the young convert? Is the young man or the family in question willing to pay damages to the one who has already worked for some girl who has become a Christian? Have any of the older men — the judging elders of the tribe — been consulted on this issue? What is their judgment on the equity of the case? Is it possible that there are no Christian elders in the tribe, no older men who understand the value system of the people and can interpret the way the people understand this relationship? What would be the attitude toward a Senoufo man marrying a girl from another tribe where there might be more Christian girls available?

These questions may undoubtedly seem to be posing more problems, rather than resolving the original one which has been described. However, we must face the facts that (1) solutions to such difficulties often rest on highly local circumstances and rarely if ever can one propose some "blanket solution" (if this were the case such solutions would have been found long ago) and (2) no solution is likely to be valid or have lasting value unless it is worked out in closest cooperation with the people themselves.

It would seem, however, that in this type of face-to-face community, the only valid approach must be something along the line of McGavaran's *Bridges of God*, where the message is communicated to the basic social unit, the family and the clan. Obviously, in this situation the whole matter of marriage is the problem of the family and clan, for it is not the bridegroom but the males of his household who do the work. Now, what is going to be the relationship of this Christian, who wants a bride, to the ongoing system? Will he be willing to work for a wife for his younger male relatives? Is one of the failures of the people to recognize his right a suspicion that he has removed himself as a potential participator in the continuing system? Do the people think of him as so much under the tutelage of the missionary that he is lost to the cause of the clan or tribe? If this is so, then perhaps they have more justice in their position than may appear on the surface, for equity requires not only that he receive a wife for past work, but that he be one who can be counted on to share his responsibility in the future of this betrothal system.

What we have said here is admittedly no pat answer to the question which has been raised, but it is an attempt to explore somewhat more extensively some of the implications of the problem and to suggest that not only is there more in such difficulties than meets the eye but any solution must be reached in the closest of contact with the people who are responsible for making such social decisions among the people. Appeals to the courts may help an individual client but this is not enough to establish a new basis of viable social responsibility.

REVIEWS

Reader in Comparative Religion, an Anthropological Approach, edited by William A. Lessa and Evon Z. Vogt. Evanston, Ill.: Row, Peterson and Co., 1958.

Reviewed by
IRVINE DAVIS

The religions of the world, according to a popular view shared by many Christians, consist of a half dozen or so "high religions" (Christianity, Mohammedanism, Buddhism, etc.) plus the aboriginal tribal religions which survive in isolated areas of the globe and which are lumped together under the term "animism." The attitude toward these "animistic" religions has too often been one of condemnation with no effort at understanding the vital role that they play in the society with which one may be dealing.

While certainly not advocating the degree of extreme tolerance toward other religions which effectively quenches all missionary zeal, we do feel that all those interested in introducing Christ to members of another society should attempt to understand the religion or religions of that society. The type of courses in comparative religion ordinarily offered in Bible schools and seminaries, with their emphasis on the "high religions," are often insufficient as a background for such an understanding.

Such courses ought to be supplemented by a knowledge of the contributions of anthropology in the field of comparative religion. With their special interest in the so-called primitive societies, anthropologists have collected a wealth of information on the aboriginal religions which not only survive in more or less pure form in many places, but which have left their imprint even where the "high religions" hold sway. We know of no better way to acquire a general orientation in this field of knowledge than to study the volume now under review.

The *Reader in Comparative Religion* is composed of eleven sections, each dealing with a different aspect of the subject and each containing a number of selections from various authors as well as pertinent comments by the editors. Section I, "The Origin and Development of Religion," deals with the speculations of a past generation of anthropologists. The reader may find the theories of Taylor and company stimulating, but he is not likely to find them satisfying or particularly helpful in understanding religious phenomena.

Section II, "The Function of Religion in Human Society," reflects the thinking of a somewhat more recent school of anthropologists who have been concerned not so much with speculations concerning the origin of cultural phenomena as with the function of such phenomena in present-day societies. Sections III through IX contain descriptions of particular religious beliefs and practices observed in societies of many parts of the world. In these sections will be found selections

---

Mr. Irvine Davis is studying for the Ph.D. degree in anthropology at the University of New Mexico. He is a member of the Wycliffe Bible Translators, studying the Keresan Pueblo language of New Mexico.

dealing with the ritual dances of the Zuñi Indians of New Mexico, the concept of mana in Oceania, totemism in Australia, ancestor worship in Africa, shamanism in Siberia, and even certain "folk beliefs" such as water-witching which are part of at least some segments of our own culture.

Section X, titled "Dynamics in Religion," deals with a subject of particular interest to missionaries as well as theorists in the field of religion. Here we find a discussion of the growth and development of various religious systems in the ancient Near East, a treatment of the changing aspects of the Jewish passover, Ralph Linton's well-known analysis of nativistic movements, several papers dealing with the ghost dance and the peyote cult among American Indians, a paper on modern cults in Melanesia, an analysis by Melville Herskovits of African religious beliefs in New World Catholicism, and finally, a consideration of the relationship between ritual and social change in Java. Section XI, "Portraits of Religious Systems," contains descriptions of functioning religions in a number of societies over the world. A series of biographical sketches of the authors whose writings are included in the volume, an annotated list of monographs on non-Western religious systems, and a general bibliography complete the book.

The editors have done an excellent job of bringing together in one volume the condensed results of three quarters of a century of anthropological thought and research on the subject of religion, and anyone who takes the time to read the selections will be struck by the wide range of the subject matter. It is true that the Christian is likely to be left with a feeling of dissatisfaction. He may search in vain for anything relevant concerning the impact of the Christian gospel on aboriginal societies. But he cannot read this book and remain ignorant of the anthropologist's approach to comparative religion, nor will he be likely to fall into the error of disdainfully classifying all tribal religions as nothing more than "animism" and unworthy of serious consideration. He will be in a much better position to understand whatever aboriginal religion he may encounter and in understanding that religion he will become a more effective ambassador for Christ.

LETTERS

Missionary Medicine in a Print Shop

As printer for an assortment of evangelicals, it falls to my lot to audit many a resounding religious discussion due to the accidental convergence on my premises of two or more customers. Thus it was that a layman whom I shall call A.Y. and a missionary medical practitioner whom I shall call the Doctor, were standing at the delivery end of a press when one of them began to scan parts of the editorial "Some Questions about Missionary Medicine," PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 6, No. 2 (March-April, 1959). Editor Wm. A. Smalley has opened a sore that needs exploring. The conversation could be synthesized like this:

" 'What does the typical mission medical program contribute to the extension of the church?' " It was A.Y. reading from the sheet. "That's what I would like to know. Treating the sick, along with feeding the hungry, clothing the naked, educating, housing, outhousing and entertaining the prospective converts, as an anesthetic for spiritual treatment, has dangerous side effects."

"But wait," said the Doctor, "you are talking to someone who is a natural-born wielder of the scalpel, and when the Lord asked me, 'What is that in thine hand?' I looked down and there was a bottle of plasma."

"Missionaries should adapt their divine endowments," admitted A.Y., "even if one was once a gifted housebreaker. But this business of strapping the unsuspecting down within earshot of the gospel—"

"While I am carving the tissue I carve the spoken word of Christ on the soul."

A.Y. pressed his point. "It's the same reaction you get from 'rice Christianity' and the 'soap-soup-salvation' remedies. If casual open-air hearers will night after night, with little hope of gain, unanimously signify by the uplifted hand almost anything the preacher tries to get them to signify in unfamiliar intonation, how much more will the written-home statistics be bloated when it comes to mission infirmary in-patients with everything to gain?"

"But we have a thriving, vital program. You can't tell me it's all in vain."

"Your hospital was conceived as a time-taking embryo of problems," went on A.Y., "and it was born at great cost though homeland financiers were in attendance—"

"At puberty it began witnessing—" the Doctor said defensively.

"To a captive audience, like Smalley says here, and now in its old age it's too much like just another hospital."

Fortunately, the Doctor is a forgiving man. He pantomimed a person who has just been dealt a stunning blow, and then pleaded, "Look, A.Y., even apart from the artificial-lure taint of medical missions, didn't the Lord Himself and His followers have compassion on the sick?"

It was a little before this remark that our circle was joined briefly by Brother Jack, a faith healer, who came for his form letters. In Mexico these days the miracle approach is decidedly loosed and let go. I felt uneasy considering the divergent convictions of the men whom my roof had chanced to bring together, but Christian love won out, even though the several factions departed, of the same opinion still. Our Jack heard the discussion without comment until this challenge about the Lord's compassion came. Then he laid hands on the shoulders of the two opponents and said, "Now you're getting off the Great Sidetrack and back on my Main Line. From Chihuahua to Yucatan we are being used of the Lord to bring sight to the blind, open deaf ears, raise the—"

"You want us to convert our clinic into a healing arena," interrupted the Doctor, "and trade in our bandages on blest handkerchiefs."

Jack was calm. "It only took just a shadow," he said, "just a rough shadow of a simple man of faith. No multi-thousand-dollar edifice, no imposing skills or tools." He flashed a gold-inlaid smile to assure us that there were no anathemic feelings, and was gone.

"He is almost right about that railroad business," A.Y. commented. "The main line is the Good News. If means-to-an-end medical missionism is the sidetrack, then the end-in-itself humanitarian gospel is positively a bridge out."

"But, my dear brother," objected the Doctor, "are you saying that we have no social obligation? Isn't it our duty to ease suffering?"

Layman A.Y. shook his head. "How much serum, sweat and Lord's money is it worth to bring a healthy baby into the overpopulated heathen world? No, our business is souls, not bodies. If it were our task to prescribe for social ills, then our treatment should be a preventive for overpopulation."

The Doctor chose not to hear this heresy. He still wanted to know whether A.Y. was accusing him of throwing his life away.

"Listen, Doc," said the man. "Your career and your hospital can contribute to the plan of the ages. Even though you waste your time when you patch up and perpetuate the races, satisfying though the job may be, there is one class of people worthy of your effort — Christian workers and their families. They are the ones whose lives count, and whose health and efficiency are all-important."

"Then you will leave the rest of the world to die?"

"No."

"Well?"

"I will give them live and healthy souls."

The Doctor stirred this around in his mind. "It doesn't sound too toxic. But we all dislike treatment that produces a stinging sensation."

"Maybe this is an advanced case," A.Y. said. "Call in your board for a consultation."

Allan Farson

Cuernavaca, Mexico

Missionary Medicine

The editorial "Some Questions about Missionary Medicine" (PA, Vol. 6, No. 2 [Mar.-Apr. 1959]) was most thought-provoking, and should be brought to the attention of all medical missionaries. At this time my schedule is too crowded to adequately formulate on paper all my thoughts on the chain reaction started by your paper, but I did want to send this preliminary note to you.

Briefly, my experience as a medical missionary in Ecuador has included working with peoples similar to those with whom Dr. Dooley served. In our Epp Memorial Hospital in Shell Mera, serving all of the eastern jungles of Ecuador, by necessity we have worked into the local culture. An example of this was the temporary measure during hospital construction of having the family of the patient bring the food to the patient, food cooked either by the relative or purchased in a local restaurant, "unhygienic from our standards, but without the introduction of any parasites not already welcomed into the patient's digestive system." We saw it work so well that we dismissed the idea of having a hospital kitchen, other than a small special diet kitchen.

We have also, I am sure, made many mistakes, which I trust may be rectified. One is criticizing the local midwifes and not giving them a course in our hospital to improve their work.

Well, I could go on, but I did want to express my enthusiasm for the general drift of the article. In all fairness to completeness, I should add that I would take issue on some parts of the article.

M. Everett Fuller

Schenectady, N. Y.

"Thus Saith the Lord"

I have some frank comments to make on the editorial, "The Moral Implications of Social Structure," which appeared in Vol. 6, No. 3 (May-June 1959) of Practical Anthropology.

The first time I read the editorial (to copy-edit it) I got the impression that you talked all around Mr. Abrecht's question without really answering it. When I read it again (in galley proof) I saw that my first impression was not altogether correct. But I wonder if others who would not read it twice might not carry off the first impression I had.

Like Abrecht, I can heartily agree with much that you say in your editorial. Yet there is a certain overtone which clashes against my spiritual convictions. There seems to be the supposition that moral values are only relative, that things which we recognize as wrong today in one culture are not necessarily wrong in another culture or were not wrong in our culture at an earlier period.

Mr. Abrecht took issue with your statement: "There is nothing intrinsically moral or right or wrong about social structures as such." Your present editorial is to defend that statement along with what followed it in your earlier editorial.

I ask the question: Is there no unalterable standard of moral values? Granted that in some cultures infanticide (let us say) is not looked upon as an evil but even perhaps as something good and desirable, while in other cultures it is considered a great evil, is there no standard outside of cultures by which the act may be judged? I am sure that you will agree that there is such a standard. It is the will of a holy God, the will which he has revealed to us in his Word; so that all acts, practices, and attitudes, whether permitted by certain cultures or not, which are contrary to that will are sin, rebellion against divine authority.

The Old Testament prophets had a "thus saith the Lord" to back up their denunciations of much that was admitted by the contemporary culture of their day. There ought to be something of their spirit in all the missionaries and bearers of the good news in our day. I do not mean, of course, that we must go about breathing fiery denunciations on everything around us, but there should be the conviction that we are bearers of a divine message to mankind in rebellion. I quite agree with Abrecht when he says: "All social structures stand under the judgment of God," because all are towers of Babel which rebellious man is building, seeking by his own efforts to reach heaven, going about to establish his own righteousness and not submitting himself to the righteousness of God. In another place you say: "Christianity is always intrusive," which is a thought along the same line.

You use the institution of slavery as a sort of illustration. Here the cursory reader might feel justified in concluding that you consider slavery bad only in certain cultures. "St. Paul was certainly not bothered about it. . . . It was not one of the issues that Jesus made anything of." That is the argument from silence. Jesus and Paul proclaimed liberty from a greater slavery than the physical. The particular type of slavery which became such a "burning issue" in our culture not too long ago was vehemently condemned by Moses. "He that stealeth a man and selleth him . . . shall surely be put to death" (Ex. 21: 16).

The mistake which missionaries and others have made and are making is to fail to distinguish between what are eternal verities, divinely given standards of right and wrong, and the appendages and products of our own culture. Too often "Thus saith the Lord" has been used to enforce changes which God never commanded.

"Thou shalt not steal" is an unchangeable expression of the divine will. Stealing can never be right. In some cultures it may be considered right to steal from certain people under certain conditions, but that does not make it a virtue. However, in seeking to define what stealing is, we are being influenced by our cultures. We Americans would be greatly influenced by what the courts have ruled on the subject. I have been told that in certain parts of Central Africa, if a man walking along a path in the jungle saw something which someone had dropped and picked it up, he would be in grave danger of being accused of theft in a native court. In Mexico, on the other hand, if I leave something of mine lie on the sidewalk in front of the house and someone comes along and picks it up, it would not be considered stealing because it was "left in his path" (i.e. the person did not enter my gate to pick up something lying in the yard; he was walking along the street and found something lying there which obviously belonged to whoever might want it. If I had really wanted it, I would not have left it there). Obviously neither the Central African nor the Mexican criterion is the standard by which stealing is to be judged. The ultimate appeal must be to the Word of God itself.

Paul C. Clarke

Puebla, Mexico

CONTENTS

MINIMIZING RELIGIOUS SYNCRETISM AMONG THE CHOLS 241 JOHN BEEKMAN

NOTES AND NEWS 250

THE BUDDHIST-CHRISTIAN ENCOUNTER IN BURMA 251 PAUL D. CLASPER

ACCULTURATION SURVEY OF THE DANSALAN JUNIOR COLLEGE 262 DAVID L. HAMM & BATUA MACARAYA

TELEVISION ON THE TEPEE 272 WESLEY A. HOTCHKISS

ETHNOGRAPHIC QUESTIONS FOR CHRISTIAN MISSIONARIES 275 JOSEPH E. GRIMES

TO SEE OURSELVES

My Contacts with Christians in Thailand 277 PRAJUAB TIRABUTANA

REVIEWS

Introducing Animism (Eugene A. Nida and William A. Smalley) 282 JAMES O. BUSWELL, III

The Christian Faith and Non-Christian Religions (A. C. Bouquet) 283 EUGENE A. NIDA

British Policy in Changing Africa (Sir Andrew Cohen) 285 JAMES MUIR

LETTERS 287

John Beekman

Minimizing Religious Syncretism among the Chols

Syncretism is the tendency for new culture patterns to be combined and intermingled with existing patterns when they are adopted into a society. In one sense syncretism is an inevitable characteristic of any profound culture change, because change does not take place in a vacuum, but is developed on, or out from, or in contrast to an existing way of life. In this article John Beekman discusses some of the dangers of syncretism where the resulting behavior is out of keeping with the gospel. He also discusses the "reorientation" of Chol values and practices in the light of the gospel. This reorientation places the gospel in a framework which seems relevant to the Chol people. In a sense it is a syncretism in which pertinent elements in Chol culture are used to point toward the gospel, or are selected for the way in which they highlight the gospel to the Chol mind. At the same time they avoid the kind of mixture which points essentially toward paganism rather than toward Christ.

In his recent book *Christo-Paganism,* William Madsen gives evidence that the present beliefs of the Aztecs living in San Francisco Tecospa are a result of a syncretistic process which began long before the introduction of Catholicism.[1] Morris Siegel, in his article "Cultural Changes in San Miguel Acatán, Guatemala," says that the religion of the Indians of San Miguel Acatán is a fusion of Indian and Catholic beliefs and practices, which does not resemble the Catholic religion in its orthodox form.[2]

William Reyburn introduces his article "The Spiritual, the Material, and the Western Reaction in Africa"[3] with an account of the death of a baby which was told to him by an African Christian. Apparently this man's beliefs concerning health, sickness, and death still admit elements of paganism.

Juan Comas, an outstanding Mexican anthropologist, in a conference held last year in Peru, made the following observation: "Practically the same thing has happened [in Peru] as with Motolinía and the Franciscan friars who arrived in Mexico in the early years of the conquest. They baptized about five thousand at one time. Theoretically these are Catholics. Actually, however, they practice their Indian religion simultaneously with

---

[1] See William Madsen, *Christo-Paganism: A Study of Mexican Religious Syncretism* (New Orleans: Middle American Research Institute, 1957; preprinted from Publication 19, pp. 105-180), and William L. Wonderly's review article "Pagan and Christian Concepts in a Mexican Indian Culture" (PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 5, Nos. 5 & 6, Sept.-Dec. 1958).

[2] *Phylon, The Atlanta University Review of Race and Culture,* Vol. 15, No. 2 (1954), pp. 165-176.

[3] PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 6, No. 2 (March-April 1959).

Catholicism. This syncretism means that there is a religious factor and primitive superstitions that have not been eliminated."[4]

Missionaries also give wide testimony to the fact that certain concepts or practices of paganism persist for years among their converts and often are found in second and third generation Christians. These concepts become an integral part of their new religion. What can be done by the missionary to avoid unwarranted degrees of this type of syncretism? What can legitimately be done to at least attempt to reorient these cultural beliefs? What can be done to encourage suitable substitutions which are introduced by a new group of converts?

Since there are many factors which enter into possible answers to these questions, the author, who has had no formal study of anthropology, does not intend to answer these questions even as they relate to the Chols among whom he has worked as a missionary-translator for ten years. Selected field experiences are presented in which a certain recurring pattern may be seen. This may suggest an approach or methodology which may be helpful to others. It is not presumed that this is the complete answer to avoiding unwarranted religious syncretism, but merely a method of communicating religious concepts in such a way as to direct or guide the process of change by which pagan belief is reoriented in terms of Christianity. Many predisposing factors in the culture in general or in the experience of the individual are not dealt with in this paper.

In the first years of his work, among the Chols, the missionary often accompanied some of the converts in evangelistic trips and noted some of the oft-recurring objections which were raised to the gospel. After there were readers, classes were conducted in the study of the printed portions of the New Testament for groups from different villages. As many as seven different groups were taught independently in the course of each month. Opportunity was given to them to tell of their experiences in witnessing and in strengthening new converts. The problems which had been both seen by the missionary and reported by the Indians were presented to each group who came for Bible study. The discussion was guided for the most part with pertinent questions in the same manner in which the missionary conducted the Bible study classes.[5] Sometimes a conclusion reached by one group would be different from that reached by another. Sometimes that which had been studied from the Old Testament Bible stories or New Testament portions was presented in the course of a discussion as pertinent to a problem.

John Beekman is a member of the Wycliffe Bible Translators, working among the Chol Indians of Chiapas, Mexico, and one of the translators of the Chol New Testament. He is also Director of the work of this organization in Guatemala. The present is the first of two articles which expand and further develop some of the concepts introduced by the same author in "A Culturally Relevant Witness" which appeared in PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 4, No. 3 (May-June 1957).

---

[4] Unpublished paper, presented August 20, 1958.

[5] One visiting missionary after observing the classes made a criticism which later was reported to the writer: "Anybody could do what he does. All he does is sit there letting the Indians explain the passage. He asks questions but doesn't stand up and lecture."

The author recalls a discussion concerning the problem of young girls who were given in common marriage and after a few weeks or more returned to their homes. While the usual reason given was that the fellow and girl did not like each other, it was suspected that the real reason was that the girl did not work hard enough to please the mother-in-law. The missionary, therefore, suggested that perhaps the girl could live at the home of the groom's parents during the day and return to her own home in the evenings. The marriage state would then begin when the girl's father was asked permission to have his daughter live at the boy's home. This suggestion was not accepted. Rather the Chol Christians insisted that in God's sight a couple entered the marriage state as soon as the promised girl began to live at the fellow's home. A recent tendency has been observed of solving the problem by building a separate house for the new couple. This house is built by the groom's father, usually very close to his own. In view of this procedure, it seems fair to say that the Indians themselves arrived at the conclusions as to how to cope with this problem. On the other hand, without the presence of the missionary to note the problems and to focus the attention of the Indians on them, it is doubtful that some of the solutions presented in this paper would have been discovered. In any case, whether the idea originated primarily with the missionary or with an Indian, they were at complete liberty to try it or to ignore it.

The first example which we shall give of actual syncretism among the Chols exists among those who call themselves Catholics. Except for new forms and symbols introduced among the Chols, their beliefs remain basically pagan. For the lack of a better name reference will be made to this group with the phrase, 'followers of the traditional religion.' Those who have been converted from this group to the evangelical faith will be referred to as the 'converts.'

Problems of Syncretism in Easter Observances

The ancient Chols had a feast at corn-planting time which, in part at least, has survived to the present time. Its form may be somewhat modified, but its purpose has probably undergone no change. The Roman Catholic priests apparently tried to substitute the Easter celebration for this, since both occurred at about the same time of year. An image of Christ on the cross was used, and today the Chols follow the practice of covering the image with a black cloth during Holy Week and of removing it on Easter morning to indicate the resurrection. The Chols have accepted this ritual, reinterpreting its significance in the light of their own corn-planting ceremony. With some variations from village to village, the following summary indicates how these new items are reconciled to their purposes. The 'god' is covered so that he will think it is dark and cloudy and remember to send sunshine to dry out the recently felled trees and underbrush so that the fields can be burned. When the cloth is removed, it is to show him the blazing sun in order that he will send rain for the newly planted corn. During this season sacrifices are made in the corners of the fields which have been cut for planting. Fasting is also practiced. The only item which one may drink in any measure is liquor. To encourage the fast the religious leaders explain to the people that eggs eaten at this time are vultures' eggs, black beans are flies, the corn drink is pus, tortillas are dung.

For the converts, on the other hand, the Easter celebrations have become extended love feasts with services from Thursday evening through Sunday; though some villagers attend to their work on Saturday. At these feasts one or two steers are often purchased and cooked in front of the chapel by the women, or each family provides chickens, beans, or other food items much as in American pot-luck suppers except that the food is not brought fully prepared. At first the services included prayers for the crops, but more recently they center almost exclusively around the events of the life of Christ which happened on these days as recorded in Scripture.

This latter development may be due to two causes. The availability of materials relating to the death and resurrection of Christ, along with men who can read and explain these in the services, has contributed to this trend. The second cause originated with the feeling on the part of one or two of the missionaries that such fiestas were an economic burden to the Indians and not a proper observance of Easter. A Mexican worker in his visits to the Chol villages, therefore, discouraged these fiestas which had become a symbol of their very purpose. A feeling of guilt still persists in the minds of some, and as a result communal gatherings of this type in some villages are not as fully attended as before. In view of this some meet this need by holding a family feast, usually of turkey, for the purpose of praying for good crops and protection from falling trees, machete cuts, and snake bites.

These converts had had their beliefs concerning the 'world owner' and the elements of nature reoriented to the beliefs of Christianity. If this had not been so, this prohibition might have resulted in a combination of Christian ideas and the old ceremony with the sacrifices made in the fields. Syncretism could have been produced rather than prevented.

Abortive Attempts at Syncretism

Among the converts in the village of Tumbalá were those who could read and understand some Spanish. In their reading of the Old Testament and from messages which they heard from Spanish-speaking pastors they became acquainted with the sacrifice of animals as a symbol of the sacrifice of Jesus. They also read that the Israelites were to eat no pork. Their own cultural background reminded them of the importance of animal sacrifices and the central use of blood in the witchcraft ceremonies. These fellows became the proponents of the teaching that the blood of pigs is the blood of our Holy Father. It should not be eaten. Therefore when a pig is killed its blood must be caught in a gourd and ceremonially buried behind the house. This practice was short-lived.

Here is another example of what could have become a peculiar characteristic of Christianity among the Chols. A shaman who continued loyal to the traditional religion attempted to synthesize his ceremony with some of the items connected with Christianity. In a village where more than half of the families had become converts, this enterprising shaman suggested some substitutions in his ceremonies. A shelf was set up, decorated with flowers and satin, on which a Bible was placed. His chants were then directed to the God of the Book and to the land-owning spirit. The convert was permitted to substitute liquor with a soft drink, but was required to provide liquor for the shaman. In questioning some of these believers it became obvious that the reason for the substitutions was very hazy in their thinking. Others felt it removed what God hated in the shaman ceremony, but did not affect its usefulness in regaining health. All still felt that health would be restored when the land-owning spirit had been effectively contacted on their behalf. Even though some items and terms of the Christian faith had been used, the basic pagan idea was unchanged.

Why did these converts accept the modified services of the shaman? Christianity at this point in their experience had been related to only a small part of their basic religious needs. They knew what it meant to be reconciled to the living God, but beyond that Christianity did not yet seem to have any real relevance. Their beliefs as to the cause and cure of sickness had not been changed. The modified ceremony did not seem to them to endanger or overlook the area of their Christian experience and conviction. While some opposed this syncretism, they were unable to explain their stand or to adequately answer the claims of the shaman. When the cultural beliefs concerning sickness were explained in terms of related Christian truths, the shaman received no further calls from the converts.

Up to this point our illustrations refer to actual or aborted attempts at religious syncretism. The following illustrations refer to potential areas of syncretism. This is based on the premise that wherever a group of converts accepts a new idea or practice without a proper understanding of its full significance or meaning, resistance to the new by the followers of the traditional religion tends to result in syncretism. To be sure, other factors limit or provoke this tendency. Some success has been observed among the Chol Indians in eliminating potential areas of syncretism by reorienting cultural beliefs. Five examples follow.

Reorienting Beliefs concerning Shamanism

The shaman with his chants, guitar, violin, and sacrifices to the land-owning spirit is a real temptation to the evangelical convert and fills a very important role for the followers of the traditional religion. In fact, one of the first questions asked by those who are approached with the gospel is what one does in times of sickness. The chants and music are believed necessary to bring the shaman into communion with the land-owning spirit. This they believe is effective only because he is indwelt with seven extra spirits. Others using these same means would not be able to communicate because of spiritual impotence. The animal sacrifice is the basis of success for his plea on behalf of the sick individual. The land-owning spirit desires other spirits and at times imprisons the spirit of a person which he releases in exchange for an animal spirit. The spirit which is acceptable to him is revealed to the shaman usually in audible communications. Often a shaman is accused of having failed to contact the land-owning spirit if a person does not recover after the prescribed sacrifice has been made. Among at least some of the Chol converts the idea that a spirit being could be contacted through music and by addressing him was not refuted; nor the idea that one must be indwelt with a spirit or spirits in order to commune with spirit beings. At the same time, the belief that a sacrifice was necessary in order to receive any benefits from a spirit being was not only considered worth retaining but worth emphasizing. One can see that many of these pagan practices are motivated with ideas that are in at least some measure compatible with Christianity. These beliefs which parallel Christian truth to be sure will need reorientation, but once they are recognized they become an important point of contact for teaching which should be exploited. The compatible ideas are extracted from the details and given emphasis. Then on this hook of mutual belief are hung the fuller truths of Christianity. One convert in speaking to a follower of the traditional religion during a measles epidemic said in part, "You call us 'monkeys' because you think our singing is like their chatter. We want help from God. You do too. You go to the old men to have them recite for you and to the shaman to have him chant. We pray and sing in our homes and in church. Our children get better; yours die."

Hymns, gospel phonograph records, and prayers are explained as the true means of contacting God. The church leaders who have been entrusted with the phonographs also know the hymns and can pray and read from portions of the New Testament. They were the logical ones to be called upon to minister to the sick instead of the shaman. The teaching that by faith in God's Son God gives us his Spirit to live in our hearts was not difficult for them to accept for it was a reorientation and extension of their belief that the snaman is indwelt. The sacrifice of God's Son (who committed his spirit into God's hands not because he was afraid that the land-owning spirit would imprison it, but to show that God was well pleased with the sacrifice of his Son) could be accepted as a sufficient and better sacrifice, making the sacrifice of animals no longer necessary. In some cases it was necessary to point out that the Old Testament sacrifice of animals and the sacrifice of Christ were not to a spirit-hungry God. The first was a picture of and the latter the actual payment for our sins, so that with nothing written against us God could hear us. Payment for sin as a basis for reconciliation and fellowship was easily understood in view of their experience with ranchers to whom they frequently were heavily indebted.

Concepts of Sin

The subject of sin is so close a corollary to the sacrifice of God's Son and so closely related to the belief in the land-owning spirit and the shaman, that one is never dealt with without the others. It seems pertinent, therefore, to make the following observations.

Making extractions from stories and comments about sin, we can begin with those ideas which correspond to Christianity. Thus we would say that sin is an offense to a spirit-being or to one's fellow man. To the followers of the traditional religion, nothing is sin unless it involves offense. Drunkenness is therefore not a sin unless it ends with a fight. Theft is not sin unless the owner 'hurts in his heart' over what has been stolen and consults the shaman to find out who stole his goods. Converts lost much of their corn through theft perhaps because it was known that they no longer consulted the shaman. Unless the thief was caught, he was quite certain that even though offense had been caused, the convert had no way of avenging himself. (However, since the converts attended services and never worked in their fields on Sunday, and since most of these thefts occurred on Sunday, this may be the major reason for these thefts.) To the follower of the traditional religion, the physical condition of his family is one of the main factors in determining whether he is guilty of offense. If he offends the land-owning spirit, sickness will fall. If he offends his fellow-man, sickness may fall if a spell of black magic is cast on him or a member of his family through the services of the shaman. Health, then, although never explicitly stated as such, is a measure of one's spiritual relation to others and to the land-owning spirit. (The term 'God' as used by the followers of the traditional religion includes the concept of the land-owning spirit, although there is a separate term used to specifically refer to the latter.)

Converts often made the statement to the followers of the traditional religion that Christ died for their sins and they should believe on him. Invariably the answer received to such a statement was: "I don't have any sin." This was a sincere answer although the author was unable to explain it in his early years among the Chols. The Indian did not mean that he had never lied, stolen, or beaten his wife. He meant that since he and his family were well, there was no unappeased offense in his life. The convert, therefore, developed another set of criteria on which to base his relationship with God. Instead of arguing that he was a sinner and God's Word said so, he pointed to the greater well-being of the converts in general. He compared his shirt and trousers to those worn by the individual to whom he was talking. He compared his shoes to the other's bare feet. He spoke of eating crackers with the family instead of losing money, hat, and machete in drunkenness. He spoke of owning mules and tin-roofed houses instead of carrying firewood on his back and patching up a grass roof. His argument implied that health is not the only criterion of one's relationship to God, and it has been a very effective answer in winning converts. It should be noted that medical work among the Chols is a very effective means of gaining converts. When the followers of the traditional religion come for medicine, it usually indicates that they have tired of the unavailing services of the shaman. They come with a subconscious feeling that all is not right because of sickness in the family. They are ready to listen to culturally related spiritual truths.

House-Dedication Practices

When a new hut is constructed the shaman is generally called upon to dedicate it to the land-owning spirit whose property (trees, grass, land) has been used in its construction. In his chants he requests protection from fire, the wind, thieves, and spirit manifestations. The drumming and violin-playing and drinking of liquor lasts from one to three days. The converts, however, dedicate their new homes by inviting the church leaders and friends to an evening of refreshments consisting of cookies and soft drinks. Prayer for the occupants of the new home and for the protection of the house, along with singing, characterizes the evening's activities.

The desire for protection from the forces of nature and from thieves is legitimate for any people. The purpose of the shaman's ceremony has been carried over into that which was substituted by the converts. Its focal center, however, has been shifted from the land-owning spirit to a more powerful spirit, i.e. the Holy Spirit. Instead of being based on appeasing the land-owning spirit through the medium of the shaman with his extra spirits, it became based on the indwelling Spirit through whom one had guidance and protection from God. The fact that rattling gourds, whistlings in the grass roofs, dirt throwings, etc. were reported as no longer occurring at the homes of converts was convincing evidence of the power of the Holy Spirit.

Use of Liquor

It is interesting to note the efforts made by one of the leaders of the convert group in the Tumbalá church to undermine the religious significance attached to the use of liquor. All the shaman's activities as well as all religious observances require the use of liquor, which the followers of the traditional religion believe to be of divine origin. The old men feel it is necessary in their prayers in order to 'get warm in reciting.' The shaman declares that he cannot offer his chants without liquor. Often when speaking to the cross he may order that 'the bottom of the gourd be poured on the cross' in order to cause the Father to be more communicative and less angry. Week-end drunkenness, apart from religious fiestas, has been a long-standing problem in Spanish-speaking cities. In the Indian village drunkenness is almost exclusively related to religious functions. In appealing to his fellow-converts to desist from all use of liquor, the above-mentioned leader made reference to Proverbs 20: 1, 2, which reads, "Strong drink is raging. . . . The fear of a king is as of the roaring of a lion," and also Luke 13: 1 which speaks of the Galileans whose blood Pilate had mingled with their sacrifices. These verses became the text for a Sunday sermon. The Indian preacher declared that liquor, which causes us to become ferocious like a lion, originated when the blood of people from Galilee was mixed with the blood of a raging lion. While this fellow's intentions were good and the impressions of his message vivid, his understanding of these verses was quite defective.

A more biblical way was found to meet the objection often raised that liquor is necessary for religious expression. Those who raised such objections were told that it is true that some outside stimulant is necessary to man in order to free his inhibitions. It is impossible to pray right without this, and the true God wants us to have it. Then the teaching of Acts 2, where the Pentecostal experience is clearly explained to be the result of the Spirit rather than liquor, is made relevant here. Again it may be seen that the purpose in the use of liquor, i.e. that an outside stimulant or constraining power is necessary in order to worship God properly, is retained but reoriented. It becomes based on the Spirit rather than on liquor. Thus the religious use of liquor with its accompanying drunkenness is no problem among the converts and can no longer be considered an area of potential syncretism.[6]

---

[6] Would this approach to the emotional experiences connected with the ritual use of mushrooms, as described by Pike and Cowan

Images

When the converts were asked why their church building contained no images, which the followers of the traditional religion call 'God's image,' the first answer used was the conventional one. The theological reply was given by the convert: "God is a Spirit and we cannot see him; however, he is present in our churches." This answer, however, did not seem to entirely satisfy the inquiring follower of the traditional religion. The statement was often made in ridicule: "All your churches have is a phonograph machine on a table. The saloons in Yajalón have the same." The underlying assumption was that a church, to be more than just a building, had to have in it something visible. To be a place of real worship and not just a place of play, it should contain something sacred, something like God. This assumption was not refuted. It was reoriented by showing that the church building does have in it those whom God himself has declared to be in his own image. The answer now given has been more or less along the following lines: "God's book tells us that he made *man* in his own image. The more we obey his commands the more fully do *we* become his image. What you call '*God's* image' is something made by man. God tells us what really is his image. It is something *he* made, not what we make. It is ourselves, not a wooden idol. He gives his Spirit to all his children. Nowhere does he say that something which *we* make has spirit power. Our churches are full of God's images when a service is held."

Candles

The followers of the traditional religion use candles in all religious functions. Prayers conducted in the Catholic church by the older men and women as those conducted by the shaman are accompanied with the burning of candles. The total disappearance of candles in the religious life of the converts has often become a point of ridicule. "You must have candles and sometimes even incense in order to make real prayers" was the answer normally given by the followers of the traditional religion as to why candles were used. A few reports filtered back to the missionary that some converts resorted to the use of candles in times of critical illness and in funeral wakes. It finally became clear that the use of candles was motivated by the idea that light made one's prayers acceptable. The converts now have an answer to queries as to why they do not use candles. They explain that God likes light and all that it represents. He wants us to have a light when we pray to him, but not a small flickering light made by man. He wants to see a great light which he himself sent down from heaven to shine in our hearts. Jesus said that he himself was the light of the world. This is the light God wants to see in our hearts. Here again is an illustration of reorienting a religious motif after one understands its purpose. Whatever in this purpose is compatible with the gospel becomes an equally acceptable starting point to both parties before proceeding to the new and fuller truth or practices of Christianity.

Perhaps all that should be claimed from the foregoing discussion as a method

---

in Practical Anthropology, Vol. 6, No. 4 (July-August 1959), be a fruitful way of showing that the Christian message has an adequate substitute for these chemically-induced 'revelations'? [W.L.W.].

of avoiding religious syncretism is that it has given converts an intelligent understanding of what their new faith embraces and why they desist from certain practices and have adopted substitutes for others. It has removed what would otherwise be temptations into which they would frequently fall. For at least some of the honest inquirers, this approach has contributed much toward removing their fears and doubts concerning the way of the gospel.

Notes and News

Reprint of "Toba Indians"

William D. Reyburn's monograph, *The Toba Indians of the Argentine Chaco,* has recently been reprinted by the publishers, the Mennonite Board of Missions and Charities, Elkhart, Indiana. The new edition has been corrected at points, and it has a brief new introduction by the author.

Reyburn's monograph is one to which repeated reference has been made in PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, because it describes a group of Indians in Argentina, the spread of Christianity among them (in Pentecostal form) without missionary leadership. It also discusses the adjustment of the mission program (Mennonite) to make possible the fostering, strengthening, and enriching of this indigenous church growing up around it.

Paul D. Clasper

The Buddhist-Christian Encounter in Burma

The fact that the gospel often makes relatively little headway against the "higher" world religions has been a source of deep concern to many missionaries. In this article, the author discusses the "peaceful coexistence" of Buddhism and Christianity in Burma, and their relative isolation from each other. He examines the basic differences in their assumptions and calls for a Christianity which will face squarely its need for "encounter" with Buddhism.

BURMA is a magic word for informed Baptists. It brings to mind the names of Adoniram Judson and Ann of Ava and the formation of "The General Missionary Convention of the Baptist Denomination in the United States for Foreign Missions." This in turn recalls the debt which the whole denomination owes to the vision of its first missionaries and the subsequent place which the spread of the gospel among non-Christian peoples has had among the concerns of American Baptists. The name of Burma reminds many of the phenomenal Christian movement among the Karens, Judson College, Brayton Case, *Burma Surgeon*, and the fact that Burma is remarkable in being a country in which the vast majority of the Christian population are Baptists. (Burmese seminary students usually begin with the impression that Baptists are "the Church" while the Anglicans constitute a "sect.")

But Burma is also a magic word for informed Buddhists. It is the place of the largest pagoda — the magnificent golden Shwe Dagon. It is the home of some of the most conservative and authentic Buddhism in the world, perhaps the closest in spirit and actual detail to the intention of the Lord Buddha. Burmans, and many Buddhists throughout the world, feel that here the doctrines and practices of Theravada Buddhism can be seen in near pristine purity. In recent times Burma has been the leading center for the contemporary revival of Buddhism in Asia, the home of the two-year-long Sixth Buddhist Council and a center for Buddhist missionary outreach. The names of U Nu and U Chan Htoon are well known in modern Buddhist circles.

Burma, then, is a land of significance for both Christians (especially Baptists) and Buddhists. It is a place where the impact of both the Wheel of Buddhism and the Cross of Christ have been felt. It is a place where Christians and Bud-

---

Dr. Paul D. Clasper is a missionary of the American Baptist Foreign Mission Society, and Vice-President of the Burma Divinity School. His article is reprinted from the *Occasional Bulletin* of the Missionary Research Library, New York, Vol. X, No. 4, May 15, 1958.

dhists mingle freely, where the Christ and the Buddha meet. *Or is it?* This is a very important question. Perhaps it would be more true to the facts to say that this is a place where the Christ and the Buddha dwell side by side, at a convenient and comfortable distance. It may be more accurate to say that Burma is not so much the *meeting* place of the two faiths, as the place where both remain in comparative isolation and maintain a relatively peaceful co-existence. The question, then, of the "encounter" in Burma really is a question!

Burmese Buddhism

It is, first of all, necessary to distinguish the type of Buddhism found in Burma from that of some other Asian countries, especially China and Japan. The Buddhism of Burma is called Theravada Buddhism, that is, the Buddhism which follows the way of the Elders. It is part of the Southern, or Conservative, School which also flourishes in Ceylon, Thailand, and Cambodia. This distinguishes it from the tradition of Mahayana Buddhism which is also known as the Northern School. The word Mahayana means, "large vehicle," and implies a broad understanding of the Buddha's teaching which will lead to an incorporation of all mankind within the fold. The West has become especially attracted to Japanese forms of Zen Buddhism with its now popular mysticism as a variant of what Aldous Huxley calls "the Perennial Philosophy." The "Pure Land" sects of Japan have also intrigued western scholars with the element of salvation by grace and through faith which many believe shows real kinship with the Christian gospel. But Theravada Buddhists look upon these Mahayana forms as heresy and believe that they have strayed far from the teachings of the Enlightened One. The Mahayana Buddhists call the Theravada Buddhists "Hinayana," those of the "small vehicle." Their conservative ways and understanding will carry only a small number across the stream of life. Theravada Buddhists repudiate the term "Hinayana," but acknowledge that theirs is the strait and narrow path, based solely on the teachings of the Lord Buddha as found in the Scriptures, the Pali Tripitaka.

Burmese Buddhists, then, pride themselves on being true to the faith "once and for all delivered." They think of themselves as conservative, scriptural, and missionary. This means that when the Burmese Theravada Buddhist encounters a Burmese Baptist Christian it is the meeting of two pietistic versions of the two faiths. This also partly explains why a real encounter is so difficult. Syncretism is less of a temptation than sheer isolation. Both groups have a firm sense that their Lord is *the* Lord; their scriptures are *the* scriptures; their traditions are the ones to be followed and there is little desire to investigate and learn from, much less copy, the other.

For instance, when an outsider suggests to a building committee of a Baptist church in Burma that the architecture might be patterned a little more after the "Burmese" styles, which means the type seen in the monasteries, the immediate reaction will be, "No, that is Buddhist, not Christian." The result will be a church a good deal more like that pictured in American periodicals. The religious tourist, seeing this, immediately ascribes it to the domination of the western missionary. But the problem is a good deal more complex than this.

Basic Buddhist Assumptions

Contemporary Theravada Buddhists believe that they have the abiding message of the Buddha in its purest form and that this alone will cure the world of its warring madness. So-called "Christian countries" have produced nothing but war and strife. The times call for a fresh and relevant proclamation of the way of the Buddha. The new World Peace Pagoda in Rangoon is a symbol of this world-wide missionary concern. The Buddhist "gospel," then, consists of a ruggedly realistic vision of this "vale of tears" and a well-defined discipline which leads to freedom from the miseries of this world and the achievement of Nirvana. The heart of this message is enshrined in the Buddha's famous Four Noble Truths and the Eightfold Path.

The first is the noble truth of suffering (*dukkha*). The world is a scene of constant suffering or trouble for all of those who have the courage to look realistically and not through the rose-tinted glasses of optimistic illusion. Birth is suffering, decay is suffering, and death is suffering. To be poor involves suffering, but to be rich involves even more subtle temptations. To be ignorant is a misery, but education produces its own perils. To be married means trouble, but to remain single means perpetual dissatisfaction. No matter what the condition or stage of life, all is impermanent and the whole is shot through with suffering.

The second noble truth describes the origin of suffering. Suffering is the result of insatiableness. Self-assertion, craving, and greed permeate all of life as we know it. The third noble truth tells of the necessity for the extinction of suffering. Nothing less than the complete fading away of this insatiable self-assertion will produce the desired end, the extinction of suffering. The achieving of this state is called Nirvana.

The fourth noble truth describes the path which leads to extinction of suffering. This Eightfold Path of discipline is a middle way between an unprofitable asceticism and a careless involvement in the world of impermanence. It consists of right understanding, right thought, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration. Thus, to tread the path to Nirvana successfully involves an intellectual grasp of the *dhamma* (doctrine), a moderately ascetic morality and a degree of mystical contemplation.

Buddhist Thought and Life

Upon this framework is reared an impressive structure of thought and life. The Abhidhamma philosophy includes a subtle psychology and a radically empirical epistemology showing many similarities to the thought of David Hume. A two-story morality for monks and laymen provides a detailed scheme for the ordinary life and the accumulating of merit which improves one's lot in future existences and moves one ever closer to Nirvana. Contemplation is a means, not an end, but as such it includes a vast panorama of methods and techniques, many stemming from ancient Hindu yogi practices.

But this is not all. In Burma, as in other Buddhist countries, this faith has amalgamated with the local "spirit worship" beliefs and customs, so that the formula for the Buddhism of Burma has been sometimes characterized as one part Buddhism and four parts "spirit worship." There is an old saying that the Burman loves the Buddha but fears the *nats* (spirits). Certainly the elements of awe, mystery, sacrifice, and expiation spring more from the "spirit worship" heritage to which the austere ethical teachings of the Buddha frequently appear as a thin veneer. The presence of both the Buddha shrine and the spirit altar in most Buddhist homes is testimony to the peaceful co-existence of these seemingly contradictory elements in the popular religion of the Burman Buddhist.

The last recorded words of the Buddha are characteristic of the basic attitude of Theravada Buddhism: "All the constituents of being are transitory; work out your salvation with diligence."[1] U Thittila, the Buddhist monk and Lecturer in Buddhist Philosophy at the University of Rangoon, describes the self-salvation of the Buddhist in the following terms: "All through the Buddha's teaching, repeated stress is laid on self-reliance and resolution. Buddhism makes man stand on his own feet, it arouses his self-confidence and energy. The Buddha again and again reminded his followers that there is no one, either in heaven or on earth, who can help them or free them from the result of their past evil deeds. 'It is through unshaken perseverance, O monks, that I have reached the light, through unceasing effort that I have reached the peace supreme. If you also, O monks, will strive unceasingly, you too will within a short time reach the highest goal of holiness by understanding and realizing it yourselves.' Understanding that neither a god nor ceremonies can help or save him, the true Buddhist finds no place for prayer; he feels compelled to rely on his own efforts and thus gains self-confidence. He sees that the tendency to rely on a god or any other imaginary power weakens man's confidence in his own power and lessens his sense of responsibility; he sees that blind faith in any authority leads to stagnation and spiritual lethargy. The Buddhist reaches his goal through perseverance in meditation rather than through prayer."[2]

The Buddhist Looks at Christianity

How, then, does the Christian gospel appear to one nurtured in the Theravada tradition? The reaction is very likely to take one of two possible forms. The Buddhist may feel that in basic essentials the religions are the same and the differences are incidental. This is frequently expressed by saying that the Buddha is Lord for Asians while Jesus Christ is Lord to the Westerner. But both religions believe in doing good, both have valuable scriptures, worthy practices, and are designed to produce good character.

But a more serious and discerning Buddhist may state the points at which he finds particular attraction or annoyance in the Christian message. The following are frequently the salient points:

1. The surety with which the Christian speaks of a personal God with whom he can have conscious fellowship leaves most Buddhists skeptical. The Buddhist may be a reverent agnostic or a more dogmatic atheist regarding the question of a personal God. Furthermore, he has been taught to look upon the belief in man's "self," as an abiding center of consciousness, as evidence of the disillusion which clings to worldly man. Ultimately there

---

[1] *Digha* XVI, 14.

[2] Quoted in *The Path of the Buddha*, edited by K. Morgan, pp. 76-77.

is no little self and no great self. This is why Buddhism is frequently described as a religion without a God and without a soul. The Buddhist wonders, then, when he hears of an I-Thou encounter, prayer as response to an Other, and salvation as a new relationship of the person to God and to other persons.

2. In a similar way, salvation as a quality of life or an experience to be realized in this existence will raise many questions in his mind. For him Nirvana is, at best, remote. This accounts for the leisureliness with which he approaches religious matters. Nirvana will not be reached in this existence nor in the one immediately following. It is likely to be innumerable existences away. But by accumulating merit through good deeds one can help to improve his lot for the future and move himself closer to the extinction of suffering.

3. The exclusive claims of Jesus Christ presented as *the* way, *the* truth and *the* life will appear to him as so much aggressive Western dogmatism, now called "cultural imperialism." This is the age-old scandal of the particular when confronting the universalism of the Oriental mind. That truth can be found in a variety of places in a variety of forms seems natural enough, but that God should choose to reveal himself especially to and through a particular people and finally at a particular time and place through a unique, historical person seems pathetically narrow.

4. The Christian belief in social service as a means of serving God will strike many modern young Burmans as a very attractive feature. In these days of the welfare state and the need to enlist responsible individuals in social service projects, the readiness of Christians who have been trained to think in these terms strikes many Buddhists as a fine thing. There is a strong tendency to seek to drain off this emphasis without getting involved with the theology of incarnation or the philosophy of history which underlies it. The attempt now to erect a welfare state upon a Buddhist base which has traditionally sought release from historical contingencies and upheld the ideal of the contemplative monk is one of the most interesting features of the present political and religious scene in Burma.

Christian Penetration in Burma

U Kyaw Than, Administrative Secretary in Southeast Asia for the World Council of Churches and the International Missionary Council, recently shocked some of the Burma Christian elders by his statement that "... among this majority of the Burmans the real presentation of the gospel had not happened as far as one can see."[3] The elders rightly felt that the presence of several hundred thousand Christians in a solidly Buddhist country did represent *some* penetration, however small. Nevertheless, U Kyaw Than's point was certainly true, that the Christian movement has made but negligible headway among the Buddhists.

What then is the situation of the Christian movement in the land of pagodas? Numerically about three per cent of the eighteen million are listed as Christians. This includes all Christian bodies. The Baptists are by far the largest denomination, numbering over 200,000 members, according to Baptist methods of calculating. The figure of three per cent, however, is apt to be misleading if taken as an indication of the range of influence of the Christian church. When one considers the high number of teachers, doctors, and professional people who are Christians and the far-reaching influence of the mission schools upon those who are still Buddhists, one can only conclude that the three per cent are a very influential minority.

---

[3] *International Review of Missions,* April 1958, p. 156.

Among the Christian three per cent over half are Karens, the largest minority group in Burma and the traditional rival of the Burman. Most of the rest come from the various hill tribes of Northern Burma — the Kachins, Chins, Lahus, etc.

It is when one looks at the figures representing the Burman Buddhist background Christians that one realizes how slow has been the penetration among the major group of the land. The Burma Baptist Churches Union includes the largest group of so-called "Burman" Christians, and it numbers about 5,000 members after roughly 140 years of activity. The usual figure given is that from the Burman Buddhist background people one out of one thousand is a Christian. Actually, this is a very generous estimate. The true picture is even more startling, probably about one out of every fifteen hundred.

This breakdown helps to explain why the Burman Buddhist continues to feel that Christianity is not for him. One time, in the home of a Buddhist friend a rustic visitor asked the host who I was. The reply was that I was a Christian "monk." To this the Buddhist asked, "What is a Christian?" Looking a bit embarrassed, my genial host answered the rustic by saying that Christianity was the religion of Americans and Karens. This is the emotional equivalent of saying that it is the religion of the people on the other side of the world, and those on the other side of the tracks!

The Planted Seed

U Ba Hmyin, the very able Yale-trained Secretary of the Burma Baptist Churches Union, thinks that "confrontation" or "encounter" may be poor words to describe what is or what will take place. He prefers to think that the potent seed of the gospel has been planted in the life and culture of Buddhist Burma and that it cannot be eradicated. However small the seed may be, its influence has already been felt and even the most exclusive Buddhist must take cognizance of this fact, especially when he considers the question of education for his own children. No one cares to dogmatize as to the future, but that the seed has already taken root and will continue to grow is the sure faith of many Burman Christians.

This surely is in line with the chastened hope of Adoniram Judson who did so much to plant the seed. Knowing the near impossibility of the Burman Buddhist becoming a Christian, Judson said, in a typical Burmese sentence, that it is more difficult for a Burman to become a Christian that it is to extract a tooth from a tiger's mouth. Still, he spoke confidently of the day when the gleaming pagodas which stud the hillsides of Burma would be changed to the steeples of Christian churches. When asked what he thought about the prospects for the conversion of Burma his answer revealed as much sober realism as it did faith and hope: "The future is as bright as the promises of God."

"Foreignness" of Christianity

This leads to the important question as to where the Christian mission now stands with reference to an encounter with Buddhism in Burma.

The immediate fact which faces the Christian church is that in a new, independent Burma it appears to the Buddhist as a reminder, and the most sinister one at that, of the Westernization that was imposed upon Burma during the days of colonialism. As Hendrik Kraemer puts it in his recent *Religion and the Christian Faith*: "To the economic and political 'invasion' they had to submit, but in the cultural and spiritual sphere they could resist, but were deeply wounded by the pretension of racial and cultural superiority made by the white domination. Christian missions were also looked upon as part of this western 'invasion' of their cultural and spiritual realm; and there were many reasons for this being so."[4]

But with the ousting of the British and the achievement of independence a new situation arose. In many ways there is a new openness to things Western. British and Americans are invited by the hundreds to lend their technical assistance to a so-called "backward" people. Western technology is welcomed with no thought of cultural pretension, but the rise of nationalism has included the revival of Buddhism. The government takes an active part in the revival and gives of its resources to the propagation of the ancestral faith. Since this is the case, it hardly seems consistent to encourage the presence of Western missionaries whose aim is to propagate an alien faith. The Christian movement is viewed then as a remnant of the colonial era and national Christians, while often appreciated as individuals, are looked upon as those who have given allegiance to a foreign faith and, therefore, are not really assimilated to Burman Buddhist culture.

In the face of this charge of "foreignness," Christians have frequently not wanted, or have not been able, to propagate the gospel aggressively. Many have thought of this as a time of proving their loyalty to Burma, nurturing their own believers and waiting for the next turn of events. The more recent Karen insurrection has cast its shadow over all Christian activities. The result has been the temptation for Christians to live a ghetto existence with isolation being more of a characteristic than encounter.

But the charge of the "foreignness" of the Christian movement can no longer stand the test of honest examination. During the war Christians demonstrated their ability not only to endure but actually to make significant advances without the help of foreign money or personnel. The Burma Baptist Convention, the nationally operated body, has supplanted the American Baptist Mission in fact as well as in name. The degree of self-support and Burma-initiated missionary activity usually comes as a great surprise to Buddhists who learn the actual facts. The Christian movement then is not a foreign-directed or dominated enterprise; it is rooted in the soil of the land.

The Future of the Church

The church life of the period immediately ahead will differ greatly from the church life of the pre-war "Mission Society" period. Just what form it will take remains to be seen. This is definitely a time of rapid transition from one era to another in the church in Burma. The pessimists look forward to a time of great "sloppiness" as nationals assume leadership of institutions and programs which they did not originate. The sentimentalists look forward to an era in which all problems will be solved easily or will not exist because the missionary is no longer able to confuse matters as in the past. What can be safely said is that in this time of transition "Little David" will likely throw off much of the armor which has been handed him and will prefer to face the situation in his own way, with his own methods. But the new era in the church will definitely be a national era. This means that the forthcoming encounter in Burma will not be between Burman Buddhists and American missionaries or denationalized Christians. It will be a meeting of loyal Burmans who are Buddhists and loyal Burmans who are Christians, each being a true representative of a faith which claims to be a world, not a provincial faith.

---

[4] Hendrik Kraemer, *Religion and the Christian Faith*, p. 26.

From a variety of informed sources there are prophecies that a period of real meeting is just ahead for these two great ways of life. No longer will isolation be possible as in the past. Each will have to take cognizance of the other, and this encounter will open up a whole new era in the relationship of Christianity to the non-Christian religions and in the relationship of East and West. Arnold Toynbee in his Gifford Lectures has forecast: "In the next chapter (of history) we may expect to see all the now surviving faiths continue to hold the field side by side and continue to divide the allegiance of mankind between them. But we may also expect to see the individual's adherence to a particular faith determined, in an ever larger number of instances, not by the geographical accident of the locality of his birthplace, but by a deliberate choice of the faith with which he feels the closest personal affinity — a feeling that will, presumably, be determined by the type of his psychological organization and orientation. The adherents of each religion thus seem likely, in the next chapter, to come gradually to be distributed all over the *oikoumene*, but it may also be expected that, in the process, they will come to be intermingled everywhere with adherents of all the other faiths, as the Jews are already intermingled with Muslims and Christians and the Parsees with Muslims and Hindus. As a result, the appearance of the religious map of the *oikoumene* may be expected to change from the pattern of a patchwork quilt to the texture of a piece of shot silk."[5]

Hendrik Kraemer has summed up the situation in the following words: "In regard to the contemporary non-Christian religions, the main remark to be made in this context is that for the first time since the Constantine victory in A.D. 312 and its consequences the Christian church is heading toward a real and spiritual encounter with the great non-Christian religions. Not only because the so-called younger churches, the fruits of the work of modern missions, live in the midst of them, but also because the fast-growing interdependence of the whole world forces the existence and vitality of these religions upon us, and makes them a challenge to the church to manifest in new terms its spiritual and intellectual integrity and value."[6]

There are many reasons to feel that

---

[5] Arnold Toynbee, *An Historian's Approach to Religion*, pp. 138-139.

[6] Kraemer, *op. cit.*, p. 20.

Burma will become the scene of a significant encounter between these two faiths.

Challenges to Buddhism

If, instead of passing each other at a convenient distance as ships in the night, a genuine encounter is in the offing, what then are some of the challenges which each faith must meet? If both are drawn sufficiently out of their pietistic isolation to engage in genuine give-and-take, it might well cause some serious modification of both faiths. It might also mean that both would be enriched rather than either one driving the other from the field.

Buddhists might be forced to give the matter of the I-Thou symbolism a second thought. Instead of so quickly dismissing this as illusion, they might really be called to face the question of whether this analogy does really refer to a significant aspect of reality. The Christian belief that "there is mercy with the Lord" and that the ultimate ground of the universe is gracious and redeeming and has been revealed historically in a Person might just contain some truth, and it may turn out to be significant. But to face up to this as a possibility worth examining would call for a genuine shedding of the conservative dogmatism which refuses to recognize any significant differences between Buddhism and Christianity. If something worth knowing is found outside of my books and traditions, then the pride which insists that I do not look is really a damning thing. Spiritual pride is equally damning whether found in a Baptist Christian or a Theravada Buddhist.

Buddhists will also have to face the question of the kind and degree of adjustment of their ancient faith to the pressures of the modern world. The case of the traditional world-denying ascetic morality being an adequate base for a modern welfare state has already been indicated. To be sure, taking a long look at India's religious development, the contribution of the Buddha can be seen, as Albert Schweitzer has pointed out,[7] to be in the direction of a modification of extreme asceticism in the direction of world-affirmation. The founder, then, can rightly be appealed to as one who was capable of challenging and modifying a well-established tradition in the light of new demands. Still, the conservatism of the Theravada tradition has resulted more in an attempt to preserve the teaching and customs of the founder rather than to maintain his prophetic spirit in relation to changing conditions. The fact that the religions of science and Marxism are the live options for university students should also give pause to Buddhists who desire that the ancient faith appear relevant to a modern revolutionary society.

Challenges to Christianity

But the encounter, if genuine, should also give Christians ample reason for heart searching. The underlying assumption of Christians is that they have everything to give and nothing to receive. It may well be that Christians have much to give, but a failure to recognize the possible need for listening and learning as well as preaching and testifying may indicate a paralyzing lack of openness and spiritual pride, as much as apostolic fervor. Christianity at its most catholic and missionary best has always been a learning and listening faith as well as a proclaiming faith. Its ability to appreciate, baptize, use, and conserve elements taken from the faiths it touches is one of the strongest elements in its claim to finality and uniqueness.

---

[7] Albert Schweitzer, *Indian Thought and Its Development.*

Burmese Christians, then, will be called upon to face squarely this particular variant of "the Oriental mind" and will be challenged to see if they can learn as well as give. Even the consciousness of the impersonal may be found to be a valuable corrective against a sentimental and naïve personalism, which does more to obscure than recommend the faith to Orientals. Baron F. von Hugel was convinced that the scientific method when appropriated by Christians could act as "purifying, enlarging, purgatorial waters" to deprovincialize the petty, selfish, shouting individual. This, in turn, would lead to a chastened and more mature appreciation of the personal.[8] It may well be that the contact with the genuine, perhaps God-given insights of Oriental religion, will perform a similar function for Christians and lead them to a more robust personalism.

In a similar way Christians may be challenged to a new appreciation of the mystical element which is not completely alien to the Christian faith, but which is certainly underdeveloped in its Burma Baptist expression. In a country where a place for meditation is provided in every village and where techniques of meditation have been developed with the tenacity and exactness of a science, Christians do not seem to have developed the prayer-meditation aspect of Christian devotion with any intensity or originality. More like their American counterparts, they are rich in organization men (Association Secretaries) and salesmen (evangelists). But Burmese Christians, if related to their Asian heritage, ought to be expected in the course of the years to produce those more skilled in prayer, contemplation, retreats, and the life of disciplined devotion. A genuine encounter with Buddhism might lead to a deeper realization of this need, while growth in this area might actually help produce a better bridge from Christians to Buddhists.

The Role of the Missionary

A final word may now be said as to the place of the American missionary in the Buddhist-Christian encounter in Burma. Contrary to much American opinion, the chief subject of conversation among missionaries is not the weather, the current salary scale or even Board policies. The most frequent subject is, "Do we have any business being here now, and if so, what is our role?"

In a day when Burmese Christians are seeking to show that Christianity is not tied to Western culture the continuing presence of the Western missionary may seem to deny in practice what he proclaims in theory. To be sure, the missionary no longer occupies the saddle. He comes at the invitation of the national body, works under the direction of its personnel committee with national leaders, and can be returned whenever the national body thinks his absence would contribute more than his presence.

Still, the missionary wonders about his present place. When is he really more of a hindrance than a help? In what ways can he help the young church to help itself without obstructing the process by which the members learn through their own trial-and-error experiments?

---

[8] Baron F. von Hugel, *The Mystical Element of Religion*, Vol. I, p. 41.

In what ways can he help to make the future encounter with Buddhism a high-level, rather than a low-level, encounter? These are some of the questions with which he is always wrestling.

If the voice of the national Christians can be trusted in this matter, then they give every evidence that missionaries are still valuable helpers in the life of the young churches. But they insist that it is missionaries of a certain type, who are willing to work under certain conditions. The Indian Lutheran Bishop, Rajah Manikam, has expressed the general feeling of Asian Christian leaders in this regard when he said: "The important question is not whether missionaries are required or not, but what *kind* of missionaries are required in the East today? The day is practically gone for the missionary of a previous generation or two who was a superintendent, a director, a boss. The day has now dawned for the missionary who is the friend, philosopher, and guide of a young church, who is willing to get behind the cart and push it along rather than pull it from the front. It takes a greater measure of of God's grace to play the humbler role. Men and women who believe in indigenous leadership will never be rejected. Men who can live out with the East God's answer to a divided world are needed badly. Do not send to the East missionaries who will look at each other critically over denominational walls. What is needed is the kind of Christians who, while valuing their own heritage, are determined not to perpetuate those divisions which, whatever they may mean to western Christendom, have far less relevance in the eastern context. There is but one Lord, one faith, one baptism, one God and Father of us all."[9]

---

[9] Rajah Manikam, "A New Era in the World Mission of the Church," *Union Seminary Quarterly Review*, Nov. 1957, p. 34.

Have You Received All Your Numbers of PA?

Practical Anthropology is printed in Mexico and mailed to more than thirty countries scattered over the face of the globe. Many of our subscribers travel widely and it is hard for us to keep up with them. Occasionally a subscriber may receive one issue in the U.S., the next few in France, and others in Africa. That is, he will receive them if he keeps us informed as to his changes of address.

We should have said he *may* receive them, because the handling of international mails can be, and often is, very erratic.

We do not want you to miss a number of Practical Anthropology. Please try to keep us informed as to your changes of address; and if you have missed any numbers of our magazine, let us know and we will send duplicates. Write to Practical Anthropology, Box 307, Tarrytown, N.Y., U.S.A.

David L. Hamm and Batua A. Macaraya

Acculturation Survey of the Dansalan Junior College

One of the important problems of missionary communication on any level is the need to know what is being understood by the teaching or preaching, and what influence the message is having upon people's thinking and attitudes. Sometimes there are overt responses which can be interpreted, and which give a clue to what is getting across. The authors of this article devised a questionnaire by which they feel that they measured something of the degree of influence which mission schooling has had on two classes of Filipino students.

A PRIMARY necessity in dealing with acculturation (the assimilation of new cultural elements borrowed from the outside) is an effort to determine the degree of acculturation of students who come to our schools, and to attempt the measurement of the change in attitudes which is effected by the school program. Accordingly, a questionnaire was prepared for the students in Marawi City, Philippines. It is proposed that these questions will be given in at least one other school and, in translation, to a group of persons of relatively small educational attainment. This report is concerned with the results of the survey as it measures attitudes of the first year and fourth year secondary level students at the Dansalan Junior College.[1]

The questions were prepared in the form of a test known to the students as "multiple choice." A small "story" was provided with three, four, or five action endings. The students were asked to choose the action which would seem to them to be the most appropriate. The stories were in four groups. (1) Three stories were prepared to measure the extent to which the students felt it reasonable to appeal to Philippine law as over and against the use of older extra-legal methods of settling disputes. (2) A second series attempted to measure the changes that take place in the students' thinking about marriage and divorce. This proved a difficult area to approach. (3) Three questions attempted to test their attitude when the cultural situation causes tension between honesty and group loyalty, which is an ethical

---

[1] With respect to the methods employed in this survey, we would like to acknowledge the help given by Dr. Charles Warriner, Associate Professor of Sociology, University of Kansas, whose consultation saved a good deal of labor.

David L. Hamm is a missionary of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, having served two terms in Marawi City, Philippines. Batua A. Macaraya is Acting Director of the Dansalan Junior College.

problem in some ways more related to Christianity than some of the other problems. (4) There were three questions involving the reaction to the need for medical attention.

The answers were tabulated on a five-point scale and the possible responses were set into the following scheme of categories: (I) traditional response which would correspond with the elements of Islam and the underlying cultural heritage of the group; (II) modified traditional response; (III) a neutral response; (IV) modified acculturated response; (V) acculturated response.

For purposes of this report we will deal with the tabulation of those answers made by the first year and fourth year groups, dividing each of these groups into Muslim and non-Muslim students. Many but not all of the non-Muslim group are Protestant young people in Marawi City. Table One shows the distribution of the answers given by ninety first-year students and forty-one fourth-year students. The number of responses in each category is given with the percentage figures. These figures indicate that the responses of both the first and fourth year groups tend to be rather more strongly in the new culture categories than in the old. This fact is further brought out if the percentages are compared, combining categories I and II into one figure and categories IV and V into one figure. This tabulation is shown in Table Two. In the first-year group more than 50 percent gave a response which indicates orientation away from the old cultural patterns even among the Muslim group. This tabulation may be useful for comparative purposes as we examine the data.

TABLE TWO

1st year	I and II	IV and V
Muslim	349 (36.8%)	487 (51.5%)
non-Muslim	33 (25.1%)	88 (66.6%)
Total	382 (35.2%)	575 (53.2%)
4th year		
Muslim	84 (23.3%)	260 (72.3%)
non-Muslim	12 (9%)	117 (88.7%)
Total	96 (19.5%)	377 (76.6%)

Law and Order

For purposes of presentation of the questionnaire to the students, the order of the stories was mixed and the possible responses were also scrambled, so that the numbering used here is for convenience in reporting.[2] The three situations involving cooperation with the agencies

TABLE ONE

1st year	O No answer	I Traditional	II Modified Traditional	III Neutral	IV Modified Acculturated	V Acculturated
Muslim	48 (5%)	163 (17.2%)	186 (19.6%)	64 (6.7%)	104 (11%)	383 (40.5%)
non-Muslim	7 (5.2%)	13 (9.9%)	20 (15.3%)	4 (3%)	18 (13.6%)	70 (53%)
Total	55 (5%)	176 (16.2%)	206 (19%)	68 (6.6%)	122 (11.2%)	453 (42%)
4th year						
Muslim	0	29 (8%)	55 (15.3%)	16 (4.4%)	51 (14.1%)	209 (58.2%)
non-Muslim	0	6 (4.5%)	6 (4.5%)	3 (2.3%)	10 (7.7%)	107 (81%)
Total	0	35 (7.1%)	61 (12.4%)	19 (3.9%)	61 (12.4%)	316 (64.2%)

---

[2] The order of presentation to the students may be determined from the numbers and letters in parentheses after each heading or question in the following discussion.

of the law were a murder case, a land case, and a case of water buffalo rustling. The following are the questions involving law and order:

1. *Murder Case (1).* Two brothers and their friend, who was a Muslim Holy Man, were returing to their village when the enemy of Older Brother jumped out of the bushes and stabbed him. Older Brother struggled for a while and died. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (B) Younger Brother went after the enemy and killed him. II (C) Younger Brother called the head men and informed them. V (A) Younger Brother took Holy Man with him as a witness and reported the incident to the constabulary. O No answer (blank).

First-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	7 (8.8%)	1 (9.1%)
II	27 (34.5%)	1 (9.1%)
V	44 (55.5%)	9 (81.8%)
O	1 (1.2%)	0

Fourth-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	1 (3.3%)	0
II	8 (26.7%)	2 (18.2%)
V	21 (70%)	9 (81.8%)
O	0	0

The expected response in the Maranao culture (Response I) would be that Younger Brother would go after the enemy. Where the issues are clear, the head men would then declare the situation as being satisfied if the enemy were killed. The case would be closed. The percentage of answers involving reporting the incident to the constabulary, therefore, was quite high for the first and fourth years. The non-Muslim does not show the appreciable shift between the first and fourth year that the Muslim group does.

2. *Land Case (6).* Farmer had a land case against Coffee Grower in which he was seeking to retain possession of his inheritance, because Coffee Grower obtained title through false means. The court decided in favor of Coffee Grower. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (B) Farmer attacked Coffee Grower to scare him out of the case. II (A) Farmer went to the head men for help to protect his property against Coffee Grower's occupation. IV (D) Farmer called the head men and with them went to the governor. V (C) Farmer appealed the decision to a higher court. O No answer (blank).

First-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	12 (15.2%)	1 (9.1%)
II	32 (40.5%)	4 (36.3%)
IV	17 (21.5%)	3 (27.3%)
V	14 (17.8%)	3 (27.3%)
O	4 (5%)	0

Fourth-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	0	1 (9.1%)
II	6 (20%)	0
IV	5 (16.5%)	1 (9.1%)
V	19 (63.5%)	9 (81.8%)
O	0	0

The second case involving land requires for a category V response a rather high confidence in the courts of the land, since it involves an appeal of a case already decided. It is therefore not surprising to find a much lower percentage of the group making a choice in category V. The choice in category IV which received a higher response from the first year students is that involving a representation to the governor. This is definitely a modification of the new culture situation, since the governor is an official in the Philippine legal sense. It represents a common modification. The governor, deputy governors, and town mayors frequently act as intermediaries in disputes, sometimes in cases that are already in the courts. In terms of the degree of acculturation this would indicate a shift in authority from the traditional rulers and head men to the mayor and district official complex. The first year group shows the defiant attitude for protecting the property against the order of the court. On this question it seems to us that we have the most significant shifting of attitude between the first and fourth years.

3. *Cattle Rustling Case (9).* The water buffalo of Rancher was stolen from his ranch in Bayang. He suspected Strongman was the thief. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (C) Rancher made sure it was Strongman before he took property for revenge. II (A) Rancher notified several ranking head men of the loss and asked them to negotiate for the return of his water buffalo. V (B) Rancher reported to the Philippine Constabulary and asked for help in regaining his property. O No answer (blank).

	First-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	15 (19%)	2 (18.2%)
II	26 (33%)	2 (18.2%)
V	36 (45.5%)	6 (54.5%)
O	2 (2.5%)	1 (9.1%)

	Fourth-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	7 (23.4%)	2 (18.2%)
II	10 (33.3%)	0
V	13 (43.3%)	9 (81.8%)
O	0	0

The third question seems to set us back on our heels because in acculturation terms it shows regression from the first to the fourth years. Cattle rustling is a serious offense. Two things about the preparation of this story complicate the response. In all the other instances we deleted specific place names. Moreover, we asked the students to consider the questions as though they occurred in their own place. It is quite evident that the response we have here is an exception to that rule. Bayang is one of the most remote of the municipal districts bordering Lake Lanao. There are constabulary detachments in Ganassi and Lumbatan on either side, but the road connection with Lumbatan is practically non-existent. The response may indicate that the constabulary cannot operate effectively in Bayang. Response I is not a very well-worded response. It would, of course, constitute a strong temptation in any culture for one to take revenge against a known offender. Considering these facts it seems likely that we have quite a reasonable reaction from the students. It is likely that some of the ethical dimensions involved were apparent to the fourth-year students but not the first-year students. The non-Muslim group answered in more or less the same way. The first-year and fourth-year groups of non-Muslims treated the question more abstractly.

Marriage and Divorce

In this general area we selected three situations which reveal tension between cultural values: the desire of students for educated spouses, the possibility of registering marriages as an indication of acceptance of Philippine law, and a situation involving divorce.

4. *Educated Wife (2).* Fourth-Year Student wanted an educated wife, and so he started to court his classmate. His relatives did not think she would make a good wife for him. They suggested that Student marry a girl from his home place who had two grades of schooling. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (B) He did as his parents desired, and married the girl from his home place. II (A) He refused his parents and said he would not marry yet. IV (D) He and his classmate

decided to "live together" so that when the baby was born the parents would be forced to agree. V (C) He refused his parents and asked them to select an "elementary graduate" or "better educated" girl for him. O No answer (blank).

First-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	26 (33%)	0
II	19 (24%)	3 (27.3%)
IV	2 (2.5%)	3 (27.3%)
V	29 (36.5%)	5 (45.4%)
O	3 (4%)	0

Fourth-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	5 (16.7%)	1 (9.1%)
II	9 (30%)	1 (9.1%)
IV	3 (10%)	3 (27.3%)
V	13 (43.3%)	6 (54.5%)
O	0	0

The issue is the conflict of the student's desire for an educated wife as over and against his duty to his parents. It was felt that the desire to have an educated wife indicates a strong desire to incorporate new culture values into living. It is commonly felt that educated boys have a hard time marrying the girls from back home, or else they simply revert completely to the old culture patterns. In this series of responses there is a question about which of the responses constitutes the greatest shift. Answer IV (D) would appear to be a more complete defiance of the parental rule than C (V). However, it is more outside of the institutionalized norms of the Maranao community than of the non-Maranao community. We therefore classify this as modification. It certainly is a modification if we think of the new culture in terms of the legal apparatus. There is, of course, a strong question as to whether or not the "no divorce" laws actually function satisfactorily in the Philippines; whether they institutionalize adequately the cultural values. Response II (A) indicates a modification of Maranao culture under pressure. The culture has been sufficiently fluid in recent years that it has not been expected of all young people that they simply do as their parents request in this matter. There is much more flexibility, especially with regards to the woman's place, than is commonly supposed. The indications are, then, that there is a considerable shift in the direction of the insistence upon educated wives. The significant figures for comparison are in Category I. Thirty-three percent of the first year students selected the old cultural response and only 16.7% of the fourth year students selected that response.

5. *Registration of Marriage (10).* A young man, Farmer, very much wanted to marry a neighbor in his community, Lady Weaver. She accepted his courtship, and the relatives approved the match, and all the arrangements that should be made before the marriage were finished. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (B) The couple were married by the local religious leader but did not register the marriage. III (C) The couple lived together. V (A) The couple were married by the religious leader and the marriage was registered with the government. O No answer (blank).

First-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	14 (17.8%)	2 (18.2%)
III	20 (25%)	0
V	38 (48.2%)	7 (63.6%)
O	7 (9%)	2 (18.2%)

Fourth-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	3 (10%)	0
III	2 (6.5%)	2 (18.2%)
V	25 (83.5%)	9 (81.8%)
O	0	0

The issue is the registration of the marriage and has to do with the use of the Philippine legal forms particularly as these are understood to be deterrent to divorce. The C response, which would probably be regarded by the Maranao group as a kind of betrothal situation, could perhaps be appropriately in category II or even category I. It would certainly indicate that the distinctions about registration or non-registration would mean little. The answer that we get shows an increasing appreciation of the form of registration as having cultural value, though the story here is not stated in a way to indicate as much as might be desired with regards to divorce.

6. *Divorce (12).* Since their marriage, Housewife and Husband were frequently quarreling and fighting, although they really loved each other. In one quarrel, Housewife got a black eye and Husband got a dislocated arm. Housewife went to her parents. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (A) Housewife with her parents' help got the husband to divorce her. II (C) Housewife asked her parents' help in requiring Husband to pay a penalty of not less than $50.00. III (B) Housewife asked the parents to call the head men together. V (D) Housewife goes back to her husband to be reconciled with mutual promises of adjustment. O No answer (blank).

First-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	18 (22.75%)	1 (9.1%)
II	20 (25%)	1 (9.1%)
III	14 (18%)	1 (9.1%)
V	25 (31.75%)	7 (63.6%)
O	2 (2.5%)	1 (9.1%)

Fourth-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	2 (6.5%)	0
II	4 (13.3%)	0
III	8 (26.7%)	1 (9.1%)
V	16 (53.5%)	10 (90.9%)
O	0	0

Question 6 is specifically aimed to measure the attitudes to divorce. There are several things involved, though we sought to make divorce the important one. The methods in the old culture in dealing with the quarrel situation would tend in the direction of solution I (A), for the wife to go to her parents and get divorced. Response II (C), which is set quite strongly in the Maranao cultural situation, would penalize both Housewife and Husband because the husband would be required to get the money, but the parents of his wife and her relatives would receive it. Response III (B) is set pretty much within the Maranao cultural complex but it leaves the issue somewhat open and for that reason we classify it as neutral. Response V (D) would, we believe, indicate a change of attitude from the Muslim cultural situation inasmuch as it would place a higher value on the continuity of the marriage than is ordinary. This would, of course, be the most Christian response. This question received a rather high percentage of what we have classified as neutral responses and perhaps the question arises as to whether that relatively passive resolution of the situation should have been included. However, it is to be noted that between the first and fourth year groups there is a very marked shift from the I (A) and II (C) responses toward the III (B) and V (D) responses.

The young people answering are many of them in the marriageable age bracket. A further analysis shows that of the 26 Muslim girls in the first-year group, 35% selected category I, the same percentage as selected category V; 19%

selected III. The Muslim fourth-year girls conformed to the school answer pattern, 66.7% selecting category V, the reconciliation solution.

Honesty vs. Loyalty

The three questions involving the problem of honesty as over against some type of loyalty put special emphasis in each case on the kinship. The moral problem in the nation is illustrated by the case of Senator Cuenco and the move against him involving loyalty to the Nationalist Party. The situations are as follows:

7. *Kerosene Sale (3)*. Merchant bought kerosene from Wholesaler, a Chinese. When the time came to pay, Merchant changed the price and tried to pay a lower price than agreed upon. The associate of Merchant is his townmate, Seller, who was present at the making of the original agreement. Seller was called by the court to be a witness. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (C) Seller testified that his townmate was right. II (A) Seller refused to testify. IV (D) Seller called the mayor to make an amicable settlement. V (B) Seller testified to the truth in spite of the adverse effect it had on his townmate, Merchant. O No answer (blank).

	First-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	21 (26.5%)	0
II	3 (3.8%)	0
IV	24 (30.5%)	6 (54.6%)
V	27 (34.2%)	4 (36.3%)
O	4 (5%)	1 (9.1%)

	Fourth-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	5 (16.7%)	1 (9.1%)
II	1 (3.3%)	0
IV	15 (50%)	1 (9.1%)
V	9 (30%)	9 (81.8%)
O	0	0

In story 7, the group loyalty would probably involve kinship in the Maranao community, inasmuch as one would almost certainly be related to practically everybody in the barrio or municipal district in which one lives. The English term "townmate" would reflect a kind of relationship anywhere in the Philippines and for that reason it was chosen rather than the term "relative." It was intended that the relationship here should be more tenuous than in question 9 where it is indicated as that of cousins. Again, in question 9 the relationship is not as close as American speakers of English might think, since cousin means a considerable number of degrees of relationships.

8. *School Examination (5)*. Fourth-Year Student knew he would have to pass English to graduate. He had 70's in the first, third and fourth grading periods, and 75's in the second and fifth grading periods. He needed a 75 in order to pass. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (B) He prepared his notes so that he could put them under his legs and look at them during the examination. II (A) He took a chicken as a present to the director asking him to influence the teacher. IIa (C) He took the test without extra effort, and pleaded with the teacher to give him a passing grade. V (D) He studied hard for the test, asking help from the teacher. O No answer (blank).

	First-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	10 (12.6%)	1 (9.1%)
II	4 (5.1%)	1 (9.1%)
IIa	6 (7.6%)	3 (27.3%)
V	54 (68.4%)	6 (54.5%)
O	5 (6.3%)	0

	Fourth-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	0	0
II	1 (3.3%)	0

IIa	1 (3.3%)	0
V	28 (93.4%)	11 (100%)
O	0	0

9. *Fraud (8).* Clerk, who worked in a government office, bought a bracelet for wife from Goldsmith. It was mostly silver but Goldsmith said it was solid gold. Goldsmith's Cousin was in the shop when the sale was made and knew that Goldsmith was cheating Clerk. Several weeks later Clerk discovered the fraud and called the head men to help him get his money back. He named Cousin as his witness. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (D) Goldsmith's Cousin testified in favor of Goldsmith against Clerk. II (A) Goldsmith's Cousin refused to testify. IV (C) Goldsmith's Cousin urged Goldsmith to return the money and get the bracelet but refused to testify. V (B) Goldsmith's Cousin testified against Goldsmith. O No answer (blank).

	First-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	22 (28%)	1 (9.1%)
II	4 (5%)	0
IV	41 (52%)	4 (36.3%)
V	10 (12.5%)	5 (45.5%)
O	2 (2.5%)	1 (9.1%)

	Fourth-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	2 (6.5%)	0
II	0	0
IV	20 (67%)	3 (27.3%)
V	8 (26.5%)	8 (72.7%)
O	0	0

In question 8 the group loyalty would be the family or kinship group who would be expecting each student to graduate. Failure would be a reflection on the group. The case of the kerosene sale (7) involves again a situation where, from the point of view of ethics, the better result might be category IV than V, although V involves most complete acceptance of the Philippine Westernized modes of dealing with ethical problems. The amicable settlement, as was noted above, is an in-between system which involves settlement out of court. It is probably as good from a Christian point of view as the other.

Question 8 is the one in which we might expect the highest degree of influence of the school situation on the students. These responses indicate that within the school situation students are carried farthest out of the context on which loyalty to the group predominates. However, the category V response can be considered as loyalty to a new group.

In situation 9, there are parallels with 7. In both cases we have a high percentage of responses in categories IV and V, with the question raised as to which of these two is really most desirable. In situation 8, involving school examinations, it is to be noted that we classified all responses except one as either old culture or modification of it. Response category I, which was desirable to a group of our first-year students, involves misconduct in terms of school norms and this fact is, of course, registered in the responses of the fourth-year group, none of whom checked it.

In this area of social relationships we find a higher degree of response in category IV and V, and most of the responses in the other categories are in part due to the fact that modern changes of Islam constitute a pressure more in the direction of what we consider to be Christian responses. It should be here stated that there are movements in the area tending toward a better level of Muslim ethics than was current before.

In question 7, besides having the problem of group loyalty, we have also the problem of the place of Philippine legal apparatus inasmuch as the case is a court case and cooperation with the courts is involved. We have here what indicates honesty but unwillingness to carry it to the court. The difference between our first- and fourth-year groups is an increased desire to achieve an amicable settlement, but actually a less cooperative spirit on the part of the fourth-year group. The question may be raised as to whether the first-year students were confused with the English that so many of them advocated false testimony. The results here indicate that loyalty *vs.* honesty constitutes a real source of tension. Christianity stresses truth in more absolute terms than Islam does.

Medicine

The fourth type of situation in which the values of the Maranao culture complex in particular and some of the older cultural patterns in the Philippines generally, come into conflict with modern culture are in the field of medicine. We are justified in calling this modern because the development of medical practice is a relatively recent phenomenon. We used three situations involving three types of medical need: illness, a delivery case, and a wound. They are as follows:

10. *Illness with fever (4).* Fisherman, a middle-aged man from a village on the shore of the lake, came home from his day on the lake with a very high fever, having a headache and feeling very weak. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (D) He pleaded with the ancestors and guardian spirits, and killed an animal to please them. II (A) He sent for the local Medicine Man to treat him. IIa (E) He saused evil-driving portions of the Koran or other writings to be read to cure him. III (C) He contented himself with self and family medication. V (B) He went to the hospital to be treated. O No answer (blank).

	First-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	6 (7.5%)	2 (18.2%)
II	10 (12.6%)	0
IIa	9 (11.4%)	0
III	9 (11.4%)	1 (9.1%)
V	40 (50.5%)	7 (63.6%)
O	0	1 (9.1%)

	Fourth-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	1 (3.3%)	0
II	3 (10%)	2 (18.2%)
IIa	4 (13.2%)	0
III	3 (10%)	0
V	19 (63.5%)	9 (81.8%)
O	0	0

11. *Childbirth (7).* Young Wife was in travail with her first child. The child started to come out feet first. The local midwife was having trouble delivering the child. *Which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (E) They let the local midwife continue and killed an animal as an offering to the guardian spirits. II (C) They called the best medicine man. III (B) They let the local midwife continue. IV (A) The father went immediately to get an experienced licensed midwife who was well known in the community. V (D) They took Young Wife to the hospital. O No answer (blank).

	First-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	1 (1.3%)	0
II	13 (16.5%)	0
III	10 (12.6%)	2 (18.2%)
IV	20 (25%)	2 (18.2%)
V	28 (35.6%)	7 (63.6%)
O	7 (9%)	0

	Fourth-year	
	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	1 (3.3%)	1 (9.1%)
II	5 (16.5%)	0
III	1 (3.3%)	0
IV	7 (23.3%)	2 (18.2%)
V	16 (53.6%)	8 (72.7%)
O	0	0

12. *Wound (11)* While chopping a board for a door panel, Carpenter slashed

a deep wound six inches long in his leg. He held his leg to try to stop the blood at first. Then, *which of the following actions do you think is best?* I (A) He caused curing portions of the Koran or other writings to be read, to cure him. II (D) He sent for the local medicine man to treat him. III (C) He contented himself with what he and his family were able to do. V (B) He sent his son to get the physician, who treated the wound. O No answer (blank).

First-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	11 (14%)	2 (18.3%)
II	13 (16.5%)	4 (36.3%)
III	11 (14%)	0
V	38 (48%)	4 (36.3%)
O	6 (7.5%)	1 (9.1%)

Fourth-year

	Muslim	non-Muslim
I	2 (6.5%)	0
II	3 (10%)	1 (9.1%)
III	2 (6.5%)	0
V	23 (77%)	10 (90.9%)
O	0	0

The types of responses provided represent some estimate of what might be expected in the community at large, and the range of responses checked by the student group indicate that the possibilities are by no means fanciful. Here we are somewhat at a loss to provide modified modern responses. We find illness and wound cases are those in which there is a higher degree of confidence in modern medical practice. The shift between the first and fourth-year groups is most noticeable in the case of the wound where there appears to be recognition that the hospital can do things that the older medicine men cannot. The delivery case is a little complicated by the fact that here again categories IV and V tend to merge. Many of our students are aware of the activities of our school nurse who has been carrying on a midwifery practice in the area for many years. She is highly regarded, a fact we knew when we phrased these responses to the situation. If we combine the number of responses to categories IV and V on question 11, we find that there is a high degree of acculturation indicated. The first-year students answered in these two categories 60.6% of the time, and the fourth-year students 76.9%.

General Observations

The total questionnaire involves 25 possibilities for response in an old culture way and only 17 possibilities of response in a new culture way. If we look back to the tabulation of totals, we find an indication that, in spite of this fact in favor of the old culture, the student responses are over 50% new culture responses when they arrive at the high school level. This proportion of the responses in these categories goes up to 72% in the fourth year, indicating that the processes of cultural change or changing attitudes continues. We must consider that the public schools from which our students come have done a considerable job of molding the minds of the youngsters. It is interesting to notice, however, that the difference between the non-Muslim and Muslim responses is not as marked in the first year of high school as it is in the last.

Conclusion

When we have made allowances for the fact that this questionnaire was prepared for and used in an academic situation and that some of the responses were influenced by that, there is still remaining an indicator of the attitudes of the student group. A comparison with attitudes of a public school group will give better ground for judgment. There is valid reason for presenting this much of the study to this group both for what it reveals about the attitudes and for the information in it about the culture in which it was made. Such value as it has is more in the detailed analysis of attitudes than in any generalization that we might make, though I think it indicates that our school, and probably all mission schools, do in fact achieve in a very considerable measure the goals they set for themselves in changing the attitudes of their students.

Wesley A. Hotchkiss

Television on the Tepee

One of the standard amusements of Indian lands is to see a television antenna protruding from the roof of a mud hogan or a tepee. There is something about a television set on a dirt floor that strikes most of us as being funny. Our amusement, however, betrays how stereotyped we are as standardized American consumers.

Oversimplified Symbol

Our advertisers have convinced us that a television antenna is ridiculously out of place except in a setting of split-level houses, "Thunderbird" styling and gray flannel suits. Our amusement at the "primitive" is that his wants have not been standardized and, in comparison with the monotonous uniformity of American "culture," his nonconformity appears ludicrous.

Television on the tepee is symbolic of the Indian American problem, but not in the way that most people think. It is symbolic of the fact that the problem is as much in the mind of the white man as it is in the situation of the Indian Americans. In the first place, this symbol is one of the easy but inaccurate generalizations that tell us nothing of importance about America's Indian people. Any group as diverse and complex as Indian Americans cannot be generalized with so simple a formula. It makes a good tourist attraction but it cannot be taken seriously by anyone sincerely concerned with the struggle of these people to emerge from second-class citizenship.

In the second place, television on the tepee is not a case of civilization versus primitive tribalism. It might rather be understood as one kind of sophisticated, standardized tribalism called "American culture" versus another kind of more elemental tribalism surviving from the

---

Dr. Wesley A. Hotchkiss is General Secretary for Higher Education and American Missionary Association of the Congregational Christian Board of Home Missions. His doctorate, from the University of Chicago, is in human geography. The article presented here is reprinted from *Advance*, by permission of the editors.

ancient Indian culture. And who is to judge the superiority of one culture to another?

This leads us to some of the doubtful assumptions upon which much of our work among Indian Americans is based and the unique contribution which the church must make to the total problem. One of these assumptions is that assimilation is the ultimate solution to the Indian American problem. Let us examine this concept as a secular approach to the problems of our original Americans.

From a purely secular point of view, assimilation means that the Indian would lose his identity in the total American culture. He would develop to a point where his wants would make him conform to the pattern of a standardized consumer.

Television on his tepee means that the Indian does not want the proper combination of things. He is unassimilated. His wants must be reconditioned so that he looks like "the man in a gray flannel suit." Furthermore, he must want the standardized consumer goods so badly that he is willing to work himself into a coronary thrombosis to get them.

Reappraising Assimilation

This is the concept of secular assimilation in its baldest terms. The end product would be to transform a primitive "pagan" into a sophisticated secularist. But the disquieting question haunts our Christian conscience: "Once he has gained our whole pushbutton world, has the Indian found his soul in the process?" In the sight of God, how much difference is there between a primitive, simple red man in a blanket and a smartly dressed, economically secure, and properly acculturated secularist?

We might examine more closely the relationship of the church to this process. The shameful thing about much of the church's mission to the Indian Americans is the shallowness of the concept of that mission. Often we have offered the church as something to be added to the complement of standardized wants which we hope the assimilated Indian will acquire.

We add the church as we would add the Rotary Club, to round out the total assimilation. We decorate the Indian's secularized integration with the trappings of a good middle-class religious institution and thereby sanctify his assimilation! We assume that the church comes in a kind of "package deal" with all the other amenities of our machine age and we can hardly shake it loose from its accumulations.

We as churchmen can never communicate the gospel to Indian Americans effectively until we have come to a contrite appraisal of our assumptions and a new appreciation of the revelation of God as it stands outside not only the Indian culture but all culture, including our own beloved acculturation of gadgets. The Christian faith is not included in the package deal we are so often accused of offering the Indians. Assimilation, therefore, is not enough or, more accurately in the Christian view, may not even be desirable.

The Christian faith always has served as a bridge between cultures even before St. Paul stood on Mars Hill and declared: "Whom therefore ye ignorantly worship, him declare I unto you." Here is the uniqueness of the Christian faith in its contribution to the Indian American problem.

The purely secular approach cannot build a bridge between cultures because it is limited to its own cultural values. The secularist has nothing beyond the tawdry values of his own culture on which to lay hold to build the bridge between himself and the Indian.

The Christian knows that his faith rests upon a foundation beyond or beneath his culture just as surely as it is beyond the Indian culture. By underlying both cultures at a profound level, it can serve as the foundation upon which the bridge can be built between them.

This makes possible a constructive, positive approach to the Indian American people and their ways of doing things which sometimes are so different from ours. We know that the Christian church does not depend upon the institutional trappings it has assumed in our society and therefore it may emerge within the Indian American community in a radically different form.

Furthermore, this view of the Christian faith beyond culture is realistic. It serves as a corrective to the tendency to sentimentalize everything Indian. Feathers and buckskin are no more sacred than television and picture windows. To idolize either is unchristian.

The bridge we build with the Christian faith is a two-way street: We can go to the Indian Americans but they can also come to us if they like. More precisely, they should be members of the redemptive fellowship of the church whether they stay on the reservation or whether they cross the bridge to the "white man's world." Our hope is that, at the end of the bridge, they will find Christians who know that it is not a white man's world but God's world.

Joseph E. Grimes

Ethnographic Questions for Christian Missionaries

A NUMBER of missionaries find that a systematic fact-finding program helps them to be in a position of greater spiritual usefulness. At the same time, the intricate detail of most professional ethnographies gives the worker untrained in anthropology the impression that he cannot hope to undertake a worth-while fact-finding program by himself. This is not necessarily the case.

I have therefore compiled a number of questions to which any missionary should be highly motivated to find answers. Without special help he can follow them out to the place where the intricacies he finds are a source of insight rather than discouragement.[1]

None of these questions should — or can — be answered with a pat pronouncement. Each one could well form the core of inquiry for a treatise of monograph length, and the missionary should consider eventual publication of his findings in that form. The main outlines of the answers to all the questions should be well in mind by the end of the first six months' residence on the field, at which time the missionary would do well to talk over what he has done with an anthropologist and receive further suggestions. The questions are not of the variety that can properly be put to an informant directly. The missionary must instead use his own ingenuity to find ways of getting concrete data on what he wants to know.

The Questions

1. Describe thoroughly the person-to-person links by which news and gossip get around the community. These are the channels the gospel also follows.

2. How are decisions regarding various matters reached by the community as a whole? by groups in the community? by households? How do these decision-making patterns influence people's decision about Jesus Christ?

3. What do people of different statuses want most out of life? How does their action show what they think to be most important? What do they think you feel is important?

---

[1] The present list of questions is not designed to be an exhaustive check list, but to help missionaries to get started. Many more comprehensive guides to field work may be found in the following useful books:

Royal Anthropological Institution: *Notes and Queries on Anthropology* (sixth edition). London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, Ltd., 1951.

George P. Murdock and others: *Outline of Cultural Materials* (third edition). New Haven: Human Relations Area Files, Inc., 1950.

John W. M. Whiting and others: *Field Manual for the Cross-Cultural Study of Child Rearing*. New York: Social Science Research Council, 1953.

John Ladd: *The Structure of a Moral Code*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1957.

R. Herbert Minnich, Jr.: *A Manual of Social Science Material for Missionaries*. Elkhart, Ind.: Mennonite Board of Missions and Charities, 1958.

4. In the community, which persons control the actions of which other persons? in what ways? on what grounds? What is your place in this system?

5. How does each kind of object produced or imported by the community (goods and services) get to its ultimate user?

6. Who lives where? Give all names, ages, titles, and kinship ties to other people. Use maps.

7. How is each individual trained from birth to become a fully participating member of the community? each recognized group within the community? What do they do about people like you who have not gone through these processes?

8. Give a résumé and evaluation of everything that has ever been written about the language, culture, and general area.

9. How is sexual behavior channeled in marriage? outside of marriage? What is the rationale for each practice?

10. Who controls each piece of land, and how is that control expressed? In what ways is the land utilized?

11. How are differences between persons or groups settled, either in or out of court? Do all differences stay settled?

12. Who are considered deviant or marginal by most people? Why? What is done about them? How do you know your work is not limited to deviants?

13. Describe all practices and idea systems of the religion you are trying to see superseded.

14. What groups of people does marriage bring into relationship? What is the nature of that relationship? Who may and who may not get married? Why? Who actually does marry whom, regardless of the rules?

15. What things and ideas from alien sources are fully accepted? partially accepted? By what process did they get accepted? What makes people accept some things from outside and reject others? What has been accepted from you, and what rejected? Why?

Joseph E. Grimes, of the Wycliffe Bible Translators and Summer Institute of Linguistics, is a Ph.D. candidate in linguistics at Cornell University. At various periods since 1951 he has been living among and working with the Huichol Indians of Mexico. Among various articles on the language and the culture of the Huichol is one which appeared in an earlier issue of PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY: "Individualism and the Huichol Church" (Vol. 1, pp. 127-134).

Prajuab Tirabutana

My Contacts with Christians in Thailand

The narrative below is excerpted from a brief but most poignant autobiography, The Simple One: The Story of a Siamese Girlhood.[1] *The autobiography, written in connection with an English course, is largely unedited, idiom, choice of words, and even grammar having been left pretty much as Miss Tirabutana wrote it. The account of her girlhood, her instruction in her own culture, her feelings about her culture and her people, her increasing contacts with Westerners (including the missionaries mentioned below), her reflections on the inconsistencies within our culture and differences between hers and ours, all these elements are woven together simply, directly, and movingly. We recommend the whole paper to every reader of* PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY.

MY sister had a friend who lived close by at an American Christian Pastor's house. I had been thinking about learning English all the time and kept saying so to my sister. My oldest sister said I should learn Chinese which would be useful to my job, but my father did not approve, he said it was useful all right but you had to learn more than ten years before you could use it in writing and reading, English was better, he added. So my sister asked her friend if the Pastor's wife had time and would like to teach English. When we got word from her that she did not mind, we went to study together. She could talk Thai so she talked Thai to us all the time. And the book that she used to teach us was the Bible. She kept talking just about God and Jesus and the miracles that He did. Well, I did not see that all those miracles He had done were any better than those miracles of the spirits which I had read about since I was a child or those of the spirits which some of the villages believed in. After she had told us all of Jesus and God, tried hard to persuade us to be Christians to which we listened with disinterest, she threw out her last card by emphasizing that "All the people who don't believe in God and Jesus the Redeemer will be sent to the deep hot hell."

I came home with an agitated and rather frightened mind. I told father all about what she had said. Father popped his eyes with great surprise and said, "Why, I had thought that white people

Miss Prajuab Tirabutana was born in a provincial town of northeastern Thailand. She has not yet been abroad, but has lived her life among her own people, but she has had considerable contact with Westerners and the products of the West, as is almost inevitable in Thailand today.

---

[1] Data Paper No. 30, Southeast Asia Program, Department of Far Eastern Studies, Cornell University, Ithaca, New York, Nov. 1958. $2.00.

were clever. Who can help you out of hell if you do just bad things. And who can draw you to hell if you do just good and proper things. I don't believe that Jesus would say so. It sounds like dictatorship to me, may be it's the pastor's wife who made that expression up. Why don't you ask her what Jesus told the people to do?" Next time I went to see her I came back to tell father that, "She said, Jesus said, God said, don't steal, don't lie, don't kill *man*, don't have any things that will make you drunk, don't make love to other people's wives or husbands, don't mention other god's name in front of Him, honour your parents, don't worship any idol except Him because He is the only true God, don't have doubts at what He said, don't covet your neighbour's house, don't be fault witness, don't say His name in vain, don't find reason in what He said, and be the good sheep for Him to lead because one who follows His track will never be in danger. And he said don't be angry easily, if some one slaps your right cheek turn your left cheek for them to slap it again. And love your neighbour like you love yourself, and God will give everything to the one who has faith in Him, but He will help just the one who help themselves." Father said, "that was not bad, but you might want to know what Buddha said." He said, don't steal, don't lie, don't *kill*, don't have any thing that will make you drunk, don't make love to other people's wives or husbands. And if you are going to do or to say anything, think it over first so that if the other people do or say the same thing to you, you will approve or you will like it or not. If you like it, all right go ahead say or do it. If you think, no you won't like it, then stop your statement or your action, and avoid every thing that will lead you into a quarrel but if you can't avoid it you must bear the consequences bravely and calmy. And every body has to be sad or suffer for one thing or other, we are the same all over the world so be kind, be sympathetic to every body, don't be jealous, be glad when others get better than you. And you must train your heart to be neutral. The one whom you can and you must depend on is yourself. And for the believing, one day when Buddha was going to preach in Kalama, the people there asked him "You see, our town is near by the high way so there are many preachers who come to preach to us, one said this, the other said that. What will we do? What should we believe?" Buddha said, "Oh yes, it is natural for you to be confused and doubtful, the belief that you don't approve it by yourself should not be in your mind. You should not decide to believe it because of these causes:

> Because you have heard it is so.
> Because it is the traditions, or old saying.
> Because it is spoken by many people.
> Because it is in the books.
> Because you guess it should be so.
> Because of your assumption.
> Because you anticipate that it should be so.
> Because it was the same as what you have believed before.
> Because the speaker is the one you should trust.
> Because this speaker, this preacher, is your teacher.

"When you have thought carefully and are sure yourself that this preaching is good, this preaching has no bad effect on the one who does it, if you do it, noble people will admire you, if you do it completely it will be good, it will be happiness for yourself and for other people. There, then you should believe it."

She persuaded us to go to her church every Sunday. The Thai preachers who had preached there were all stupid, they said something that, by looking at their face we could see clearly that they did not even understand what they said themselves. When they prayed, they did like this, "Oh Father, you are the only God, the only Almighty, the only Light of the world, the only Good Shepherd, be kind to us sinful people, give me this and that and these and those, and oh, Father, give us this and that and these and those. And thank you for your kindness that you have given us this and that and these and those. We'll be good sheep for you to lead. And there are so many hard headed people who don't believe in you, forgive them and don't throw them in hell yet, give them a chance, be kind to them by inspiring them to believe that you are the only God, Amen." Oh dear me! if there is God I was sure that He would be bored to death with these flatterers who praised Him because they wanted to beg and beg and beg for many things from Him. And what was the use any way to beg things from Him. He had already said He would help only the ones who help themselves. But their music, even though it was full of praise for God and Jesus, was really something. I could not remember how long I studied the Bible (it should be English but it was not) with her. I just remembered that my patience came to the end one day, then I left.

* * *

Shortly after I had installed my shop the director of the hospital in Bangkok where I had worked before had heard that I had passed the bookkeeping examination, asked me to keep the books for their clinic in our town as a part time job. I accepted the job and had a chance to study English with the new doctor's wife for three times a week. She talked a lot more than our former teacher, which was good for me too that I could practise listening English. After my ears were completely flooded by her talk a year later I stopped learning.

* * *

Because I worked with the mission, they said they did not force anybody, but kept asking, inviting and persuading me to go to their church, and I did not want to be antisocial, so it was necessary for me to go to their church. The preachers here were a little bit wiser than at the other mission because they were more educated, but still stupid enough to raise themselves up by stepping on other people's hand. They blamed, and were sarcastic about other religions without really knowing those religions and then praised themselves highly. I was bored to death. One day the head of their preachers preached to us how silly my religion was. Well, I was not a religious person, actually at that time I did not know much about my own religion more than what father had told me. My time was not so precious as gold, but it seemed nonsenses to spend half a day in sitting and listening to such abusing. I had read from some Indian history that one king had two sons, and by custom he should give the throne to the first son after he had died; but he did not want the bad or stupid one to be a king, so before he died he called his two sons in and gave them each a sheet of paper with two equal lines on it, and told them to make one line shorter without erasing it. The first son could not do it but the second son could do it easily by drawing the other line longer. So the king gave the throne to him. I knew as well that they would fire any worker who showed even a little that their religion was unbelievable. But my job was only a part time job so I did not care much if they would fire me. I would not starve to death if I did not work with them. So I could not come to church any more, if they would let me work for them I would be glad to, if they did not want me it would be all right for me. Fortunately, they could not find another worker to take my place; so I did not lose my job.

Here I tried to read some of their Bible, it was not much different from the other Mission's, except one Mission have sabbath on Sunday and can eat every kind of food, the other have sabbath on Saturday and can not eat porks, duck and no scale fish. But both were translated word for word which must require special patience to read and understand it. And I had not much of that patience. Some of the members of their church were, as I had noticed and heard from the gossip between themselves and other people who knew them before, misfits from general society. I mean they had done something that people thought was bad or wicked to do, our town is small that almost every body knows each other and what they have done, so the people did not accept them, or I might say it the other way, they dared not go to those groups any more. When the American Pastor who naturally knew nothing about them but wanted more and more members for their church, even though these people were Buddhists before but they knew just a little about it, so the Pastor could persuade and attract them by money or by helping, to be members easily. (This is just in my own town, I knew nothing about the other towns, which might be different.) This was very useful to us because some of them if they had no place to go would be a nuisance and some of them might even be harmful to society. But when they came together and had rules of their own they could walk with their backs straightened up and dared not do mischief any more. And these missions had introduced us to know many useful things for our country in the past so we appreciate their services.

* * *

The hospital could not find a worker to take my place so they decided to have me. Here I came to the cross way. I had to think hard and carefully about it. Workers who did not believe in God could not work long with them. If I wanted to get promotion and permanent job I had to believe in God, or at least had to act as if I was going to believe. I really wanted the job. But for God really I had nothing against Him. Whether there was God or there was not did not matter with me. I knew that I could act as if or going to believe as well if I wanted to, and I thought that I could make prayer better than some of their preachers, which I thought I could make it good enough to make them thrill. But doing that in my religion we called deception. They would be glad if I did so even they knew that I did not really believe because most of the workers were that way. But if I did not pretend I would not have any promotion or might be fired out any day that there is some body whom they think they could persuade to believe in God to come to take my place. But how could I look straight into other people's eyes if I knew myself that I was deceiving some body all the time? I would lose my self confidence then. It was hard for me to decide what to do so I consulted the matter with my father. He said I better live the honest life and be poor than getting money by deceiving people because it would make you feel bad all the time. I accepted the job and waited for whatever would come to me in the future. I could help in the expenses then but father did not let me, so I could buy some comfortable things for myself. And by this time I had chances to go to some western people's party, which was quite different from what we had in our town.

* * *

I really appreciate the western people coming to our country. We learnt many good and useful things from them. But what I wish with my whole heart is I would like them to learn, to understand us too. And the way to do it is to communicate with as many people as possible or to read our books, and I can assure them that they will find many interesting things in us. And that way they will understand us and will not look down on us as most of them are doing now. When they came to our country what most of them did was to do their duties and learnt a little Thai language, just enough to tell the servants to do what they wanted to do in the house and the drivers to go left or right or straight, if they were doctors they would learn just the sentences that deal with patients such as, "Open your mouth, take a deep breath, is it painful here?" And if they were Pastors, they would learn how to say, "Lord, Almighty, The Glory, The Redeemer, the only Light of the world," and so on in Thai. So their communications were limited to the servants, the drivers and a few people who could talk (mostly a little) English. If these few people failed them, they hated us and looked down on us all. Our language is not hard to study, if they do not try to be too clever and really want to learn they can learn enough to read in six months.

REVIEWS

Introducing Animism, by Eugene A. Nida and William A. Smalley. New York: Friendship Press, 1959. 64 pp. $.90.

Reviewed by
JAMES O. BUSWELL, III

Friendship Press has inaugurated a new series of paper-bound volumes on the various religious systems, of which *Introducing Animism* is the latest. Also in print are *Introducing Buddhism* by Kenneth Scott Latourette, *Introducing Hinduism* by Malcolm Pitt, and *Introducing Islam* by J. Christy Wilson.

Nida and Smalley have provided a fascinating, modern treatment of animism, a term which has been widely misunderstood by students of comparative religion who have tended to classify all pagan religions in this one category. *Introducing Animism* includes a careful distinction between the various legitimate uses of the term. The book is profusely illustrated with some 47 pictures of religious objects and activities from no less than twenty different cultures.

The authors have taken pains to show that the larger religious systems also contain their animistic aspects. Certain forms in Buddhism, Hinduism, Islam, and Christianity are briefly treated in this regard. Also treated in the context of animism are such widely observed forms of primitive religion as ancestor worship, divination, fetishes, magic, mana, shamanism, taboo, totemism, witchcraft, and others.

The elaborate spiritual beliefs of the Dahomey of West Africa are briefly described, illustrating the relation of various animistic forms within one tribal religion. The discussion of totemism here is weakened not only by necessary brevity, but by being discussed in an African context when it takes such varied forms from one culture area to the next around the world. Its complexity rivals that of all other forms of primitive religion. However, the authors' objective is limited and has been achieved even here in that the integration of the various animistic forms within one culture has been nicely illustrated.

Above all, *Introducing Animism* shows the rationale of much of primitive belief about the supernatural, and adequately demonstrates the all-pervasiveness of religion in the life of the primitive. The implication becomes obvious, that since primitive religion is so highly integrated with the whole of life's concerns, the Christianity that is introduced must be made to fulfill the integrative social functions of the primitive religion, lest in time of crisis the "convert" return to his animistic *practices* precisely at those points where his Christian *belief* has not been made to apply.

Nida and Smalley conclude their study with a discussion of the weakness of animistic beliefs, and a chapter on "The Impact of Christianity on the Animistic World." The nature of the Christian message to the animist is clearly described, with proper emphasis upon the particular characteristics of primitive society — unity, integration, — which Christianity reinforces particularly in the present state of disruption in many primitive societies. "The essence of the impact of Christianity has meant a change *from fear to faith*." This important consideration has its spiritual meaning but also its social significance. It may be typified by the difference between the use of magic, or power by formula, and prayer, or power by faith.

In the brief reading list included at the end of the volume, one misses the standard work on animism, *Primitive Culture* by Edward B. Tylor, 1871. Very likely the authors wished to include only those books which are in print and readily available. Fortunately, but only recently, Harper and Bros. have made this long-out-of-print classic available again in a two-volume paper-bound edition. The second volume, including all of the chapters on animism, is titled *Religion in Primitive Culture.* Also worthy of inclusion is Row, Peterson and Co.'s *Reader in Comparative Religion: An Anthropological Approach* edited by W. A. Lessa and E. Z. Vogt, published last year.[1] Gathered here are over sixty of the most important, previously widely scattered, treatments of the various forms of primitive religion.

Introducing Animism will make excellent supplementary reading in cultural anthropology or missions courses, and should certainly become a part of the library of anyone dealing with primitive people.[2]

The Christian Faith and Non-Christian Religions, by A. C. Bouquet. New York: Harper and Bros., 1958, pp. x, 430. $7.00.

Reviewed by
EUGENE A. NIDA

A. C. Bouquet has written a stimulating book on the combined theme of comparative religions and the theology of missions. Bouquet's theological orientation is liberal. He is, however, well informed, writes with rare sympathy for non-Christian religions as well as for the need of effective missionary work, and presents some significant challenges both to pagans and to Christians.

Bouquet begins with an interesting statement of presuppositions about the world around us (in which he has been very much influenced by recent theories of astronomy and astro-physics). He follows this with a brief historical survey of religion, in which he treats "primitive" religions briefly and concentrates most of his attention on the three principal historical phases of religious development, as he sees them. They are the pre-axial period before Zarathustra in the 6th century B.C., the axial period lasting down through Jesus Christ, and then the post-axial period which is discussed in subsequent chapters, and interwoven with a number of other considerations. (The axial concept comes from the Swiss historian Jaspers.)

Bouquet treats briefly the principal of diffusion (which of course is better known to anthropologists than to most laymen), but this is necessary for some of his later comments on developments in Buddhism, contemporary Hinduism, and the religion of the Parsees, which he regards as having been influenced by Christianity. Bouquet then treats the rise and expansion of Christianity, and sketches briefly the principal periods recognized by K. S. Latourette.

All of this, however, is preparatory to Bouquet's main thesis, namely, the importance of the *Logos* doctrine in effective communication with the non-Christian world. Bouquet takes his clue from Justin Martyr, who in his famous diaolgue with Trypho (2nd Century A.D.) assumes the position that the wisdom of the Greek philosophers (and Justin himself had been thoroughly trained in the various Greek schools of thought, having ended up a Platonist before becoming a Christian) was in a sense the *Logos* 'Word' of God before Christ. Bouquet then goes back over the whole problem of the *Logos* theory and its relationship to the philosophy of Heraclitus, its development as the *Nous* 'mind' in Plato, and the later use of the *Logos* theory by the Stoics and the Neo-Platonists, who must have influenced Philo and he, as well as the general movement which he reflected, must, in turn, have had a dominant influence in the usage and meaning of *Logos* in the Gospel of John.

---

[1] Reviewed in PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY, Vol. 6, No. 5 (Sept.-Oct. 1959), pp. 235-236.

[2] Copies may be obtained from PRACTICAL ANTHROPOLOGY. See the notice on page 250.

In this attempt to resurrect the doctrine of the *Logos* as the means of rapprochement with non-Christian religions, Bouquet is, of course, not introducing anything especially new. Moreover, in his treatment of the exegetical background of the usage of Greek *logos* in the New Testament, and especially in the prologue to John, he does not reflect the most widely accepted view of contemporary scholarship, which sees in this usage far more of the Old Testament background of the 'Word' as the revelation of the wisdom of God, than of any contemporary philosophical developments. Bouquet is quite frank to admit that by and large Continental, and especially German, scholars range themselves on the side of the Old Testament background and British scholarship is more inclined to see Neo-Platonic and Gnostic influence, but it would seem that until some fresh light is available on the subject, Bouquet will find himself very much in the minority.

After developing the *Logos* doctrine in its Biblical setting, Bouquet then sets out to indicate directly and indirectly its application in various cultures. Many of his observations are highly instructive, and his short chapter on "Indigenization," in contrast with syncretism, is very useful. He brings in Marxism, not primarily as a religion, but as an antagonist of all religions, and exhibits keen awareness of its historical and sociological background. This is followed by a general view of various contemporary religious developments, with special emphasis upon relevant communication and approach to the major world religions, but except for indicating how the *Logos* approach might be applicable, there is nothing especially new.

In the last chapter, entitled "Theological Revaluation," he takes up one by one those who have made the greatest contributions to the problem of comparative religions and the theological implications of such developments for the Christain faith. He has some particularly interesting comments on the views of Brooke Foss Westcott, who is much more famous for his joint editing of a Greek New Testament text with Hort, but who had some highly illuminating views on the subject of communication with non-Christian religions.

Bouquet concentrates most of his criticism on the views of Hendrik Kraemer. Kraemer's earlier book, *The Christian Message in a Non-Christian World* (1938), has had a far-reaching effect on missionary thinking, and his later work, *Religion and Christian Faith* (1956), is a very effective presentation of the view that in Jesus Christ we have a completely unique revelation of God, and that in a sense "conversations" (in the technical sense of reaching mutually satisfactory goals because of having some common ground) are essentially impossible. The special revelation of God in Jesus Christ as interpreted in the Scriptures makes for Christianity a position of distinct "otherness," and hence *rapprochement* in the technical sense is not possible, though understanding and communication are by no means ruled out.

It is quite understandable, in view of Kraemer's position, why Bouquet should be so critical of him, and why the book, even as Bouquet admits, seems to lie beneath the shadow of Kraemer's views. Bouquet argues his own position with expertness, and as a representative of the best in the liberal theological position, he is certainly not a naïve syncretist. He likewise holds to the uniqueness of Jesus Christ and the superiority of the revelation which God has granted in Christ. Moreover, he can see and readily points out, where justified, the inferior aspects of the various non-Christian faiths — all of which would make good reading for some functional anthropologist who have tried to defend everything in non-Christian religions and attempted to make Christianity come out second best in certain comparative treatments.

On the other hand, Bouquet feels that Kraemer is too insistent upon using the Bible to prove all his points — too Bible-centered in his orientation and too dependent upon the written revelation. Also, he feels that the *Logos* doctrine, if only given a chance, might form the basis whereby we could convince people in non-Christian religions that their religious experience, at least to some extent, reflects the revelation of God in a pre-Christian "*Logos*" and that accordingly the revelation in Christ is a fulfillment of their aspirations, even as the Paul can regard the Law of the Old Testament as a kind of preparation for the fuller revelation in the Person of the Son.

Among conservatives, Bouquet's views will not be acceptable, but his brilliant treatments of many elements of non-Christian religions, especially Hinduism and Buddhism, will be deeply appreciated and his theological implications will at least stimulate many to do some thinking, for the issues that Bouquet raises are not straw men.

British Policy in Changing Africa, by Sir Andrew Cohen. Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1959. 116 pp. $4.50.

Reviewed by
JAMES MUIR

With a foreword by Adlai E. Stevenson, this book is the second volume in the new Northwestern University African Studies Series (the first being Herskovits' *Dahomean Narrative*). The work is the outcome of Sir Andrew's "Harris Lectures" at Northwestern University during April 1958. He speaks from his rich background with the British Colonial Office, having been the Governor of Uganda, and head of the African Division of the Colonial Office.

Above all else, I would call him realistic. He sits well in the councils of men like our own George Kennan and Dr. Norman Graebner who, being hard-

---

James Muir is the son of missionaries in Africa, and is going to Africa (Angola) himself with the South Africa General Mission. He has the B.A. in anthropology from Wheaton College.

headed realists, do not attempt to run away from the cold and difficult problems facing the "unclaimed areas" of the world today. The author deals specifically with West and East Africa, but his principles apply elsewhere.

The book contains four main sections dealing with the past, the present scene in Africa, the present tasks of the British Government, and the future in relation to African and Western cooperation.

Sir Andrew's realistic view of the force of nationalism is very healthy after the mixed image of communism, nationalism, and pink fellow travelers which has been foisted upon us. He clearly separates communism from nationalism (pp. 114-115). He also points out that the territorial policies are more flexible now because they result from the interaction of two forces: action of government and the pressure of local opinion (pp. 36-37).

His placing the responsibility of Africa's future squarely on the shoulders of the West is very arresting. He does not maintain any romantic view of "preserving the past" or "venerating the noble savage." He recognizes inevitable change and with solid realism faces the facts of change. The aim and purpose for the West's influence in Africa must be "the steady movement towards self-government.... This requires stability, economic progress, and outside help" (p. 115).

Sir Andrew states that our interests in Africa are three-fold: (1) moral and humanitarian, to bring Africans to self-government and self-betterment; (2) economic, to meet the West's need for both raw materials and finished goods; and (3) political, to help Africans remain stable and friendly to the West (p. 114). These three interests can be realized in a successful manner only if they are also satisfying to the African. This is the function of practical anthropology. He stresses the two principles of understanding the African and cooperating with him. "We should not treat him as a saint or an agitator, but as an individual with whom we should make every effort to establish human contact. We should not be disappointed when he turns out to be less than perfect. We should realize that it is his business to oppose the colonial Government." Sir Andrew emphasizes eight points concerning attitudes which we should foster in relation to the African (pp. 59-62). These attitudes will help us into a meaningful contribution to the African's self-development. His last two sentences are: "We have a cooperative job to do. To do it successfully we need to understand each other and the nature of the job."

I believe that this clear-cut statement is sounder than the more traditional policies of the colonial governments and their allies. Let us, too, be realistic in missionary strategy. Is cultural change in the process? If so, what is changing and what are our places in this change? The world is not the same world as it was six months ago, yet we missionaries are encrusted with the ideas of a dozen to forty years ago merely because "they worked then." I believe this book can be of great value in stimulating us to preparation for the changes ahead, as well as for coping with and understanding better the changes that surround us today.

LETTERS

Monotheism

Regarding Eugene A. Nida's article, "Are We Really Monotheists?" I am afraid of its theological implications. If we follow out the implications that God is *one* in purpose (and possibly one ontologically), but in function and/or form *many*, what Biblical criterion is there to set up only three persons for the Godhead? How can an infinite God be restricted to just three form functions, especially as the doctrine of the Trinity is not clearly formulated in Scripture?

What about "the angel of the Lord," "Wisdom," "Elohim (in His many functions)," "Jehovah," "the Most High," "the Ancient of days," "One sitting on the throne," "the seven Spirits of God," and other references to Deity? How do we equate some of these to reduce Him to three form functions? Why have just three persons to the Godhead? Why not have seven? Or ten? Or a myriad?

In *The Water Babies*, Charles Kingsley had at least five persons in the Godhead: the Irishwoman (God as warning sinners and seeking them), Mrs. Be-done-by-as-you-did (God as retribution and justice), Mrs. Do-as-you-would-be-done-by (God as love and mercy), Mother Carey (God as Creator), and a nameless *person* who apparently symbolized God as awfully holy, righteous, and majestic. Why not add Vishnu (the Preserver) and Siva (the Destroyer)? Why not a myriad persons, each symbolizing a specifically different function of the Godhead?

We need some principle for pulling God together in our conception of Him and not fragmenting Him. This may possibly be found in the distinction *purpose* (meaning) — *function* (distribution) — *form*. God is a unity in purpose. He is a multiplicity in form, or personality system. In orthodox Christian theology, He manifests three personality systems, all of them ontologically identical, but different in form or pattern. And functionally, He is infinite, playing now one role, now another. And this, of course, is only a first approximation to what He really is, and contains inevitable distortions.

James Lauriault

Yarinacocha, Loreto, Peru

Explanations of the Trinity

In considering the article "Are We Really Monotheists?" in the March-April issue of Practical Anthropology, I thought I would make reference to an analogical "explanation" of the Trinity which I have found useful in dealing with Muslims in Afghanistan. "Explanations" of the Trinity are numerous, and the validity of solid cubes, triangles, descriptions of family relationship, etc., are open to question. I heard of the following illustration having been used in Turkey with some success, and though there is some appeal to reason, it seems to be much more "personable."

Simply: In English, we say that we are going to take a walk out *in* the sun. By this we mean the sunshine or light, as we cannot literally walk in the sun. The sun itself is a body or reality which we cannot see (ordinarily) and this body behind all might be compared to the Father, except that the Father is a Person. What we know of the sun is that here on earth is sunshine, the light representing the thing behind it all; this light in the world might be compared to the Son, except that the Son is a Person. Indeed, He said, "I am the light of the world." If we plant a seed in the earth, the energy of the sun will penetrate down into the darkness of that earth and give that seed life; this energy might be compared to the Holy Spirit, except that the Holy Spirit is a Person. He is a Comforter, and not just One who fills with power and "energy." And yet the sun's light and energy are merely facets of one thing. Perhaps where this analogy most seriously breaks down is that there is no real comparison anywhere to be made with the Persons of the Trinity.

I have found that Muslims who present accusations of polytheism to Christians are invariably moved by a stock phrase taught to them by the *mullahs*, rather than presenting an intellectual stumblingblock or rather than be moved by sincerity or a desire to really want to understand. And we gullible Christians quickly jump to argue with them, rather than let Him give us discernment as to whether the inquiry is being genuinely made. I repeat, it usually is not. Both the discernment on the part of the Christian and the prepared heart of the non-Christian are a testimony in themselves to the forgotten Third Member of the Trinity, "not by might nor by power (nor by logic, nor by Christian linguists or anthropologists, nor by arguing) but by My Spirit. . . ."

This brings me to a point unmentioned in the article. Despite the fact that I have been a Christian for some number of years, it was only relatively very recently that the Person of the Holy Spirit was revealed to me. Perhaps the greatest problem that the missionary encounters is trying to describe a pie he has never seen, or should I say, One whom he knows nothing about in his personal experience. This can be checked, something like one proves arithmetic, by the reverse point of view, namely that the Muslim has no evidence of having seen the Person of the Spirit in the Christian's life according to the very characteristics of the Spirit that the Christian glibly enumerates from the Bible.

EMMETT C. MCKOWEN, JR.

San Diego, California

Too Much Cameroun

It would be wise in the coming issues to leave the Cameroun for a little while. Do not make the Cameroun the hub of the world, even from the point of view of practical anthropology.

P. C. TOUREILLE

Stanleyville, Belgian Congo

v.6
1959

342226

v.6
1959

THREE DAY

GRADUATE THEOLOGICAL UNION LIBRARY
BERKELEY, CA 94709

GTU Library
3 2400 00337 1105